HEGEMONY AND THE CANADIAN NEWSPAPER INDUSTRY’S
PORTRAYAL OF THE OKA CRISIS

A Thesis Submitted to the College of
Graduate Studies and Research
in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
for the Degree of Masters of Arts
in the Department of Sociology
University of Saskatchewan
Saskatoon

By
Warren H. Skea

Summer 1993

Copyright Warren H. Skea, 1993. All rights reserved.
In preparing this thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for a Postgraduate degree from the University of Saskatchewan, I agree that the Libraries of this University may make it freely available for inspection. I further agree that the permission for copying of this thesis in any manner, in whole or in part, for scholarly purposes may be granted by the professor or professors who supervised my thesis work or, in their absence, by the Head of the Department or the Dean of the College in which my thesis work was done. It is understood that any copying or publication or use of this thesis or parts thereof for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission. It is also understood that due recognition shall be given to me and to the University of Saskatchewan in any scholarly use which may be made of any material in my thesis.

Request for permission to copy or to make other use of material in this thesis in whole or in part should be addressed to:

Head of the Department of Sociology
University of Saskatchewan
Saskatoon, Saskatchewan S7N 0W0
ABSTRACT

The Canadian newspaper industry possesses considerable freedom over how it reports and portrays news events. The intention of this thesis is to examine how the Canadian daily newspaper industry, an industry that professes and prides itself on being objective and professional, portrays one such situation, the Oka crisis. Specifically, this thesis analyzes the ideological function of the newspaper industry during the Oka crisis when extensive public relations campaigns were employed by both the government and the army to prepare and manage their media releases.

The literature suggests that the portrayal of news events in Canadian newspapers is based on four variables: i) the editorial nature of a newspaper, ii) the region in which a newspaper is published in Canada, iii) the corporate structure of the newspaper, and iv) the type of sources utilized in a particular article. A thematic analysis of all articles and editorials within a one week time frame found in fifteen major daily Canadian newspapers is provided as well as tests of significance of the four independent variables. The statistical analysis suggests that three of the four independent variables the literature suggests are important, in fact are not significant in the thematic portrayal of Oka crisis by the Canadian newspaper industry.

Alternatively, this thesis employs the theoretical concept of hegemony, which proposes that the ruling class is able to coerce subordinate groups or classes into consenting to their best interests by suggesting the interests they promote are in everyone's best interest. The ruling class then receives mass popular support of their agenda from the subordinate groups. Hegemony, when successful, is undetectable. Similarly, in liberal democratic societies, like Canada, the newspaper industry relies on the concepts of objectivity and freedom of the press so that ideology sustaining the political and economic status quo may be latently published in newspapers without any scepticism by the reading public.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First, I would like to thank the Department of Sociology for two consecutive Teaching Fellowships. Secondly, the Department of History and Dr. Swan for awarding me with the Messer Fund for Research in Canadian History scholarship to cover the costs of the considerable microfilm copying that was necessary for this thesis.

I owe many thanks to my supervisor Dr. Terry Wotherspoon for his valuable insights, his countless hours of reading drafts, and the numerous discussions as to how this thesis should finally appear. I would also like to thank my initial supervisor Dr. Vic Satzewich, who unfortunately moved to the University of Lethbridge at the end of my first year of the M.A. program, for his suggestion of this topic.

I would also like to acknowledge my committee members Dr. Bernard Schissel for reading initial proposals and providing methodological insights and Dr. Gurcharn Basran for his theoretical insights as well as providing insightful interpretations of Noam Chomsky’s work.

I would also like to recognize Dr. Mike Collins for theoretical insights beyond the sociological realm.

I would like to sincerely thank my parents, Harvey and Carole, for their moral and financial support and their belief that I could accomplish these aspirations.

Finally, I would like to thank my wife Sharon. Her support, at times, may appear to have gone unnoticed but I do genuinely realize that much of this would have been considerably more difficult if she were not at my side. Thank you for everything and I only hope my days as a student will be short-lived so that I may provide the stability and comforts in life you deserve.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

PERMISSION TO USE................................................. i

ABSTRACT............................................................... ii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.................................................. iii

TABLE OF CONTENTS.................................................... iv

LIST OF TABLES......................................................... vi

CHAPTER ONE: NEWSPAPERS AND THE OKA CRISIS
1.1 Introduction................................................... 1
1.2 The Research Question......................................... 4
1.3 The Oka Crisis.................................................. 5
   1.3.1 The History of the Mohawks’ Land Claim.............. 6
   1.3.2 The Events of the Oka Crisis......................... 8
1.4 Order and Ideology in the News............................... 11
1.5 The Media’s Portrayal of Reality............................. 14
1.6 Media Framing Theories....................................... 15
   1.6.1 Liberal Theoretical Approaches..................... 16
   1.6.2 Professional Journalist-Centred Theories.......... 17
   1.6.3 Organizational Theories.......................... 18
   1.6.4 Event-Centred Theories.......................... 18
   1.6.5 Deterministic Theories.......................... 19
1.7 Critical Theoretical Approaches............................. 20
   1.7.1 Critical Organizational Theories.................. 20
   1.7.2 Critical Symbolic Theories...................... 23
   1.7.3 Instrumental Theories.......................... 25
1.8 Hegemony and the Analysis of the Oka Crisis........... 26
1.9 The Direction of Research................................... 27
1.10 Limitations of the Research............................... 28

CHAPTER TWO: THEORETICAL APPROACH
2.1 Introduction................................................... 30
2.2 Definition of Hegemony....................................... 31
2.3 The Role of Hegemony in Capitalism......................... 32
2.4 Hegemony in Journalism.................................... 37
2.5 The Journalists................................................ 39
2.6 Hegemony in Confrontational News.......................... 45
2.7 The State, Legitimation, and the Media.................... 47
2.8 The Notion of Power in the Newspaper Industry........ 50
2.9 Hegemony, Audience Confidence and Perception........... 52
2.10 Conclusion..................................................... 54
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>NAME OF TABLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Frequency Distribution of Themes of Articles</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Type of Theme of Article by Newspaper</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Editorials by Newspaper</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Editorial Solution by Newspaper</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Correlation between Themes and Editorial</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Type of Information Source by Newspaper</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Correlation between Theme and Source</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Corporate Structure by Theme</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>Region by Theme</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>Region by Editorial Solution</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1: NEWSPAPERS AND THE OKA CRISIS

1.1 INTRODUCTION

The major daily newspaper industry plays an important role in the day to day life of Canadians. Approximately 69% of Canadians aged eighteen years and over read a newspaper on a daily basis (Newspaper Marketing Bureau;1992). Most Canadians have experienced to varying degrees the awesome potential of the newspaper industry to influence the attitudes, beliefs and behaviours of the reading public. This influential quality warrants an examination of the Canadian newspaper industry's portrayal of specific and significant events. This thesis explores one such event - the Oka crisis - which occurred thirty kilometres west of Montreal in the summer of 1990.

Newspapers have been in existence in Canada longer than any other broadcast or visual media (television and radio). The newspaper industry has published opinion and taken major events into the homes of millions of Canadians, and implanted images of reality into their minds. At the last count there were close to 120 daily newspapers in the country with hundreds of weekly or bi-monthly newspapers (Siegel,1983). In recent years the structure of the
newspaper industry has changed. Several major mass circulation newspapers have become part of the conglomerate media monopolies. Today over 75% of daily newspapers sold in Canada are owned and operated by a handful of companies (Newspaper Marketing Bureau, 1992). Corporate control has changed the character of the industry. In an aesthetic sense, Khaki and Prasad (1988) state that it is not uncommon to see "shorter stories, bigger type which provide more punch in the effort to maintain a large readership in a very competitive market" (Khaki and Prasad, 1988: 20).

The role of the newspaper industry in reporting events and disseminating information is an important aspect of a "free" or liberal democratic society. As an institution, in general, the newspaper industry has enjoyed, under the garb of freedom of the press, special status allowing certain freedoms ordinary citizens do not enjoy (Khaki and Prasad, 1988). Throughout this century it has become more difficult for the state to place any limitations on speech and related forms of expression (Ginsberg, 1986). The courts have eroded the possibility for libel suits against newspapers, thus "making it difficult for private agencies or individuals to seek to constrict the flow of ideas and information" (Ginsberg, 1986: 97).

Next to the institutions of government and business, in power and influence the newspaper industry in Canada has become a potent channel through which national symbols have
been transmitted to Canadians. Essentially, Canadian laws do not require the press to be objective, fair, or even representative of the society it serves, even though the Kent Commission on Newspapers in 1981 supported legislation, backed by public support, making the media responsible to the public.

The newspaper industry claims that its objective is simply to provide information to the public; however, many theorists believe the daily newspaper industry's main objectives include both ideological and corporate based elements. (see Porter, 1965; Clement, 1975; Gans, 1979; Gitlin, 1980; Steward, 1980). These same theorists argue that the structure of newspapers, in particular the structure of newspaper articles and the standardized methods journalists are taught, are designed to promote the political and economic status quo. Hence, the newspaper industry in Canada maintains at its disposal what Wilson (1974) terms "power resources".

It is a false consciousness that alleges that it is the groups whose members lack political power or economic resources that benefit from freedom of the press. The producers of ideas within the newspaper industry are dominated by the most powerful segments of the upper class (Porter, 1965; Gitlin, 1980; Ginsberg, 1986). Although the notions of freedom of the press and objectivity are essential in a liberal democratic society, it is the
powerful groups and individuals with their beliefs and ideas that are provided access to the media.

These same powerful groups, such as the government, also consciously manipulate events for favourable media coverage. In the case of the Oka crisis, Winter reports that "...to the federal government Oka represented an exercise in public relations, or more precisely, in crisis or public opinion management" (Winter, 1992:248). The army alone hired over twenty public relations experts to advise them at a cost in excess of one million dollars (York and Pindera, 1991:374-375). The media were furnished with managed opinion in the form of news releases and programmed spokespersons from both the army and all levels of government (Winter, 1992).

At the same time Natives in Canada have long expressed considerable dissatisfaction with the coverage of Native affairs by the Canadian newspaper industry (Khaki and Prasad, 1988). Specifically, Natives feel that there has been persistent negative portrayal, bias, scapegoating, stereotyping and sensationalism of Native peoples by the Canadian media (Khaki nad Prasad, 1988).

1.2 THE RESEARCH QUESTION

The structure and privilege of "freedom" by the newspaper industry in Canada indicates that the industry
maintains a powerful position that, at the same time, must uphold the notion of objectivity to the reading public. An important question therefore emerges. How has the Canadian newspaper industry portrayed crisis events that have come under the scrutiny of extensive public relations campaigns by the government and other dominant groups?

It is the intention of this thesis to examine the major Canadian daily newspaper industry's thematic portrayal of the events of the Oka crisis, as well as to determine if the variables the literature suggests are important in how Canadian newspapers portray events, like Oka, have significantly influenced the industry's portrayal of the events at Oka. I will further demonstrate that existing liberal and critical theoretical explanations as to how the Canadian newspaper industry has portrayed events like the Oka crisis are inadequate. I employ the theoretical concept of hegemony to explicate the newspaper industry's portrayal of the Oka crisis.

1.3 THE OKA CRISIS

Newspapers report on a variety of topics but news events that fulfill the criteria of social or moral disorder and rebellion against the authorities are provided important status by the newspaper industry. Because the events of the Oka crisis included disorder and rebellion against both
government and law enforcement officers, the Oka crisis was considered an important story by the newspaper industry. Oka was considered newsworthy not only because the Mohawks were involved in an armed standoff with the Quebec provincial police, but also because the Mohawks are an easily recognized and identified group with political goals not witnessed in Canada since the F.L.Q. crisis of 1970. All of these elements and the fact that the events at Oka could be easily outlined and packaged led to the high degree of reporting of the Oka crisis by the newspaper industry.

1.3.1 THE HISTORY OF THE MOHAWKS’ LAND CLAIM

Although the newspaper industry in Canada rarely expounded on the history of what became the Oka crisis it is apparent that land negotiations between Mohawks and European colonizers in the Kahnawake and Kanesatake area had taken place as early as the eighteenth century (Winter, 1992). The Mohawks at Kahnawake were able to gain title to land reserves held by the Jesuits while in 1840 the "British government confirmed... the obligation to use the land for the benefit of the [Kanasatake] Mohawks" (Winter, 1992:211).

The Mohawks undertook numerous legal campaigns to gain the rights to their land, arguing they had never surrendered it. On numerous other occasions the Mohawks attempted to claim the land by force but were unsuccessful and
subsequently incarcerated (Winter, 1992). The Jesuit Order, although obliged to use the land for the benefit of the Mohawks, sold off portions of the land to settlers. After this misappropriation Chief Kennatosse of the Oka Mohawks went to England in 1902 to argue his case directly to King Edward II, to no avail.

In 1936, the Jesuit Order sold the remaining land to a wealthy Belgian Baron. Then in 1947 the Quebec government authorized the Town of Oka to expropriate some of the Baron’s land, including the pine treed land in and around the nine-hole municipal golf course (Winter, 1992:212-213). Protests concerning the land in question occurred in the intervening decades until the summer of 1990. In 1950, the land was sold and a privately owned saw-mill was developed. Mohawk protesters were arrested and fined for assaulting the mill manager. Again in 1959, the Mohawks protested the leasing of the land in question for the development of a private nine-hole golf course. In 1975, the Kanesatake, Kahnawake, and the Akwesasne Mohawks submitted a comprehensive land claim to the federal and Quebec government but it was subsequently rejected because the Mohawks could not claim that the land was theirs "from time immemorial" (Winter, 1992). In 1977 the Mohawks submitted a specific claim and "after almost a decade of negotiations the federal government decided the claim did not meet its narrow criteria" (Winter, 1992:212).
The historical events surrounding the disputed land that led to the Oka crisis are important in understanding why the uprising occurred and why the land was deemed important by both groups.

1.3.2 THE EVENTS OF THE OKA CRISIS

It is not my intention to analyze historically the events of the Oka crisis. However, I will briefly outline and develop a time frame within which the significant media reference points of the crisis occurred. As noted earlier, the debate on ownership of the land between Mohawks and local governing officials had been ongoing for several decades. In the summer of 1990 a band of Mohawk Natives at the Kanesatake reserve near Montreal, after the prolonged unresolved land claim dispute with local governing officials, began an armed stand-off that is now referred to as the Oka crisis. The Mohawks of Kanesatake contended that the wooded section of land under dispute had traditionally and legally been Mohawk land and in fact has spiritual significance as a burial ground to the Mohawk people. The mayor of Oka countered that this tract of land was municipal property and, therefore, Oka town council’s responsibility. Several months prior to the start of the armed blockades Oka town council approved the sale of the tract of land in question for the expansion of an existing adjacent golf
course. The Mohawks unsuccessfully tried for months to enter into negotiations with Oka town council over this land and maintained that the land was legally and rightfully Mohawk land. However, civic officials did not co-operate with Native leaders and would not enter into any negotiations. Subsequently, on March 11, 1990, just prior to when the start of golf course construction was to begin, Kanesatake Mohawk warriors took a bolder step in their protest to stop construction - they erected a blockade on the road entering the disputed land that they lay claim to.

On June 30, after a three month legal battle, the Oka town council won a court order to have the roadblock removed. Mayor Jean Ouellette engaged the provincial police force to forcibly remove the Mohawks and the blockade. It was at this point that the Mohawks defended the blockade by taking up arms.

At this time, the newspaper industry in Canada published at least one major article or editorial in each of the major daily newspapers on the previous day's events at Oka. However, before the armed conflict between Quebec provincial police and the Mohawks, the conflict between the Mohawks and local officials in Oka received limited "back page" coverage by the Canadian newspaper industry. In support of the Kanesatake Mohawks, the Mohawks of Kahnawake, forty kilometers to the east of Oka, erected a blockade on the Mercier Bridge that links Montreal with its suburbs to
the south. Although these are separate, but related, incidents at different geographical locations, it is widely accepted that all events at both Kahnawake and Kanesatake constitute the Oka crisis.

The second major event that marks the crisis is the shooting death of Corporal Lemay on July 11, 1990. Corporal Lemay, an officer with the Quebec Provincial Police (S.Q.), was shot and killed in a gun-fire exchange between Mohawks and provincial police officers. Although unsubstantiated by coroner inquests that Mohawk fire killed Lemay, it was the Mohawks that were considered responsible by the media for his death. This event triggered further and more intense domestic media coverage of the happenings at Oka because the threat of more intensified violence was seen as real.

The third major event within the crisis was the support for and incursion of the Canadian army at Oka. After the death of Corporal Lemay and the seemingly extended nature of the dispute, Quebec government officials appealed to the federal government to activate military personnel into the contested area. Although the actual physical deployment of troops was important, it was the public debate and demonstrations advocating the army’s involvement that occurred prior to the deployment of the army (perhaps precipitated by Lemay’s death) that were considered more significant incidents by the media. The standoff between Mohawks and the army lasted until September 26, 1990.
The isolated physical and geographic nature of the events of the crisis meant that the newspaper industry was significant in the reporting of the news. Essentially, the visual media did not have an advantage in reporting because for the most part the events, or at least the confrontational battles, were not witnessed by the media. As well, the editorial component of newspaper coverage allowed for more interpretive and synoptic reporting of the events at Oka by the newspaper industry. Arguably this gave the newspaper industry an advantage over the visual media in the formulation of perceptions of the crisis. One may argue that Canadians’ perceptions of the Oka crisis were largely shaped by the major daily newspaper industry.

1.4 ORDER AND IDEOLOGY IN THE NEWS

The moral disorder story has a "hallowed tradition" in newspaper reporting (Gans, 1979). As previously mentioned, the Oka crisis represented the ideal moral disorder story to the newspaper industry. In most moral disorder stories, "the values being violated are never made explicit, and that they are being violated is not discussed." (Gans, 1979:56) However, it is apparent that the participants in the story are being identified as transgressors (the Mohawks in this case). The frequent appearance of disorder stories suggests that order is an important value to the newspaper industry,
but is somewhat meaningless until it is revealed what and whose definition of order is being utilized.

There are numerous definitions of order, most of which are perceived differently by different people. For example, Gans (1979) states that the slums may appear orderly to people who do not reside there as long as there are no disturbances and crimes of poverty are not directly affecting their lives, but "for slum dwellers order is not possible until exploitation, as well as crime, is eliminated." (Gans, 1979:58).

Social disorder is generally defined as disorder in public domains. The most important criterion of the newsworthiness of disorder is the target of the demonstration (Gitlin, 1980; Gans, 1979).

Ultimately, social disorder is equated with political disorder; similarly, social order is viewed as the absence of violent or potentially violent threats to the authority of public officials. (Gans, 1980:58)

National news is ostensibly about and for the entire nation. Therefore, its values pertain to "national order". A protest march in which a person was killed would be considered headline national news while a murder as a result of domestic violence would be considered local news. The question that begs to be asked is; whose order is being valued? Gans (19790) declares that "when all other things are equal, the news pays attention to and upholds the actions of elite individuals and elite
If the news includes values and interpretations, it also contains ideology in the sense that it has been scrutinized under certain criteria (Hall et al, 1978; Gans, 1979; Gitlin, 1980). Marchak (1981) asserts that the media in general constitute an arena in which competing ideologies exist. In a similar sense Gans (1979) contends that the ideology within the media is an "aggregate of only partially thought-out values which is neither entirely consistent nor well integrated; and since it changes over time, it is also flexible on some issues" (Gans, 1979:68). Hence, Gans labels this aggregate of values and reality judgements as paraideology to distinguish it from "deliberate, integrated and more doctrinaire values defined as ideology, but it is ideology nevertheless." (Gans, 1979:68). Therefore, ideology of the media states that what they report is objective, while ideology by the media is ideology that is developed by other structures and the media is only the vehicle for that ideology.

Gans states that paraideology is difficult to place on the conventional political spectrum because journalists are not aware, nor consistent, in the ideological components of their reporting. However, he further states that in its respect for tradition and its nostalgia for pastoralism and rugged individualism, the news is unabashedly conservative, as it is also both in its defense of the social order and its faith in leadership. (Gans, 1979:68)
The ideological element within the media has long been considered a critical area of inquiry by sociologists. The patterns of discourse used by the media's coverage of the new left movement in the United States in the mid-1960's have been documented in the sociological literature. Gitlin (1980) has identified delegitimization and marginalization (showing demonstrators to be deviant or unrepresentative), disparagement, emphasis on violence, and emphasis on internal dissention as prominent themes in the mass media's coverage of the new left (Gitlin, 1980).

It is apparent that the newspaper industry does retain certain values and certain ideological elements. There are several theoretical perspectives that attempt to explain or manage the media's interpretation and reporting of the news.

1.5 THE MEDIA'S PORTRAYAL OF REALITY

It would be incorrect to assume that the way in which the newspaper industry in Canada depicts the world, including crises such as that at Oka, is simply the way the world exists. Even within an event there is an infinite number of detailed occurrences. Erving Goffman has demonstrated that in everyday life we "frame" reality in order to negotiate it, manage it, comprehend it, and choose appropriate repertoires of cognition and action (Goffman, 1974). Frames are principles of selection,
emphasis, and presentation composed of little tacit theories about what exists, what happens, and what matters (Goffman, 1974; Gitlin, 1980). The media also utilize frames and framing techniques.

1.6 MEDIA FRAMING THEORIES

Media frames, largely unspoken and unacknowledged, organize the world for both journalists and the audience who reads their reports. Gitlin asserts that

Media frames are persistent patterns of cognition, interpretation, and presentation, of selection, emphasis, and exclusion, by which symbol-handlers routinely organize discourse, whether verbal or visual (Gitlin, 1980:7).

Frames enable journalists to process large amounts of information quickly and routinely, to recognize it as information, to assign it to categories and package it for quick relay to their audience (Hall et al, 1980). Therefore, for organization purposes frames are unavoidable, particularly in the newspaper industry. Gitlin (1980) states that any analytic approach to journalism must ask: What is the frame here? Why this frame and not another? and what patterns are shared by the frames over the reporting of this event? (Gitlin, 1980:7).

It is then apparent that framing the news is an important consideration in the reporting of the news. If
the framing of news affects the way an article or editorial is written then specifically, how does this framing process occur, and what are the factors that create the differences in the reporting of the news?

I will outline some of the major liberal theoretical approaches that address these questions as well as critical theoretical approaches that attempt to explain how the Canadian newspaper industry portrays events. I will further demonstrate that the liberal and previous critical theoretical approaches are inadequate in the explanation of how the Canadian newspaper industry portrayed the Oka crisis. As earlier suggested this inadequacy allows for the theoretical concept of hegemony to explain the newspaper industry’s portrayal of the Oka crisis.

1.6.1 LIBERAL THEORETICAL APPROACHES

In a general sense there are numerous liberal theoretical approaches to the explanation of how certain stories are selected as news and what is reported by the newspaper industry. Herbert Gans (1979) systematizes these approaches which include (i) professional, (ii) organizational, (iii) event centred and (iv) deterministic forces that constitute world images (Gans, 1979). The liberal approaches believe the media to be objective and reflective of society.
1.6.2 PROFESSIONAL JOURNALIST-CENTRED THEORIES

The first liberal theoretical approach is journalist-centred theories. This approach explains the news as a product of professional news judgements. For example, an event like the Oka crisis is portrayed as a "law and order" issue because that is what journalists are taught to write when any group opposes the established structures of government and the police in a society. In the extreme form of this viewpoint, journalism is a profession with autonomous criteria for training, recruitment, and promotion, serving the public interest by following its own stated and unstated rules concerning objectivity (Gitlin, 1980). Like any other profession, journalism is (or ought to be) insulated from extrinsic considerations, whether from political pressures, pressures from publishers, news executives, or advertisers, pressures from outside interest groups, and conscious or unconscious ideological screens operating among journalists themselves. There is a recognition that some frames do exist in the reporting of news by this group of theories but they believe the frames are objective/neutral frames that only aid in the packaging process of events. It is no surprise that such theories are commonly held by journalists and advocates of the objectivity of the press. These theories contain several...
contradictions because journalists and editors are pressured to take a particular viewpoint on an issue. At the same time journalist-centred theories ignore significant evidence that suggests that the newspaper industry’s framing process is not objective.

1.6.3 ORGANIZATIONAL THEORIES

This group of theories stresses the "inertia, the sheer habit of news organization" (Gans, 1979). Some of these "organizational" theories emphasize commercial imperatives; others stress the organizational structure of the news operations themselves such as the effect of the division of labour in story selection (Gans, 1979). Somewhat compatible with these theories are the more recent phenomenological approaches to news as social constructs which emphasize the human agency of news. Essentially, they state that the informal rules which journalists adopt enable them to process vast amounts of information and to select and repackage it in a form that audiences will accept (Gitlin, 1980). The news is then dissected and modestly rebuilt with pieces of the complete story.

1.6.4 EVENT-CENTRED THEORIES

The third liberal theoretical approach is "event-
centred" which argues that news "mirrors" or "reflects" the actual nature of the world (Gans, 1979). The treatment and changes in the reporting of events by the print media apparently reflect changes occurring in the world. The mirror metaphor, as Edward Epstein showed, was common among news executives in the late 1960's (Gitlin, 1980). Although it has waned in credibility as critics from the first two groups have pointed to the systematic selectivities involved in the creation of news, mirror theory retains a commonsense standing as to how journalists and news executives frame the news.

1.6.5 DETERMINISTIC THEORIES

The fourth and last set of liberal theories "explains story selection with forces outside the news organization" (Gans, 1980:79). These theories are essentially deterministic in nature. For example, technological determinists argue that the message is determined by the technology of the medium. Similarly, economic determinists believe the national economy determines story selection, while cultural theorists see journalists as selecting and reporting on stories that reflect national cultural values.
1.7 CRITICAL THEORETICAL APPROACHES

To be sure each of these liberal theories has something to offer but all fall short of completeness (Gans, 1979). The first set of theories, those that suggest no framing or ideological elements are reported by journalists or the media, although advocated by numerous individuals, has no theoretical or sociological component. At this time I will outline in more detail the tenets of three alternative, critical theoretical approaches.

1.7.1 CRITICAL ORGANIZATIONAL THEORIES

Hall et al (1978) have provided a more substantial contribution to the study of the print media. The process of news production, as Hall demonstrates, is a complex procedure that differs from straightforward reporting. The newspaper industry is frequently not the "primary definer" of news events at all; but newspapers structured relationship to power has the effect of making them play a crucial, but secondary, role in reproducing the definitions of those who have privileged access, as of right, to the media as "accredited resources" (Hall et al, 1978). The journalists in fact come in at the last instance, "to reproduce the definitions of the powerful institutions, without being in a simple sense, in their pay" (Hall et
al, 1978:57). At the time of news production, the media stand in a position of structured subordination to the primary definers. Through a detailed analysis of the process of production, Clarke (1987) observes:

that [the] news portrays the social world in a fragmented, decontextualized and ahistorical manner which concentrates upon events, upon formalized institutions, and which depend upon official, institutionalized sources; that power is largely invisible in news, since the journalistic concept of "politics" equates it with parliamentary procedures of government, rather than power; that journalists as a professional group, share a range of common traits ...[and] are structurally denied access to a comprehensive knowledge of the news/current affairs audience (Clarke, 1987:7-8).

Another way that the newspaper industry actively comes into its own is with respect to selectivity (Hall et al, 1978). This may be demonstrated in the sense that not every statement by a relevant primary definer in respect to a particular topic is likely to be reproduced in the actual newspaper; nor is every part of each statement. By "exercising selectivity the media begin to impose their own criteria on the structured "raw materials" - and thus actively appropriate and transform them" (Hall et al, 1978:60). As well, each newspaper is differently appropriated, evaluated and made operational (Hall et al, 1978, Clarke, 1987). Hall states that,

each paper's professional sense of the newsworthy, its organization and technical framework (in terms of numbers of journalists working in particular
news areas, amount of column space routinely given over to certain kinds of news items, and so on), and sense of audience or regular readers is different (Hall et al, 1978:60).

Perhaps an even more significant aspect is the transformation of an event into a finished news item. This has to do with the way an item is coded by the media into a particular language form. Just as each newspaper has a particular organizational framework (sense of news and readership) each will also develop a regular and characteristic "mode of address" (Hall et al, 1978:61). This means that "the same topic, sources and inferential structures will appear differently even in newspapers with a similar outlook, since the rhetorics of address will have an important effect in inflecting the original item" (Hall et al, 1978:61). Hall further suggests,

the language employed will thus be the newspaper's own version of the language of the public to whom it is principally addressed; its version of the rhetoric, imagery underlying common stock of knowledge which it assumes its audience shares and which thus forms the basis of the reciprocity of producer/reader (Hall et al, 1978:61).

Hall asserts that the construction of reality by the print media differs on an individual newspaper basis. How this reality is constructed depends on numerous variables displayed by that newspaper. Although Hall's analysis is directed at the portrayal of the "mugging problem" in British newspapers it may be applicable to how the Oka
crisis was portrayed by Canadian newspapers.

1.7.2 CRITICAL SYMBOLIC THEORIES

The role of the Canadian media is analyzed by Jill Armstrong (1972) in her analysis of the F.L.Q. crisis of 1970. This is the only analysis that demonstrates the role of the Canadian media during a crisis. Armstrong asserts that liberal democracies have generally permitted, to varying degrees, opposition to the prevailing order; however, when threats, factual or contrived, attain serious proportions, the forces are developed. Armstrong examines the mobilization of political, military and ideological forces in Canada during the 1970 crisis. Armstrong argues that,

There must be a popular acceptance of the over-all legitimacy of the authorities and the regime. The public response in the Quebec crisis was generally that of unquestioning acceptance and a failure to challenge government policy. (1972:302)

Her argument is that, "The official definition of the situation must provide the means for individual actors to identify themselves... Ordinary members weigh the statements of opinion leaders and heed those they see as trustworthy" (Armstrong, 1972:303). The role of symbol manipulation is evident in times of crisis. For example, Armstrong states that the funeral of Laporte was used as a means to gain
overall legitimacy for politicians. "His widow had asked that the funeral be private, but her needs were secondary to those of the state. The ceremony symbolized him as a dedicated representative of the government's policies vis-a-vis French Canada" (Armstrong, 1972:303). The media were used very effectively to "mobilize fear" among the populace. Armstrong argues that this was accomplished by "reduction of a complex phenomenon to a readily identifiable and threatening entity... Canadians were given a legitimate target which to seek retribution" (Armstrong, 1972:304). This was designed to gain support for the government. She maintains that the role of the media in the F.L.Q. crisis was as follows:

The media provide a crucial influence on the climate in which members of the public come to form opinions on an issue, since they are the primary sources of information and interpreters of events. The abundant support for the government and the hunt for ideological defectors was undoubtedly affected by editorial treatment of the events in Quebec (Armstrong, 1972:305).

A content analysis of letters to the editor revealed the reflexive character of the pro-government writers in terms of repeating the very words used by political leaders. For example, "Almost to a man, the opponents were called "bleeding hearts", echoing the words of the prime minister in a television interview" (Armstrong, 1972:312).

Perhaps the most interesting results from this study
were the "consistent findings that the trust in the leadership appeared to be almost automatic suggesting that Canadians eliminated themselves as social actors when faced with events of crucial significance" (Armstrong, 1972:323). Armstrong's study illustrates that in terms of crisis, it is the political leadership which is given access to the media and the media, for the most part, gives overwhelming support to that leadership. The translation of government rhetoric to the public through the media tends to establish particular opinions in the public which in turn supports the government but remains passive in the process, being manipulated both by political power centres and the means of communication.

1.7.3 INSTRUMENTAL THEORIES

Porter (1965) and Clement (1975) provide the seminal critical analysis of the print media in Canada. Both take an instrumentalist approach when analyzing the media. They impute that a conspiratorial motive or dominant ideology is developed by the owners and controllers of the newspaper industry and they determine what is printed in their particular newspaper. Those who own and control (i.e. the board of directors) the major daily newspaper corporations are members of what both Porter and Clement term the "corporate elite". The dominant ideology essentially
constructs a reality that will maintain the current social, economic, and political conditions. It is in this "corporate elite's" best interest to increase its personal wealth and power at the expense of the proletariat. Porter's and Clement's conspiratorial approach claims the reality construction that journalists and editors report is formulated by those who maintain the power - the owners and controllers - the "corporate elite".

1.8 HEGEMONY AND THE ANALYSIS OF THE OKA CRISIS

In no way is this an exhaustive list of the theoretical perspectives that explain how the newspaper industry portrays and reports the news. The common characteristic of all these theoretical perspectives is that events are seen to be framed in some way by the newspaper industry. The monopolistic nature of the Canadian newspaper industry, as well as how journalists are educated, play an important role as to how news events are framed in different newspapers (Armstrong, 1972; Hall, 1978; Gans, 1980). Although the theories previously mentioned each have important contributions to how the news is framed by the newspaper industry, they neglect to explain how ideology is disseminated by the newspaper industry in a country that guarantees freedom of the press and how journalists voluntarily disseminate ideology.
The conflictual nature of the land dispute between the Mohawks and all three levels (municipal, provincial, and federal) of government, as well as the turbulent events throughout the Oka crisis pitting the impotent Mohawks against the established power elite, allows for an analysis of how the Canadian newspaper industry framed or portrayed the Oka crisis and if the variables exhibited by a newspaper as suggested in the literature have significantly influenced the newspaper industry's portrayal of the crisis.

1.9 THE DIRECTION OF RESEARCH

The literature suggests that the portrayal of news events in Canadian newspapers is based on several variables. A thematic analysis of all articles and editorials on the Oka crisis in the newspapers in this thesis is given. Tests of significance of the independent variables the literature suggests as important are performed. These statistical tests of significance suggest that the theoretical concept of hegemony best explains the Canadian newspaper industry's portrayal of the Oka crisis.

Specifically, the remaining chapters of the thesis will examine this question in the following format. Chapter Two will provide an in-depth analysis of the theoretical approach of hegemony and demonstrate how it can offer an explanation as to how the newspaper industry in Canada has
portrayed the Oka crisis. Chapter Three will introduce the methodological rationale of the study based on the literature and other studies on the newspaper industry in Canada. This chapter will also include a list of the newspapers selected in this analysis and an operationalization of the dependent and independent variables. Chapter Four will report and examine the results of the statistical analysis as well as test the significance of the independent variables. It will also utilize the theoretical perspective to explain the results of the statistical analysis. Chapter Five, the conclusion chapter, will summarize the findings and suggest why the findings and provide a more substantive interpretation. I will also suggest that the labelling of the newspapers in this analysis, on the right-left continuum, on the basis of a newspapers thematic portrayal of the Oka crisis might result from this research.

1.10 LIMITATIONS OF THE RESEARCH

The limitations of this research may be the scope and generalizability of this research. This thesis examines fifteen major daily newspapers from across Canada. These newspapers represent a large majority of newspapers read by Canadians on a daily basis but it cannot be suggested that
all other major Canadian daily newspapers would portray the events of the Oka crisis in the same fashion. The statistical analysis is therefore, restricted to the newspapers named in this analysis. As well, the theoretical explications derived from the analysis may be identified only with the newspapers in this analysis.

The scope of this thesis is restricted to the examination of the Canadian newspaper industry's portrayal of the Oka crisis. Specifically, the dependent variable dichotomizes articles and editorials on a "pro-Native" and "anti-Native" basis. It is not the intention of this thesis to examine the racial portrayal and characterizations of Native peoples by the Canadian newspaper industry.
CHAPTER 2: THEORETICAL APPROACH

2.1 INTRODUCTION

Undeniably, a news story undergoes a series of complex procedures before it is finally printed in a newspaper. These procedures, as Goffman (1974), Hall et al (1980) and Gitlin (1980) assert, is how the framing of news events is achieved. In his categorization of theoretical approaches in the reporting of the news, Herbert Gans suggests that all four (of his previously mentioned) liberal theoretical approaches fall short of completeness. Gans (1979) asks the analytical questions: where do news frames come from? and how are they fixed into the appearance of the stable, the natural, and the taken-for-granted? Gans’s synthesized theoretical approach correctly "looks both inside and outside news organizations for explanations of the news, and... conclude[s] that the production of news is a system of power." (Gitlin, 1980:251).

What I seek here is not so much an alternative to Gans’s theoretical perspective, as a more ample theoretical domain within which to understand the framing process and the newspaper industry/Oka crisis relationship. A
theoretical approach that would be both structural and
historical in nature while accounting for regularities in
journalistic procedure and product, as well as the role of
ideology in the framing of the news would be appropriate.
The most comprehensive theoretical approach that allows for
this is the Gramscian concept of hegemony.

There exists no precise theory of hegemony specifying
"social-structural and historical conditions for its
sources, strengths and weaknesses." (Gitlin, 1980:251). However, Gitlin contends that there is a paradigm emerging
since the collapse of the New Left and the translation of
Antonio Gramsci's Selections from the Prison Notebooks
(1971) that can aid in situating the history of media-crisis
relations. In order to understand the role of hegemony in
explaining the ideological framing of the news by the
newspaper industry a complete understanding of the concept
of hegemony is necessary.

2.2 DEFINITION OF HEGEMONY

Gitlin (1980) defines Gramsci's concept of hegemony
this way:

hegemony is a ruling class's (or alliance's)
domination of subordinate classes and groups
through the elaboration and penetration of
ideology (ideas and assumptions) into their
common sense and everyday practice; it is the
systematic (but not necessarily or even
usually deliberate) engineering of mass
However, there exists a fine line between hegemony and coercion; in fact hegemony includes elements of coercion. More recently, Stuart Hall has elaborated the notion of hegemony, drawing on Gramsci's terminology, as follows:

"hegemony" exists when a ruling class (or, rather, an alliance of ruling class fractions, a "historical bloc") is able not only to coerce a subordinate class to conform to its interests, but exerts a "total social authority" over those classes and the social formation as a whole. "Hegemony" is in operation when the dominant class fractions not only dominate but direct - lead: when they not only possess the power to coerce but actively organize so as to command and win the consent of the subordinated classes to their continuing sway. "Hegemony" thus depends upon a combination of force and consent. But - Gramsci argues - in the liberal - capitalist state, consent is normally in the lead, operating behind "the armour of coercion" (Hall, 1983:332).

Thus, hegemony is a process that is entered into by both the dominators and the dominated. Hegemonic reality "seeps into popular common sense and gets reproduced there; it may even appear to be generated by that common sense." (Gitlin, 1980:254). Hegemony, when successful, is undetectable.

2.3 THE ROLE OF HEGEMONY IN CAPITALISM

The masses in "free" or liberal democratic societies are led to believe that coercive political and economic
elements do not exist in a systemic fashion. The existence of hegemony in democratic capitalist societies flies in the face of this capitalist-based ideology. Therefore, it is necessary to demonstrate the actual operation of the concept of hegemony.

In Gitlin's words

[I]n liberal capitalist societies, no institution is devoid of hegemonic functions, and none does hegemonic work only. But it is the cultural industry as a whole, along with the educational system, that most coherently specializes in the production, relaying, and regearing of hegemonic ideology. (Gitlin, 1980:254).

So in Gramsci's theory, hegemony - the successful construction of popular consent to the rule of essentially capitalist governing parties - is achieved by displacing the reality of capitalist domination with the appearance of liberal democracy. In a liberal democracy the belief in freedom of the press by the subordinate class is essential. The subordinate class must believe that the interpretations of news by the media are subject not only to objectivity but the subordinate groups' world views.

The media in general, and particularly the newspaper industry, in Canada are owned and controlled by the corporate elite (Porter, 1965, Clement, 1975). These elites attempt to transpose their ideological reality through the newspapers 1) to formulate the terms of their own unity, and 2) to certify the limits within which all competing
definitions of reality will contend. Newspapers are then instruments in which the rules of almost every aspect of life are produced. Hall suggests the elite class structures the ideological field in which

subordinate classes 'live' and make sense of their subordination in such a way as to sustain the dominance of those ruling over them. (Hall, 1983:333)

Gitlin contends that at any given moment there is not a single "functioning ruling class" but an alliance of powerful groups searching for a basis of legitimacy. Hence, a specific hegemonic ideology will be complex. Newspapers maintain what Marchak (1981) terms an "arena of competing dominant ideologies". This corresponds with Hall's assertion that "the content of dominant ideology will reflect this complex interior formation of the dominant classes" (Hall, 1983:333).

Gitlin (1980) states that the hegemonic ideology will be complex for a deeper structural reason. The actual production and dissemination of ideology is not created by the economic elite. The actual task of disseminating ideology within the newspaper industry is left to journalists and editors. As Gouldner points out, "the dominant economic class under capitalism is actively and routinely engaged in the conduct of economic affairs" (Gouldner, 1976:229). The dominant economic class cannot directly command the newspaper industry on what to print.
However, Gitlin states that the owners of the cultural apparatus (which includes the newspaper industry) "interlock at high levels with the managers of the corporate and political sectors" (Gitlin, 1980:255). Gouldner's differentiation between the political and economic sectors might then be extended to the cultural order:

In consequence of these developments, the system of stratification under capitalism differs profoundly from that of previous societies... With the growing differentiation between the economic, political, and bureaucratic order, and with the growing specialization among different personnel, each of the newly differentiated spheres develops a measure of autonomy and, we might add, of "slippage," from the other. The operating personnel of the administrative, the political, and the ruling classes, each develop specialized standards and skills for dealing with their own spheres, thereby making the latter less intelligible and less accessible to the direct supervision of the dominant economic class (Gouldner, 1976:230).

Gitlin (1980) argues that the fact that power and culture in a modern social system are specialized makes ideology essential. Ideology is then a potentially cohesive force in societies that are divided in economic, ethnic, and political terms. The image of the relative autonomy of the different sectors of society, particularly the newspaper industry, legitimates the capitalist political and economic system (Gitlin, 1980:255). The newspaper industry plays an important role in securing legitimacy for the whole society through the dissemination of ideology.

However, there is a need for opposition to the unifying
ideology. Gouldner asserts:

It is precisely because the hegemonic elite is separated from the means of culture, including the production of ideologies, that ideologies developed in capitalist society may often be discomforting to the hegemonic elite, so that they prefer other mechanisms of dominance and integration more fully and routinely accessible to them (Gouldner,1976:230-231).

The hegemonic ideology of bourgeois culture is "extremely complex and absorptive; only by absorbing and domesticating conflicting values, definitions of reality, and demands on it, in fact does it remain hegemonic" (Gitlin,1980:256). The hegemonic ideological system, like the economic system, routinely encourages and tolerates ideologies which challenge and alter its own rationale.

Hegemony is an historical operation in which one picture of the world is preferred over others by engaging routines seen as both practical and commonsensical (Gans,1979, Gitlin,1980). Raymond Williams asserts that the internal structures "have continually to be renewed, recreated and defended; and by the same token ... they can be continually challenged and in certain respects modified" (Williams,1973:8). The ideologically dominant frames are taken for granted by the media and defended through the continued practices that they do not believe to be hegemonic. As Gitlin (1980) declares, hegemony operates effectively outside consciousness by "self-conceived professionals" working autonomously within institutions that
proclaim to be neutrally informing the public.

2.4 HEGEMONY IN JOURNALISM

Hegemony exists not only in the larger society and in professionally organized vocations such as law and medicine but also among journalists. In order to continue to substantiate the dominant frames seen in the newspaper industry journalists must practice, understand, and believe in the hegemonic ideology. It is apparent that a journalist must be considered by their employing newspaper familiar with the dominant ideals of that particular newspaper.

Through socialization and experience, essentially by class interest, the owners' and managers objectives are to maintain the system in which they operate - or in other words the notion of capital, private property, and the state. Furthering this notion they are also committed to the code of ethics under which the state and its agencies function and to individual success within bureaucratic corporate structures (Horton, 1978; Gitlin, 1980). The media elite want to preserve and honour the political-economic system because their power and prestige depends on its success (Porter, 1965; Clement, 1975).

At the same time the political and economic elite - including the newspaper elite - consider some opposition or conflict of opinion between the newspaper industry and the
political/economic elite as necessary. Any difference of opinion between the newspaper industry and the political and economic elite is subtle in nature in the sense that the underlying nature of the political and economic system is never questioned. The newspaper industry's methods of legitimizing the system as a whole:

pull it in conflicting directions: at one moment toward the institutions of political and economic power, and at another toward alternative ... movements depending on political circumstance." (Gitlin, 1980:259).

The conflictual basis of the newspaper industry also helps in the legitimizing of the newspaper industry as a whole. The newspaper industry develops a strategy of "neutrality" by incorporating competing forces in order to secure a larger audience as well as by claiming reliable routines of objectivity (Hall, 1978, Gitlin, 1980). In other words the newspaper industry cannot ignore oppositional movements or debates within the current political and economic system because it would undermine not only the larger political and economic system but also the legitimacy of the newspaper industry. The ideology of newspaper/media neutrality is complex in that it manages contradicting social movements in a careful way to promote the newspaper industry.
2.5 THE JOURNALISTS

The perception that journalists are autonomous professionals is an important element in the legitimization of the newspaper industry. The audience must believe that what they are reading is accurate and true. Journalists are trained to believe that "they have professional prerogatives to preserve" (Gitlin, 1980). The class background, training, and finally the work that a journalist produces contain social control elements that determine the way in which the news is reported.

Although extensive editing of journalists' work by editors does occur there are mechanisms that keep editing to a minimum. Journalists are predominantly chosen from the upper middle class so an upper middle class ideology is likely to be portrayed in their reporting (Porter, 1965; Clement, 1975; Gitlin, 1980). A lot of the values that journalists maintain may be considered liberal by conventional nomenclature; however, they tend to share the "core hegemonic assumptions of their class; that is, of their managers as well as their major sources." (Gitlin, 1980:260)

As a rule the salaries of journalists working for major Canadian daily newspapers are considerably higher than the average national wage. The salaries of journalists are important so that newspapers are able to attract people with
an upper middle-class background. It also ensures that journalists will generally share the tastes of their management, their sources, and their audience. Gitlin states that journalists share more than tastes with their sources but also such things as vacation spots and recreation activities. Their common approach to the world implies a homogenized impression of the world and reality. Social activities are important aspects that not only allow journalists access to the news, but also allow sources to dictate the way in which they would like the news to be framed by the journalist. The journalist's lifestyle then creates a symbiotic relationship in the sense that journalists gain access to information and sources are able to communicate "the news" through hegemonic routines.

Journalists are trained so that certain ideological assumptions are latent in their reporting. The work of hegemony, all in all, consists of imposing standardized assumptions over events and conditions that must be "covered" by the dictates of the prevailing news standard (Gitlin, 1980). The stereotyping that is witnessed in the newspaper industry results from the newspaper's desire for easy ways of transmitting and manipulating bits of information - bits which, moreover, need to be easily interchangeable and easily edited, re-edited, or reorganized at the last minute, usually by producers and editors who have been nowhere near the scene of the story (Gans, 1979).
If newspapers are to "cover the news" they have to simplify stories so that they can be processed and covered in a relatively small space; even larger articles take only one half of a page. The narrative form of newspaper articles and the strict limits on time and space usually mean "the account is stripped of context and history, leaving only the barest possible facts" (Winter, 1992:208). By simply leaving out detail in an article a journalist is able to change the scope and context of an article with relative ease. Often this simplification can reflect a political philosophy that a particular newspaper ascribes to.

Journalists are "trained to be desensitized to the voices and life-worlds of the working-class and minority people" (McCormack, 1972:32-33). They are also trained in locating and treating "the news" so that it is "credible" and "important". "Credibility", "importance", and "objectivity" - these elusive categories are neither arbitrary nor fixed. They are flexible enough to shift with the expectations and experience of news executives and high-level sources, yet definite enough to justify journalists' claim to professional standards (Gitlin, 1980).

The newspaper industry claims to reserve "journalistic opinion" for editorials only while the facts are presented in "news stories" (Gans, 1979, Gitlin, 1980). The concept of objectivity in journalism has an insulating quality in that journalists assert their "objectivity" when their neutrality
is questioned.

Journalists' ideals are fluid enough to protect them from seeing that their autonomy is bounded: that by going about their business in a professional way, they systematically frame the news to be compatible with the newspaper's political philosophy. Journalists thus "sustain the dominant frames through the banal, everyday momentum of their routines. Their autonomy keeps within the boundaries of the hegemonic system" (Gitlin, 1980:269).

To maintain the notion of "objectivity" in journalism top newspaper managers develop an environment of autonomy in which the forms of social control are "indirect, subtle, and not at all necessarily conscious" (Gitlin, 1980:259). Promotions for journalists are based on the past reporting performances (Gans, 1979; Gitlin, 1980). Therefore, one of the mechanisms to control the way in which journalists write their articles or editorials is by promoting those journalists who write in what the editors and owners consider the "correct ideological way". This also demonstrates to junior journalists the way in which the news is to be reported - or framed - before they will achieve occupational advancement.

When hired, journalists are expected to, and through the routines of their job, form contacts with sources which they depend on for stories (Gans, 1979). Gitlin would argue that this is when journalists begin to "absorb the world
views of the powerful". However, as earlier stated there are some disputes between journalists and institutional sources that occur in the newspaper industry. Conflicts of policy between journalists and sources, or journalists and editors are still within the field of terms which do not "overstep the hegemonic boundary" (Gitlin, 1980:263).

Several general assumptions are shared by journalists that pertain to the values reported in the news. These specifically are:

that the news involves novel events, not the underlying, enduring conditions; the person, not the group; the visible conflict, not the consensus; the fact that "advances the story", not the one that explains or enlarges it. (Gitlin, 1980:263)

Only where coverage under these rules contradicts institutional interests, or is interpreted to be at odds with, or falls into a neutral area where no interests are clearly defined is there basis for conflict between journalists and newspaper elites over the reporting of news (Gans, 1979; Gitlin, 1980).

The newspaper industry seeks order in the reporting of the news. The orderly format ends up promoting social stability. Gitlin asserts that this "is what much of the audience longs for: a sense that whatever is wrong in the world, it can be put right by authoritative (almost always official) agencies." (Gitlin, 1980:266). Even if the story is about disorder it is "likely returned to order by benign
official aegis" (Gans, 1979:54). Stories about destabilizing conflicts - such as the Oka crisis - usually end up confirming the core hegemonic principles (Gitlin, 1980).

Journalists stereotype events considered news as well as stereotyping how they report the news. However, as Harvey Molotch asserts, news stereotypes are not frozen. Molotch states that "news is a rather undefined state of affairs (Molotch, 1977). Essentially news is what journalists within the newspaper industry define and present as news. As Gitlin (1980) states, news "is historical and contestable; all deep social conflicts are in part conflicts over what is news." (Gitlin, 1980:273)

Although newspapers and journalists claim to be completely objective, an exact definition of "objectivity" is never agreed upon (Gans, 1979). Gitlin provides the example of asking a journalist what constitutes news; most journalists' response is "what is important". However, what journalists do not identify is who considers it important. It also depends on who is asking the questions and what questions are asked. It is apparent that hegemony plays a significant role in what is defined and reported as news. Journalists' upper middle-class background, education, and their upper middle-class lifestyle are all significant variables determining how the news is defined and reported.

The autonomy of journalists is an important aspect of the role of hegemony in the reporting of the news. Herbert
Gans reports that a journalist asserted, "I am as autonomous as I could expect to be" (Gans, 1979:96). Gitlin reveals the significance of autonomy in journalism when he states that "journalists thus sustain the dominant frames through the banal, everyday momentum of their routines" (Gitlin 1980:269).

2.6 HEGEMONY IN CONFRONTATIONAL NEWS

When confrontational events occur journalists almost always are sent to "cover the story". These events place journalists in the precarious position in which oppositional world views that must be acknowledged are present within the larger and more powerful dominant ideologies. Hegemony plays an important role in determining how journalists report the news of these confrontational events.

Gitlin asserts that the reporting of confrontational events incorporates routines of objectivity that are adaptable. Although the main sources of news are official, journalists also need other sources; "they must survey society for signs of instability, they must produce dramatic news, and thus they are vulnerable to the news-making claims of unofficial groups" (Gitlin, 1980:270). Because the idea of "objectivity" and the standards of "newsworthiness" are loose, the hegemonic routines of news coverage are vulnerable to the demands of oppositional and deviant
groups.

Through the everyday workings of journalism, large scale social conflict is imported into the news institution and reproduced there: reproduced however, in terms derived from the dominant ideology. (Gitlin, 1980:271)

News routines represent demands, individuals, and frames which do not contradict dominant hegemonic principles. Such principles include:

- the legitimacy of private control of commodity production;
- the legitimacy of the national security State;
- the legitimacy of technocratic experts;
- the right and ability of authorized agencies to manage conflict and make the necessary reforms;
- the legitimacy of the social order secured and defined by the dominant elites; and
- the value of individualism as the measure of social existence. (Gitlin, 1980:271)

Journalistic routines simply do not represent the demands of movements and events that are "inchoate, subtle, and most deeply subversive" of these principles (Gans, 1979; Gitlin, 1980).

A demonstration, Gitlin asserts, is reported as a potential or actual disruption of legitimate order - not as a sign of social problems as it may be in reality. These assumptions automatically divert critical attention away from the institutional operation of property and State (Gans, 1979; Gitlin, 1980). Journalists' autonomy is contained within the boundaries of these principles of reporting any altercation as a story of social disorder.
The autonomy of journalists to report confrontational events, then, is relative in that journalists are bound by their hegemonic principles to frame events in their articles in such a misrepresentative manner.

Journalists' ideals are based on routines that are steady enough to maintain hegemonic principles and flexible enough to absorb many new and opposing facts. These frames and routines legitimate the political and economic system as a whole. When oppositional or confrontational movements' claims about reality are taken on and verified by journalists, the "hegemonic frame begins to shift" (Gitlin, 1980:273). However, any changes in the hegemonic frames are changes in degree only. The hegemonic principles of property and State as previously discussed still prevail. Gans (1979) reports that in the case of crisis or confrontation the normal hegemonic routines threaten to undermine hegemonic ideology. When journalists submit news articles that are sympathetic to radicals, editors are likely to intervene in the news process in order to sustain the hegemonic principles (Gans, 1979).

2.7 THE STATE, LEGITIMATION, AND THE MEDIA

The newspaper industry influences the climate in which members of the public form opinions on an issue. It is apparent in times of crisis that the state is used as the
primary source of information and interpretation. The major
source of the disposition to comply with leadership rests in
the political socialization of the masses (Armstrong, 1972).
Therefore, the legitimate power and the legitimate
authoritarian power of the state needs to be theoretically
examined during national crisis.

Giddens (1979, 1981) asserts that power (paralleling
hegemonic principles) is "double-edged" in that it typically
combines some amount of repression from above and legitimate
compliance from below. Power operates not only though
formal rules and laws but also from informal rules and
traditions and the passivity of subordinates. As Armstrong
(1972:303) declares, ordinary members "weigh the statements
of opinion leaders and heed those they see as trustworthy".

Giddens (1981) further states that political
institutions operate primarily in the political structures
of the state and are concerned with "authorization" or the
domination of people. In Giddens's opinion, Poulantzas is
partly correct to represent the state as a structure or
framework within which power is exercised by classes (or
other interest groups) external to it. However, this does
not negate the fact that these structured relations between
positions within the state are also occupied by real people
as well, by state leaders, bureaucrats, and lesser officials
who retain special capacities or powers of their own
(Giddens, 1981:218-220). Giddens seems to follow Weber's
theoretical approach to some degree when he asserts that the state’s bases for domination are twofold. The first is the monopoly of organized violence inherent in the state’s repressive (police and military) branches. Second is the capacity of these branches to store information and strategic knowledge for surveillance purposes (Giddens, 1985:14-16). These two means of domination allow the state a significant amount of legitimate power.

A strategy employed by the state attempting to gain support is to convince system members that an enemy poses a severe threat warranting stringent measures (Armstrong, 1972). Ginsberg (1986) asserts that political forces such as the state use a number of basic ideologies to expand or bolster their support and reinforce their pragmatic claims. One of the main strategies is what he calls moralistic ideologies. Moralistic ideologies are employed by the state when they,

put forward ideas that plausibly link them and their allies with ethical and virtuous ideals while stigmatizing their opponents by identifying them with depravity and vice. (Ginsberg, 1986:121)

By magnifying the enemy, one depicts an evil which is easy to hate. Naming a villain "ascribes to him a status which places him beyond the pale of civilized society, and defines him as deserving of harsh and severe sanctions" (Klapp, 1956:339-340). Armstrong found that during the October crisis the definition of the extent of the threat
was vague enough to escape close scrutiny at the time of the crisis. Villain labels are sufficiently vivid to evoke an emotional response demanding strong measures.

In times of moral crisis, vilification movements tend to arise spontaneously in an urge to find and punish culprits. The need for culprits may be so great as to provoke outright scapegoating, creating a widespread feeling of moral alarm... Vituperation, suspicions, and investigations are directed as much to giving public satisfaction as to solving the problem (Klapp, 1956:61).

2.8 THE NOTION OF POWER IN THE NEWSPAPER INDUSTRY

It is apparent that the journalists’ framing of events considered newsworthy and the depictions of those individuals not representing the interests of the capitalist political and economic system in their articles are powerful licences of identification as well as the creation of knowledge. To Foucault, power and knowledge are inseparable and form what he calls a power/knowledge spiral (Foucault, 1977). Foucault argues that power itself creates new objects of knowledge and accumulates new bodies of information. Knowledge is its own form of power, whether or not the knowledge is self-deceptive. In the hands of the "state intelligensia" ideas obviously serve purposes other than those stated, such as ideological purposes. Foucault’s power/knowledge spiral is a concept "in which control ideologies are utilitarian forms of knowledge, "alibis" for
the exercise of power" (Foucault, 1977:27).

Armstrong’s study illustrates that in times of crisis, it is the political leadership which is given access to the media and the media, for the most part, gives overwhelming support to that leadership. The translation of government rhetoric to the public through the media tends to establish particular opinions in the public which in turn supports the government but remains passive in the process, being manipulated both by political power centres and the means of communication. Ultimately in the absence of stress, legitimacy of authority "is not put to the test, but in crisis, the measure of support for cardinal values is empirically tested, their meaning is amplified, and their content is reinforced and rejected" (Easton, 1965:198).

The notion of the state controlling or having the power to rule its citizens’ opinions has been explicated by authors such as Orwell in his classic novel 1984. Alexis de Tocqueville warned of the states control over public opinion. De Tocqueville (in Ginsberg, 1986) further warned that the chief threat to freedom in the modern era was not that the state would rule opinion but that opinion would rule the state. He asserted that governmental responsiveness to opinion encouraged citizens to believe that the state was simply a servant to whom vast powers could be safely granted. As a result, he warned, it was the government ruled by opinion that would rule absolutely.
Essentially it is deference to public opinion that functions to expand the modern state's power (Ginsberg, 1986). As de Tocqueville foresaw, the citizens of liberal democracies have granted vast powers to their governments believing that "what they bestow upon their rulers is bestowed upon themselves" (Ginsberg, 1986: x).

2.9 HEGEMONY, AUDIENCE CONFIDENCE AND PERCEPTION

The newspaper industry would not exist if it were not for its mass audience. Newspapers' main source of revenue is not from the selling of the newspaper but the selling of advertisement space. Newspapers with larger and more desireable audiences are able to charge higher advertising rates. Therefore, the role of the newspapers' audience is significant in the political philosophy of a newspaper. The goal of a newspaper is to assemble the largest and richest possible audience because it is this type of audience that will generate the most advertising revenue.

Gitlin (1980) asserts that newspapers are willing to risk offending a particular corporate interest in order to maintain or increase consumer confidence. The media, and newspapers in particular, believe they are "advertiser-supported [and] must take into account the general objectives and desires of advertisers as a whole" (Gitlin, 1980: 280). However, the newspaper industry's
audience-aided profit motives are compatible with journalists' routines of objectivity (Gans, 1979; Gitlin, 1980). A journalist's story critical of a particular corporate entity is perceived by the audience as a "good common-sense" story, thus ratifying the hegemonic frames (Gitlin, 1980). Essentially the newspaper industry has a general interest in stabilizing the capitalist political and economic order, and it is this interest which is compatible with journalists' hegemonic routines and the dominant news frames.

Newspapers ... survive on the advertising revenues that come from business. Journalism can thrive only so long as the business community remains healthy enough to provide these funds. Business, on the other hand, depends upon journalism to foster its own growth - through the dissemination of information through news and advertising (Gitlin, 1980:281).

Precisely for this reason the relations among the newspaper industry, corporations, and the State are intrinsically thick with conflict (Gans, 1979).

The whole hegemonic process in journalism operates "in a reformist key" (Gitlin, 1980). It exposes particular business and State violations of the core hegemonic principles. Corporate "violations" exposed by the newspaper industry - bribery, health and environmental hazards - are the exception. The newspaper's hegemonic frames usually play down the impact of these violations by "blaming 'the public', by speaking from the angle of consumers and not
workers, and by refraining from attempts at general explanation and radical solution" (Gitlin, 1980:282).

This frail reformist attitude by the newspaper industry does not threaten the legitimacy of the capitalist political and economic system. The media seek symbiosis with capital as demonstrated in the routines of "objective" journalism. The newspaper industry, hoping to profit from the production and dissemination of opinion and information, generally devotes the bulk of its attention, particularly in the area of politics, to matters it deems likely to interest the powerful upper income groups in society. Ideas thought unlikely to interest these strata and capitalism in general are usually criticized or ignored.

2.10 CONCLUSION

The concept of hegemony explains how the dominant ideology is propagated by the newspaper industry under the guises of "objective" journalism and freedom of the press. As Gitlin states:

Indeed, the hegemonic ideology of bourgeois culture is extremely complex and absorptive; only by absorbing and domesticating conflicting values, definitions of reality, and demands on it, in fact does it remain hegemonic (Gitlin, 1980:256).

Hegemony is a historical process in which one picture of the world is systematically preferred over others,

54
usually through practical routines and at times through extraordinary measures. Hegemony operates effectively - it does deliver the news - yet outside consciousness; "it is exercised by self-conceived professionals working with a great deal of autonomy within institutions that proclaim the neutral goal of informing the public" (Gitlin, 1980:258). Simply by doing their jobs journalists tend to serve the political and economic elite definitions of reality.

I intend to demonstrate through my thematic analysis in Chapter Four that the newspaper industry does frame the news and that there are ideological elements within newspaper articles and editorials. However, I will also show it is not easy to predict or explain how ideology will be constructed in a particular newspaper on the basis of that newspaper's distinguishing characteristics as the literature suggests. The theoretical concept of hegemony allows for a much more sophisticated explanation of how the newspaper industry in Canada has ideologically represented news events such as the Oka crisis.
CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

The major daily newspaper industry in Canada is large and diverse. The Canadian newspaper industry’s portrayal of the events at Oka in the summer of 1990 will undoubtedly vary to some degree from newspaper to newspaper. The task of deciding how methodologically to analyze the major daily newspaper industry becomes a major concern.

The research design of this thesis will consist of a content and thematic analysis. I will examine, as my unit of analysis, major English-language daily newspapers throughout Canada - with a concerted effort to include newspapers from all geographic regions. The newspapers I have selected on the basis of this criterion are as follows: The Montreal Gazette, The Citizen from Ottawa, The Calgary Herald, Edmonton Journal, The Vancouver Sun, The Globe and Mail from Toronto, Winnipeg Free Press, Toronto Star, The Calgary Sun, The Edmonton Sun, The Halifax Chronicle Herald, The St. John’s Evening Telegram, The Leader-Post from Regina, The Star-Phoenix from Saskatoon, and The Charlottetown Guardian and Patriot.

56
The analysis will consist of an examination of all articles and editorials that focus on the Oka crisis from the above mentioned newspapers from Monday, July 16 to Friday, July 20, 1990 inclusive.

The rationale for choosing this particular week to analyze these newspapers is twofold. The first is that the death of corporal Lemay had already occurred on the prior Wednesday. It may be argued that this was a central incident within the crisis. Secondly, manifesting from the shooting death of corporal Lemay was the significant national media attention received by the Oka crisis.

3.2 THE RATIONALE OF THEMATIC ANALYSES

Qualitative, or thematic analysis, emphasizes the fluidity of text and content in the interpretive understanding of culture (Ericson, 1991). Although qualitative analysis is a subjective measure it has valid assessment abilities. As Ericson (1991) states, the role of the analyst is to "construct a reading" of the text. Dworkin (1986) states that the qualitative analyst must try to understand with the producers and users of texts; he or she must engage in "constructive interpretation". Interpretation, understanding, and application are all part of the same process in which the analyst makes judgements and ultimately presents claims that compete with
those of the people involved in the practice he or she is analyzing (Ericson, 1991). Qualitative content analysts are primarily concerned with discovery and verification through quasi-experimental reasoning. Hall (1975) states,

[Qualitative content analysts] point, in detail, to the text on which an interpretation of latent meaning is based; they indicate more briefly the fuller support or contextual evidence which lies to hand; they take into account material which modifies or disproves the hypotheses that are emerging; and they should indicate in detail why one rather than another reading of the material seems to the analyst the most plausible way of understanding it... The really significant item may not be the one which continually recurs, but the one which stands out as an exception from the general pattern - but which is also given, in its exceptional content, the greatest weight (Hall, 1975:15).

Researchers have shown that when analyzing continuing stories and news themes, some patterns and systematic relationships can be captured only through qualitative research techniques (Ericson, 1991). Ethnographic readings of content will allow for the fluid nature of text and content. On these counts a qualitative analysis of articles and editorials on the Oka crisis, in terms of thematic categorization, will provide a useful basis for examination of the portrayal of the events of the Oka crisis.

3.3 THE DEPENDENT VARIABLE

The dependent variable in this analysis will be the
thematic categorization of the articles and editorials on the Oka crisis in each of the newspapers in this analysis. As earlier suggested the thematic categorization will be of a qualitative nature. I conducted a pre-test of articles from The Vancouver Sun, The Montreal Gazette, and The Saskatoon Star-Phoenix from the week of July 9 to July 13, 1990, to determine the number and types of themes that emerged. I found that four major themes emerged: (i) law and order, (ii) death of Lemay, (iii) Natives' story and (iv) Native rights and history.

3.3.1 THEME I - LAW AND ORDER

The first theme I will call a law and order theme. This theme essentially includes dialogue in an article or editorial that advocates para-military or government intervention to end the Natives' blockade at Kahnawake. This theme communicates a very anti-Native tone. A clear example of an article with a law and order theme would be an article found in the July 18, 1990 edition of The Calgary Sun. It is titled "Soldiers on standby in Mohawk dispute". The first sentence of the article is as follows:

The Armed Forces have been put on standby in the standoff between Mohawks and police... Chateauguay suburb residents goaded police - and howled for a military strike. "We want the army," the crowd of 2,000 shouted. (Calgary Sun, July 18, 1990)
It is apparent that this article focuses on the protest against the Mohawks and that the support of para-military force is supported by the Chateauguay residents. While there is support for intervention by police and military in this article there is obviously no support for the Mohawks and their position. The average reader for whom it was intended would gloss over the words and develop the intended picture of non-support for the Mohawks by military strike.

From a journalistic standpoint the above paragraph is a textbook example of an opening paragraph. It is written in narrative form, it is factual, precise, and written with a definite separation between story-teller and subject (Winter, 1992). In keeping with the customs of the profession of journalism this paragraph is also stripped of context and history, leaving only the barest facts (Winter, 1992). The phrases "The Armed Forces have been put on standby" and "howled for a military strike," conjure an image of civil or "acceptable" protesters protesting against the unlawful and immoral Mohawk protesters' tactics. Similar journalistic characteristics were found in all articles within this theme. Other articles categorized in the law and order theme used words like "illegal" and "militant".
3.3.2 THEME II - DEATH OF LEMAY

The second theme focuses on the death of corporal Lemay. Although this may appear to be a neutral theme quite often it conveyed government and police rhetoric. A similar kind of interpretation was found by Armstrong in her analysis of the FLQ crisis in that the funeral of Laporte was used to attain legitimacy for the government. This theme was then also decidedly "anti-native" in that it indirectly accused natives for Lemay's death, as suggested in the example below, while it is apparent that this point is still contentious. A July 17, 1990, article also in The Calgary Sun exhibits this theme. The article is titled "Slain Officer Mourned". The first sentences proceed as follows:

The pregnant widow of Quebec provincial police Cpl. Marcel Lemay bowed her head and sobbed as the Last Post echoed in the old stone cathedral here yesterday. Lemay, 31, was shot and killed last Wednesday during a pre-dawn police tactical squad raid on a Mohawk blockade of disputed land at Oka, 30km west of Montreal. (Calgary Sun, July 17, 1990)

Corporal Lemay's widow is described as pregnant and "bowed her head and sobbed". This is to elicit a response not of sorrow for Lemay's widow but an anger response directed at the Mohawks for Lemay's death. The anger and blame that this paragraph incites from Lemay's death acts as
a delegitimization tool for the Mohawks' cause. In other articles categorized under the "Lemay's funeral" theme portrayed the Mohawks as atypical, violent and criminally deviant.

3.3.3 THEME III - NATIVE'S STORY

The third theme focuses on the Natives' "story" or situation in the Oka crisis. This theme provides accounts of Natives' interpretations and the problems they face at the blockade. Because the Natives and Native sources are the focus of these articles and editorials, a "pro-native" approach is undertaken. A July 16, 1990 article found in The Saskatoon Star-Phoenix, titled "Ottawa provoking Indian war", represents this theme. The first sentence of the article is as follows:

The standoff between Quebec police and Mohawk Indians will spark native warfare across the country, warns a lawyer for the Algonquin Indians of Barriere Lake. (Saskatoon Star-Phoenix, July 16, 1990)

This article obviously cites Native supported sources. Although not elaborated in this sentence, from the title of this article ("Ottawa provoking Indian war") and the tone it has established it is apparent that this article is "pro-Native" and focuses on the Natives' issues and Natives' story. This style of article was typical of all articles categorized within this theme.
3.3.4 THEME IV - NATIVE HISTORY

The fourth theme focuses on the larger topic of Native rights and the history of Native peoples in Canada. This theme was most often found in editorials expounding many of the injustices perpetuated on Natives in Canada. This is also a "pro-native" theme because it illustrates Native rights. A July 20, 1990 article in the Toronto Globe and Mail titled "Quebec human rights group refused entry to Mohawk area" represents this theme. The first sentence of this article is as follows:

Provincial police refused access yesterday to officials of the Quebec Human Rights Commission who are investigating reports of rights abuses at the Oka blockade, as police tightened their grip on the community. Rennee Lescop, Pierre Lepage and Jacques Bergeron told reporters they could not understand why they were refused permission to cross police barricades yesterday.

(Toronto Globe and Mail, July 20 1990)

The body of this article, as is suggested in the title, addresses the topic of human rights and the possibility that Mohawks' human rights may have been violated at Oka. This article, and other articles with this theme, further question the way in which the police and government handled the standoff at Oka and imply it has been at the expense of Native rights.

These four themes, as I have demonstrated, can be further dichotomized. The first category can be called
"anti-Native" themes and includes the law and order theme and the Lemay funeral theme. The second group is the "pro-Native" themes that include the Natives' "story" and the Native rights and history theme.

The analysis of the dependent variable enables a frequency distribution of themes on an individual newspaper basis (to be specified later). This distribution of themes on a newspaper basis allows for an examination of independent variables that will aid in explaining why the portrayal of the events at Oka differed among newspapers.

3.4 THE INDEPENDENT VARIABLES

There are four independent variables in this analysis. These variables were chosen on the basis of the literature and previous examinations of the Canadian media. Porter (1965) and Clement (1975) assert that the ownership structure of the Canadian newspaper industry is a significant variable in its interpretation of reality (Porter, 1965, Clement, 1975). This hypothesis suggests that the corporate structure determines the portrayal of events through mechanisms such as the editorials of a newspaper. Armstrong's (1972) analysis of the media's representation of the F.L.Q. crisis determined that the political leadership was given access to the media and the media gave its support to the political leadership. Finally, Ponting and Gibbins
(1980) found that the level of sympathy to Natives and Native issues differs across Canada on a regional basis.

The literature suggests that these are important variables that might explain the newspaper industry's portrayal of the events at Oka. Therefore, on the basis of this literature I have chosen the following four independent variables: the editorial solution of the articles and editorials in a newspaper, the corporate structure of the newspaper, the type of sources utilized in a newspaper's articles and editorials, and the geographic region of each newspaper in this analysis.

3.4.1 EDITORIAL SOLUTION

The first independent variable is what I term "editorial solutions". Editorials and articles will advocate or approve one of two possible solutions to end the Oka crisis. The first is intervention by paramilitary (i.e., police or the army) forces that would essentially separate and terminate the Natives' struggle. The second possible solution would clearly be non-intervention by paramilitary forces and an advocacy of peaceful negotiated solutions to the crisis. This dichotomization on the basis of editorial solution will provide a basis to determine if the editorial solution proposed in an article is correlated with the theme of the article.
3.4.2 CORPORATE STRUCTURE

The second independent variable is the corporate structure of the company, or parent company, of the newspaper. This variable has been trichotomized into horizontal integration ownership or linked companies forming a newspaper only chain, cross-ownership or the control over more than one medium, and conglomerate ownership involving a company with diverse holdings such as energy, manufacturing and communications which may appear to be unrelated (McQuail, 1984). For simplicity I will categorize ownership structure in the following manner: (i) small "newspaper only" companies, (ii) medium sized corporations that own numerous media organizations, (iii) and large corporate structures which own non-media as well as the newspaper being analyzed. For example, the newspapers in this analysis are part of five different Canadian newspaper chains.

The largest newspaper chain in Canada (in terms of number of newspapers) is the Thomson newspaper chain which publishes 38 dailies. Of the newspapers in this analysis, it owns the St. John's Evening Telegram, The Charlottetown Guardian and Patriot, The Globe and Mail, and the Winnipeg Free Press. In 1990 the Thomson newspaper chain's share of Canadian newspaper readership on a daily basis was 20.7% (Newspaper Marketing Bureau, 1992). All of the newspapers in
the Thomson newspaper chain would be classified as a large corporate structure based on the criteria listed above.

The second major daily newspaper chain in Canada is Southam Newspapers. Although Southam has only eighteen newspapers they would be considered major Canadian newspapers, of which five are included in this analysis. They are The Montreal Gazette, The Ottawa Citizen, The Edmonton Journal, The Calgary Herald, and The Vancouver Sun. In 1990 Southam Newspapers' share of the Canadian newspaper readership on a daily basis was 27.8% (Newspaper Marketing Bureau, 1992). Based on the aforementioned criteria, newspapers within the Southam chain will be classified as part of a large newspaper chain.

The third chain in which newspapers in this analysis appear is the Sun Publishing Group. The Sun Publishing Group consists of five newspapers with an 11.1% share of the Canadian newspaper readership on a daily basis in 1990 (Newspaper Marketing Bureau, 1992). Two of the Sun Publishing Group's newspapers, The Calgary Sun and The Edmonton Sun, appear in this analysis. The Sun Publishing Group will be classified as a large corporate structure because media giant Maclean Hunter is a part owner of the Sun Publishing Group.

The fourth chain to be analyzed is Torstar. Torstar officially owns only one newspaper, the Toronto Star, but it also is part owner of fourteen other smaller newspapers
Therefore, on the basis of the criteria already developed, Torstar will be considered a small corporate structure.

The fifth newspaper chain to be examined is Armadale Communications. Armadale owns two newspapers in this analysis, the Regina Leader-Post and the Saskatoon Star-Phoenix. Armadale's 1990 share of the Canadian newspaper readership on a daily basis was 2.4% with almost a complete monopoly in Saskatchewan (Newspaper Marketing Bureau, 1992). Armadale is involved in and owns other types of media outlets throughout Saskatchewan and Manitoba. Again, based on the criteria already selected, the newspapers under Armadale's corporate structure will be considered medium sized.

The final newspaper, The Halifax Chronicle Herald, is independently owned and operated. Because it has no larger corporate structure it will be considered a newspaper with a small corporate structure.

3.4.3 TYPE OF SOURCE

The third independent variable in this analysis is the "type" of source used in the article or editorial. The type of source cited will be trichotomized into: (i) "Native or pro-Native sources", (ii) official state, police, military or "non-Native sources" or government, police or military
etc. sources, and (iii) alternating sources which begin with "non-Native sources before citing Native sources". This third category of "non-Native then Native source" is an important consideration because research on the habits of newspaper readers indicates that most readers read the first few sentences of an article or "scan" the article and if it is not of particular interest to them they do not read the whole article (Newspaper Marketing Bureau, 1992). Most newspaper readers also "scan" the front page of a newspaper to get a highlight of the news (Gans, 1979). Therefore, because most of the articles on the Oka crisis were located on the front page of the newspapers in this analysis and many readers only read the first part of an article, the location of "opposing" sources is a significant consideration. A frequency distribution and cross tabulation will be constructed indicating the relationship of this variable with the theme of the editorial or article. Specification models controlling for other independent variables will also be constructed.

3.4.4 REGION

The fourth and final independent variable is region. Regional diversity in people's attitudes and opinions in complex activities are apparent (Ginsberg, 1986). However, Ginsberg (1986) found considerable similarity of outlook on
basic political questions across all regions. Region is
categorized essentially on a provincial basis. The reason
I have used provinces as regional categories is because it
is difficult to suggest that larger Canadian regions are
distinct. For example, it would be incorrect to assume that
within what is usually identified as the prairie region, the
provinces of Alberta, Manitoba, and Saskatchewan are similar
in terms of political philosophies and ideologies.

The following provinces constitute the regions within
this analysis: British Columbia, Alberta, Saskatchewan,
Manitoba, Ontario, Quebec, and the Maritime provinces. Low
population in the Maritime provinces lead to the collapse of
the four provinces into one regional category. Also the two
territories are excluded because of the limited number of
daily newspapers printed in the extreme north and the low
readership levels. However, this regional categorization
does not come without problems. Some of the regions within
the analysis only have one newspaper that qualifies for
inclusion in the sample. For example, Quebec only has The
Montreal Gazette, Manitoba only has The Winnipeg Free Press,
and British Columbia only has the Vancouver Sun.

A frequency distribution of themes per region is also
presented. Also a first order table controlling for the
proportion of the native population within each region will
be presented. Ponting and Gibbins (1980) found through the
employment of the Indian Sympathy Index that "the region in
which respondents lived had a marked impact on their orientations towards Indians and Indian issues" (Ponting and Gibbins, 1980:89). They found that the western provinces were least sympathetic to Native issues and Quebec and Ontario were the most sympathetic to Native issues.

For each cross tabulation two tests of significance will be performed. The first measure will be a correlation coefficient indicating the strength of the association. The second is a Yule’s Q coefficient providing a less conservative measure of association. This will determine which independent variable categories in each newspaper are related to which particular theme. Summary statistics for each independent variable in each newspaper will also be provided.

3.5 CONCLUSION

The rationale of this statistical analysis is based on the variables the literature suggests are important. The nature of these variables dictates that the statistical analysis is descriptive in nature. However, the calculation of correlation coefficients will indicate the relative importance of each of the independent variables to the dependent variable or the theme of the articles and editorials in each of the newspapers. The goal of this statistical analysis is to test the variables the literature
suggests are important in how the newspaper industry portrays reality as well as to demonstrate the role of the concept of hegemony in the portrayal of the Oka crisis by the Canadian newspaper industry.
CHAPTER 4: FINDINGS

4.1 INTRODUCTION

The thematic portrayal of an article on the Oka crisis, or the dependent variable in this analysis, essentially provide an instantaneous glance at how the Canadian newspaper industry represented the events at Oka. This chapter provides an extensive statistical examination and interpretation of the thematic position of the articles and editorials focusing on the Oka crisis in each of the newspapers in this analysis. I also provide a statistical analysis and interpretation of the previously discussed independent variables correlated with the dependent variable in this chapter. The statistical interpretation of the variables and the analysis of the newspapers' thematic portrayal is then employed to substantiate how the theoretical concept of hegemony explains the Canadian newspaper industry's portrayal of the Oka crisis.

To be sure, the Oka crisis comprised numerous complex and intertwined events and incidents. However, as Gitlin (1980) states, the media utilize frames to simplify complex events and repackage them into simple and understandable situations for their audience. The use of wire service
articles and the buying and selling of editorials indicates that the overall portrayal of the Oka crisis will not deviate to a large extent. Although there is an overarching similarity in the newspaper industry's portrayal of the Oka crisis the theoretical concept of hegemony suggests that some differences exist so that the concept of freedom of the press is not questioned. As well, this allows "space" for real differences in newspapers' portrayals.

Newspapers, as finished products, vary in several ways. For example, a newspaper published in a large metropolis will vary considerably in content and style from a newspaper originating in a smaller centre and with a different target audience. In order to develop an understanding of how the Canadian newspaper industry portrayed the events at the Oka crisis a frequency distribution of the four key themes (the dependent variable) found in each of the analyzed newspapers is necessary (see Table 4.1). Newspapers are in rank order from most "anti-Native" to most "pro-Native".

4.2 FREQUENCY DISTRIBUTIONS

Within the time frame of this analysis the fifteen newspapers' weekday editions published 208 articles and/or editorials (or an average of 13.9 articles per newspaper) on the events of the Oka crisis (see Table 4.1). Most of the articles written about the Oka crisis were found on the
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Newspaper</th>
<th>Law and Death of Lemay</th>
<th>Native Story</th>
<th>Native Rights</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>St. John’s Evening</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telegram</td>
<td>[70.50%]</td>
<td>[14.25%]</td>
<td>[14.25%]</td>
<td>[100%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>[66.60%]</td>
<td>[8.30%]</td>
<td>[16.60%]</td>
<td>[100%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>[75%]</td>
<td>[25%]</td>
<td>[100%]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>[63.60%]</td>
<td>[18%]</td>
<td>[9%]</td>
<td>[100%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montreal</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gazette</td>
<td>[59.40%]</td>
<td>[21.90%]</td>
<td>[15.60%]</td>
<td>[100%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizen</td>
<td>[56%]</td>
<td>[40%]</td>
<td>[100%]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Globe and Mail</td>
<td>[53.30%]</td>
<td>[33.30%]</td>
<td>[6.60%]</td>
<td>[100%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlottetown</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guardian</td>
<td>[50%]</td>
<td>[25%]</td>
<td>[16.60%]</td>
<td>[100%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herald</td>
<td>[44.40%]</td>
<td>[44.40%]</td>
<td>[0]</td>
<td>[100%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Star</td>
<td>[42.30%]</td>
<td>[50%]</td>
<td>[100%]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Halifax</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chronicle Herald</td>
<td>[50%]</td>
<td>[33.30%]</td>
<td>[16.60%]</td>
<td>[100%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Free Press</td>
<td>[33.30%]</td>
<td>[55.50%]</td>
<td>[0]</td>
<td>[100%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regina</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leader Post</td>
<td>[42.80%]</td>
<td>[57.20%]</td>
<td>[100%]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal</td>
<td>[33.30%]</td>
<td>[46.60%]</td>
<td>[13.30%]</td>
<td>[100%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saskatoon</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Star Phoenix</td>
<td>[28.6%]</td>
<td>[42.80%]</td>
<td>[28.60%]</td>
<td>[100%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N=</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mean=</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>percentage=</td>
<td>51.50%</td>
<td>6.10%</td>
<td>34.50%</td>
<td>7.10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N= 106, mean= 7.1, percentage= 51.50%.
front page or on a page on which numerous articles about the crisis were published. The Canadian newspaper industry, it may then be argued, perceived the events at Oka to be important news because of the allocation of considerable front page space to the crisis. However, accounting for the size and style of the newspaper, the space and number of articles and editorials committed to an event, such as that at Oka, would indicate the relative importance that that particular newspaper places on the event in question (e.g. see Table 4.3 below).

For example, The Halifax Chronicle Herald published six articles or editorials, the least published, on the Oka crisis during the week analyzed. Although the Halifax Chronicle Herald is one of the smallest newspapers in terms of readership in the analysis, it is not the smallest. The Charlottetown Guardian and Patriot has a smaller readership but published twelve, or twice as many, articles/editorials on the events of the Oka crisis during the week in question. Newspapers with large readerships generally published more articles/editorials during the week analyzed. For example, The Montreal Gazette published thirty-two articles/editorials - more than any other newspaper - on the Oka crisis. The Toronto Star, also one of the largest newspapers in terms of daily readership, published twenty-six articles/editorials while two of the larger newspapers in the analysis published considerably fewer articles.
While the Toronto Globe and Mail and the Vancouver Sun published fifteen and eight articles/editorials, respectively, on the Oka crisis, these totals were the same as or fewer than considerably smaller newspapers such as the Ottawa Citizen, which published twenty-five, and the Saskatoon Star-Phoenix, which published fourteen articles/editorials. (see Table 4.1). What this indicates is that each newspaper, regardless of size, provided a different amount of coverage to the Oka crisis. This coverage essentially indicates the priority that a particular newspaper placed on the Oka crisis.

As previously mentioned, a pre-test was conducted to determine the themes prevalent in the reporting of the Oka crisis by the Canadian newspaper industry. There were four major themes that emerged: the first theme was a law and order approach advocating any para-military intervention necessary to end the conflict and quell the Mohawks' undertaking, the second theme focused on the shooting death and funeral of Corporal Lemay, the third theme focused on the Natives' "story" or Native interpretations of the events at Oka, and the fourth theme concentrated on the issue of Native rights and the history of Natives in Canada.

4.3 ANALYSIS OF THEMES

The newspaper industry in Canada, in large part, relies
on newspaper wire services for its articles. Reporting on the Oka crisis is not an exception to this trend in that the Canadian Press Wire Service provided most newspapers with a majority of their articles. However, the articles received by a newspaper over a wire service are not necessarily published in the same way that they appear from the service. Often staff journalists or editors add bits of information that they believe enhance the article or they may delete any or several portions of the article they have received from the news service. An example of how newspapers can change the same article they have received from the Canadian Press News Service may be illustrated in the following articles.

The first article appears in the July 18, 1990 edition of the Regina Leader-Post, titled "Indian leaders to meet", and is identical to an article published in the July 18, 1990 edition of the St. John's Evening Telegram, titled "Hostility now mounting over Mohawk standoffs", except that the article in the Evening Telegram is continued on the next page while the Leader-Post article concludes. The conclusion of the Evening Telegram article is as follows:

"The Mohawks have blocked off the Mercier Bridge into Montreal and, when the police tried to push us around in our own town, we pulled down their fence." Police spokesmen were unavailable to confirm the numbers of onlookers or rioters. After the skirmish with police, some residents burned an effigy of an Indian 300 metres from the Mohawks' heavily armed barricade at the entrance to the bridge. That act has been repeated by townspeople almost nightly since the crisis began last week. The mood of the residents here, who have been living
with their main access to Montreal blocked for five days appears to be growing more hostile. The bridge closure means at least an hour more travelling time to Montreal.

A group of residents has set up tables at a gas station near the police lines to collect names for a petition asking that the army be called in to settle the standoff and open the bridge. In Oka, the Mohawks of Kahniesatake - fighting the town’s proposed golf course expansion on land they claim as theirs - are studying a proposal received Tuesday from Quebec’s native affairs minister, John Ciaccia.

No talks were held Tuesday in Oka, but the Montreal Gazette reported from Ottawa that the federal government, as recently as a month ago, tried to buy the Oka golf course in hopes of settling the dispute. Federal Indian Affairs Minister Tom Siddon defended the government Tuesday, saying it had tried, through the offer, to settle the 270 year old land dispute with the Kahniesatake Mohawks. The Mohawks erected a small barricade at the site of the proposed extention about four months ago.

The town of Oka obtained an injunction to clear the barricade and, when the Mohawks defied it called in provincial police.

During an early morning gun battle last Wednesday, one police officer was killed. In support of the Mohawk cause in Oka, Kahnawake natives barricaded the Mercier Bridge, the main route north to Montreal, and threatened to blow it up if a settlement is not reached.

A Red Cross medical team went behind Indian lines at Oka on Tuesday to evaluate the health of seniors, pregnant women, children and the sick and reported it was satisfied with the conditions of those they examined. (St. John’s Evening Telegram, July 18, 1990)

This indicates that although both the Regina Leader-Post and The St. John’s Evening Telegram published an article that came from the same Canadian Press release article the resulting published articles differs markedly. Although the beginning of this article that does not appear here is somewhat neutral in regards to the Oka crisis, the conclusion that the St. John’s Evening Telegram published
was of an "anti-Native" theme. It is then apparent that the "same" story is not necessarily identical in a different newspaper and that the editing and editorial changes within a newspaper article are quite significant.

Of the four themes, articles and editorials with a law and order theme were the most common. In the fifteen newspapers in this analysis the law and order theme was prevalent in 106 articles/editorials or 51.5% of the articles, with an average of 7.1 articles for the week surveyed found in each of the newspapers (Table 4.1). Specifically, several newspapers published a considerable number of articles/editorials with a law and order theme that exceeded the average of 51.5% of all articles per newspaper. For example, the newspaper with the highest proportion of articles/editorials with a law and order theme was The Vancouver Sun with 75%. Interestingly, the Edmonton Sun and the Calgary Sun were third and fourth respectively in terms of newspapers with the highest proportion of articles/editorials with law and order themes. This is interesting because three of the four newspapers with the highest proportion of law and order themes are Sun titled newspapers. However, it is important to note that the Vancouver Sun is not part of the Sun Publishing chain of newspapers although it shares the same name. The newspapers with the lowest proportion of articles/editorials with a law and order theme were The Saskatoon Star-Phoenix with 28.6%,
The Edmonton Journal at 33.3%, and The Winnipeg Free Press at 33.3%. A final point to be made in regards to the law and order theme is that The Montreal Gazette had a significantly higher than average number of articles/editorials (19 or 59.4%) with a law and order theme. This may be attributed to the fact that the Gazette's readership is within the geographic area in which the crisis occurred and that the Gazette had several staff reporters at the scenes of the crisis.

The second theme, which focused on the shooting death of Corporal Lemay, occurred in a total of twelve articles/editorials or 6.1% of the articles with an average of .8 articles found in each of the newspapers during the week (Table 4.2). Four newspapers in this analysis, The Halifax Chronicle Herald, The Regina Leader-Post, The Saskatoon Star-Phoenix, and The Vancouver Sun, did not have any articles/editorials that focused on Corporal Lemay. However, every other newspaper in the analysis had a gratuitous article focusing on Lemay's death. Interestingly, three of the four newspapers that did not have articles with the theme of Corporal Lemay were smaller newspapers. Of these four, only The Vancouver Sun would be considered a large newspaper.

These two themes, as earlier discussed, communicate an "anti-Native" tone; therefore, 57.6% of the articles/editorials on the Oka crisis in these Canadian...
daily newspapers can be classified as "anti-Native" (see Table 4.2). This is a significant proportion of articles and editorials in a majority of newspapers, specifically those newspapers with larger audiences, that portrayed the Oka crisis in an "anti-Native" fashion. It is also interesting that two of the newspapers that did not publish articles on the death of Corporal Lemay, the Saskatoon Star-Phoenix and the Regina Leader-Post, also published the highest proportions of "pro-Native" theme articles or editorials of these newspapers (see Table 4.2).

The third theme focusing on the "Native story" was found in 72 articles/editorials or 34.5% of the articles with an average of 4.8 articles per week in each of the newspapers (see Table 4.1). It is here that a pattern of themes starts to emerge. Those newspapers with the highest number and proportion of articles with a law and order theme, such as the Calgary Sun, the Edmonton Sun, the Vancouver Sun, the St. John's Evening Telegram, and the Montreal Gazette, also have the lowest number and proportion of articles/editorials with a Native theme. At the same time newspapers such as the Regina Leader-Post (57.2%), the Winnipeg Free Press (55.5%), the Toronto Star (50%), and the Edmonton Journal (46.6%) that had the highest proportion of articles/editorials with a "Native story" theme also had among the lowest proportion of articles/editorials with a law and order theme.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Newspaper</th>
<th>Anti-Native</th>
<th>Pro-Native</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>St. John's Evening</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telegram</td>
<td>[85.75%]</td>
<td>[14.25%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton Sun</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver Sun</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary Sun</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montreal Gazette</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa Citizen</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto Globe and Mail</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlottetown Guardian</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary Herald</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto Star</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Halifax Chronicle Herald</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg Free Press</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regina Leader Post</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton Journal</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saskatoon Star Phoenix</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N= 118</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>mean= 7.9</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>percentage= 57.60%</td>
<td>41.60%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The fourth theme, focused on Native rights, in many ways blends with the "Native story" theme in that it communicates Native rights historically as well as the role of Native rights in the Oka crisis. This theme was expressed in eighteen articles/editorials or 7.1% of the articles with an average of 1.2 articles over the week found in each of the newspapers. The Saskatoon Star-Phoenix published more articles/editorials with this theme (28.6%) than any other newspaper in this analysis. At the same time seven newspapers - the St. John's Evening Telegram, the Calgary Herald, the Regina Leader-Post, the Vancouver Sun, the Winnipeg Free Press, the Toronto Star, and the Ottawa Citizen - did not publish any articles/editorials with a Native Rights theme. However, some of these newspapers did publish several other articles/editorials with a "pro-Native" theme. In fact the majority of articles/editorials published in the Regina Leader-Post and the Winnipeg Free Press are of a "pro-Native" theme. These last two themes communicate a "pro-Native" tone; therefore, 41.6% of the articles/editorials on the Oka crisis in the sampled newspapers are of a "pro-Native" nature (see Table 4.2).

According to Gitlin (1980), the employment of the concept of hegemonic ideology by the media entails that all sides of a news event, in this case including the Native's side of the Oka crisis, must receive some access to the media or the claim of media bias may be easily imputed. Although "pro-
Native" articles constitute a minority of articles/editorials at 41.6%, the label of bias cannot be applied to the newspaper industry as a whole. However, as I suggested earlier, when one analyzes newspapers individually it is apparent that on the basis of readership the majority of Canadians reading newspapers are reading a significantly higher proportion of "anti-Native" articles and editorials. This means that most of the newspapers with larger audiences or readership are the newspapers that publish more "anti-Native" articles and conversely, the newspapers that published more "pro-Native" articles, such as the Saskatoon Star-Phoenix and the Regina Leader-Post, have smaller readerships. These statistics, although descriptive in nature, are meaningful because they signify each of the newspaper’s thematic portrayal of the Oka crisis as well as denoting each newspaper’s political philosophy.

4.4 EDITORIALS

The importance a newspaper places on a "news event" may be determined by the amount of editorial space the event has been allotted (see Table 4.3). Editorial space indicate the relevance a newspaper believes a story has and provides some insight into the philosophy of that newspaper’s editorialship and correspondingly the newspaper’s philosophy. Although the actual number of editorials
TABLE 4.3 - EDITORIALS BY NEWSPAPER, 1990

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NEWSPAPER</th>
<th>NO. OF EDITORIALS/PERCENTAGE OF PUBLICATIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>St. John’s Evening Telegram</td>
<td>0 [0%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton Sun</td>
<td>2 [16.7%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver Sun</td>
<td>1 [12.5%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary Sun</td>
<td>2 [18.2%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montreal Gazette</td>
<td>4 [12.5%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa Citizen</td>
<td>2 [8%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto Globe and Mail</td>
<td>4 [26.7%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlottetown Guardian</td>
<td>1 [8.3%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary Herald</td>
<td>2 [22.2%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto Star</td>
<td>2 [7.7%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Halifax Chronicle Herald</td>
<td>0 [0%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg Free Press</td>
<td>0 [0%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regina Leader Post</td>
<td>1 [14.3%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton Journal</td>
<td>3 [20%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saskatoon Star Phoenix</td>
<td>2 [14.3%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mean</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>percentage</td>
<td>12.10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
focusing on the Oka crisis found in each of the newspapers in this analysis varies slightly from a low of zero to a high of four, the proportion of editorials to total number of articles varies significantly.

For example, three newspapers published no editorials on the Oka crisis during the week of July 16 to 20, 1990 (see Table 4.3). Two of these three, the St. John's *Evening Telegram* and the Halifax *Chronicle Herald*, are small newspapers suggesting that perhaps they have a small editorial staff or they do not have the financial resources to purchase editorials; however, the Winnipeg *Free Press*, a large daily newspaper distributed throughout Manitoba, also did not publish any editorials on Oka during this week. One may only speculate as to why this occurred but perhaps one explanation may be because of the sensitive nature of aboriginal rights in Manitoba at this particular time, most notably in the effects of Elijah Harper's non-acceptance of the Meech Lake Accord in the Manitoba legislature as well as the unfolding and revealing of the findings of *The Report of the Aboriginal Justice Inquiry of Manitoba*. The editorials that did appear in the Winnipeg *Free Press* at this time were aimed at global news issues such as the re-unification of Germany and Gorbachov's economic policies in the former Soviet Union. To be sure, the sensitive nature of Native issues in Manitoba may have been a contributing factor to the lack of editorial space on the Oka crisis provided by
At the same time The Globe and Mail published four editorials, or 26.7% of its stories, devoted to the Oka crisis (Table 4.3). This may be explained by the structure of the Globe and Mail. Although The Globe and Mail is published in Toronto it is distributed throughout Canada on a daily basis and is recognized as Canada's national newspaper. This perhaps allows for more commentary or editorial space; however, this does not analyze the nature of the commentary. The nature of the commentary will be discussed in the forthcoming analysis. The Montreal Gazette also published four editorials on Oka during this week but editorials constituted only 12.5% of the Gazette's stories (Table 4.3). The average number of editorials found in the newspapers during the week of concern was 1.7 or 12.1% of the total number of stories devoted to the Oka crisis (Table 4.3).

4.5 ANALYSIS OF EDITORIAL SOLUTIONS

The first independent variable in this analysis is the editorial solution advocated in each article or editorial. As earlier suggested, an article's editorial solution is one of two possible solutions. The first solution advocates paramilitary intervention, such as the police and army, to terminate the Natives' rebellion. The second solution
advocates non-intervention by paramilitary forces and espouses a peaceful resolution to the crisis.

The frequency distribution of the articles/editorials on a per newspaper basis (Table 4.4) reveals that, for the most part, the number of articles supporting paramilitary intervention equals those that promote paramilitary non-intervention. However, most newspapers did not follow this general pattern and many deviate significantly from the overall trend of half of the articles supporting intervention and the other half supporting non-intervention. The St. John’s Evening Telegram published five articles (71%) that advocated paramilitary intervention and only two articles (29%) that advocated non-intervention (Table 4.4). Also following this trend was the Edmonton Sun, which published nine articles (75%) promoting paramilitary intervention and three promoting (25%) non-intervention, and the Vancouver Sun which published five articles (62.5%) advocating intervention and three (37.5%) promoting non-intervention (Table 4.4). It is interesting to note that these three newspapers (indicated with an "a" in Table 4.4) also published the highest proportion of articles with themes that are considered "anti-Native" suggesting a correlation with the dependent variable.

Conversely, the Edmonton Journal published five articles (33%) advocating paramilitary intervention and ten articles (67%) advocating non-intervention (Table 4.4). At
### TABLE 4.4 - EDITORIAL SOLUTION BY NEWSPAPER, 1990

(a) = intervention promoting newspapers  
(b) = non-intervention promoting newspapers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Newspaper</th>
<th>Intervention</th>
<th>Non-Intervention</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>St. John's Evening Telegram (a)</td>
<td>5 [71%]</td>
<td>2 [29%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton Sun (a)</td>
<td>9 [75%]</td>
<td>3 [25%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver Sun (a)</td>
<td>5 [62.5%]</td>
<td>3 [37.5%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary Sun</td>
<td>6 [55%]</td>
<td>5 [45%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montreal Gazette</td>
<td>17 [53%]</td>
<td>15 [47%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa Citizen</td>
<td>13 [52%]</td>
<td>12 [48%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto Globe and Mail</td>
<td>7 [47%]</td>
<td>8 [53%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlottetown Guardian</td>
<td>6 [50%]</td>
<td>6 [50%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary Herald</td>
<td>4 [44%]</td>
<td>5 [56%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto Star</td>
<td>13 [50%]</td>
<td>13 [50%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Halifax Chronicle Herald</td>
<td>3 [50%]</td>
<td>3 [50%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg Free Press (b)</td>
<td>2 [22%]</td>
<td>7 [88%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regina Leader Post</td>
<td>3 [43%]</td>
<td>4 [57%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton Journal (b)</td>
<td>5 [33%]</td>
<td>10 [67%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saskatoon Star Phoenix (b)</td>
<td>4 [29%]</td>
<td>10 [71%]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N = 102  
Percentage = 49% 51%
the same time the Saskatoon Star-Phoenix published four articles (29%) promoting intervention and ten articles (71%) promoting non-intervention and the Winnipeg Free Press published two articles advocating intervention and seven promoting non-intervention (Table 4.4). Interestingly these newspapers (indicated with a "b" in Table 4.4) are the newspapers that published the highest proportion of articles with "pro-Native" themes.

It appears that there is a correlation between the themes a newspaper published in its articles and the editorial solution it promotes (Table 4.5). The Yules Q statistic is a well known correlation statistic that parallels the phi coefficient although it is a less exact measure. The phi or correlation coefficient also presented in that table provides the best indication of the association between the theme of an article/editorial and the editorial solution offered on a per newspaper basis because it is also a standardized measure of association. For example, the Halifax Chronicle Herald's phi coefficient is an even 1.0 indicating that there is a perfect association between the themes of the articles in that newspaper and the editorial solution offered in the articles (Table 4.5). The Charlottetown Guardian and Patriot also displays a significantly high phi coefficient of .84 while two newspapers, the Calgary Sun (.25), the Ottawa Citizen (.36), and the Saskatoon Star-Phoenix (.32), exhibit phi
coefficients that indicate that there is a low association between the theme of the article and the editorial solution while phi coefficients for all other newspapers fall somewhere in the middle (Table 4.5).

What this indicates is that there are a few extreme newspapers - the few with the articles' themes almost perfectly correlated with their editorial solution and those with the articles' themes not at all correlated with the editorial solution. Substantively, this may indicate that one does not necessarily need to know the editorial solution of the article to better predict the theme of that article. This may suggest that by knowing which newspaper an article was published in, may be relatively easy to predict the theme of the article. This may be apparent because a majority of articles within a newspaper are from one particular theme. Essentially there is no consistency in the correlations between themes and editorial solution on a per newspaper basis because all but a few of the newspapers in the analysis are highly correlated in terms of theme and their editorial solution.

4.6 ANALYSIS OF SOURCES

The second independent variable in this analysis is the "type" of source(s) used in the article or editorial. As earlier illustrated the type of source predominant in an
### TABLE 4.5 - CORRELATION BETWEEN THEMES AND EDITORIAL SOLUTION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Newspaper</th>
<th>Correlation</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>Yules Q</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>St. John's Evening Telegram</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton Sun</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver Sun</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary Sun</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montreal Gazette</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa Citizen</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>0.65</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto Globe and Mail</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlottetown Guardian</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary Herald</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto Star</td>
<td>0.47</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Halifax Chronicle Herald</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg Free Press</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regina Leader Post</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton Journal</td>
<td>0.57</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saskatoon Star Phoenix</td>
<td>0.32</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: high correlation indicates high intervention and "anti-Native" theme.
The category of "non-Native then Native" sources is a significant consideration not only because little physical space is given to the Native issues but also because a significant proportion of newspaper readers do not read entire newspaper articles. An example of this type of article is found in the July 16, 1990 issue of the Montreal Gazette titled "Mohawks maintain Mercier Blockade".

Negotiations broke off last night with no resolution to the impasse between armed Mohawks and Surete du Quebec officers who have been facing one another with guns across barricades for the last five days. And the blockade of the Mercier Bridge is to continue today. Native affairs Minister John Ciaccia left the four-hour meeting speaking vaguely but optimistically about progress, but Ellen Gabriel, a representative of the Mohawks, was angry.

Ciaccia said an agreement to clear the Mercier Bridge, blocked by Kahnawake Mohawks in support of the Kahnasatake natives at Oka, was making progress but "technicalities" remain to be ironed out and the bridge won't be opened for rush hour traffic today. "We made great progress. We have an agreement in principle (about the bridge). We want to appeal to people's patience and calm so we can finalize it". Ciaccia said there were still questions about the police presence.

As well, he said there was a problem getting agreement on inspection of the bridge. Gabriel left the meeting supported by two other women. Her hands and arms were shaking as she spoke with frustration of the negotiations. "I know there's a potentially violent situation in Chateauguay," she said. "There are lives at stake here too".

"We have to have some more meat in this discussion and not a discussion about the Mercier bridge, which is
beside the point; the discussion is land. "We want a guarantee that all people of the Mohawk nation will be granted amnesty for the situations that have happened" (Montreal Gazette July 16, 1990).

The frequency distribution of articles and editorials on a per newspaper basis (Table 4.6) indicates that non-Native sourced articles were the most common type of article source in the newspapers included in this analysis at 46.2%. Native sourced articles were the next most common type of article representing 29.8% of all articles. The least utilized type of source was the "non-Native then Native" sourced article at 24% (Table 4.6).

The newspaper with the largest proportion of articles and editorials using Native sources was the Charlottetown Guardian and Patriot with 66.6% or 8 of the eleven articles on the Oka crisis (Table 4.6). Ironically this newspaper appears in the middle of the ranking of newspapers with an "anti-Native" theme. This is partially because the Charlottetown Guardian and Patriot used Native sources to provide or support "anti-Native" themes in their articles.

The following excerpt from the July 17, 1990 issue of the Charlottetown Guardian and Patriot demonstrates that Native sources were indeed used in "anti-Native" articles:

Another Mohawk band set up a blockade of a nearby bridge in sympathy with the Indians. Erasmus said it's "extremely likely" that further armed confrontations could occur in other parts of Canada in the next few months, especially since some native people believe action yields quicker results than negotiations.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Newspaper</th>
<th>Native</th>
<th>Non-Native</th>
<th>Non-Native then Native</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>St. John's</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evening Telegram</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton</td>
<td>[14.30%]</td>
<td>[71.40%]</td>
<td>[14.30%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>[8.30%]</td>
<td>[58.30%]</td>
<td>[33.40%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>[12.5%]</td>
<td>[37.5%]</td>
<td>[50.0%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>[36.40%]</td>
<td>[54.50%]</td>
<td>[9.10%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montreal</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gazette</td>
<td>[21.90%]</td>
<td>[65.60%]</td>
<td>[12.50%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizen</td>
<td>[36%]</td>
<td>[44%]</td>
<td>[20%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Globe and Mail</td>
<td>[20%]</td>
<td>[53.30%]</td>
<td>[26.70%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlottetown</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guardian</td>
<td>[66.60%]</td>
<td>[25%]</td>
<td>[8.4%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herald</td>
<td>[11.10%]</td>
<td>[55.60%]</td>
<td>[33.30%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Star</td>
<td>[38.50%]</td>
<td>[50%]</td>
<td>[11.50%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Halifax</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chronicle Herald</td>
<td>[0]</td>
<td>[33.30%]</td>
<td>[66.60%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Free Press</td>
<td>[33.30%]</td>
<td>[22.20%]</td>
<td>[44.50%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regina</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leader Post</td>
<td>[14.30%]</td>
<td>[14.30%]</td>
<td>[71.40%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal</td>
<td>[46.60%]</td>
<td>[33.30%]</td>
<td>[20.10%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saskatoon</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Star Phoenix</td>
<td>[42.80%]</td>
<td>[28.60%]</td>
<td>[28.60%]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N=</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mean=</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>percentage=</td>
<td>29.80%</td>
<td>46.20%</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Edmonton *Journal* and the Saskatoon *Star-Phoenix*, with 46.6% and 42.8% respectively, are the next two newspapers with the largest proportion of articles with Native sourced articles — well in excess of the average of 29.8% (Table 4.6). This is not surprising because these two newspapers are also the two newspapers with the largest proportion of "pro-Native" articles. Conversely, the newspapers with the smallest proportion of articles/editorials using Native sources are the Edmonton Sun, the Calgary *Herald* and the Vancouver Sun with 8.3%, 11.1% and 12.5% respectively (Table 4.6). These proportions of Native sources may be predicted for these newspapers because they are among the leading newspapers with "anti-Native" articles.

Two newspapers have a large proportion of non-Native sourced articles/editorials. These include the St. John’s *Evening Telegram* with 71.4% of its articles on the Oka crisis being non-Native sourced and the Montreal *Gazette* with 65.6% of its articles on the Oka crisis being non-Native sourced — also well in excess of the average of 46.2% (Table 4.6). However, these findings are anticipated because both the St. John’s *Evening Telegram* and the Montreal *Gazette* are among the leading newspapers with articles containing "anti-Native" themes. The Charlottetown Guardian and Patriot is again inconsistent with the pattern of non-Native sources as it was with Native sources. The
Guardian and Patriot had three (25%) of its articles with non-Native sources, well below the proportion of newspapers with a similar number of "anti-Native" articles but consistent with its high proportion of Native sourced articles (Table 4.6).

The third source type or classification is "non-Native then Native" sourced articles. This classification is important because it essentially provides a blending of "pro-Native" and "anti-Native" themes. However, the dominance of the non-Native viewpoint and the fact that it is at the beginning of the article is important in that most readers will be left with the initial impression that this is an "anti-Native" article. There are two types of newspapers in which this strategy was incorporated. The first type was newspapers that reported a large proportion of "anti-Native" articles such as the Edmonton Sun and the Vancouver Sun that also presented a large proportion, 33.4% and 50% respectively, of "non-Native then Native" sourced articles (Table 4.6). The second type of newspaper that presented a large proportion of "non-Native then Native" sourced articles was newspapers that presented more "pro-Native" articles like the Halifax Chronicle Herald (66.6%), the Winnipeg Free Press (44.5%) and the Regina Leader-Post (71.4%) (Table 4.6). This would indicate that these newspapers, while maintaining a predominantly "pro-Native" theme in their articles/editorials, did so in a less blatant
manner than newspapers such as the Edmonton Journal (20.1%) and the Saskatoon Star-Phoenix (28.6%) that had a considerably smaller proportion of articles with the "non-Native then Native" source.

Throughout this discussion on the type of source utilized by a newspaper it is apparent that there might be a correlation between the type of source utilized by a newspaper and the dominant theme within a newspaper. Table 4.7 correlates the theme and the type of source used on an individual newspaper basis. This correlation is signified by the lambda statistic. The lambda coefficient when multiplied by one hundred indicates the reduction in error in the prediction of the dependent variable with knowledge of the independent variable.

The lambda statistics reported in Table 4.7 would indicate that the correlation between the dominant theme a newspaper presents and the type of source utilized is not highly correlated for most and rather high only for a few. The average lambda coefficient is .2 or a 20% reduction in error in the prediction of the theme of an article when one knows the type of source utilized in the article or editorial. This is due to the fact that for six newspapers - the St. John's Evening Telegram, the Calgary Sun, the Edmonton Sun, the Regina Leader-Post, the Saskatoon Star-Phoenix, and the Winnipeg Free Press - the correlation between these variables is 0 (Table 4.7). However, this
TABLE 4.7 - CORRELATION BETWEEN THEME AND INFORMATION SOURCE

(a) = Newspapers with Non-Native themes and low lambda statistics  
(b) = Newspapers with Native themes and low lambda statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Newspaper</th>
<th>Lambda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>St. John's Evening Telegram (a)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton Sun (a)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver Sun</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary Sun (a)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montreal Gazette</td>
<td>0.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa Citizen</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto Globe and Mail</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlottetown Guardian</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary Herald</td>
<td>0.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto Star</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Halifax Chronicle Herald</td>
<td>0.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg Free Press (b)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regina Leader Post (b)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton Journal</td>
<td>0.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saskatoon Star Phoenix (b)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

mean= 0.2

note: high correlation indicates newspapers with "pro-Native" theme and non-Native sources or vice versa.

100
correlation of 0 is indicative that these newspapers with a lambda of 0 can be considered extreme newspapers. Of these six newspapers the Calgary Sun, the Edmonton Sun and the St. John's Evening Telegram (those labelled a) are among the "top" few newspapers which advocate both paramilitary intervention and publish articles with "anti-Native" themes, while the Regina Leader-Post, the Saskatoon Star-Phoenix and the Winnipeg Free Press (labelled b) are among the "top" few newspapers advocating non-intervention and published "pro-Native" articles/editorials. It may be suggested that these extreme newspapers have predetermined the themes to their articles despite the source(s) used.

This interpretation would indicate that for these six newspapers the themes are easily predicted even without the knowledge of the type of source used because they represent the extreme newspapers in terms of the theme they have portrayed. For other newspapers, specifically the Halifax Chronicle Herald with a lambda of .66, the Vancouver Sun with a lambda of .5 and the Toronto Globe and Mail also with lambda of .5 it is significantly easier to predict (50% to 66%) the type of theme of an article or editorial with the knowledge of the type of source utilized in that article. It may be suggested that these newspapers are more objective in the thematic portrayal of articles regardless of the source utilized.
4.7 ANALYSIS OF CORPORATE STRUCTURE

The third independent variable in this analysis is the corporate structure of each of the newspapers. The corporate structure of a newspaper will be categorized as follows: (i) a small corporate newspaper, (ii) a medium corporate entity that owns other types of media structures including the newspaper in this analysis, (iii) and a large corporate structure that owns numerous different types of companies outside of its media interests.

The cross tabulation of articles/editorials (see Table 4.8) indicates that large corporate newspapers published 155 articles/editorials - significantly more than both medium sized corporate newspapers with a total of 21 articles, and small corporate newspapers which published a total of 32 articles. When the corporate structure variable is cross tabulated with the themes of the articles some distinctive trends emerge. For example, articles found in newspapers with a small corporate structure are evenly distributed in the larger theme dichotomization of "pro-Native" and "anti-Native". The majority of articles fall into two of the themes: fourteen or 44% in the law and order theme and fifteen or 47% in the Natives Story theme with six and three percent, respectively, in the themes of Lemay's funeral and Native rights (Table 4.8).

Articles found in medium sized corporate newspapers are
**TABLE 4.8**

**CORPORATE STRUCTURE BY THEME, 1990**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>THEME</th>
<th>SMALL CORPORATE NEWSPAPERS</th>
<th>MEDIUM CORPORATE NEWSPAPERS</th>
<th>LARGE CORPORATE NEWSPAPERS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Law and Order</td>
<td>14/44%</td>
<td>7/33%</td>
<td>85/55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Death of Lemay</td>
<td>2/6%</td>
<td>0/0%</td>
<td>10/7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Natives Story</td>
<td>15/47%</td>
<td>10/48%</td>
<td>47/30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Native Rights</td>
<td>1/3%</td>
<td>4/19%</td>
<td>13/8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>32/100%</td>
<td>21/100%</td>
<td>155/100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Lambda = .08
divided in a contrasting manner. Seven or 33\% of articles in medium sized newspapers emphasize the law and order theme while ten or 48\% of articles are found on the Native Story theme and 4 or 19\% of articles are found in the Native rights theme (Table 4.8). Two thirds of articles found in medium sized corporate newspapers have a "pro-Native" theme.

Articles found in large sized corporate newspapers mirror the thematic breakdown of articles found in medium sized corporate newspapers. The theme with the largest number of articles is the law and order theme with 85 (55\%) of articles found in large corporate structured newspapers (Table 4.8). Ten articles (7\%) of all articles are found in the death of Lemay theme. Therefore, 62\% of all articles in large corporate newspapers portray an "anti-Native" theme. As well, 47 (30\%) of articles in large corporate newspapers fall in the Native Story theme and a further 8 (13\%) fall within the Native rights theme (Table 4.8).

The lambda coefficient of .08 indicates that the correlation between the corporate structure of a newspaper and the theme of its articles and editorials is not substantively significant (see Table 4.8). The lambda coefficient indicates that one would have an 8\% reduction in errors in the prediction of the theme of an article with the knowledge of the newspaper's corporate structure. These findings would indicate that although the corporate structure of a newspaper would appear to be correlated with
the thematic portrayal of the events at Oka there is no obvious progression in the portrayal from small to large corporate newspaper structures. Although it is apparent that newspapers with a large corporate structure portrayed the events at Oka in a very "anti-Native" manner, it is also evident that medium sized corporate newspapers' portrayal of the events were more "pro-Native" than small sized corporate newspapers (see Table 4.8). This suggests that the instrumentalist theory utilized in Porter's (1965) and Clement's (1975), analysis which state that newspapers with large corporate structures portray reality in such a way as to preserve the status quo, is not that easily resolved. This analysis has demonstrated that larger corporate structures of a newspaper do not mean the more conservative the newspaper's portrayal of reality.

The small corporate newspapers in this analysis are the Charlottetown Guardian and Patriot and the Toronto Star. The target audience of the these newspapers may be termed as the petty bourgeoisie (Newspaper Marketing Bureau of Canada Readership Data and Guide, 1991). It may be argued that the main objective of these newspapers is to promote the democratic capitalist order of which they are a part. If this is the case, then it may be assumed that these two smaller newspapers would be somewhat conservative in nature. This appears to be a plausible explanation with the inadequacy of a more comprehensive explication. This
explication subsequently resolves why small corporate newspapers portrayed the events at Oka in a more "anti-Native" and law and order fashion than medium sized newspapers.

It is then apparent that a newspaper’s corporate structure has little significance in the portrayal of the Oka crisis but that an easily identifiable pattern according to how newspapers do represent reality is difficult to discern. This finding also does not support the processual instrumentalist argument that the larger the corporate structure of a newspaper the more conservative or status quo its portrayal of events. Again the discovery that the corporate structure of a newspaper is not a substantively significant variable in the explanation of the portrayal of the Oka crisis suggests that the theoretical concept of hegemony is the best explanation to how the Canadian newspaper industry portrays events because it allows for a more complex and unidentifiable solution to the portrayal of events by the newspaper industry.

4.8 ANALYSIS OF REGION

The fourth and last independent variable in this analysis is the region in which a newspaper is published. Region has been categorized into seven more or less provincial categories. They are the Maritime provinces,
Quebec, Ontario, Manitoba, Saskatchewan, Alberta, and British Columbia. Ponting and Gibbins (1980) found through the employment of the Indian Sympathy Index that "the region in which respondents lived had a marked impact on their orientations towards Indians and Indian issues" (Ponting and Gibbins, 1980:89). The Indian Sympathy Index found that residents of Quebec, British Columbia and Ontario had the highest mean scores on the index, or were more sympathetic to Native issues. Saskatchewan and Alberta residents, although they had the greatest knowledge of Native issues, had the lowest mean scores on the sympathy index, or they were the least sympathetic regions to Native issues. The Maritime provinces and Manitoba region's mean scores on the sympathy index were comfortably between the most sympathetic regions and the least sympathetic regions. Although this study occurred several years ago and Native issues have evolved substantially, it may be assumed that the regional trend of "Native sympathy" across Canada would more or less have stayed the same.

The cross tabulation of the themes of articles and editorials on a regional basis (Table 4.9) indicates that Ponting and Gibbins's findings based on individuals do not exactly parallel these findings of newspapers - assuming that the theme of an article (either "anti-Native" or "pro-Native") is equivalent to Indian sympathy. For example, Ponting and Gibbins found that Quebec was the most
### Table 4.9

**Region by Theme, 1990**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>THEME</th>
<th>MARITIMES (3)</th>
<th>QUEBEC (1)</th>
<th>ONTARIO (3)</th>
<th>MANITOBA (1)</th>
<th>SASKATCHEWAN (2)</th>
<th>ALBERTA (4)</th>
<th>BRITISH COLUMBIA (1)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>14/56%</td>
<td>19/59%</td>
<td>33/50%</td>
<td>3/33%</td>
<td>7/33%</td>
<td>24/51%</td>
<td>6/75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2/8%</td>
<td>1/3%</td>
<td>4/6%</td>
<td>1/11%</td>
<td>0/0%</td>
<td>4/8%</td>
<td>0/0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>6/24%</td>
<td>7/22%</td>
<td>28/42%</td>
<td>5/55%</td>
<td>10/48%</td>
<td>14/30%</td>
<td>2/25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>3/12%</td>
<td>5/16%</td>
<td>1/2%</td>
<td>0/0%</td>
<td>4/19%</td>
<td>5/11%</td>
<td>0/0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>25/100%</td>
<td>32/100%</td>
<td>66/100%</td>
<td>9/100%</td>
<td>21/100%</td>
<td>47/100%</td>
<td>8/100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Number of Newspapers in Each Region in Parenthesis
Themes: 1=Law and Order, 2=Death of Lemay, 3=Natives Story, 4=Native Rights

Lambda = .09
sympathetic region to Native issues; however, 62% of articles or editorials found in the Quebec newspaper (the Montreal Gazette) had an "anti-Native" theme (Table 4.9). At the same time 56% of articles and editorials from Ontario newspapers had an "anti-Native" theme as did 75% of articles and editorials in British Columbia newspapers. Again this indicates that a newspaper’s thematic portrayal of Oka is directly opposed to the individuals’ Indian sympathy uncovered by Ponting and Gibbins. By contrast, Saskatchewan newspapers, the region Ponting and Gibbins found to be the least sympathetic to Native issues, had the lowest proportion of "anti-Native" articles at 33% (Table 4.9). Alberta newspapers had a relatively high proportion of "anti-Native" articles at 59% while Manitoba newspapers had the second lowest number of "anti-Native" articles, next to Saskatchewan newspapers, at 44% (Table 4.9). Ironically, it was newspapers in the Maritime region that had the second highest proportion of "anti-Native" articles at 64% but in Ponting and Gibbins’s (1980) index this was a more sympathetic region to Native issues than both Alberta and Saskatchewan.

These findings generally suggest that newspapers in regions with higher proportions of Natives portrayed the Oka crisis in a more "pro-Native" manner. However, an anomaly to this trend is Alberta (see Table 4.9.). Alberta has a high proportion of Natives as well as a high proportion of
"anti-Native" articles in its newspapers. The lambda coefficient of .09 (see Table 4.9) indicates that the correlation between the region of a newspaper and the portrayal of the Oka crisis on the basis of theme is not significant and that one would have a 9% reduction in errors in the prediction of the theme of an article with the knowledge of the region in which the newspaper was published. Therefore, I would conclude that statistically the newspaper industry's portrayal of the Oka crisis as either "anti-Native" or "pro-Native" does not parallel the opinion of a region's population in regards to Native issues as found by Ponting and Gibbins (1980). This would indicate that something other than the regions' and the readers' opinions within these regions affects the newspaper industry's thematic portrayal of the Oka crisis. Although statistically speaking region is not a significant variable, when one examines regional categories significant trends do appear, as specifically, in the high proportion of "pro-Native" and non-intervention articles in the Saskatchewan and Manitoba regions (see Table 4.9 and 4.10).

When the region variable is correlated with the editorial solution of either promoting para-military intervention or non-intervention offered by a newspaper (Table 4.10), similar trends appear. For example, the newspaper in the Manitoba region (the Winnipeg Free Press) had the lowest proportion of articles or editorials
### TABLE 4.10
Region By Editorial Solution, 1990

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Editorial Solution</th>
<th>MARITIMES (3)</th>
<th>QUEBEC (1)</th>
<th>ONTARIO (3)</th>
<th>MANITOBA (1)</th>
<th>SASKATCHEWAN (2)</th>
<th>ALBERTA (4)</th>
<th>BRITISH COLUMBIA (1)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intervention</td>
<td>14/56%</td>
<td>17/53%</td>
<td>33/50%</td>
<td>2/22%</td>
<td>7/33%</td>
<td>24/51%</td>
<td>5/63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Intervention</td>
<td>11/44%</td>
<td>15/47%</td>
<td>33/50%</td>
<td>7/78%</td>
<td>14/67%</td>
<td>23/49%</td>
<td>3/37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>25/100%</td>
<td>32/100%</td>
<td>66/100%</td>
<td>9/100%</td>
<td>21/100%</td>
<td>47/100%</td>
<td>8/100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Number of Newspapers in Each Region in Parenthesis

Lambda = .08
promoting intervention at 22% (Table 4.10). The Saskatchewan region had the second lowest proportion of articles promoting intervention at 33% while the other five regions were similar to each other in terms of the proportion of articles promoting intervention. For example, of the newspapers analyzed: in Ontario 50% promoted intervention, in Alberta, 51%, in Quebec, 53%, in the Maritimes, 56%, and 63% in British Columbia promoted intervention (Table 4.10).

The lambda statistic for this cross tabulation is .08, which indicates that the correlation between the region of a newspaper and the editorial solution it offers is not strong. It further suggests that one would have an 8% reduction in errors in the prediction of the editorial solution an article offered with the knowledge of the region in which the newspaper was published. The regions of Saskatchewan and Manitoba are the only regions that have editorial solutions that differ substantially from the other provinces. In other words by knowing the region of a newspaper one would not have a significantly better chance of knowing the type of editorial solution that the newspaper offered.

A possible explanation as to why the two newspapers published in Saskatchewan were among the most "pro-Native" newspapers may be due to the political persuasion of the province. At both the federal and provincial government
levels Saskatchewan residents have always strongly supported the New Democratic Party which may be argued is more likely to support, or at least be philosophically open, to Native rights and struggles.

4.9 CONCLUSION

Statistically, there were few correlations between the independent variables and the dependent variable or the theme of the articles a newspaper published. Nevertheless, the descriptive outlined in Table 4.1 and Table 4.2 did indicate that there was a notable contrast in the portrayal of the Oka crisis on a per newspaper basis. However, the only substantively strong correlation between dependent variables and the independent variable was the editorial solution variable. Because none of the other three independent variables can be stated to be substantively correlated with the thematic portrayal of the Oka crisis it appears as though the previous theoretical explanations as to how the Canadian newspaper industry portrays or represents events are suspect.

As I have suggested throughout the examination of the data, it is apparent that alternative variables or an interaction of variables other than the corporate structure of the newspaper, the type of source used by articles in the newspaper, and the geographic region the newspaper is
located in, influenced the construction of the Oka crisis by the daily Canadian newspaper industry. The small influence of the independent variables indicates that although some definite trends occur in terms of the Canadian daily newspaper industry's portrayal of the Oka crisis, there is something larger at work.

These findings indicate that instrumentalist arguments, that essentially state that the corporate elite of the newspaper industry create and disseminate a dominant ideology via the newspapers, put forth by such theorists as Clement (1975), are unfounded here. This is not to imply that the newspaper industry is objective and that the notion of ideology in the media does not exist. In fact it is apparent from the descriptive data that the newspaper industry portrays the events at Oka in differing ways and that the way in which the events are portrayed constitutes certain ideological agendas. By discovering that the independent variables in this analysis (corporate structure of the newspaper, type of source, and region of newspaper) do not significantly affect the portrayal of the Oka crisis by the newspaper industry the question emerges of how ideology, or in this case the constructed portrayal of the Oka crisis, is transmitted. I have also suggested in the theoretical chapter that the newspaper industry does construct ideological interpretations of reality based on certain assumptions and it is through the concept of
hegemony that the explanation of how ideology and the construction of reality is managed by the newspaper industry.

The notion of hegemony in the newspaper industry allows for the creation of ideology on an individual newspaper basis and is substantiated in this analysis by the fact that three of the four independent variables are not substantively significant and that there are no easily identifiable patterns in the newspaper industry's portrayal of the Oka crisis. It is apparent that the newspaper industry in Canada includes only accepted liberal, or mainstream, frames in the thematic portrayal of the Oka crisis ranging from "pro-Native" to "anti-Native". Although a majority of articles and a majority of newspapers take a decidedly "anti-Native" approach, all articles are set within certain thematic limits or boundaries ensuring a complete diversity of articles does not exist.

The idea that a hegemonic ideology exists in the newspaper industry is strengthened by the structure and the premises upon which the industry is founded. The notion of freedom of the press and the "objectivity" principle on which the industry is founded allows for, as the notion of hegemony suggests, the dominated to collaborate or consent in the construction of reality. Hence, the dominant groups, or those that construct reality, could argue that because no patterns of how the newspaper industry portrays the Oka
crisis (or any other event) are apparent, a "constructed" reality or ideology does not appear in the newspaper industry. However, the data do indicate that most Canadians on the basis of readership read articles that portrayed the events of the Oka crisis in an "anti-Native" manner. In fact this is the objective of hegemony in that it operates through a complex web of social activities and institutional procedures and meshes with common sense to grant consent from the dominated. In other words, by appearing "objective", by not allowing any visible or recognizable patterns of ideology (i.e., the independent variables) to exist, the newspaper industry creates the illusion of being objective. Hegemony is successful in this case because it is undetectable.

This independent and contrasting construction of ideology allows for what Marchak (1981) calls "competing ideologies" to exist, and also strengthens the rationale of hegemonic ideology in that the concept of freedom of the press and the lack of a single conforming ideology create the appearance of objectivity. This analysis has demonstrated that any newspaper can construct its own reality or portrayal of a crisis situation and that without a doubt these contrasting portrayals of the Oka crisis by the newspaper industry illustrate that, as Gitlin (1980) suggests, the framing of news events does occur. For example, the portrayal of the Oka crisis by the Montreal
Gazette or any of the Sun newspapers contrasts significantly to the way in which the Winnipeg Free Press, the Saskatoon Star-Phoenix, or the Regina Leader-Post portrayed the Oka crisis. What appears is a cyclical pattern in the way in which the newspaper industry through its procedures and principles, legitimates the concepts of liberal democratic or capitalist societies - the foundation upon which the newspaper industry is dependent. It may also be argued that the government’s and army’s extensive public relations campaign may have been a contributing factor in the newspaper industry’s overall negative portrayal of the Oka crisis.
CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSION

5.1 INTRODUCTION

Natives in Canada have expressed a high level of dissatisfaction with the coverage of their communities by the newspaper industry (Khaki and Prasad, 1988). Specifically, they have voiced considerable concern over the media’s inability to be objective and accurate on important Native issues. Of particular concern has been the persistent negative portrayal, bias, scapegoating, stereotyping, and sensationalism applied to Native peoples by the media (Khaki and Prasad, 1988). Clearly the media must bear some responsibility for perpetuating the persistent myths and misconceptions about Native peoples that have been nurtured over the years by other societal forces, such as the criminal justice system (Wotherspoon and Satzewich, 1993).

The representation of Native peoples and their struggles as portrayed by the newspaper industry ultimately affects the larger public’s perceptions of Native people. A Gallup poll taken during the Oka crisis on August 8-11, 1990 found that 44 percent of Canadians believed that "Native Indians are being badly treated by governments"
Later in the standoff Globe and Mail Native Affairs reporter Rudy Platiel stated that "the continuing image of belligerent masked gunmen [in the media] apparently [is] eroding the initial support for Mohawks." (Toronto Globe and Mail, September 15, 1990). The intent of this analysis was to investigate theoretically how the Canadian newspaper industry thematically constructed the Oka crisis and if the variables the literature suggests are important in the portrayal of events are significant by focusing on the industry's portrayal of the Oka crisis.

5.2 INTERPRETATION OF FINDINGS

The findings of this analysis indicate that the portrayal of the events at the Oka crisis by the Canadian daily newspaper industry was predominantly of an "anti-Native" nature (see Table 4.2). The intention of this thesis was not to focus on the political element or the racial characterization of Natives by the Canadian newspaper industry but rather, to examine how the newspaper industry has portrayed the Oka crisis and to examine the ideological constructs employed by the Canadian newspaper industry.

Of the four independent variables in this analysis only editorial solution was substantively correlated with the theme of the articles or editorials found in the newspapers.
analyzed. This does not suggest that on an individual newspaper basis, some of the independent variables were not correlated with the dependent variable but, accounting for all newspapers, it cannot be suggested that the newspapers in the analysis portrayed the events of the Oka crisis on the basis of the independent variables.

It is apparent that something other than the corporate structure of the newspaper, the type of source used in articles in the newspaper, and the region the newspaper is located in affected the newspaper industry's portrayal of the Oka crisis. Therefore, the instrumentalist arguments that suggest that these variables do influence the newspaper industry's portrayal of events is too simplistic. The descriptive data (see Table 4.1 and Table 4.2) indicate that even though the variables were not substantively significant, the portrayal of the Oka crisis by the newspaper industry on a per newspaper basis differed significantly. This does not suggest that these variables are not of some importance and that the newspaper industry does not disseminate ideology. Rather, the findings reveal that the newspaper industry does not mechanically portray crisis, even when the overall portrayal tends to be relatively consistent.

This eclectic portrayal of the events at Oka validates the theoretical concept of hegemony. Hegemony is a complex set of activities and procedures that appear as common
sense. This process contributes to gaining consent from the dominated in society by the dominators. In other words, because no identifiable patterns based on the independent variables can be uncovered the newspaper industry produces the illusion of being objective, although a significant majority of articles and editorials are "anti-Native" in nature and portrayed the events at Oka as a "law and order" issue.

Liberal democratic countries uphold the notion of freedom of the press. The Canadian newspaper industry is founded not only on liberal democratic principles but also upon the notion of objectivity of the press. Therefore, the newspaper industry must maintain some semblance of objectivity, or at the very least a facade of impartiality, or it will de-legitimate this society's founding principles as well as its own. This all suggests that the newspaper industry in Canada does have some interest in preserving the liberal democratic principles upon which this country is constructed. The newspaper industry in Canada is then a vehicle for the transmission of ideology sustaining the principles of a liberal-democratic society.

5.3 THE ROLE OF MEDIA IN PROTESTS

It should have come as no surprise that the Oka crisis was portrayed by the Canadian newspaper industry in a
predominantly "anti-Native" fashion. Previous studies on the way in which the media reports protests have had similar findings. The chief problem with protest as a communication mechanism is that the media, upon which the protesters depend, have considerable discretion in reporting and interpreting the events they cover. Should, for example, a particular group of protesters be identified as "freedom fighters" or "terrorists" by the media? The question that is always solicited by the audience is, if a demonstration leads to violence, was this the fault of the protesters or of the authorities? (Ginsberg, 1986:134) These questions are typically answered in the public's eyes by the media, not the protesters. This means the media's interpretation of protest activities is more a reflection of the views of the groups and forces to which the media are responsive - usually segments of the upper-middle class - than it is a function of the wishes of the protesters themselves. Thus, the effectiveness of a protest as a media strategy depends, in large measure, on the character of national political alignments and coalitions.

In general, success on the idea market for protesters requires an alliance with at least some segment of the powerful upper class (Ginsberg, 1986:135). Knowing the politics of the media and its portrayal of protest would suggest that the Mohawks' struggle at Oka was condemned to a negative portrayal by the newspaper industry and in fact
this was confirmed by the 57.6% of articles with an "anti-Native" theme among the newspapers of this analysis. However, the Oka crisis appears to have been a vehicle for the advancement of Native struggles over self-government and self-determination in the sense that it appears that Natives and Native rights are now recognized as significant issues.

5.4 THE GOVERNMENT'S REACTION TO OKA

Although there has been little sociological examination of the media's portrayal of the Oka crisis there has been some analysis of the federal government's response to the Oka crisis and Native affairs. Ponting's (1990) findings are consistent with Gitlin's (1980) findings, in that the primary technique used by the federal government via the media was to "cast the Mohawk issue as one of 'law and order' or 'one law for all Canadians'" (Ponting, 1990:87). Ponting states that this was to be expected from the police and the military because of their training and world view but also because their personnel were on the front lines of the conflict (Ponting, 1990). Their behaviour is illustrated by the following commentary by an Assistant Commissioner of the RCMP:

This whole thing [the Oka crisis] is about trying to make the laws of the land apply equally to all citizens (Ponting, 1990:87).
This statement takes all responsibility for the violence and unrest off the law enforcement officials and lays blame on the Mohawks for their criminal acts.

In summary, the government's rhetoric portrayed the government as restrained, committed to the rule of law, generously responsive, and liberal (Ponting, 1990). In contrast the Mohawks are portrayed as atypical, factionally divided, violent, and criminally deviant. These characterizations parallel Marx's (1982) analysis of the method employed by liberal-democratic states to discredit social movements. The thematic analysis indicated that the newspaper industry's portrayal of the Oka crisis, whether the Quebec or federal governments intention or not, was to try and discredit the Mohawks' claims as well as place the blame for all of the unrest on the Mohawks.

Liberal democracies do sometimes seek to manipulate their citizens' beliefs (Hall, 1978, Gitlin, 1980, Marchak, 1981, Chomsky, 1989). The government's response to Oka becomes important because most often if a crisis situation involves the government, as it did in the Oka crisis, the media rely on the state's reactions and comments. Liberal theories tend to realize the dependency of journalists or the media's reliance on accredited sources but do not realize that there may be ideology and interpretations that favour the status quo that are communicated via the media by the accredited sources. For
example, the army hired twenty public relations experts to advise them on what to stress in interviews, provide documents for spokespersons, and to anticipate any communication problems by the army at an estimated cost of over one million dollars (Winter, 1992). According to Major Richard Larouche, the army's public relations experts advised the army to impress at all times three specific themes on the media: 1) the soldiers would not fire first; 2) they would return fire with force; 3) the military was there at the invitation of the Quebec government and would leave when asked (Calgary Herald, October 25, 1990). The success of these public relations campaigns is reflected in the decrease in the amount of support the Mohawks received as earlier indicated in the polls. It is apparent that the only group without public relations expertise was the Mohawks who were often "grabbed on short notice by the media, for off-the-cuff remarks" (Winter, 1992:251).

The newspaper industry in Canada became a forum for the government and the army's calculated portrayal of events at Oka leading, therefore, to the manipulation of public opinion. Through its depictions, the newspaper industry was instrumental in accomplishing the government's goal of public opinion management. As I have demonstrated, journalists followed their well-established convention of relying on authorized "knowers" or sources to construct ideology and interpret reality under government auspices.
5.5 THE POLITICAL PHILOSOPHY OF THE CANADIAN NEWSPAPER INDUSTRY

The thematic representations of the articles and editorials of the newspapers in this analysis, it may be argued, are consistent with the political philosophies on the left/right political continuum. Obviously those newspapers that thematically portrayed the Oka crisis in a more "anti-Native" manner (refer to ordering of newspapers in Table 4.1) would be considered right leaning or more conservative newspapers while those newspapers that portrayed the Oka crisis in more of an "pro-Native" manner would be considered left leaning or more liberal newspapers. Although this analysis only examines one "news event", albeit a large one, this alignment in terms of political philosophy approximates those previously suggested. This further suggests that a framing or a portrayal management of the news by the Canadian newspaper industry does occur. This tendency may occur, in part, based on the audience, or the desired audience, of a particular newspaper.

5.6 CONCLUSION

As suggested throughout this analysis, the framing or the constructed portrayal of news events does exist. The media invariably subscribe to public relation campaigns
because, as I have demonstrated, the Canadian newspaper industry has a predilection towards government and the established superstructures. The ways in which the Oka crisis was portrayed were as numerous as the newspapers in which they appeared. However, the themes of all articles fall within clearcut acceptable boundaries. Therefore, the implementation of existing theories on the Canadian media did not adequately explain the newspaper industry’s portrayal of the Oka crisis. The findings of the statistical analysis are important because not only does it validate the theoretical approach of hegemonic ideology within the Canadian newspaper industry but also illustrates the generally "anti-Native" tone the industry took towards the Oka crisis.

It is too simplistic to state that the way in which the Canadian newspaper industry portrayed the events at the Oka crisis was contingent on a few easily identifiable variables or characteristics. The theoretical concept of hegemonic ideology ensured that a complex portrayal, as was confirmed, of the Oka crisis by the Canadian newspaper industry occurred. The findings of this thesis would suggest that further research in the area of the media’s portrayal of events is necessary if the concerns about media messages and media objectivity are to be addressed. More specifically, it may be of some importance to study the effect of class based or racial group characterization by the media and
their relationship to societal attitudes.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


