CONTROLLING CONTAGION:
POLICING AND PRESCRIBING SEXUAL AND POLITICAL NORMALCY IN COLD WAR CANADA

A Thesis Submitted to the College of
Graduate Studies and Research
In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
For the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy
In the Department of History
University of Saskatchewan
Saskatoon

By:

FRANCES V. REILLY

© Frances Vija Reilly, June 2016. All rights reserved.
Permission to Use

In presenting this thesis in partial fulfillment of the requirements for a Postgraduate degree from the University of Saskatchewan, I agree that the Libraries of this University may make it freely available for inspection. I further agree that permission for copying of this thesis in any manner, in whole or in part, for scholarly purposes may be granted by the professor or professors who supervised my thesis work or, in their absence, by the Head of the Department or the Dean of the College in which my thesis work was done. It is understood that any copying or publication or use of this thesis or parts thereof for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission. It is also understood that due recognition shall be given to me and to the University of Saskatchewan in any scholarly use which may be made of any material in my thesis.

Request for permission to copy or to make other use of material in this thesis in whole or part should be addressed to:

Head of the Department of History  
Room 522, Arts Building  
9 Campus Drive  
University of Saskatchewan  
Saskatoon, Saskatchewan  
S7N 5A5
Abstract

This dissertation examines the Cold War fear of infiltration and the ‘enemy within.’ While several Cold War histories examine the culture of anxiety, few consider how the larger fears of nuclear weaponry and radiation influenced Canada’s perception of the enemy as contagion during the 1950s and 1960s. This study of Cold War political and sexual policing addresses the various ways in which disaster and destruction of social and sexual norms were anticipated in the atomic age. The efforts to control the enemy, whether domestic communism or sexual ‘deviancy,’ were indicative of how the contemporary threat was likened to disease.

Divided into two case studies, Operation Profunc and Cold War sexual psychiatry, this dissertation examines fear and efforts to control fears of potential destruction through containment and surveillance. This is the first historical study of Operation Profunc, a Canadian plan to intern domestic communists in the event of war or communist attack. Between 1948 and 1983, the RCMP, with support from the Department of National Defence and the Ministry of Justice, monitored hundreds of Canadian leftists. Plans for reception centres and internment camps persisted over three decades in anticipation of a potential national emergency.

The fear of contagion and culture of anxiety was also evident in psychiatry, a field that was becoming more standardized in classifying mental disorder through the 1950s. At this time, homosexuality was equated to character weakness, social destruction, and anxiety. Indicative of the era’s efforts to control disorder was the 1956 establishment of the forensic clinic for so-called “sexual deviates” at the Toronto Psychiatric Hospital. As with the American Psychiatric Association’s DSM, the forensic clinic worked to codify and control ‘deviant’ sexuality in an effort to maintain safety in a period of insecurity.

Combining these separate histories of national defence and psychiatric nomenclature, this dissertation examines how the two fears of contamination reflected the broader anxieties of the era. In the atomic age the homefront was the battlefield. The Cold War was a conflict that saw the transference of the global divide between superpowers to the individual. Fear of contagion was one that united self with society.
Quite often graduate degrees are perceived as merely transitional experiences. In many ways they are, but it is important to remember that the process is a significant experience in itself. The years spent researching, writing, and basically surviving as a student are not merely for the purpose of obtaining a well-sought status. Six and a half years is a long time to work on a project and, for someone from the West Coast, the Saskatchewan prairies can be an alien place. But I have truly enjoyed this process – Saskatoon was my home and, at the risk of sounding clichéd, I truly understood the importance of community, friendship, and support through the course of this program.

I have to acknowledge my committee, their expertise, and their advice and influence over the years. Despite the anxiety of defence I could not help but enjoy their kindness, their enthusiasm, and the depth and range of their knowledge. Dr. Martha Smith-Norris has provided me concrete counterpoints to my more theoretical pursuits. I appreciated both her encouragement and her tough questions throughout the writing and examination process. Quite simply I would not have done this degree if it were not for Dr. Erika Dyck, her enthusiasm for the history of medicine, and her resourcefulness. She is largely responsible for my interest in the intricacies of health, medicine, and society. Dr. Todd Morrison provided a view of psychology to this history of medicalization that otherwise would have missed. Dr. Steve Hewitt, with his expertise on police history and surveillance in Canada was an ideal external examiner. As a historian that I admire, I was honoured that he agreed to be the external for the exam and greatly value his advice.

Finally, I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr. Valerie Korinek, for her hard work. I cannot say how fortunate I feel to have had the chance to work with Valerie, a historian who I greatly respect. Her frankness, encouragement, and humour kept me going. She remained hands-off but was always available for help, advice, and compassion.

The University of Saskatchewan’s History Department has been incredibly supportive. When I arrived in 2009, Linda Dietz, Nadine Penner, and Ingrid McGregor made me feel at home and made my experience as a student, TA, and, later, sessional enjoyable. I would like to thank the Department of History for the funding and experience it provided me through TA-ships and senior teaching fellowships as well as travel funding for research and conferences. I would like to draw particular attention to the editing fellowship for *Folklore Magazine* provided by the Department of History in conjunction with the ICCC and the Saskatchewan History and Folklore Society. Two years of editing for this journal and working with the Sask History and Folklore Society was a wonderful experience, providing me with a better understanding of Saskatchewan as a province and history as a professional discipline. I would also like to thank the CGSR for their funding in a time of need.

In terms of archival research, this project provided several opportunities to visit a variety of archives and collections including Library and Archives Canada, which provided the material on Operation Profunc. I would like to thank Jon Court at the CAMH archives for years of correspondence, assistance, and advice. The CAMH Hewton Bursary was also enabled me to
conduct further research of the history of sexual psychiatry Los Angeles. The staff at UCLA were very helpful and the ONE National Gay and Lesbian Archives extremely accommodating.

Neil Richards has been an incredible fount of knowledge and I would like to thank him for his help and expertise on the subject of gay and lesbian pulp literature. His archive of pulp novels at the University of Saskatchewan Special Collections is the most extensive in Canada and a joy to visit. I would also like to thank Doug Beaton for his assistance and the materials he provided through 2011 and 2012. His collection at the Diefenbunker in Carp, Ontario was very fun to visit and I hope to return.

I have met many delightful, intelligent, and fascinating people at the University of Saskatchewan. The process of researching and writing is an isolating one – support and community are crucial to survival. Long walks, good beer, and compelling café conversations have been integral. First of all I would like to thank Vickie Lamb Drover, Sara Roberts, Erin Spinney, Glenn Iceton, Paul Burrows, and Jason Underhill for hours of conversation. Laura Larsen, Adam Montgomery, and Corey Owen performed the amazing feat of reading through the entire thesis and provided invaluable advice and edits. I would also like to thank Margaret Orlowski, my father Sean Reilly, and my partner Amir massoud Farahmand, who provided writing advice and emotional support throughout. I would be remiss if I did not acknowledge the help of Sean Waldbillig, Brianne Collins, Lucas Richert, and Heather Stanley in navigating the history of psychiatry and sexual pathologization. My sister, Patricia Reilly, was a valuable research assistant and a fun travelling companion in Los Angeles, and is irreplaceable in every other way. The hospitality and kindness of Michelle Desveaux, and Katayoon Navabi and Ehsan Sherbati, who housed me when I reached the nomadic stage in the last year, was crucial to the completion of this project. And finally I must acknowledge the patience and understanding of my mother Laura Reilly who through hours of discussion and verbal processing, particularly during one visit to the GP airport, helped me piece this together.

It is often difficult to explain to those not in the heat of it all what completing a doctoral degree is like, but my family, both immediate and extended, and close friends have been nothing but supportive and genuinely interested in the project. So, whether this was genuine or merely indulgent, thank you very much. I would like to dedicate this to SoloGen, Pat, and my parents.
List of Figures

Figure 1: Table: Profunc Statistics from 1951 to 1978 .........................................................56
Figure 2: Operation Profunc Form .................................................................61
Figure 3: “Rats are Coming!” .................................................................67
Figure 4: “You Can’t Ignore the Rat” .............................................................68
Figure 5: Operation Profunc Map of Canada .....................................................80
Figure 6: Cartoon: “You don’t suppose ...” ....................................................173
List of Abbreviations

APA American Psychiatric Association
AUUC Association of United Ukrainian Canadians
CAMH Centre for Addiction and Mental Health
CBC Canadian Broadcasting Corporation
CCF Co-operative Commonwealth Federation
CCW Congress of Canadian Women
CIB Criminal Investigation Branch
CMAJ Canadian Medical Association Journal
CPA Canadian Psychiatric Association
CPC Canadian Peace Congress
CP of C Communist Party of Canada
CSIS Canadian Security Intelligence Service
DEW Line Distance Early Warning Line
DND Department of National Defence
DOCR Defence of Canada Regulations
DSM Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders
EMO Emergency Measures Organization
FRC Federation of Russian Canadians
HCA Housewives Consumers’ Association
ICBM Intercontinental Ballistic Missile
LPP Labor Progressive Party
NATO North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NIMH National Institute of Mental Health
NFB National Film Board
NDP New Democratic Party
OPA Ontario Psychiatric Association
PAL Parents’ Action League
PROFUNC Prominent Functionaries of the Communist Party
RCMP Divisions:
   ‘A’ Eastern Ontario and Parts of Quebec
   ‘B’ Newfoundland
   ‘C’ Montreal
   ‘D’ Manitoba and Northern Ontario
   ‘E’ British Columbia
   ‘F’ Saskatchewan
   ‘G’ Hudson Bay Region
   ‘H’ Nova Scotia
   ‘J’ New Brunswick
   ‘K’ Alberta
   ‘L’ Prince Edward Island
   ‘O’ Southern Ontario
RCYO Russian Canadian Youth Organization
RWFC Russian Workers and Farmers Club
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SIP</td>
<td>Special Identification Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIRC</td>
<td>Security Intelligence Review Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TECHINET</td>
<td>American Technical Intelligence Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TPH</td>
<td>Toronto Psychiatric Hospital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UCLA</td>
<td>University of California, Los Angeles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WBA</td>
<td>Workers Benevolent Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WIDF</td>
<td>Women’s International Democratic Federation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

Permission to Use ............................................................................................................. i
Abstract ............................................................................................................................... ii
Acknowledgements ............................................................................................................ iii
List of Figures ....................................................................................................................... iii
List of Abbreviations .......................................................................................................... v

**INTRODUCTION** Contagion: Constructing and Maintaining the Cold War Threat ....... 1  
1. Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 1  
2. History ............................................................................................................................ 8  
3. Historiography ............................................................................................................... 15  
4. Methodology .................................................................................................................. 26  
5. Summary ......................................................................................................................... 33  
6. Conclusion ....................................................................................................................... 35

**PART ONE: CONTAINMENT**

**CHAPTER ONE** Anticipating Disaster: Planned Internment, Anti-communism, and the Threat of Cold War Infiltration ................................................................. 37  
1. Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 37  
2. Method: Containment ..................................................................................................... 39  
3. Canadian Anti-Communism ........................................................................................... 42  
5. Case Study: Operation Profunc ..................................................................................... 54  
6. Conclusion ....................................................................................................................... 62

**CHAPTER TWO** Isolation, Functionality, and Control: Planning Operation Profunc From ‘M’ Day to the Camp .............................................................. 66  
1. Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 66  
2. Method and Focus .......................................................................................................... 69  
3. Maintaining Security through Isolation, Secrecy, and Location .................................. 73  
4. Neys, Prince Albert, and Comox: Planned Internment ................................................ 84  
5. Conclusion ....................................................................................................................... 92

**CHAPTER THREE** Psychiatric Containment: Robert E. Turner and Efforts to Medicalize Homosexuality .................................................................................. 94  
1. Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 94  
2. Method and Focus .......................................................................................................... 99  
3. Sexuality, Normalcy, and the Fascination with ‘Deviance’ ............................................. 110  
4. Turner and Defining the “Most Common Deviation” .................................................... 116  
5. Conclusion ....................................................................................................................... 124
CHAPTER FOUR The Invisible Menace: Mental Illness, Sexuality, and the Fear of Deviancy
................................................................................................................. 126
1. Introduction.......................................................................................... 126
2. History: Medicalizing Sexuality .......................................................... 128
3. The Spectre of the Invisible Homosexual .......................................... 134
4. Invisible Threat of Mental Illness ....................................................... 142
5. Conclusion ....................................................................................... 147

PART TWO: SURVEILLANCE

CHAPTER FIVE From Dale of the Mounted to the Crash Plan: The RCMP and the Technology of Cold War Spying .................................................................................. 149
1. Introduction.......................................................................................... 149
2. Method: Surveillance ........................................................................... 152
3. The Mountie as Spy: 1957 and Growing Anxiety ............................ 156
4. Police Infiltration and Maintaining Normalcy .................................. 162
5. Conclusion ....................................................................................... 171

CHAPTER SIX “Handmaids in Soviet Service” and Other Front Organizations: Watching and Being Watched through Operation Profunc........................................................................ 173
1. Introduction.......................................................................................... 173
2. Method and Focus ............................................................................. 175
3. Workers Benevolent Association: Ukrainian Labour Associations and Socialism ......................................................... 178
4. Congress of Canadian Women: Subversion from within the Home 183
5. Canadian Peace Congress: Undermining the Superpowers through Pacifism.............................................................. 190
6. Conclusion ....................................................................................... 197

CHAPTER SEVEN Medicalization and Surveillance: The Expert, the Self, and the Culture of Anxiety .................................................................................................................. 199
1. Introduction.......................................................................................... 199
2. Method and Focus ............................................................................. 202
4. Surveillance through Diagnosis .......................................................... 215
5. Conclusion ....................................................................................... 227

CONCLUSION Quarantine and the Fear of Contagion .......................... 230
1. Introduction.......................................................................................... 230
2. Summary .......................................................................................... 235
3. Concluding the Two Case Studies ....................................................... 237
4. Conclusion ....................................................................................... 239

APPENDIX ......................................................................................... 241

BIBLIOGRAPHY .................................................................................. 242
INTRODUCTION Contagion: Constructing and Maintaining the Cold War Threat

1. Introduction

In 1951, in the midst of Cold War fears about communist infiltration, British Columbia’s RCMP division evaluated the use of an old immigration quarantine station at William Head for the purpose of interning communists in the case of a national emergency. A memo from British Columbia’s ‘E’ Division stated:

The group of buildings comprising the Quarantine Station are located on a peninsula in a sparsely settled area of Vancouver Island and could be isolated without the slightest difficulty. The location of the various buildings and their construction are such that guarding would not be difficult. The various buildings would house a total of approximately five hundred internees comfortably over a lengthy period and could be used as a permanent internment camp.¹

Built in 1893 to secure the health of the new province during an immigration boom and following an outbreak of smallpox,² the William Head Quarantine Station’s location provided guards with a strategic and unobstructed view of their surroundings.³ The facility, therefore, was a key point of surveillance at the province’s Pacific gateway protecting the population from alien infiltration. In the context of the Cold War, an era of intensified surveillance and anxiety about international and domestic communism, the quarantine station promised an additional service to national security. ‘E’ Division anticipated that as an internment camp for Canadian communists in the case of a national emergency William Head station would effectively separate the threat of what was considered contagious political ideology from the rest of the population. This anxiety about infiltration was deeply influenced by contemporary fears about radiation and nuclear destruction. At the foundation of the fear about Cold War invasion was concern for the future and the state of normalcy within society.

This plan for communist quarantine was part of a larger program of surveillance and a nation-wide plan to arrest and detain Canadian leftists in the event of a national emergency.

² Peter Johnson, Quarantined: Life and Death at William Head Station, 1872-1959 (Victoria: Heritage House Publishing Company Ltd.), 100.
³ “Internment Camp – Policy ‘E’ Division,” memo from C. W. Harvison to RCMP Commissioner, 4 May 1951. LAC.
Introduction

Within the context of heightened fear of fifth column\(^4\) activity, subversion, and Soviet espionage during the Cold War, Canadian defence ran a program of widespread surveillance called Operation ‘Profunc’ beginning in the late 1940s. Building on long-standing anti-communist sentiment within Canada, along with decades of RCMP surveillance of Bolshevism and left-wing activity, Operation Profunc looked to previous episodes of wartime civilian internment in its plan for a possible Cold War conflict. Operation Profunc ran for three decades, ending in 1983 just prior to the creation of the civilian-based surveillance agency CSIS in June 1984.\(^5\) During this time, the RCMP and Department of National Defence devoted specific resources to this top-secret plan that ran parallel to other counter-subversion and counter-espionage programs.\(^6\) The three-decade-long operation closely monitored suspected individuals, identified as “PROminent FuncTionaries of the Communist Party,”\(^7\) with the purpose of arresting, detaining, and later interning them in the case of a war with a Communist power.

The suggestion of ‘E’ Division planners to use an immigration quarantine station for the purpose of protecting Canada against the spread of communism during a war provides several hints of how a potential war was imagined during the 1950s and 1960s. At this time, the Canadian Cold War threat was portrayed as both definite and vague, as something that oozed through society and as an alien force that spread through the familiar. Consequently, communism in Canada could take the form of the average citizen. The threat was ultimately deemed contagious, evident in both the portrayal of communist infiltration and the apparent need to ‘quarantine’ potentially dangerous individuals. As one memo stated: “The building could be segregated without difficulty.”\(^8\) In this sense, ‘E’ Division’s plan to use the William Head Quarantine Station was particularly symbolic of the way in which the Cold War threat was

\(^4\) The term “fifth column” originated in the Spanish Civil War when a general in Franco’s army, marching upon Madrid, claimed there was a ‘fifth column’ of communist supporters within the city who would take it from the inside. The term referred to sabotage from within and became increasingly popular in the rhetoric and discourse of security and defence during the Cold War. According to historian John E. Haynes, the idea of ‘fifth column’ carried “biomedical implications for the body politic.” John E. Haynes, Red Scare or Red Menace: American Communism and Anticommunism in the Cold War Era (Chicago: Ivan R. Dee, 1996), 18.

\(^5\) “Canadian Security Intelligence Service”

\(^6\) RCMP surveillance files under the heading “Profunc,” or something similar, go back to the 1930s. ‘E’ Division, for instance, has documents that go back to 1938 while other files including one labelled “Prominent Communist Functionaries (PRFUNC)” covers RCMP surveillance of groups and public figures such as Tim Buck through the war years. “Prominent Communist Functionaries (PRFUNC).” Reference no. 88 ATIP: 99-A-0027, LAC.

\(^7\) This would also refer to the Labor Progressive Party, as the Canadian Communist party changed names throughout the twentieth century from the ‘Communist Party of Canada’ to the ‘Labor Progressive Party’ and back again.

\(^8\) “Internment Camp – Policy ‘E’ Division,” memo from C. W. Harvison to Interment Operations, 4 May 1951. LAC.
articulated and envisioned as a contamination or disease. While internment was not enacted, Operation Profunc was realized through the steady surveillance and monitoring of ‘prominent functionaries’ for subversive action and thought. Unlike other cases of actual incarceration, such as that of communist leaders following the First World War, during the Great Depression, and the internment of Canadian leftists during the Second World War, Operation Profunc’s plan defined the anticipation for attack that was prevalent in Cold War North America. This was an era that was militarily and culturally defined by the nuclear bomb and its possible devastation.

According to the documents available, ‘E’ Division did not gain access to the old quarantine station for the purpose of internment. Not only was it unnecessary, given the way in which the Cold War unfolded without direct military conflict between Canada and the Soviet Union, the project also failed to acquire the institution in the event of such an emergency. Regardless, it remains undeniably relevant to the larger history of Cold War Canada. This short episode in defence planning epitomized the call for security in the face of subversion. From a wider perspective, the recently declassified Operation Profunc documents provide historians with a new chapter in the history of Canadian Cold War surveillance and security. Through analysing this otherwise untouched component of Canadian Cold War history, this dissertation examines how previous concepts of wartime internment would have not only continued during a Cold War emergency but would have expanded, incorporating a wider desire to contain and control an apparently devastating and contagious threat to society and national security: communism.

The Cold War fear of contamination and contagion was not restricted to communism. It also included homosexuality as a destructive force linked to communism through its apparent social deviancy that threatened the breakdown of society and national insecurity. Like communism, homosexuality was also considered contagious, albeit in a different way. Authorities considered it a force that operated below the surface; similar to domestic communists masquerading as ‘normal’ Canadians, homosexuals could appear innocuously as heterosexuals.

---

9 Letter from C. W. Harvison to W. Dick, 1 June 1951. LAC. Despite this development, the site was still considered ideal by the RCMP a few years later: “It is considered here that the William Head Quarantine Station offers facilities not elsewhere existing in B.C. at the present time. Should the R.C.N. [Royal Canadian Navy] decide not to use this installation as a Gunnery School, it is felt that it would be ideal for our purposes, both as a Reception Centre and later as a permanent Internment Camp.” “Re: Internment Operations – General Reception Centres,” letter from W. J. Butler to RCMP Commissioner, 2 July 1953. LAC. Original emphasis.

10 “National insecurity,” used most famously by Reg Whitaker and Gary Marcuse in their 1994 Cold War Canada: The Making of an Insecurity State, was also used from Keith Nelson and B. J. C. McKercher eds. Go Spy the Land (1992) and H. W. Bonds, The Devil We Know (1993).
This elusiveness of the homosexual’s identification through physical appearance and mannerisms was articulated in Canadian physician Samuel R. Laycock’s 1950 article “Homosexuality – a Mental Hygiene Problem” in the Canadian Medical Association Journal (CMAJ). He stated: “The general public, backed by the opinion of some clinicians, thinks that homosexuals can be picked out by their appearance and behaviour.”11 The ability to easily identify homosexuals, he noted, was not the case: “Caution must, therefore, be exercised in picking out homosexuals by appearance and manner alone. The only true test of degree of homosexuality is the degree to which the psychic and/or overt sex interests and activities are directed towards the opposite sex.”12 In this article, Laycock addressed the need to medicalize homosexuality through psychiatry. He detailed the complexities of identifying homosexuals and the importance of scientific method in helping treat homosexual patients. His article worked to explain homosexuality to an apparently uneducated readership, answering the following questions: “What is a homosexual?”; “How do homosexuals get that way?”; and “How to help homosexuals?” Laycock’s article was timely. It was written two years after American biologist Alfred Kinsey’s famous text on male sexuality, three years before Kinsey’s 1953 publication on female sexuality, and two years before the American Psychiatric Association’s (APA) first edition of the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (DSM), which clinically defined homosexuality as a sexual deviation. The manual kept this classification of homosexuality from 1952 until 1974 when it was officially deleted from the DSM following public debates between psychiatrists and protests from gay activists. Within this context, a few years later in 1956, the Toronto Psychiatric Hospital with the University of Toronto Department of Psychiatry opened a ‘Forensic Clinic.’ The clinic was the result of mounting pressure from the community to address sex crimes within society.13 Although not initially directed at ‘sex deviates,’14 the clinic became infamous for its work on sexual deviancy with specific attention to homosexuality.

Homosexuality had been a subject of study and interest since the mid-nineteenth century in the early days of modern psychiatry and psychology. The nineteenth-century study of

---

13 Elise Chenier, Strangers in Our Midst: Sexual Deviancy in Postwar Ontario (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2008), 118.
sexology shifted the subject of homosexuality away from the rhetoric of religion and morality focusing instead on the apparent causes of the so-called condition. Richard von Kraft-Ebing was especially important to late-nineteenth-century European studies of sexual deviance. His monumental text, *Psychopathia Sexualis* (1886), was foundational to how homosexuality was interpreted by sexologists, suggesting that its existence was contingent on environmental and inherited factors. Kraft-Ebing was one of a number of European scientists discussing the theories of heredity and inversion during the nineteenth century; however *Psychopathia Sexualis* was the first comprehensive and thorough biomedical account of sexual deviation, influencing the study into the twentieth century. Sigmund Freud was also influential to the study of sexuality and his psychoanalytical approach presented new theories of sexuality at the turn of the twentieth century. Freud argued that homosexuality was not a form of degeneracy but was in fact a ‘normal,’ albeit underdeveloped, form of sexuality. Freud’s method of psychoanalysis remained popular throughout the twentieth century. Many of his followers within the APA, however, disregarded his views on homosexuality preferring the idea that it was not only deviant but could be contracted through environment or passed through heredity. This approach reflected the conservative views of several members of the APA whose research and outlook was influenced by Christian values and sexual normalcy.

The pathologization of homosexuality during the mid-twentieth century took a different form from that of the nineteenth century as scientific, medical, and psychiatric studies gained public interest. Kinsey was partly responsible for the popularization of the study of sex following the Second World War. His two studies on male and female sexualities were bestsellers and eagerly read by the wider public as well as professionals. While sex has been, not surprisingly, a consistent subject of interest among humans, the 1950s culture of modern science and medicine

---

17 Bayer, Homosexuality and American Psychiatry, 24.
18 These followers included Irving Bieber and Charles Socarides who embraced psychoanalytic method but took the view that homosexuality was abnormal and a symptom of mental illness. This will be discussed in more detail in Chapter Seven.
transformed the interest into something rooted in science. Cold War sexual psychiatry surpassed
the Victorian fascination with sexology, fostering a culture of pseudo-science and popular
fascination with psychiatric method. Laycock’s 1950 article captures the medical perception of
homosexuality in an era that glorified scientific progress. The article stresses the importance of
understanding homosexuality and its origins in order to unmask and demystify the condition. The
goal of this study according to Laycock was to prevent individuals who suffered from the so-
called ‘handicap’ from engaging in anti-social behaviour, all the while encouraging them to seek
treatment and psychotherapy:

Homosexuals are handicapped persons in our society. Like all handicapped persons, they need help in accepting their handicap objectively and then going on to realize their potentialities. As in the case of all handicapped folk, it frequently is not the handicap that is the major problem but how the individual feels about his handicap.

The homosexual could only be considered well when seeking medical aid, acknowledging the illness or disorder. Laycock’s statement and patronizingly sympathetic approach betrayed his belief in sexual normalcy, which was accentuated by his use of the term ‘handicapped.’ This article and others in the journal used ‘handicap’ to describe sexual abnormality and conditions that were socially and psychologically inhibiting. According to Laycock, the problem was psychological. By defining homosexuality as something other than an individual’s deviancy, and rather as disorder, Laycock took an apparently sympathetic approach. But this brand of sympathy proved to be as destructive as the contemporary police vetting of same-sex activity. Rather than being arrested and imprisoned, therefore criminalized, gay men and women became patients and subjects of often damaging psychiatric practices, thus medicalized. Evident in this process was the emphasis on potentiality of damage, one that was reflected in the active surveillance of Canadian leftists through the Cold War.

Laycock instructed his readers – namely physicians, psychiatrists, social workers, and the clergy – that their role was to understand the individual, encourage normalcy, and to ultimately treat disorder. With knowledge of the psychology of homosexuality, medical practitioners were to take the role of guide and protector of the patient: “Those who deal with homosexuals must

21 Within the heterosexual domestic context, the idea of the woman’s role in the marriage transitioned from Victorian sexual repression, the toleration of sex for the purpose of reproduction, to sexual containment during the 1950s within the “erotically charged marriage.” Elaine Tyler May, Homeward Bound: American Families in the Cold War Era (New York: Basic Books, 1988), 99.
22 Laycock, “Homosexuality – A Mental Hygiene Problem,” 249.
first of all have a sane, objective view of the problem themselves.” Laycock’s use of ‘sane’ and ‘objective’ referred to the apparent need for clear guidance of a group of people whose sense of sanity was, in his view, compromised. More importantly, sanity and objectivity were equated with heterosexuality and professionalism, implying that homosexuals were unable to reason. Additionally, Laycock’s article stated that the problem was ultimately medical; guilt had no place in this age of medicine and scientific objectivity. The article used scientific method and psychiatry to stress the importance of maintaining normalcy within both the individual and society. This combination of faith in scientific objectivity and sexual normalcy spoke to the contemporary anxiety about the inability to define and detect threats to society and security. Homosexuals, as Laycock had noted, were ultimately undetectable without the power of medical and scientific process.

The transference of the classification of ‘deviant’ sexuality, which still existed into the 1960s despite Kinsey’s claims of the regularity of same-sex activity, from amorality to illegality and illness, reflected the contemporary fears of enemy infiltration. Homosexuality, it was believed, threatened domestic security in an era that defined the nuclear family as the epitome of normalcy and safety. In this sense, homosexuality was feared as a corrupting force to domestic security in the same way that communism was for national security and nuclear war was for the safety of the nation, citizen, and future of humanity.

There were several connections between communism and homosexuality during the Cold War that existed within the wider context of fear and surveillance. The first link between the two was contagion. At the very foundation of Cold War anxiety about infiltration was the fear that both communism and homosexuality were not only abnormal but also to some degree contagious. This fear was ignited by the very real implications of the Gouzenko Affair – the existence of Soviet Spy rings in North America. The second link was the atomization of threat, or the psychological and social internalization of Cold War fears that established citizens as microcosms of the larger patterns of global paradigmatic divides. Cold War vetting reflected a larger system of surveillance and anxiety through the specific attention paid towards leftists and

---

23 Laycock, 248.
gays and lesbians. Not only did police, governments, and medical professionals identify these two groups as abnormal and weak, but they also considered them dangerous because of their rejection of capitalist and heterosexual domestic normalcy. Finally, the third link between communism and homosexuality in the case of Cold War construction and maintenance of threat was potentiality. Both the planned internment of communists in Canada and the medicalization of homosexuality throughout North America were built on the idea that illegal action was not the only thing that made individuals culpable – intent was also destructive to the self and society. As scholars Elizabeth Grace and Colin Leys state in their discussion of subversion, “since the Cold War is ultimately about ideas and values, the ‘enemy within’ may do as much damage by the ideas it advocates as by any concrete act. Hence thought-control becomes a legitimate state activity.”

The question of potentiality was at the heart of this fear about subversion and expectation of disaster during the Cold War. Operation Profunc was based on the idea that a certain population of Canada could engage in subversive behaviour in the event of a future war or Communist attack, and stemmed from the growing concerns of espionage and the selling of state and nuclear secrets. The medicalization of homosexuality redirected the definition of sexual ‘abnormality’ from action to personality, focusing on individuals’ sexual desires rather than sexual acts.

Operation Profunc and the medicalization of homosexuality defined Cold War anxiety in Canada and North America within military and civilian spheres and through private and public operations. At the centre of Cold War anxieties about invasion and infiltration, of anti-communism and homophobia, were the accompanying fears of lack of control, disrupted normalcy, and subversive solidarity. The Cold War enemy was invisible, covert, and difficult, if not impossible, to detect. In the nuclear age, the perceived threats of communism and homosexuality mirrored the silent and unmanageable poison of radiation that, like a disease, infected indiscriminately.

2. History

At the foundation of Cold War anxieties was the nuclear bomb and complete destruction, bringing already established anti-communist sentiments to another level. The American

---

27 Laycock, 246.
construction and use of the atomic bomb at the close of the Second World War altered the expectations and concerns for future war. The atomic bomb, or fission bomb, was not only larger than conventional weapons but had the complicating element of radioactivity.\(^{29}\) The politics of the bomb and the fear of nuclear war intensified with the increase of weapons worldwide and the rapidly changing technology that enabled more efficient and deadly means of destruction.\(^{30}\) The power of the atomic bomb was made clear with the Trinity Test in July 1945 that was then followed by the bombing of Japan that August. By 1949 the Soviet Union had built and detonated its own atomic bomb. In 1952 the Americans created the hydrogen bomb, or fusion bomb, that was soon replicated by the Soviets.\(^{31}\) By 1957 nuclear weaponry had escalated to quicker means of delivery and destruction with the Soviet invention of Intercontinental Ballistic Missiles (ICBMs). This transformation of nuclear delivery radically changed the nature of defence against nuclear attacks.\(^{32}\)

The nuclear threat was clearly driven by the collective anticipation of military action as the two superpowers continued to intimidate each other with increasingly deadly weapons. With the birth of nuclear weapons came nuclear deterrence. As military historian Robert O’Connell states, “Henceforth, the chief purpose of military establishments would no longer be ‘to win wars’ but ‘to avert them.’”\(^{33}\) The nuclear threat was invisible on two levels: an attack could arrive with little or no warning, and the superpowers were engaged in an arms race that was built on the fear of destruction and global dominance. War was, as O’Connell described, an aversion tactic.\(^{34}\)


\(^{30}\) Peace organizations and medical groups quickly contested the American attacks on Hiroshima and Nagasaki in 1945, American nuclear dominance, and the continued creation of nuclear weapons throughout the Cold War. One such organization was the Canadian Peace Congress that was tied to international peace organizations and therefore deemed threatening to national security. This group is discussed in more detail in Chapter Six.

\(^{31}\) The primary ingredient of the fission bomb, Uranium-235, was relatively scarce. The fusion bomb, however, could use synthetically prepared elements like Plutonium, thus eliminating the concern for availability of resources. By the late 1950s the availability of Plutonium made for easier manufacturing of nuclear weapons and what was a secret weapon in 1945 became standard by 1962. Michael Mandelbaum, *The Nuclear Future* (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1983), 44-45.


\(^{34}\) The basis of the nuclear arms race was an unwillingness to engage in war and the belief that to maintain order was to maintain the superpower dichotomy. O’Connell, 297. Mutually Assured Destruction (MAD) embodied the nature of Cold War deterrence. The concept of assured destruction developed between the United States and Soviet Union
Introduction

Between the late 1940s and early 1990s there were several occasions when the Cold War nearly became ‘hot.’ These points of near destruction included, but were not limited to, the Suez Crisis of 1956, the 1962 Cuban Missile Crisis, the crash of a B-52 bomber carrying a nuclear payload near Greenland in 1968, and two computer glitches that led the West to believe that the Soviets had launched a first strike in 1979 and in 1980. Actual nuclear attack, therefore, did not characterize the Cold War. Rather, the era and the influence of military technology on society and culture were driven by the expectation of nuclear destruction that in turn influenced the construction and maintenance of perceived national threats.

Accompanying the increased nuclear threat was the growing culture of civil defence. Plans for civilian preparedness shifted considerably over the decades, at times appearing ignorant of the long-term effects of nuclear radiation on the environment and the body while at other points seeming to be willfully deceptive about the realistic danger of radioactivity. As scientific and medical knowledge about the effects of nuclear radiation improved throughout the 1950s and into the 1960s, the plans for civilian preparedness leaned more towards the effort to control

by the mid-1950s, and gave the state permission to destroy its enemy with retaliatory nuclear strike even after it was attacked. By being the first to attack another state, therefore, the offensive state would be committing suicide. Mueller, “Strategic Airpower and Nuclear Strategy,” 295. MAD was military diplomacy that fit a new era of warfare, its acronym capturing the mood of the period while representing its sense of fragility.

Although, as historian Sarah Fox explains, the Cold War was ‘hot’ for thousands of American civilians living and working around test sites and uranium mines. The fact that citizens were affected by radiation from mining and atmospheric tests run by their own government, rather than from an attack by the Soviet Union or other Communist power, challenged the binaries of ‘Us’ and ‘Them’ that defined the Cold War. Sarah Alisabeth Fox, Downwind: A People’s History of the Nuclear West (Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press, 2014), 5-6.

On 9 November 1979 four command centres for American nuclear arsenal received data that the USSR had launched a strike against the United States. After some investigation the Americans discovered that computer software used for training purposes depicted a worst-case scenario of a Soviet first strike attack. In June 1980, displays at NORAD, the Strategic Air Command (SAC), and the Pentagon suddenly indicated that enemy nuclear weapons had been detected. At first these displays were interpreted as a false alarm but when days later the same information appeared on the displays, technicians discovered that the data was the result of a faulty computer chip and bad wiring. Another near miss took place on a night in September 1983 when a new computer was installed at a Soviet station monitoring American missiles by satellite. Lieutenant Colonel Stanislav Petrov, a scientist, who replaced the usual operator, was given instructions that should the computer detect American missiles he should press a button to alert Soviet military authorities of an American launch. When five American ICBMs were detected later that night Petrov hesitated before reporting the alleged attack, reasoning that an American first strike would likely consist of more than five missiles and also that the computer was new and could be prone to glitches. After checking the Soviet ground-based radar, Petrov saw no indication of an American attack and the potential crisis was averted. Physicians Dale Dewar and Florian Oelck note that in the years following the end of the Cold War there have been several other nuclear near misses but these mistakes are highly classified. Dale Dewar and Florian Oelck, From Hiroshima to Fukushima to You: A Primer on Radiation and Health (Toronto: Between the Lines, 2014), 135-36.

Frances Reilly, “The Consumption of Science and Technology: Canadian Atomic Culture during the Cold War” Master of Arts Thesis (Edmonton, University of Alberta, 2008), 45.
potential panic than to offer information about potential war.\textsuperscript{38} The fallout shelter was one of the more iconic symbols of suburban Cold War culture even though few North Americans had them in their backyards.\textsuperscript{39} While there were some plans for public and municipal shelters in Canadian cities, civilians were encouraged to build their own fallout shelters with plans provided by Canadian and American civil defence organizations. Ultimately, the success of these shelters was based on the willingness of participation and the financial capabilities of a middle-class suburban population. Evacuation operations, while appearing slightly more egalitarian, were also based on consumer society and suburban orderliness.\textsuperscript{40}

These defence plans, while at times providing useful infrastructure for non-military emergencies such as natural disasters, provide a glimpse of what the Third World War might have been like. These were plans that attempted to prepare civilians and government alike for a war of unprecedented magnitude. The fission bomb was twice used in wartime, but the fusion bomb existed only in its extensive tests in supposedly unpopulated regions such as deserts, islands in the Central Pacific, and the ocean.\textsuperscript{41} There was more to nuclear war than blast and even radiation, as deadly as these would be; there was the threat of complete societal breakdown. This psychological nature of potential war, driven by both the anticipation of attack and its aftermath, epitomized the threat of infiltration and the need for containment.

The threat of infiltration was evident in the preparations for guarding against possible fifth column activity. The strong divide between the two superpowers spoke to the efforts to maintain control in a period of threat and anxiety. American Senator Joseph McCarthy dominated American anti-communism in the 1950s, creating a culture of fear, hysteria, paranoia, and surveillance that was soon known as ‘McCarthyism.’ The House Committee on Un-American Activities created blacklists, accused individuals of communist activity, and held publicized inquisitions that damned often innocent Americans of seditious activity in an


\textsuperscript{39} Burtch, Give Me Shelter, 156.

\textsuperscript{40} Operation ‘Lifesaver,’ the publicized evacuation of Calgary in September 1955, included options for citizens without cars to leave the city, either by city bus or by carpooling with neighbours. The plan’s expected success, however, was largely dependent on citizens’ accessibility to private transportation and the location of the program—a new suburban neighbourhood of Calgary with easy access to surrounding areas. Reilly, 107.

extensive modern-day ‘witch-hunt.’ As the Soviet Union expanded through Eastern Europe and Communism spread through Southeast Asia during the 1950s, the West, led by the extreme political views of the United States, imagined Communism to be a political and ideological contagion that had to be contained.\(^42\)

In Canada, this divide and fear was evident in a few ways. One was the country’s participation, or lack thereof, in the nuclear arms race. By 1952, four nations had the capacity to build a fission bomb because of scientific and technological capabilities along with access to the crucial ingredient, Uranium-235. At this time, out of these four countries only three, the United States in 1945, the Soviet Union in 1949, and the United Kingdom in 1952, constructed and tested nuclear bombs. The fourth country, Canada, contributed its nuclear scientists and its uranium to international operations such as the Manhattan Project but never built a nuclear bomb of its own.\(^43\) Beyond its precarious geographical location between the two superpowers, Canada was also affected by the residues of McCarthyism that drifted across the border.\(^44\) Fears of possible military retribution from the United States were further spurred by the American occupation of the north through the Distance Early Warning (DEW) Line.\(^45\) This radar system, constructed with the purpose of warning Canadian and American forces of attacking Soviet bombers, lost its usefulness to Canada with the invention of ICBMs that nearly coincided with the project’s completion.\(^46\)

The Cold War divide in the Canadian context was also evident in the nation’s war on communism.\(^47\) Though less publicized than the McCarthy trials it was nevertheless extensive. Evident in the existence of Operation Profunc, Canada’s Cold War against communism was quiet, steady, and persistent.\(^48\) The Cold War culture of anti-communism, fostered by the extreme geo-political divide between East and West, gave credence to a well-established campaign against leftist politics in Canada. Operation Profunc epitomized Canada’s culture of

\(^{42}\) This is evident in George Kennan’s Containment Theory that will be discussed in more detail in Chapter One.

\(^{43}\) Both Canada and Britain contributed scientists to the Manhattan Project, although Canada did not enjoy the same security that Britain did. The project left Canada with a clear understanding that its contribution and role in providing Uranium was exclusive to the United States. Reg Whitaker and Gary Marcuse, Cold War Canada: The Making of an Insecurity State, 1945-1957 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1994), 44-45.

\(^{44}\) Kinsman and Gentile, The Canadian War on Queers, 10.

\(^{45}\) Whitaker and Marcuse, Cold War Canada, 145.

\(^{46}\) Reilly, 16.

\(^{47}\) Communism, with a capital-C, refers to that which is state-based as in the Soviet Union and the People’s Republic of China while “communism” refers to the ideology in general.

\(^{48}\) This was evident especially in the 1960s and 1970s when citizens under surveillance were categorized as national threats more for their ties to leftist politics than to the FLQ. This will be discussed in more detail in Chapter Five.
paranoia during the Cold War, defining the deep-seated climate of anti-communism and culture of surveillance that stemmed from the post-First World War era with the creation of the interventionist state and the growing fear of Canadian Bolshevism.

The militaristic threat of nuclear war and the political danger of communist infiltration tell only one aspect of the Cold War. The nuclear bomb and communism were linked by more than the frightening prospect of Soviet domination of the West. They were linked by the covert menaces of espionage and potential attack, and the danger of complete destruction, which were increasingly difficult to detect thanks to rapidly changing technology. These two elements also applied to the apparent dangers that homosexuality posed to society, politics, and the individual. Ironically, the methods used to target these perceived dangers in the name of national security and normalcy in turn threatened human rights and civil liberties in Canada.

The prospect and worried anticipation of nuclear war characterized the era and challenged established rules of military combat. In the atomic age and in the context of a possible nuclear war the battlefield became obsolete. While the superpowers worked to dissuade each other from destruction, civilians became the central character and target of war.\textsuperscript{49} Threatening unprecedented damage through immediate blast and then the lingering effects of radiation, the nuclear bomb pushed governments and organizations into a new era of defence and disaster planning. Radiation was menacing particularly in its silent and invisible contamination of the environment. This ability to stealthily poison and kill provided an added dimension to warfare and its concomitant threat. The menace of espionage and fifth column activity shifted the focus from external threats to domestic threats. Here the role of the civilian transitioned from one of target, in the case of nuclear war, to danger, in the case of domestic communism. Indeed similarities arose between the Cold War and conflicts such as the Second World War where authorities warned civilians against spreading information and jeopardizing military operations. But what set the Cold War apart was the concept of infiltration and the overwhelming idea that civilians posing as ‘normal’ Canadians could compromise security not only by acting as the fifth column but also by challenging core values of society, democracy, and normalcy. To security officials, communism was like radiation or a virus: it could seep into a population, infect it, and transform it into something unrecognizable.

\textsuperscript{49} Mueller, 295.
Operation Profunc’s plans for the quarantine station and Laycock’s *CMAJ* article both illustrate the way in which disease provided a model to describe communism and homosexuality during the Cold War. ‘E’ Division’s 1951 proposal showed how the symbolism of disease was prevalent, if subtle, in Canada’s plans for potential war. Evident in the operation to intern communists at the old immigration quarantine station, the Cold War exploited a decidedly different meaning of contagion from that of the nineteenth century when the institution was constructed. In the 1950s, the disease that apparently threatened the Canadian public was not viral or bacterial but ideological. This transformation spoke both to an enthusiasm for medicine and modern science as a ‘fix all’ and to the manner in which communism was conceptualized as a menace, symbolically replacing smallpox, tuberculosis, and influenza as the new contagion. While the subject of Canadian anti-communism is prominent within Canadian Cold War scholarship, the construction of communism as a figurative contagion within Canadian society is not. It is for this reason that Operation Profunc is one of the focal points of this dissertation about threat and anxiety during the Cold War. It is telling that in an era glorifying science, technology, and medicine that the threat to safety and security was symbolically linked to disease. What better example of this articulation than the desired use of a quarantine station, an institution dedicated to protecting the nation against alien disease, as a means of censoring debate and discussion in a period of heightened security.

In his 1950 article, Laycock wrote, “Finally, homosexuals must be helped to discover for themselves that it is fun to be reasonably normal and that it pays great dividends.” Sexual psychiatry fits within the history of Cold War surveillance through its classification of the ‘other.’ By categorizing activity according to normalcy, sexual psychiatry worked to manage a perceived threat to society. Cold War historians have connected homosexuality and communism through the classification of ‘character weakness’ throughout the 1950s and 1960s. Homosexuality was often considered as both the result and cause of communist infiltration. This was particularly evident in Canada’s case of the ambassador John Watkins, who was caught having sexual affairs with men in the Soviet Union and later died under mysterious circumstances.

---

50 Laycock, 249-250.
circumstances. In fact, the similarities between the two constructed threats extended beyond this apparent concern for men’s seduction into deviancy to a larger issue of compromised security at the hands of sexual ‘abnormality.’ ‘Character weakness’ points to the growing concern for mental health, control over the self, and the danger of potentially abnormal behaviour. The connection between communism and homosexuality in the context of the Cold War was, on the surface, about national security. At its foundation, however, the fear about both was not only about so-called abnormality but the wider effects and damages to society.

3. Historiography

The defining text on American Cold War culture and society is Elaine Tyler May’s 1988 *Homeward Bound: American Families in the Cold War Era*, which challenges various assumptions about the structure of American society and the nuclear family. The gender norms of the 1950s, May states, were not a return to tradition but were in fact a reaction to the state of contemporary politics and society following the Second World War. In her influential study, May confronts the idea that the suburban nuclear family was isolated and oblivious to contemporary politics, arguing that this was not an era when people simply turned inward to enjoy postwar prosperity. One of her more explicit and memorable examples of how the Cold War leached into all facets of culture and society during the 1950s was a news clipping of a newly-wedded couple preparing to spend their honeymoon in their bomb shelter. May uses this now famous example to demonstrate both the domesticity of the bomb in the form of a matrimonial fallout shelter and the militarization of the family. The effect of the bomb on domestic culture was evident in the newly-weds’ decision to begin their married life in preparation for a nuclear apocalypse. This example also indirectly plays on the concept of Cold War containment, a theme central to the era as discussed in this dissertation and to which May

---


54 May, 3.

55 Ibid., 1.
refers as the “key to security.” Her cultural examination of the period through film and literature shows the strong ties between the family, sexuality, and war. Her work provides a significant model for Canadian Cold War studies as it addresses the connection between society and military technology in an era defined by militaristic terms such as the ‘nuclear family’ and the domestication of the bomb. The use of domestic terminology to describe the militarization of the home, such as referring to the bomb shelter as the ‘pantry,’ enforced gender roles and the importance of the family in a period fearing conflict.

May’s book is important to this dissertation and to the larger study of Cold War culture and society because of the connection it makes between the individual and the larger Cold War. Along with scholars such as Paul Boyer, May brought people into the history of the Cold War encouraging studies about atomic culture for an era that had otherwise been divided into discussions of politics and political figures, proxy wars, and military technology. While May and scholars like her drew attention to Cold War citizens, individuals, although typically ‘Great Men,’ have symbolized the larger conflict throughout the Cold War. Because of its span from the late 1940s to the early 1990s the Cold War is often divided into specific eras, many of which are defined by the leadership of the time. Truman, Eisenhower, and Kennedy, for instance, are used as key indicators of the separate eras in American Cold War history. Joseph McCarthy has also

56 Ibid., 16.
57 Ibid., 60.
58 Ibid., 101. Sociologist Guy Oakes also addressed the domestication of war. He cited civil defence handbooks that encouraged housewives to conceptualize radiation as “just another form of household dirt that could be managed by simple techniques and the addition of another appliance, a Geiger counter.” Guy Oakes, The Imaginary War: Civil Defence and American Cold War Culture (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994), 126.
62 One example of this is John G. Stoessinger’s article about the war in Vietnam from Truman to Nixon where the policies of each presidency were symbolized in the American presence in Vietnam. John G. Stoessinger, “A Greek Tragedy in Five Acts: Vietnam” in Why Nations Go to War (Boston and New York: Bedford/St. Martin’s, 2001).
been used to represent a different type of era, his name often synonymous with anti-communism, ‘witch-hunts,’ and paranoid surveillance.\(^{63}\)

Historian Martin McCauley addresses the historical and historiographical shifts of the early Cold War in his 2003 *The Origins of the Cold War, 1941-1949*. Examining a period that experienced a clear divide between the United States and the Soviet Union and their respective politics, McCauley points to the way in which scholarship had evolved from discussions of blame to more nuanced interpretations of the international conflict.\(^{64}\) This shift involved the movement away from the orthodox interpretation of the conflict that focused on Soviet hostility and expansionism. This revisionist approach rejected the Western-centred analysis of the Cold War, transferring the blame from the East to the West and criticising American foreign policy under President Truman during the Second World War.\(^{65}\) The post-revisionist approach specifically avoided the blame polarities that were at the centre of the earlier historical methods.\(^{66}\) These historiographical shifts reflected the contemporary political and activist interpretations of the conflict. The revisionist approach was closely associated with the protest movements of the Vietnam War and the emergence of the “New Left” in the late 1960s and 1970s.\(^{67}\) The Vietnam War and its aftermath challenged the American understanding of communist threat and Cold War dichotomy, which was also evident in 1960 when the Soviets shot down American pilot Francis Gary Powers. Putting him on trial for espionage, the Soviets exposed the existence of four years of American spying on Soviet fighters and anti-aircraft missiles.\(^{68}\) This event jolted the American paradigm of Cold War espionage, shifting the spotlight on Soviet international surveillance to shed light on similar activity conducted by the Americans.

---


\(^{66}\) McCauley notes that one branch of the post-revisionist interpretation was inspired by American historian John Gaddis’s 1972 *The United States and the Origins of the Cold War, 1941-1947* which examined the containment policy and the complex relationship between the West and the Soviet Union that was the result of the allied efforts to combat Nazi Germany during the Second World War. McCauley, 15.

\(^{67}\) Ibid., 12.

In Canada the historiographical blame polarities were more complex. As with the Americans, there was the understood ‘Us’ and ‘Them’ divide between the two superpowers, but as a neighbour of the United States, Canada has often differentiated itself from the more extreme views of American Cold War anti-communist policies. Understanding that the lack of a House Committee on Un-Canadian Activities equalled a lack of communist surveillance and vetting, Canadian historians have been slow to develop a more nuanced approach to the Cold War within Canada. Canada’s differentiation from the United States was particularly evident in the history of the nuclear bomb and northern defence systems. But despite its popular image of peacekeeping, Canada was not a nation existing solely under Pearsonian diplomacy. Throughout the 1990s and into the twenty-first century, several Canadian historians have challenged this iconic image of Canada to consider more unsavoury aspects of the nation’s history.

Political scientist Reg Whitaker is one of the foundational figures in Canadian Cold War historiography for his approach to Canadian security and control. His work on RCMP surveillance and anti-communism in Canada counters the American assumption that Canadian Cold War society was a northern version of the United States. His work challenges the other popular myth entertained by many Canadians that Canada was a friendlier nation towards communism than its neighbour. Whitaker’s work on the nature of RCMP Cold War surveillance and the recent development of CSIS in 1984 was well established by the late-1980s. One of his more important publications is the 1994 study co-authored by Gary Marcuse, Cold War Canada: The Making of a National Insecurity State, 1945-1957. Focusing on Canada’s early Cold War

---

69 Whitaker and Marcuse, 13.
70 Richard Cavell, ed. Love, Hate, and Fear in Canada’s Cold War (Toronto: University Toronto Press, 2004), 10-11.
72 Grace and Leys, 69. It should be noted that some historians and political scientists have been critical of this image and the “myth of middlepowermanship” since the mid-1960s. Donald Gordon, “Canada as Peace-keeper,” in Canada’s Role as a Middle Power: Papers Given at the Banff Conference on World Development, August 1965, ed. J. King Gordon (Toronto: The Canadian Institute of International Affairs, 1966), 51-65.
73 This assumption is evident in the omission from American historical studies that often consider Canada as either invisible or part of the United States. One of the best examples is the complete lack of mention in John Gaddis’s 2005 The Cold War, despite Canada’s basic yet visible roles as host for the DEW Line project and in the Suez Crisis under diplomat Pearson. Military historian J. L. Granatstein often presents a conflicting image of Canada as a “nation forged in fire” from the Second World War and a peacekeeping nation under diplomat Pearson. J. L. Granatstein and Norman Hilmer, Empire to Umpire: Canada and the World to the 1990s (Toronto: Copp Clark Longman, 1994) and Granatstein, Canada’s Army: Waging Wars and Keeping the Peace (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2004).
period, Whitaker and Marcuse organized their study between two significant years. Militarily this era opened with the atomic bomb in 1945 and closed with the ICBM in 1957, two inventions essential to scientific innovation, military defence, and international political relations. Specific to their study, this era was bookended by Igor Gouzenko and Herbert Norman. Cold War Canada opens with an analysis of the 1945 Gouzenko Affair, highlighting the beginning of Cold War anti-communist hysteria in Canada.\textsuperscript{75} It closes with Norman’s 1957 suicide, the tragic result of an era of fear, anxiety, and suspicion, highlighting the effect of anti-communism, McCarthy witch-hunts, and Canadian-American Cold War relations on politics, society, and the individual.\textsuperscript{76} In this way Whitaker and Marcuse’s study also revolves around specific individuals, evident in their analysis of the effect of Cold War surveillance and suspicion on peace activist James Endicott and NFB filmmaker John Grierson.\textsuperscript{77} These individuals act as central figures, although not ‘Great Men,’ symbolizing a wider and cultural impact of anti-communism, indicating the breadth and scope of the Cold War’s destruction of Canadian culture and society.

Surveillance was a key component of the Cold War and is fundamental to this dissertation in its discussion of power structures, authority, and perceived threat.\textsuperscript{78} It is impossible to write a thesis on power, surveillance, sexuality, and medicalization without mentioning Foucault. Michel Foucault provides the main theoretical underpinnings for this dissertation.\textsuperscript{79} His poststructuralist method is central to understanding the language and meanings behind political, police, and medical authority during the Cold War.\textsuperscript{80} Foucault’s work is integral to analysing the way in which ‘normalcy’ and ‘abnormality’ were defined and used to monitor behaviour and thought through the establishment of a ‘default setting’ in an era glorifying

\textsuperscript{75} Whitaker and Marcuse, 59.
\textsuperscript{76} Ibid., 424.
\textsuperscript{77} Individuals like Gouzenko have been established as symbols of their eras evident in the following study: Amy W. Knight, \textit{How the Cold War Began: The Gouzenko Affair and the Hunt for Soviet Spies} (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 2005).
\textsuperscript{78} Another source is Gary Kinsman, Dieter K. Buse, and Mercedes Steedman, eds. \textit{Whose National Security? Canadian State Surveillance and the Creation of Enemies} (Toronto: Between the Lines, 2000).
\textsuperscript{79} Central texts include Foucault’s work on power structures, discussions of threat, and surveillance, \textit{Discipline and Punish: the Birth of the Prison} (1977), medicalization and control, \textit{The Birth of the Clinic: An Archaeology of Medical Perception} (1973) and \textit{Madness and Civilization: A History of Insanity in the Age of Reason} (1965), and sexuality, \textit{The History of Sexuality: An Introduction Volume I} (1976). These works will be discussed in more detail throughout the dissertation.
\textsuperscript{80} Also central to this research are the works of historians and philosophers of science such as Ludwik Fleck, \textit{Genesis and Development of a Scientific Fact} (1935, translated into English in 1975), Thomas Kuhn, \textit{The Structure of Scientific Revolutions} (1962), and Susan Sontag, \textit{Illness as Metaphor} (1978) and \textit{AIDS and its Metaphors} (1989). These texts will be discussed in more detail throughout the dissertation especially in terms of the medicalization of homosexuality.
Introduction

scientific objectivity. The intersections of medicalization, quarantine, and the power gained through observation (the gaze) are integral to the discussion of Operation Profunc and Cold War sexual psychiatry. Foucault’s interpretation of Jeremy Bentham’s Panopticon, for instance, explicitly lays out the importance of invisibility in gaining control over the individual’s body and consciousness: “[The individual] is seen, but he does not see; he is the object of information, never a subject in communication.”81 In the case of Cold War sexual and political surveillance, the clinic and the police, as with the Panopticon’s principle power, maintained control over the individual by being “visible and unverifiable.”82

In Canadian scholarship, Steve Hewitt’s work is central to the history of police surveillance. Hewitt addresses the blame polarity in Canada from another angle drawing attention to the limited documents available. In his 2002 article “Reforming the Canadian Security State: The Royal Canadian Mounted Police Security Service and the ‘Key Sectors’ Program,” Hewitt refers to the lack of material on domestic surveillance in the west, pointing to the irony that western scholars had easier access to communist files than they did to anti-communist surveillance records.83 Meanwhile, Hewitt’s 2002 Spying 101: The RCMP’s Secret Activities at Canadian Universities, 1917-1997 challenges the popular image of the stalwart Mountie, in much the same way that Whitaker and Marcuse did for the idea of a complacent Canada. Following the course of RCMP surveillance of citizens, Hewitt tracks the longevity of Canadian anti-communism as a force existing since the Great War.84 Spying 101 illustrates how the RCMP was blatantly suspicious of collective movements and intellectual organizations. There is a sense of the ridiculous in this book, particularly in the clumsy and often uneducated attempts of the RCMP to catch communist infiltrators, showing both incompetence of method and the overwhelming secrecy surrounding the remaining documents. Hewitt studies both the targets of surveillance, who were often aware that they were being watched,85 and those who monitored the so-called subversives. Spying 101 provides a comprehensive study of RCMP anti-

---

82 Foucault, Discipline and Punish, 201.
84 Hewitt, “Reforming the Canadian Security State,” 166.
communism while effectively addressing the lacuna in scholarship of Cold War surveillance in Canada.

Gary Kinsman and Patrizia Gentile’s 2010 *The Canadian War on Queers: National Security as Sexual Regulation* addresses surveillance in the context of policing of gay men and women during the Cold War. Their book places Cold War vetting of gays and lesbians in the context of a larger history of national security, drawing links between this era and the more recent climate of Islamophobia and the ‘War on Terror’ in Canada. Kinsman and Gentile present a history of covert surveillance that was manipulative and psychological in nature, the purpose of which was to control a group of people rather than to maintain national security in the face of a communist threat. The Cold War, they state, was one for normalcy and protecting heteronormative spheres from the ‘other.’

*The Canadian War on Queers* is a text central to the culture of homophobia during the Cold War and one that effectively situates both fears of the ‘other’ and control through surveillance within the larger history of national security. Presenting specific case studies of gays and lesbians who were monitored by the RCMP, Kinsman and Gentile wrote a history not just about surveillance but also resistance. Central to this history is the extent of Cold War surveillance and the use of authority and fear to create enemies.

Richard Cavell’s 2004 anthology *Love, Hate, and Fear in Canada’s Cold War* is an example of changing Canadian scholarship on this period. As the title suggests, *Love, Hate, and Fear* captures a variety of experiences of the era through histories of culture, security, surveillance, and sexuality. It addresses the breadth of the Cold War and the impact of geopolitical divide and impending nuclear war on society, culture, and the individual. The anthology includes articles from scholars such as Whitaker, Hewitt, and Kinsman. Specific to the cultural history and the place of the individual in the Cold War are two articles by Mary Louise Adams and Valerie Korinek. Cultural sources are central to the Cold War as they capture

---

86 Kinsman and Gentile, xiii.
87 Ibid., 25.
88 Ibid., 22-23.
89 Also central to this dissertation is Elise Chenier’s *Strangers in Our Midst: Sexual Deviancy in Postwar Ontario* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2008). While this book provides a comprehensive study of postwar sexual psychiatry and the Toronto Psychiatric Hospital Forensic Clinic, it does not explore the culture of surveillance like the other studies in this section and it will therefore be discussed in more detail later in the dissertation.
what cannot be fully and properly expressed at the time. More than that, Adams and Korinek illustrate the microcosm of the Cold War as it existed within both the cultural experience and the Canadian context. In her article, “Margin Notes: Reading Lesbianism as Obscenity in a Cold War Courtroom,” Adams draws attention to censorship, morality, and sexuality through a study of pulp literature from the early 1950s. Focusing specifically on the obscenity trial of Tereska Torres’s novel *Women’s Barracks*, Adams examines the effort to control morality and to maintain safety from ‘perversion.’

Korinek addresses the magazine as a medium that conveyed the complexity of the era in her article “‘It’s a Tough Time to Be in Love’: The Darker Side of *Chatelaine* during the Cold War.” The magazine, *Chatelaine*, proved to be a valuable resource for capturing the intricacies of the Cold War as experienced by Canadian women and families. Korinek situates her study within a growing field of Canadian Cold War history noting the lack of atomic culture in the Canadian context. This is a valid point and one that makes her study of *Chatelaine* all the more relevant as is evident in her discussion of the juxtaposition between consumer culture, evident in the high percentage of ads throughout the magazine, and the political commentary of the articles which offered readers divided visions for the future: the ‘space age’ versus Cold War anxiety. Korinek’s study of *Chatelaine* addresses the issue of the uniqueness of Canadian Cold War society, noting that the magazine was different from contemporary American media through its more nuanced approach to threat and the ‘other.’ As the title suggests, Korinek’s work demonstrates how the positivity of Civil Defence expressed in American women’s journals was less prominent in Canadian magazines. Instead of publishing stories such as that of the honeymoon bunker explored by May in *Homeward Bound*, periodicals like *Chatelaine* explored

---

93 Mary Louise Adams, “Margin Notes: Reading Lesbianism as Obscenity in a Cold War Courtroom,” in *Love, Hate, and Fear in Canada’s Cold War*, 137.
94 Valerie Korinek, “‘It’s a Tough Time to be in Love’: The Darker Side of *Chatelaine* during the Cold War,” in *Love, Hate, and Fear*, 63.
95 Korinek, 164.
97 Korinek, “‘It’s a Tough Time to be in Love,’” 170.
the darker realities of the era, examining the complexities of nuclear war and life behind the Iron Curtain.

The connection between culture and the larger political climate is evident in Daniel Hurewitz’s 2007 *Bohemian Los Angeles and the Making of Modern Politics*. This book explores the link between the personal and the political throughout the early twentieth century in Los Angeles. Hurewitz’s study is about space, sexuality, politics, culture, race, and containment. Focusing on a specific neighbourhood in Los Angeles, Edendale, Hurewitz examines how identity and politics converge through the twentieth century. Challenging the belief that this process was confined to the 1960s and 1970s, Hurewitz follows the period leading up to the 1950s, McCarthyism, and fears about political and sexual normalcy. *Bohemian Los Angeles* is bookended by two figures: female impersonator Julian Etling in the 1910s and Harry Hay of the Mattachine society in the 1950s. Together Etling and Hay symbolize the transition between public and private displays of character, the changing concept of sexuality, and the shifting understanding of the connection between private identity and politics in the early twentieth century. Focusing on the growing film industry in Los Angeles, Hurewitz addresses art and spectacle in society, and how these reflected politics, sexuality, race, and culture. Throughout his book, Hurewitz provides a comprehensive discussion of the interconnections of sexuality, politics, and culture and explains why outsiders perceived that homosexuality and communism were connected. He draws attention to the 1930s and its growing anxiety about morality that was “reframed through two fears that were linked in the local culture: fear of Communism and of sexual perversion.” In his question of what is fundamental to identity, Hurewitz demonstrates the implicit and often unbreakable connections between the state and the individual, politics and identity. This study of the individual as a microcosm of the larger political and social context is significant to the history of communism, surveillance, containment, and sexuality.

Central to the study of the Cold War anxiety is American historian Andrea Tone’s 2009 book on psycho-pharmaceuticals. In *The Age of Anxiety: A History of America’s Turbulent Affair*...

---

98 Korinek cites articles from *Chatelaine* such as “The hydrogen bomb should be outlawed” (1958) and “Can you protect your family from the bomb?” (1962). Korinek, 167-169.
100 This is also discussed in George Chauncey’s *Gay New York: Gender, Urban Culture, and the Making of the Gay Male World, 1890-1940* (Boulder: Paradigm Publishers, 1994).
102 Hurewitz, 128.
with Tranquilizers, Tone addresses America’s efforts to maintain civilian fear in a period of chaos through the transference of Cold War politics to personal anxiety. She addresses the mixed elation and fear of science, medicine, and technology in the atomic age from a mixed psychological and cultural perspective. Through this examination of how anxiety was pathologized and marketed during the 1950s and 1960s, Tone’s study is an example of how the Cold War existed at multiple levels within society: internationally, domestically, and, in the case of the tranquilizer, personally. Her work is important to my study of Cold War fears; however, I consider the climate of both anxiety and Cold War psychiatry in a different way. While she conceptualizes the microcosm of the nuclear arms race as it existed within psycho-pharmaceuticals, I see it as existing within the clinic and the planned internment camp.

Thematically my work on Cold War anxiety responds to these central works while advancing the way in which we see the conflict within Canada. This dissertation elaborates upon my Master’s thesis that examined how the Cold War culture of science and technology influenced both contemporary optimism and anxiety about the future. The thesis, “The Consumption of Science and Technology,” addresses the history of Cold War atomic culture and, unlike most studies of Canadian Cold War society, it recognizes the significant psychological effect of the bomb on Canada. This dissertation combines an aspect of RCMP surveillance of leftists with the medical classification of homosexuality. Presenting these two cases of surveillance and control of the ‘other’ against the backdrop of potential nuclear war, this dissertation provides a new approach to Canada’s Cold War. The interplay between these three facets has not been addressed, neither within the Canadian field nor within the American context that developed the study of the atomization of the Cold War.

This dissertation is the first comprehensive study of Operation Profunc. Few scholars of Cold War surveillance have examined Operation Profunc because of the lack of information and data available. Whitaker, for instance, has written on the existence of RCMP surveillance through the Security Service and how it evolved into CSIS. In their 2000 article, “A War on

---

105 Since the completion of the thesis in 2008 there have been two significant publications that address the larger culture of Cold War fears in Canada: Andrew Burch, Give Me Shelter (2012) and Tarah Brookfield, Cold War Comforts: Canadian Women, Child Safety, and Global Insecurity, 1945-1975 (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2012).
106 Whitaker, “Submission to the Special Committee on the Review of the CSIS Act.”
Ethnicity? The RCMP and Internment," Whitaker and Greg Kealey referred to the discovery of Operation Profunc files in the late 1970s through a Royal Commission.\textsuperscript{107} This article has been useful in my research, creating a foundation for an understanding of the Security Service’s process of surveillance. It is clear, however, that Whitaker and Kealey were unable to gain full access to the material at that time. A much earlier report providing the RCMP with a historical outline of Canada’s Security Service in 1978 conducted by Carl Betke and Stan Horrall has also been valuable. As part of a larger report, this chapter was classified for decades as top secret and even though I had requested access to a copy through the Library and Archives Canada in 2011, parts remained censored. Using newly de-classified data, this dissertation provides details not only on the existence of an extensive plan, but on the nature of the planning process, the delegation of tasks through ranks, departments, and regions, and the discussions of how the physical containment of leftists would be enacted. This dissertation, therefore, provides new data for the history of Canadian police surveillance. It demonstrates the extent of Canadian Cold War anti-communism based on a fear of infiltration and contagion.

This dissertation also presents the culture of Cold War homophobia in a different context from how it has previously been examined. Kinsman and Gentile’s work on the police vetting of Canadian queers throughout the Cold War has provided a foundational understanding of homophobia and control during this era. However, homosexuality was not simply seen as deviant during the Cold War – it was considered a contagious force akin to radiation. This fear of infiltration, mixed with the contemporary faith in science, technology, and medicine to expose covert threats to society and national security, was exemplified through the medicalization of homosexuality. In an era where the psychology of the individual was interpreted as a microcosm of the larger Cold War, the medicalization of sexuality and the definition of psychological normalcy were especially relevant.\textsuperscript{108} The comparison between communism, homosexuality, and the nuclear threat is historically and methodologically new to Canadian studies. Indeed historians in Canada have effectively associated the place of the family as a structure of safety and normalcy within the Cold War and postwar eras, and in the face of social upheaval. However, a

\textsuperscript{107} Reg Whitaker and Greg Kealey, “A War on Ethnicity? The RCMP and Internment,” in Enemies Within: Italian and Other Internees in Canada and Abroad, eds. Franca Iacovetta, Roberto Perin, and Angelo Principe (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2000), 128-147.

\textsuperscript{108} In addition to Mary Louise Adams, Mona Gleason, and Andrea Tone this concept has also been explored by the following scholars and will be addressed later in the dissertation: Erika Dyck, Psychedelic Psychiatry: LSD from Clinic to Campus (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2008) and Jackie Orr, Panic Diaries: A Genealogy of Panic Disorder (Durham: Duke University Press, 2006).
discussion of the combined fears of infiltrating forces, deviant sexuality, and radiation has not been adequately explored. The three factors of politics, sexuality, and military technology are central to the culture of the Cold War, playing to both the atomization of the global threat to the individual within society and the mixed glorification and fear of modern science and technology.

4. Methodology

This dissertation is centred on the efforts of police and medical authorities to define, monitor, and control alleged and confirmed political and sexual ‘deviants.’ In the case of Operation Profunc, the majority of the sources are partially censored surveillance records. In addition to the complications that arise from doing a history of planned internment as opposed to actual internment, there is the complication of working with documents that have been recently declassified or otherwise heavily redacted and possibly destroyed. The Operation Profunc documents are at once limiting and overwhelming; they include extensive reports about various groups and associations but suffer from significant gaps in information. The excitement of uncovering this plan was at times marred by frustration at the limited material available. I frequently considered how to deal with these documents, given the substantial holes. Ultimately I settled on examining the existing material as it was, looking at the plans’ patterns, reading between the lines to consider what might be missing, and considering how this operation fit within a larger landscape of anticipating and planning for disaster during the Cold War.

In 2010, CSIS declassified the Operation Profunc documents and transferred them to Library and Archives Canada (LAC). This declassification process has been a guarded one. In 2011 when I began my research on this subject, I acquired four disks of digitized copies of the recently declassified documents through an Access to Information and Privacy (ATIP) request to the LAC. This digital package included a total of about 16,295 pages of documents on organizations under surveillance, examinations and analyses of potential internment sites, and regulations of the program both in peacetime and in the event of war. The documents were heavily censored and many of the files were missing vital information about the program. Censorship of the documents ranged from the redaction of names, typically of officers authoring or receiving information, to the complete removal of sections within reports, often regarding finances of the organizations under surveillance, layout of internment sites, and details about
security at a time of war. In all, an equivalent of 2,149 pages out of the total 16,295 were redacted, making up 13 per cent of the total data.  

This is a significant amount but a deceptive number as the redacted 13 per cent does not take into account several other possible ways in which data are missing or purposefully useless. The number of uncensored pages, for instance, does not take repeated pages into consideration.  

It was not uncommon to find a document or page included in the same file twice or in a separate file altogether. Some documents also have a French or English translation, making up a separate document of otherwise already existing material. These numbers also do not account for the nature of the uncensored material; there were several public documents included within the collection such as details on the Geneva Convention and civil defence booklets.  

Finally, the quality of the censored 13 per cent of the collection gives few hints of what is actually missing. For the pages that were fully redacted, versus pages that were manually censored, it is impossible to know what kind of data are missing, for instance photographs, letters, memorandums, reports, or lists of suspected individuals. The fully redacted documents only consist of reference numbers of the censored pages.  

The best example of this type of censorship is a file on the Security Advisory Committee apparently compiled in 1991. The file consists of fifteen scanned pages, the only visible documents being four scans of cover pages and the file folder itself. The rest of the file consists of pages representing redacted material, indicating that there were a total of 285 pages removed.  

In many cases there is little clue to what material is missing or what has been removed. Given the cancellation of the program in the
1980s, it is also possible that the majority of Operation Profunc’s documents have been destroyed prior to the 2010 declassification.

With such a significant amount of information missing from the reports the logical question is how valuable are these documents to the larger history of Canadian security internment and the Cold War? In a word – very. In the case of Operation Profunc, the Cold War culture of secrecy persists into the twenty-first century. As scholars P. Whitney Lackenbauer and Matthew Farish have noted, the post-Cold War era experiences the paradoxical perpetuation and neglect of the Cold War memory.114 Tommy Douglas, one of the more famous subjects of surveillance, was an example of the continued control of security documents after the Cold War. Public revelations about the existence of Operation Profunc in the 2010s gave away to astonishment at not only the size of Douglas’s surveillance file or the years under which he was surveilled but at the continued redaction of the material followed by significant destruction of the data. According to one article, 215 pages accounting for about one-fifth of the Douglas file that went back to 1936 remained either completely secret in 2011 or significantly redacted.115 An earlier article from 2006 noted that Douglas had a surveillance dossier spanning 1,142 pages and nine volumes. The Canadian Press had obtained this information from LAC under the Access to Information Act. The article also states that there were more than 650 secret dossiers making up the RCMP surveillance of Canadian politicians and bureaucrats as part of “a project known as the ‘VIP program.’”116 The reason given for both of these decisions to maintain secrecy was that it was integral to maintaining Canadian security. Opening the files to Canadians would apparently compromise ongoing Canadian security methods. In 2013 journalist Jim Bronskill summarized his seven-year fight to gain access to Douglas’s file while the federal government stalled and declared there was no public or historical importance to those documents.117

---

114 Lackenbauer and Farish, “The Cold War on Canadian Soil,” 943.
Additionally, *The Canadian Press* article states: “Although some information in the file dates back almost 80 years, CSIS maintains uncensored release would reveal secrets of the spy trade, jeopardizing the lives of confidential informants and compromising the agency’s ability to conduct secret surveillance.”118 One would hope that national security has developed since the 1930s when Douglas’s files began, given the remarkable shifts in technology never mind the significant changes in international relations and security concerns.119

On a similar note, the ATIP form accompanying the documents I received from LAC in 2011 states that the information removed from the scanned documents was to protect Canadian security.120 The effort to protect the integrity of the surveillance methods from half a century earlier calls into question the current status of Canadian security. It also poses the question of how historians are to conduct national history in the face of steady censorship of the past and official management of Canada’s image as a non-participant in Cold War vetting and anti-communist histrionics.

The majority of this research began with an analysis of the missing information. Because of this attention to censorship, along with an interest in literary interpretation, my research into Operation Profunc has been textual in nature, focusing on the written information available. None of the released files contain personal documents or records of individual people under surveillance through the late 1940s into the 1980s.121 Names of people deemed suspicious, however, are occasionally visible in some membership lists included in the documents. Overall, my focus on the released Profunc files has been the result of both adaptation to the state of the documents and an interest in rhetoric of war and defence. The individual discussed in this dissertation, therefore, is the ‘symbolic individual’ or the individual as a microcosm of society, demonstrating the strong link between the political and the personal, normalcy and national

---

118 Bryden, Ibid.
119 The censorship of security records by CSIS has increased in recent years. Hewitt, “‘He Who Controls the Past,’” *Brokering Access*, 201.
120 The letter that came with the package included information on the sections of the Access to Information Act material under which uncensored data was deemed insecure. These included: 16 (1) (d): Information injurious to the security of penal institutions; 14 (b): Strategic or Tactics (meaning material “On strategy or tactics adopted or to be adopted by the Government of Canada related to the conduct of federal and provincial affairs.”); and 16 (1) (c): Injurious to the enforcement of any law of Canada or a province or the conduct of lawful investigations. The list also included: 23 Solicitor-Client privilege information; 19 (1) Personal Information; 13 (1) Information obtained in confidence; and 15 (1) Def National Defence. LAC, letter to author, 26 July 2011. Hewitt, “‘He Who Controls the Past,’” 197.
121 Individuals who believe they were under surveillance between the 1940s and 1980s, or their relatives, can submit requests for personal records from Library and Archives Canada.
security. So rather than engaging in the personal story of communists and other citizens profiled as national security threats, this dissertation focuses on the history of policy surrounding the surveillance program. It examines the rationale provided for monitoring individuals and organizations, how the definition of enemy shifted over time along with the plans for a potential war, and the methods of maintaining a top-secret surveillance program for over three decades. The way in which the program was managed points to the larger matter of how the Cold War was conceptualized within the RCMP Security Service: covert and contagious.

Censorship was not an issue in my research on sexual psychiatry. As with the focus on Profunc, this dissertation’s examination of psychiatry is textual in nature. To garner an understanding of the situation in Canada between the 1950s and 1980s, I have focused on a variety of documents. These include private papers, such as reports, letters, and meeting minutes, of Canadian and American psychiatrists and articles from the CMAJ, a journal that was specialized yet accessible to non-medical professionals.\(^{122}\) The accessibility of the journal is especially significant given the era’s cultural interest in medicine, psychiatry, and science. These two types of sources are used to provide context to the Toronto Psychiatric Hospital’s (TPH) Forensic Clinic. They help identify the clinic’s significance and illustrate how it was unique to both the American and Canadian fields of sexual psychiatry. The use of these three sources – private papers, a public medical journal, and an out-patient clinic – is also for the purpose of illustrating the nature of sexual psychiatry during the Cold War. Between the 1950s and the 1980s there were several significant shifts in psychiatric method, namely the APA’s efforts to move away from psychoanalysis and to become a more consolidated and scientific practice.

Security took a different form through sexual psychiatry than it did through Operation Profunc. Unlike the top secret RCMP plans for internment, discussions about psychiatric diagnosis and containment of sexual deviancy were public. But while the classification of mental illness and disorder was public, the medicalization of homosexuality was based on the private, focusing on desire, sexuality, and character. As with the documents on RCMP surveillance of

---

\(^{122}\) In her doctoral dissertation on the medicalization of female heterosexuality, Heather Stanley addresses the use of the CMAJ as a source in the historical examination of Canadian medicine and society during the 1950s and 1960s. She states that while it was “not the only source of medical discourse in Canada, the CMAJ is particularly useful due to its status as a generalized professional journal, its vast and ever-increasing penetrative reach to the English Canadian medical community, and because it was not just a reflection of hegemonic medical discourse – it was an engine of that hegemony within the profession.” Heather Stanley, “The Double Bed: Sex, Heterosexual Marriage and the Body in Postwar English Canada, 1946-1966” Ph.D. dissertation (Saskatoon: University of Saskatchewan, 2013), 23.
leftists, documents regarding sexual psychiatry and treatment do not include personal cases or files. Again, the individual discussed in terms of surveillance through medicalization is the symbolic individual. Especially in the case of psychiatry and the pathologization of sexuality, the individual was a microcosm of the larger Cold War; both the fear of the ‘other’ and invisible menace were articulated through the medical effort to define and categorize homosexuality as a disorder that could be identified and cured.

The medicalization of homosexuality was a less overt type of surveillance and control than was Operation Profunc. For this reason it can be a messier case study than RCMP surveillance and this is mainly because of a lack of consolidation of records. To our knowledge, there was no governmental plan to remove gays and lesbians from general society, although they were routinely purged from government office and prevented from immigrating. The medicalization of homosexuality, however, was ubiquitous, hence the variety of sources used in this dissertation. The first group of sources are those from specific psychiatrists such as American Dr. Doug Marmor in Los Angeles who was one of the instrumental psychiatrists, along with psychologist Dr. Evelyn Hooker and APA Chair Dr. Robert Spitzer, who worked to remove homosexuality from the DSM. The removal and declassification of homosexuality as a symptom of mental illness says a great deal about why it was originally included in the DSM in 1952. This dissertation’s focus on the APA is important to the larger discussion of Cold War vetting of homosexuality; as an institution of authority, like the police vetting of communists, the APA demonstrated both the power of medicalization and pan-North American control by an American institution during the Cold War. The CMAJ provides a different type of data for this research. As a Canadian publication it demonstrates Canadian-based research and discussions in an era of American domination. The journal is professional, with articles written by researchers and clinicians, but not specialized, covering a variety of subjects. In terms of the Cold War, for instance, the journal covered the impact of potential war on the individual from the possible effects of nuclear radiation and anxiety disorders. The articles within the CMAJ that address

---

123 One specific example of this was evident in the Marmor papers at the UCLA archives. One letter from 1966 from the Janus Society of America referred to the case of an “alien Canadian” who was to be deported from the United States by US Immigration and Naturalization Service on the grounds that, as a male homosexual, he had a “‘psychopathic personality.’” Letter from Clark P. Polak to Judd Marmor, 6 December 1966. Box: 53, Folder: 8, Judd Marmor Papers, 1923-2001, Charles E. Young Research Library, University of California Los Angeles (UCLA), Los Angeles, California.

124 In addition to various articles throughout the 1950s and 1960s on the potential psychological effects of nuclear war, such as J. S. Tyhurst’s “Psychological and Social Aspects of Civilian Disaster,” Canadian Medical Association
the treatment and study of homosexuality as deviancy or symptom of mental illness represent the
significant changes both in the perception of homosexuality and of psychiatry.

The TPH Forensic Clinic for ‘sexual deviants’ provides an institutional representation of the
medicalization of homosexuality during the Cold War. This institution was unique both
nationally and internationally as discussed in Elise Chenier’s 2008 Strangers in Our Midst. At a
time when homosexuality was still criminalized, the medicalization of same-sex activity and
desire was portrayed as advanced and representative of the contemporary culture of science and
medicine as tools to fix ‘abnormalities.’ The documents from this institution focus on the
practitioners, such as Dr. R. E. Turner, and the clinic rather than the patients. As with Operation
Profunc, this study of medicalization addresses the institution of authority, methods of
surveillance, and the text. This study is about how threat was medically defined and how
homosexuality was understood in terms of its possible motivations. The study of medicalization
takes the management of Cold War fear to a separate level. Containment of homosexuality was
achieved through medical codification while surveillance was enforced by the medical authority
and the individual who believed that homosexuality was a symptom of mental disorder. While
the planned containment of communists was theorized, the containment of homosexuality was
two-fold; it existed within the clinic and through the new psychiatric categorization of same-sex
activity and desire as symptomatic of mental illness.

Terminology is central to this dissertation, particularly as this is a study of perceived
threats. For communism, ‘sympathisers’ was a vague term used by the RCMP and Canadian
government to describe leftists who were not confirmed communists. This could also include
individuals who would object to the process of internment but were not politically active.
‘Leftists’ is a wider term that refers to confirmed communists, socialists, and individuals
supportive of either. This dissertation also uses the term “prominent functionaries” to specifically
address the targets of the program. Most, but not all, people under surveillance identified with
some form of leftist politics. Whether they actually posed a threat to Canadian security was
another matter. ‘Homosexual’ is a medical term and in this dissertation it is used exclusively

*Journal 76* (1 March 1957): 385-393, the journal also published special editions devoted to civil defence and
preparation for the physical dangers of nuclear attack. One example of these publications was the “Special Issue for
Civil Defence” from 1952 that featured articles on how to treat wounds from atomic blasts, biological warfare, and
plans and more recent research on treating medical conditions resulting from a nuclear attack. *Canadian Medical
Association Journal 87*, no. 22 (1962).
Introduction

within that context. Historically the medical term refers primarily to men and only occasionally to women; unless otherwise specified, however, in this dissertation the term refers to both men and women reflecting the language of contemporary documents. Generally the terms ‘gay’ and ‘lesbian’ or ‘gay men’ and ‘gay women’ are used in this dissertation in reference to individuals and to the social and cultural context of sexuality. ‘Queer’ is used very rarely. It is applicable to the social and cultural context but as this is a history of medical terminology, classification, and authority, it does not work as well as it would in a study of community and personal identity. As a history on the creation and maintenance of Cold War fears and threats, terminology is especially important for both establishing identity and the authoritative use of it as a form of control over the individual.

5. Summary

This dissertation is divided into two parts: “Containment” and “Surveillance.” Each section details the separate situations of Operation Profunc and Cold War sexual psychiatry as they pertain to the specific theme of managing Cold War threats. “Containment” is divided into four chapters that discuss ways in which the perceived Cold War threats of communism and homosexuality were to be quarantined, isolated, and removed from the rest of society in an attempt to prevent the spread of deviancy. “Surveillance” is divided into three chapters addressing the ways in which personal thoughts and desires were monitored by points of authority, either the RCMP in the case of leftist ideology or medical professionals in the case of homosexuality. These chapters move through the discussion of Cold War anxiety and management of fear thematically rather than chronologically. The two parts explore separately the intent behind containment and surveillance through two very specific cultures of fear: anti-communism and homophobia.

Chapter One begins “Containment,” with a study of Operation Profunc and the history of anti-communism in Canada. It illustrates how the three-decade-long RCMP surveillance operation, while fitting within the context of a long history of internment in Canada, was exceptional for its focus and scope. Rather than reacting to a conflict through internment, as was the case of First and Second World War internment programs, Operation Profunc existed as a plan anticipating attack. This chapter examines Operation Profunc’s philosophy, how its plans were organized, and the delegation of tasks in the event of an attack or national emergency. Chapter Two addresses the actual plans of Operation Profunc. It covers details such as how
civilians would be arrested, where and how they would be processed, and plans for detention locations. Using specific cases of planned internment sites across Western and Central Canada, where most internment camps would be located, this chapter illustrates the extent of planning operations in terms of security, secrecy, and containment.

Chapter Three begins the examination of the medicalization of homosexuality with the specific example of the TPH Forensic Clinic for ‘sexual deviants.’ As the first of its kind in North America, the Forensic Clinic was presented as a ‘humane’ method of dealing with ‘sexual deviants.’ The Forensic Clinic, while a specific example of Cold War sexual psychiatry, fits into a larger culture of enthusiasm for medicine and science in the nuclear age. Chapter Four extends past the physical case of the clinic to the conception of homosexuality as an invisible menace. The similarities between homosexuality and communism as defined during the Cold War went beyond the alleged ‘character weakness.’ Evident within the pathologization of homosexuality were clear links between medicalization and the fear of an invisible and contagious threat similar to communism or radiation. This chapter adds a cultural approach to the medical history of sexuality, demonstrating the ability of medical nomenclature to confine the individual.

Part Two, “Surveillance,” begins with Chapter Five, which focuses on how the Operation Profunc surveilled certain Canadian leftists between the late 1940s and early 1980s. Following the process of vetting communists, socialists, and ‘sympathizers’ this chapter looks at how, when, and why, under this program, the RCMP shifted its attention and what happened when it remained doggedly focused on the spectre of the domestic communist amid significant changes in international relations and prospective security threats. Chapter Six addresses the process and focus of Operation Profunc with specific case studies. It examines why certain groups were monitored, the reasoning behind surveillance, and how the spread of communism was imagined in these specific instances. Looking at three specific organizations under surveillance – the Workers Benevolent Association, the Congress of Canadian Women, and the Canadian Peace Congress – this chapter illustrates how Operation Profunc saw communism as a fluid contagion that spread through seemingly ‘innocent’ operations. Records on these organizations demonstrate both the process of Operation Profunc’s surveillance and the conceptualization of communism as an invisible and covert menace akin to radiation.

Chapter Seven addresses the surveillance of gays and lesbians through the field of psychiatry. It analyses the shifts of homosexuality’s classification in the manuals between the
Introduction

1950s and after its removal in the 1970s. This chapter considers the way in which the focus of surveillance shifted from the medical authority to the individual through the creation of a disorder specifically based on self-reflection and interpretation. The history of contagion and surveillance during the Cold War is hardly a simple one. The separate histories of Operation Profunc and the pathologization of homosexuality rarely cross within the documents presented here. Nevertheless, the two are inextricably linked. This connection between the police vetting of leftists and the medical classification of homosexuality is evident through the various types of containment, namely the planned internment of “prominent functionaries” and the medicalization of gays and lesbians during the Cold War.

6. Conclusion

This dissertation’s purpose is to achieve a historical narrative that presents a cohesive and comprehensive view of surveillance and security during Canada’s Cold War. Through this approach it seeks to understand the influence of science and technology on society and the construction of truth in an era defined by the paradigmatic forces of military technology and medical innovation. During the Cold War, an era that prized innovation, control over science, technology, and medicine equalled control over society. Anxiety was central to Cold War surveillance and security both in the anticipation for potential war and in the definition of disorder. It is easy to cast these histories of surveillance and anxiety as speciality studies but they are integral to understanding the larger national history. Together, the establishment of communism and homosexuality as threats provides a comprehensive view of the way in which the Cold War culture of fear manipulated society and security. This anxiety influenced definitions of normalcy within society and was fed by expectations of threat.

The efforts to maintain security and the significance of these assertions should not and cannot be lost within the contemporary culture of managing, or rather mismanaging, history. The 2009 proposed construction of a Victims of Communism monument by the Supreme Court of Canada, for instance, exemplified Canada’s history of anti-communism by focusing solely on Communism as a force against human rights and freedoms, rather than totalitarianism in general.\[125\]

If built, this monument would present a limited and threatening image of communism
in Canada. Mismanaging the history of the Canadian left was also evident in the spring of 2015 when the new Museum of Canadian History decided to remove its exhibit on the Winnipeg General Strike, despite the protests of historians and activists. Not only would the museum ignore one of the more violent events in Canadian history, at the hands of governmental, police, and military authorities, but it would also remove a narrative wherein the victims were leftists. Equally significant to the intensified efforts to manage Canadian threats are the culture of anti-terrorism and the apparent danger of radicalised youth in Canada in the early years of the twenty-first century. The prime targets of this specific fear – young men who have converted to Islam as opposed to Islamic-born radicals – are deemed dangerous because of a misunderstood link between the religion and masculine violence and militancy. The resulting denial of civil liberties, fed by this fear during the twenty-first century, in the name of national security evokes earlier cases of profiling citizens perceived to be dangerous during a time of potential war.

It is impossible to discuss the Cold War without recognizing the various levels of conflict, politics, and perception. Cold War conflict, for instance, was manifested in both international politics and the threat of nuclear war. Politics of the era existed both at the global and domestic levels. Perception of the war existed both in the form of the geopolitical battle between the East and West, and at personal and societal levels, evident in the establishment of the nuclear family as the foundation of normalcy in the West. The creation and management of threats to national security during the Cold War was tied to the culture of normalcy because of the indisputable link between the larger war and the individual. Canada’s Cold War was about the fears of and for the individual. The individual could either be the threat, in the case of the domestic communist or the secretly gay citizen, or threatened by the silent spread of either radical political ideology or sexual deviancy. The fears of communism and homosexuality mimicked the larger global tensions of the nuclear arms race and spreading radiation, indicating a larger concern for lack of control and uncertainty in an era defined by ideological paradigms and scientific prowess.

PART ONE:
Containment
CHAPTER ONE  
Anticipating Disaster: Planned Internment, Anti-communism, and the Threat of Cold War Infiltration

1. Introduction

A 1965 report for British Columbia’s ‘E’ Division described the importance of Operation Profunc, stating:

“This plan, as with similar schemes in existence throughout Canada, has been devised to facilitate the unobtrusive and simultaneous apprehension and detention of persons whose affiliations are such as to render their free movement detrimental to the security and wellbeing of the nation.”

According to this report, Operation Profunc was a necessary measure to preserve Canadian security and one that, while in this case specific to British Columbia, was a nation-wide project. The report went on to state that, unless there were instructions to the contrary, the plan would not become operative until one of two eventualities:

(a) by diplomatic declaration or sudden attack we are irrevocably committed to war;
(b) prior to war and/or during a build-up of international tensions, i.e. at the ready, simple or general alert.

Plans for civilian internment were hardly unique to Operation Profunc – civilians were interned in Canada under the War Measures Act during both World Wars. Operation Profunc was also part of a long history of anti-communism in Canada that went back to 1917. Unlike other twentieth century wartime internment plans in Canada, however, Operation Profunc was organized in peacetime and in preparation for potential war, attack, or national emergency.

Indeed, the plan coincided with growing national and international tensions and was structured in a period that witnessed outbreaks of military and political hostilities around the globe. Still, Operation Profunc, while part of a larger history of Canadian internment, was different. It was unprecedented and representative of a new type of war in the atomic age. In addition to working prepares the ground for further discussion.

2 “Top Secret ‘E’ Division Apprehension Plan,” 2. Ibid., LAC.
3 A similar emergency detention program was instituted by the United States Attorney General in 1948. This plan involved Security Index Cards for communists and “dangerous individuals” so that “in the even of war with the Soviet Union, these persons could immediately be interned.” Elizabeth Grace and Colin Leys, “The Concept of Subversion and its Implications,” in Dissent and the State, ed. C. E. S. Franks (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1989), 68.
to maintain national security in a period of anticipated conflict, Operation Profunc had to be sustained in peacetime. The plan to contain a potentially radical population in the case of a national emergency was reflective of the larger Cold War anticipation for complete disaster and destruction.

Established in 1948 and cancelled in 1983, Operation Profunc was an extensive disaster plan in terms of duration, intention, and scope. As stated in a 1964 report on the apprehension of persons in the case of an emergency, the purpose of Operation Profunc was five-fold: to detain persons that the Minister of Justice designated as “likely to act in a manner prejudicial to the public safety or the safety of the State,” to seize, search, and safeguard property belonging to illegal organizations by the Governor-in-Council, to search persons and “detain them temporarily if circumstances warrant it,” to freeze funds of illegal organizations, and to conduct searches for records of illegal organizations.\(^5\) The details of the plan shifted over the decades, attempting to maintain control over a wide population of civilians classified as possible dissidents in a crisis. Regardless, the foundational components of the plan, to contain a communist threat in the event of war, remained consistent over the three decades. This plan to arrest, detain, and intern several thousand Canadian “prominent functionaries” in camps, prisons, and institutions across the country, spoke to the anticipation of destruction resulting from a communist-led attack on Canada.

In order to ensure smooth operation, the Profunc plan was top secret. Designed on a “need-to-know” basis, discussions about Operation Profunc were limited to the RCMP, the Department of National Defence, and the Ministry of Justice. RCMP reports on the maintenance of the plan stressed “no phase of [Operation Profunc] is to be discussed with junior members of the Force or any other person outside of the Force until otherwise instructed.”\(^6\) The plans themselves, which were updated every few years, were to be “maintained on a regional basis” and “at the detachment level will be sealed and kept in their strong box.”\(^7\) To ensure the safety of the plan itself, therefore, it had to be physically contained within the police station. The element of restriction in Operation Profunc tied it to the larger Cold War and was symbolic of the global

---
fear of contamination. The plan to intern prominent functionaries was unquestionably part of a longer history of confinement and anti-communism in Canada, but the way in which containment was imagined through Operation Profunc drew it into a deeper Cold War narrative of policing, control, and anxiety.

2. Method: Containment

Containment is one of the two primary themes in this dissertation. The subject of containment is central to the study of Cold War threats and the way in which they were perceived by points of authority – the RCMP, in the case of communism, and medical professionals, in the case of pathologized homosexuality. Part One of this dissertation discusses how containment was conceptualized for different threats. How the threat in question, whether communism or homosexuality, should be controlled or managed was a central concern for professionals in the quest to contain “contagious” threats. Plans for containment, whether through internment in the case of prominent functionaries or pathologized homosexuality in the case of sexual psychiatry, indicated that the threat was contaminating and had to be controlled. Because the Cold War fear was based on contamination, whether by ideology or weaponry, it was not surprising that containment had a central role in discussions of defence. This discourse of containment was present both in civil defence operations, implemented to prevent the spread of nuclear destruction to the wider population, and the American policy for containment to prevent the invasive flow of international Communism into the West. As Elaine Tyler May stated in *Homeward Bound*, “Containment was key to security.”

In this dissertation, the theme of containment is addressed as both conceptual and physical. In its most basic form, the Cold War fallout shelter, promoted by Canadian and American civil defence organizations, was the physical representation of Cold War containment. While not the focus of this dissertation, the shelter and radiation can act as models to illustrate this theme and discourse of containment that was prevalent throughout the Cold War. Whereas the spread of political or sexual ‘deviancy’ was conceptual, the spread of radiation and the efforts to use the shelter to protect the body from destruction were physical. The ‘self’ that civilians were to protect from radiation through containment within the shelter was the physical self, rather than the ideological or sexual self. But even here, social, cultural, and sexual norms would

---

be protected through the body. Unlike the individual monitored and contained within the clinic and the internment camp, the individual contained within the shelter was the civilian as a valuable member of society, rather than the civilian as threat. The shelter, therefore, used containment to protect whereas the camp would use it to imprison.

The Cold War focus on containment as a concept emerged from the Second World War. The “containment theory,” as it was soon known, was first introduced by American diplomat George Kennan. In February 1946, Kennan wrote what is now referred to as the “long telegram,” an 8,000-word telegram dispatched from Moscow to Washington. The so-called thesis of the telegram proposed that the whole basis of American policy towards the Soviet Union throughout the Second World War was misguided.9 After a period of confusion about how to negotiate with the Soviet Union in the early days of Truman’s presidency, the American government redesigned its method of policy. It shifted away from Roosevelt’s ideas of international diplomacy to fit the changing global atmosphere that followed the war. Cold War historians have considered Truman’s 1947 proclamation of a new form of American diplomacy, the ‘Truman Doctrine,’ as the fundamental point that marked the beginning of American foreign policy following the Second World War.10 As American Cold War historian John Lewis Gaddis stated, “The Truman Doctrine implied an open-ended commitment to resist Soviet expansionism, therefore, at a time when the means to do so had almost entirely disappeared.”11 Essentially, American policymakers wanted to have something more powerful than Roosevelt’s method of “patience and firmness” when dealing with the Soviet Union. It was in this context that the containment theory developed, which called for a clearer strategy to deal with the Soviet Union, its politics, and managing global relations following the Second World War. The containment theory set the tone for the Cold War and the ways in which the western powers identified the threat. The distance between the theory’s initial intent and the American policymakers’ eventual understanding of the theory resulted in the subsequent division of global military and political authority into two opposing superpowers. The gradual simplification of the containment theory matched the desire to reduce the otherwise confusing war to a basic identification of enemy and ally.

10 Gaddis, Strategies of Containment, 22.
11 Ibid., 23.
The term ‘containment’ was used more generally to describe American policy towards the Soviet Union following the Second World War. It was, according to Gaddis, a series of attempts to deal with the consequences of “that wartime Faustian bargain” which saw the Soviet Union as an ally in the fight against Nazi Germany. While the concept of containment was considered by the American government since the early 1940s, Kennan’s “long telegram” was fundamental in shaping the early Cold War American view of international relations. Containment, however, had a number of different interpretations. For instance, Kennan did not necessarily intend for the concept to become a template for an international policy or a comprehensive statement of national security. Kennan also warned against dividing the world into two global superpowers. Ultimately, the containment theory’s objective would be to limit Soviet expansionism because “communism posed a threat only to the extent that it was the instrument of that expansion.” Kennan cautioned against using the policy to openly oppose all Communist governments. In a period of international postwar instability, this explicit political prejudice would detrimentally affect American international relations.

Kennan also stressed that blanket condemnations of communism would not serve to help Western nations because “they focused attention only on the symptoms, not the disease.” While reference to the enemy as disease in wartime was not uncommon, the use of disease to describe the spread of communism was especially significant in the Cold War context, pointing to the larger conceptualization of the enemy as a contaminant. Through Kennan’s long telegram and the Truman Doctrine, American international diplomacy approached the Cold War envisioning a new type of threat: one that silently crossed borders and infected nations from within.

The containment theory’s mutation into an international policy against communism as a whole was indicative of the American Cold War method of profiling an enemy and defining a threat. The development of the containment idea through the late 1940s was a simplification of the international situation. It was also the result of an improperly defined enemy. This vague definition of the enemy germinated from the conception of the threat itself, along with the

12 Ibid., 4.
13 Ibid., 25.
14 Kennan suggested that rather than encouraging the divide of the world into two spheres, one governed by the United States and the other by the Soviet Union, a containment policy would encourage the emergence, over time, of independent centres of power in Europe and Asia. Ibid., 40.
15 Ibid., 33.
16 Ibid., 40.
17 Ibid., 43.
psychological nature of the war and potential nuclear attack. Political identity, namely Communism, defined the Cold War enemy. Compared to the straightforward conflicts of the First World War and Second World War, the Cold War was not an obvious battle. Unlike these earlier wars, the Cold War did not have a physical battlefield per se. Defined by policy and shaky international relations, espionage, nuclear development and the arms race, and proxy wars, the Cold War was a period of suspicion about an abstract enemy. Indeed, the two World Wars were each defined by ideological rhetoric, such as freedom and democracy over tyranny and autocracy. The Cold War rhetoric, however, was manufactured from the ideology that defined it; it was fought through means of psychological intimidation between the two superpowers, each boasting better and more dangerous weapons. The ultimate enemy of the Cold War was covert, contagious, and seemingly ubiquitous.

3. Canadian Anti-Communism

Like the United States, Canada fostered a sense of anti-communism, but it operated separately and in a different environment. Indeed Canadian foreign policy was increasingly influenced by developments in Washington. As was evident in cases of high profile individuals, such as Canadian Ambassador to Egypt Herbert Norman, American security service and spying agencies could, and did, cast Canadian officials as dangers to North American security. The influence of American Cold War fears on Canada was also evident in the American military presence in Canada’s north with the construction of the Distance Early Warning (DEW) Line and the power of the American Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI) and Central Intelligence Agency (CIA) in vetting certain Canadians. Despite the growing influence of American McCarthyism and, eventually, American security officials and technology on Canada’s security system, Canada had its own Cold War threats. Its fear of the bomb ultimately existed separately, as did its fear of communist infiltration. These were not mere copies the American experience.

In Canada, anti-communist sentiment, mixed with a strong fear of invasion, infiltration, and subversion, led to the labour-intensive plan for communist containment in the event of a war: Operation Profunc. It spawned from a well-cultivated fear of Bolshevism that was then fed by contemporary concerns about infiltration, the ‘other,’ and potential military unrest between the

---

19 Frances Reilly, "The Consumption of Science and Technology: Canadian Atomic Culture during the Cold War" Master of Arts Thesis (Edmonton, University of Alberta, 2008).
superpowers. The covert nature of the Cold War enemy, however, was only further demarcated by the inability of security groups such as the RCMP to properly define the Cold War enemy. Operation Profunc categorized suspect organizations into three groups: the most straightforward being “Recognized Communist Organizations,”20 and the less defined being “Ethnic or Mass-Language Organizations”21 and “Front Organizations.”22 According to the “Profunc Manual,” a handbook reprinted and, to some extents, revised over the course of the Cold War, a communist organization was deemed “recognized” after it was briefed by the “I” Directorate Central Research Branch at Headquarters, followed by approval by the Profunc Advisory Committee on Internment, established in 1950.23 Through this process, the Profunc Manual states, the Governor-in-Council was then enabled “at the outset of a national emergency to declare all said organizations illegal and thus empower this Force to close down and search in the name of the Custodian all property belonging to any illegal organization.”24 In addition to labour and communist organizations, many of the other groups profiled in Operation Profunc were of non-Anglo Saxon origin, pointing to the RCMP’s discrimination and belief that these groups were more susceptible to the spreading force of international Communism.25

Operation Profunc cast a wide net, focusing on leftist organizations and the ‘other,’ namely ethnic groups that possibly had socialist leanings or were affiliated in some way to communism. More than in the First and Second World Wars, the RCMP Security Service during the Cold War monitored an increasing amount of Canadian-born individuals and organizations. In addition to monitoring publications such as *The Canadian Tribune*, the official organ of the

---

21 These organizations included, over time, Association of United Ukrainian Canadians, Bulgarian Canadian People’s League, Carpatho-Russian Society (or Society of Carpatho-Russian Canadians), Canadian Council of National Groups, Canadian Slav Committee, Federation of Russian Canadians, Federation of Yugoslav Canadians, Finnish Organization of Canada, German Canadian Cultural Association, Hungarian Literature Association, Independent Mutual Benefit Society, Lithuanian Literary Society, Macedonian Canadian Peoples League, Polish Democratic Association, Russian Canadian Youth Organization, Sons and Daughters of Canadian Lithuanian Mutual Benefit Society, United Jewish People’s Order Mutual Benefit Society (or United Jewish Peoples Order), and Workers Benevolent Association. “Profunc Manual,” 1980, Ibid., LAC.
24 “Profunc Manual,” 1971, Ibid., LAC.
Part One: Chapter One

Labor Progressive Party (LPP)\(^{26}\) of Canada, the Operation Profunc targeted groups such as the Canadian Council of National Groups, the Canadian Peace Congress, and the Congress of Canadian Women. Despite the broader focus on Eastern European ethnicity, these organizations were primarily Anglo-Celtic and were defined more by leftist ideology than by ethnicity. The Canadian Peace Congress, for instance, held positions on international affairs that the security service deemed compromising. In 1950 the Canadian Peace Congress presented a nine-point appeal to its members, which included points such as “Stop the Korean War,” “Forbid Aggression Under any Pretext,” “Make War Propaganda Punishable by Law,” and “Ban Atomic Weapons with Strict Controls.”\(^{27}\) An Operation Profunc report about the Congress of Canadian Women indicated that the “Bill of Rights for Canadian Women” circa 1950 had subversive platforms such as “equal pay for equal work, equal opportunity for jobs,” and the even more radical “free health and medical service provided by a nation-wide non-contributionary health plan.”\(^{28}\) Evident particularly in the case of the Congress of Canadian Women, the organizations had leftist leanings, promoting the importance of social welfare and government support for Canadians citizens.\(^{29}\) Threat, according to Operation Profunc, was diverse in terms of the groups under surveillance – under the larger heading of ‘communist’ were ‘undesirable’ immigrant groups, social subversives, and ‘deviants.’ The efforts to control groups that actively questioned the establishment pointed more to the desire to stifle dissidence than to supress communism.

The difficulties of defining the Cold War enemy were further complicated by the invisible boundary drawn between homefront and battlefield, enemy and ally. While it was true that the Canadian Cold War communist ‘witch-hunts’ were not without American influence, it was equally true that these hunts had a separate root stretching back to the late 1910s.\(^{30}\) Historians have been divided on the subject of the influence of American McCarthyism on Canadian anti-communist activity, debating whether Canadian Cold War anti-communism was homegrown or produced and controlled by American politics. Historian Robert Bothwell noted

\(^{26}\) “Labour” was not officially spelled with a “u” in Canada until the later twentieth century. Documents throughout the Cold War that refer to the LPP, such as those from the RCMP, reflect the earlier spelling of “labor” without a “u”. For that reason, this dissertation’s spelling of the Labor Progressive Party reflects the contemporary spelling.

\(^{27}\) “Canadian Peace Congress,” brief, 2 January 1951. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-26-44, LAC.


that while the Canadians were sceptical of American anti-communist “hysteria,” Canadian politics were not devoid of similar anti-communist sentiments. He stated that, “Of the four national parties of the period, all supported NATO, denounced communism, and prevented, if possible, the employment of known Communists in positions of public trust.” He continued on to say that by the mid-1950s communists were practically unknown in elected office and that supporters of trade unions were “on the run.” Reg Whitaker and Gary Marcuse, on the other hand, presented anti-communism in Canada as independent from the growing American culture of anti-communism. Operation Profunc offers yet another view of Canadian anti-communism and its relation to American security and surveillance, demonstrating both Canada’s lack of innocence and the nature of its particular ‘brand’ of anti-communism. If the separate Cold War climates within Canada and the United States could be characterized, it would be through their individual approaches to managing the fear of communism. Compared to histrionic McCarthyism, Operation Profunc and RCMP surveillance were subtle but consistent. Operation Profunc stemmed from a separate and long-cultivated history of fear and suspicion of communism, socialism, and collectivist activity that was then placed in the context of the Cold War. This plan highlighted another element of Canada’s history of anti-communism that was missing from Bothwell’s interpretation, but which was present in Whitaker and Marcuse’s analysis of Cold War Canada: discreetness and coverture. Operation Profunc, like the civil service purges described in Cold War Canada, worked stealthily.

The RCMP Security Service, responsible for domestic security in Canada until 1984, had a decidedly anti-communist focus when considering probable threats. This attitude was not necessarily unknown, and several Canadians belonging to political organizations throughout the Cold War were aware that they, or at least the organizations to which they belonged, were under police observation. What remained unclear to Canadians throughout these decades was the extent of surveillance and the role of the RCMP Security Service in Operation Profunc. This plan to

---

31 Bothwell, Canada and the United States, 49.
32 Bothwell, 49.
33 In Cold War Canada they challenged the idea that Canada avoided having its own ‘witch-hunts,’ providing a history of Canada’s own culture of Cold War anti-communism. In his own writing, Whitaker has disputed many of the popular ideas concerning the American influence on Canadian politics, stressing the anti-communism inherent in Canadian politics and society following the First World War.
34 According to historian Mark Landis, Senator Joseph McCarthy’s politics, and the era of McCarthyism, was the result of McCarthy’s displacement of private motives onto public objects such as the political arena. Mark Landis, Joseph McCarthy: The Politics of Chaos (London and Toronto: Associated University Presses, 1987), 75.
intern civilians encapsulated the excessive anti-communism that existed in Canada throughout the twentieth century and its influence on Canadian security. Operation Profunci was also significant for its covert efforts to contain the threat by imprisoning perceived menaces to national security. The containment theory, while an American creation, was both influential to and mirrored by the Canadian response to a possible communist threat.

Several historians have addressed the significant roles played by figures such as Igor Gouzenko, Herbert Norman, and John Watkins in Cold War Canada. The connections between these men and the anti-communist climate of the era point to pre-existing prejudices and American-influenced histrionics. This is not to say that fears were unfounded. The “Gouzenko Affair” was a turning point in both Canadian anti-communist sentiment and North American awareness and fear of Soviet espionage. In September 1945, Russian cipher clerk Igor Gouzenko, who was working in Canada, provided evidence to the Canadian government that a Soviet spy ring was operating in Ottawa. Following this discovery, Gouzenko and his family defected to Canada and hid their identities. The Canadian government’s response to Gouzenko’s claims was initially cautious, but the eventual treatment of the spy network was severe. Whitaker notes that, even though the war had ended, the Canadian government responded to Gouzenko’s claim with a “secret order-in-council under the War Measures Act,” and arrested the suspects without warrant, held them without bail, without counsel, and without habeas corpus, interrogated them in the RCMP barracks and in secret sessions, and then issued official reports naming many of them as spies and traitors, even though a good number of them were never subsequently convicted of any offense in the courts.

While this response was understandable given the situation, the extreme view of communism and socialism as an inherent menace to Canadian society went beyond Gouzenko’s findings and was fed by deep-seated anti-communist sentiments.

Herbert Norman’s Cairo suicide in 1957 and John Watkins’s death in 1964 pointed to the extent of anti-communist ‘witch-hunts’ that followed the Gouzenko Affair through the 1950s and 1960s. They also exemplified the detrimental influence of the American secret service on

---

36 Bothwell, Canada and the United States, 37.  
Canadian officials. Herbert Norman, a Canadian diplomat, jumped to his death after continued attacks and slander by the American FBI, who targeted him on the poorly defended grounds that he was a communist. 

Like many intellectuals of his generation, Norman had participated in leftist organizations and societies during his youth, but these activities had little influence, if any, on his work as a Japanologist or as ambassador to Egypt. Seven years later, the RCMP and CIA held Norman’s friend and colleague, John Watkins, for investigation. Watkins was gay and had two affairs with Russian men in the Soviet Union when he worked as a diplomat for the Department of External Affairs. Soviet intelligence, it turned out, had tried, unsuccessfully, to entrap and blackmail Watkins into revealing classified information. Watkins, whose health was declining, died after being secretly interrogated by the RCMP and CIA in a Montreal hotel room for several days. Norman’s suicide exemplified the power that American security had over Canada, which intensified the already prominent anti-communist sentiment within the country. Watkins’s interrogation and subsequent death, meanwhile, spoke to contemporary prejudices. Homosexual sex was classified as illegal at this time and until 1969, when an omnibus bill decriminalized private, consenting sex between two adults. Consequently, gay men were often deemed dangerous for their apparent susceptibility to blackmail and, potentially, seduction into communism, regardless of the fact that there were both homosexual and heterosexual “honey traps.”

These two instances of perceived breaches of national security illustrated how North American anti-communism influenced the Cold War understanding of national threat: the FBI’s evidence that Norman was a communist was unstable and the attempt to entrap and blackmail Watkins was unsuccessful. The environment of anti-communist sentiment in Canada was further

---

38 It is worth noting that throughout, Norman’s security record was the property of two nations: Britain and the United States. After it came to the attention of the Senate Internal Security Subcommittee in the United States, “Norman’s past was splashed all over the front pages in March 1957.” Shortly following this ordeal, Norman jumped to his death. What made the Canadians even more bitter about the situation was that the Americans offered no apology or remorse for their infringement on what was an otherwise Canadian affair. Bothwell, 68.


40 Journalist John Sawatsky unveiled aspects of the Watkins interrogation from the perspective of the RCMP. Sawatsky’s account of the Watkins case was arguably more sympathetic to Leslie Bennett, the Canadian conducting the interrogation. This book describes Watkins as being embarrassed about his sexuality but unable to “contain his lusts.” John Sawatsky, *For Services Rendered: Leslie James Bennett and the RCMP Security Service* (Markham, Ontario: Penguin Books Canada Ltd., 1983), 179.

41 This was evident in the anxiety surrounding the “Munsinger Affair” in Canada the early 1960s. Gerda Munsinger, an émigré from East Germany, had affairs with several Canadian politicians during this period and was alleged to be a Soviet spy. This proved to be not the case, although the hype surrounding the affair and the fact that Munsinger was a sex worker pointed to the fear of male heterosexual vulnerability in the face of Soviet “honey traps.”
Part One: Chapter One

strengthened by the increasing influence of American foreign policy following the Second World War. The United States was Canada’s primary ally during the Cold War. Yet this relationship was complicated and turbulent. The Canadians found themselves reliant on American interpretations of the international situation in the early years of the Cold War because there was no Canadian intelligence in the Soviet Union. By the Korean War (1950-1953), the nature of this diplomatic relationship became more complicated with Minister of External Affairs, L. B. Pearson’s fear that the international conflict could get out of control under American General MacArthur. The construction of the DEW Line by the mid-1950s further highlighted Canada’s increasingly complex relationship with the United States. Americans, eager to have a series of early-warning radar stations set up in the continent’s north in order to detect Soviet bombers, supplied the project with most of the necessary technicians and covered two thirds of the project’s cost. Canada, unable to fund the project or a defence system of its own, was obligated to accept.

The defence relationship between Canada and the United States, both military and political, demonstrated the density of the Cold War construction of threat and efforts to maintain security. While figures such as Gouzenko, Norman, and Watkins illustrated the extent of Cold War anxieties about Communism and contamination as dictated by both domestic and international security services, Operation Profunc demonstrated the way in which these concerns were fostered and addressed in a specifically Canadian context. In addition to the blatant plans for containment of a threat, Operation Profunc was especially Canadian for its discreetness and secrecy.

4. In Defence of Canada: The War Measures Act

In order to understand Operation Profunc and its role in Canadian security, it is integral to contextualize it within a larger history of internment. Prior to Operation Profunc, Canada had a significant history of containment in wartime which included prisoner of war camps and ‘enemy

42 Bothwell noted that the period following the Second World War was one when the Canadian government looked inward, developing domestic security (old age pensions, unemployment security, and other elements of the social safety net) rather than developing foreign policy. Robert Bothwell, The Big Chill: Canada and the Cold War (Toronto: Canadian Institute of International Affairs, 1992), 14.
43 Bothwell, Canada and the United States, 41.
44 Ibid., 54.
45 Ibid., 55.
46 In addition to the DEW Line there were two other defence lines that ran across Canada starting in the early 1950s – the Mid-Canada Line and the American Pinetree Line.
alien’ internment. Canada also had a substantial history of anti-communism that was related in part to these wartime internments preceding Operation Profunc. The First World War spawned the War Measures Act and the Defence of Canada Regulations (DOCR), which enabled the suspension of civil liberties in the name of national security. The War Measures Act introduced Canada to a new era of national security, coinciding with its new international military and diplomatic presence achieved during the Great War. First implemented by the Borden government at the beginning of the First World War, the War Measures Act transformed the role of the government in the lives of Canadian civilians. In its attempts to ensure the safety of the nation, the Canadian government took on the responsibility of monitoring the civilian population and thus implementing an interventionist state in Canada. The two central components of the Act that accentuated the extent to which Canada was under police surveillance and scrutiny were its primary motive and its methodology.

The Act’s motive was simple: through it, the government could take decisive action against a resident threat in the name of national protection. During the First and Second World Wars, this decisive action included the arrest and imprisonment of civilians considered potentially dangerous at a time of war. The War Measures Act primarily focused on ethnic nationals such as Germans, along with immigrants from the Austro-Hungarian and Turkish Empires between 1914 and 1918.\(^\text{47}\) The Canadian government also vetted and interned Ukrainian Canadians and conscientious objectors\(^\text{48}\) such as the Doukhobors who, although a distinctly separate ethnic group from Anglo-Canadians, were not representative of the sworn enemies overseas. During the Second World War, Japanese Canadians were imprisoned and detained in remote camps and villages across the country because of fears of coastal attack, similar to that at Pearl Harbor in December 1941, and Japanese espionage. The forced removal and internment of 22,000 Japanese Canadians at this time\(^\text{49}\) was also the result of racial prejudice and, as scholar Mona Oikawa notes, an exercise of spatial discrimination in an effort to maintain the

---

\(^{47}\) During the First World War, of the 8,579 men at 24 camps across the country, 5,954 were Austrians, 2,009 Germans, 205 Turks, and 99 Bulgarians. In addition to these internees, camps included 81 women and 156 children who were dependents of interned men and voluntarily moved to the camps. Patricia Roy, *Canadian Encyclopedia*, s.v. “Internment.”

\(^{48}\) Also within this category were groups such as the Mennonites and Hutterites (religious communities of German descent) opposing conscription on the basis of their culture of pacifism more than an adherence to Germany, a culture from which they suffered religious persecution.

“respectable space of the white bourgeoisie.” During this time, Italian and German nationals were also monitored for Fascism. An intercepted letter from a Second World War internment camp in 1939, for instance, revealed that one prisoner who was born in Germany was interned for carrying out his son’s last wishes: “The reason I am being kept is that six (6) years ago I fulfilled my dying [sic] son to bury him in his Nazi uniform, which he brought over from Germany.” While some of the individuals under suspicion clearly aligned themselves with the Fascists, others did not and were interned primarily for their nationality. The imprisonment and internment of these groups was at times hasty and, particularly in the case of the Japanese Canadians, driven by racial animosity.

Vetting civilians on the basis of their ethnic ties was not the only way of targeting perceived threats. Civilians were increasingly monitored and interned for their ideology. Following the First World War, Bolshevism became the primary focus of national security. This was especially evident in the violent reaction of the City of Winnipeg, the RCMP, and the Canadian army to the Winnipeg General Strike of 1919. Throughout the Great Depression, Relief Camps acted as internment sites for unemployed working class men. The camps were located in remote areas, likely to dissuade protests and public reaction to the dire economic situation. Ironically, this isolation and containment helped foster leftist ideology among the unemployed men, leading to one of the decade’s most iconic protests – the On-to-Ottawa Trek of 1935. The vetting of leftist ideology became more pronounced during the Second World War when, again under the War Measures Act, the RCMP focused on pacifists and war resisters. Beginning in 1939, the War Measures Act targeted, and in many cases interned, groups such as the Jehovah Witnesses, Quebec anti-conscriptionists, communists, the radical left, and “a motley group of luckless individuals overheard making ‘disloyal’ comments in taverns and like places.”

The Canadian government and the RCMP believed that these groups held mixed

---

50 Oikawa, “Cartographies of Violence,” 44.
51 “Internment Operation Censorship,” intercepted and translated letter from [redacted], Kananaskis to [redacted], 3 November 1939. Reference no. A 2011-00179-08-48-02, LAC.
53 As the trek moved eastward, it “epitomized all that was wrong with the federal government’s handling of the single homeless unemployed during the Depression.” Bill Waiser, All Hell Can’t Stop Us: The On-to-Ottawa Trek and Regina Riot (Calgary: Fifth House Publishing, 2003), xi.
loyalties at a time of war and were therefore potentially damaging to national security and the war effort.

Under the DOCR the RCMP interned 100 communist and leftist Canadians during the Second World War.\(^\text{55}\) One government report claimed: “These persons being trained agitators and conspirators were undoubtedly the most troublesome of any group held during the war.”\(^\text{56}\) Evident in the Second World War internment of leftist Canadians was the fear of a different type of threat: lack of loyalty and solidarity at a time of international conflict. This was brought on in part by a severe diplomatic miscalculation on the part of the Communist Party of Canada (CP of C). In 1939, following the Canada’s declaration of war on Germany, the CP of C opposed the war, refused to support members in the conflict with Germany, and aligned itself with the Soviet Union, placing the Germany-Soviet Pact as its priority rather than decades of anti-fascist rhetoric.\(^\text{57}\) This stance was damaging and led to divides within the party, particularly between Jewish and non-Jewish members.\(^\text{58}\) The CP of C’s opposition to war had long-lasting effects on the party.\(^\text{59}\) It also fed already strong sentiments within the Canadian government and RCMP that communists were security threats and were fundamentally different, dangerous, and able to encourage dissent in a period that called for national unity. When considering why communists were viewed as a national threat despite Canada’s alliance with the Soviet Union, Whitaker noted that Charles Rivett-Carnac, head of RCMP Intelligence, declared communists to be worse than Nazis because “fascism did not involve the ‘overthrow of the present economic order’” and was a “‘modified form of capitalism.’”\(^\text{60}\) Essentially even though fascism was Canada’s enemy, communism was worse.

The other central component of the War Measures Act was how it was used against leftists. The Act’s methodology was to work against possible espionage at a time of emergency.

\(^\text{55}\) Out of the 800 internees at the camp at Kananaskis, 100 were interned for being communist. Except for one woman, Gladys McDonald who was imprisoned at a penitentiary, this was an all-male population. Ian Radforth, “Political Prisoners: The Communist Internees,” in Enemies Within: Italian and Other Internees in Canada and Abroad, ed. Franca Iacovetta, Robert Perin, and Angelo Principe (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2000), 194.


\(^\text{59}\) Manley, 29.

\(^\text{60}\) Whitaker also quoted Rivette-Carnac as saying “‘Fascism […] is the reaction of the middle classes to the Communist danger and, as perhaps you are aware, the Communists describe it as the last refuge of capitalism.’” Whitaker, “Official Repression,” 137.
Because the Act’s target was articulated to be a threat to national security, the government and RCMP could take all necessary actions to prohibit any development of an enemy force. The DOCR, Section 21 of the War Measures Act, set aside the standard trial procedures in order to effectively prevent enemy infiltration. The DOCR included:

full powers of censorship over the press; preventative detention of anyone who might potentially act in a manner ‘prejudicial to the public safety or the safety of the state;’ the prohibition of statements which ‘would or might be prejudicial to the safety of the state or the efficient prosecution of the war.’

While the DOCR’s purpose was to keep the nation safe at a time of war, it was also an effective method of managing a population and ensuring national support in a period of potential vulnerability. Censorship, for instance, could prevent enemies from learning about troop movements and shipping schedules that could seriously compromise the war effort. Evidence showed, however, that censorship was liberally implemented during the Second World War to include a number of publications unrelated to fascism. In his study of communist repression during the Second World War, Whitaker notes that the first papers censored in the 1940s were communist, and that left-wing politicians such as Agnes Macphail and Camillien Houde, suffered the consequences of censorship when the press was prohibited from attending their speeches. In short, the DOCR, according to historian Ramsay Cook, “represented the most serious restrictions upon civil liberties of Canadians since Confederation.”

Many of the targets, especially political figures such as Macphail and Houde, challenged the Canadian military, exhibiting more a lack of conformity than probable threat to national security. Also evident in this effort to control political unity through the DOCR was a concern for the ‘other’ within Canadian society.

---

61 In addition to this, should any member of a banned organization break the regulations, the entire membership would be presumed guilty unless it could prove otherwise. Whitaker, 138; Quoting The Defence of Canada Regulations of 1939.

62 Whitaker writes: “In any event, the main thrust of censorship seems to have been directed toward the murky area of subversive opinion and its effects on public morale.” 139.

63 Houde was mayor of Montreal and was later imprisoned with a number of other suspected communists at the beginning of the Second World War because he publicly opposed conscription laws. One RCMP Security Service file during the Second World War was devoted to monitoring Quebec protests over Houde’s internment through the spring of 1943 and into the winter of 1944. A letter from Association des Electeurs de Ste-Marie expressed this deep and culturally driven discontent, stating that: ‘“No one can choke the deep, muffled rumble/ Of a whole people murmuring a name.’” “La Patrie’ Committee for the Liberation of Camillien Houde,” letter from Association des electeurs de Ste-Marie to L. St-Laurent, W. L. Mackenzie-King, and C. G. Power, 4 February 1943. Reference no. A 2011-00179-08-49-33, LAC.

64 Whitaker, 140.

In 1982, ex-communist internee Ben Swankey wrote of his experiences between 1940 and 1942 in an article titled “Reflections of a Communist, Canadian Internment Camps.” Three months after he became Communist Party Head of Alberta in 1940, Swankey was arrested and detained before being transferred to a camp in Kananaskis County, Alberta. His article reflects the frustrations shared by many Canadians at the time. While the RCMP was diligent with its records and interned some higher profile communists like Swankey, many of their files were out of date and a number of the internees were no longer affiliated with the communist party.66 Swankey’s article highlights the questionable methods of arrest that were based on limited, if any, evidence and which were greatly influenced by the era’s “anticommunist hysteria.”67 Recounting his arrest, Swankey showed how, under the DOCR, officers could legally arrest individuals without charge and could keep civilians in custody as long as the RCMP deemed necessary. Anti-communist panic and the use of the DOCR were central to Operation Profunc. Swankey’s article, therefore, proves to be a valuable resource not just for the history of Second World War internment but also for considering the events of possible communist internment during the Cold War. Operation Profunc internments would likely be influenced by those sentiments that existed within the government and police force during the 1940s. They would, however be operating in decidedly different era.

Historian Ian Radforth’s study of communist internment during the Second World War reflected the anti-communist frenzy articulated in Swankey’s memoirs. Radforth illustrated how the arrests of June and July 1940 were a demonstration of the RCMP’s management of public fears:

The government wanted to be seen to respond effectively to wide-spread public fears that saboteurs within Canada posed a serious threat to the success of the war effort, as well as to public safety. Since the security services had little evidence of actual fifth-column plots in Canada’s war plants, the Communists made convenient targets for detention.68

The nature of the arrests and the petty humiliations69 that internees endured following their arrests sustained the image that the RCMP and Canadian government were tough on dissenters.

66 Ben Swankey, “Reflections of a Communist, Canadian Internment Camps,” Alberta History 30, no. 2 (1982): 14. This point is also evident in Whitaker’s article on communist repression during the Second World War. Whitaker, 147.

67 Swankey, “Reflections of a Communist, Canadian Internment Camps,” 12.

68 Radforth, 197.

69 Prisoners would not go to trial before being sent to camps and were allowed two hearings that were often nothing more than a series of kangaroo courts. Radforth, 202. The internees were immediately treated like criminals.
Radforth suggested that this example of internment was indicative of the lengths to which the government could be pushed by rampant public fears, an ugly reality that could only be exasperated in the case of a Cold War emergency.

5. Case Study: Operation Profunc

Operation Profunc existed in the period between the Second World War’s use of the Act to intern ‘enemy aliens’ and the 1970 use of it to deal with domestic terrorism in Quebec. Following its implementation during the First and Second World Wars, the War Measures Act was used for a third time in response to the October Crisis in 1970. This final case differed greatly from the 1914 and 1939 implementations of the Act: it was for a purely domestic situation rather than an international conflict. The War Measures Act was never put in operation for Operation Profunc, but the plans for communist internment indicated that had a state emergency arisen, the DOCR, and later the Internal Security Regulations after 1963, would have enacted the security plan to arrest, detain, and intern a predominantly Canadian-born population.

Understanding the War Measures Act is integral to understanding Operation Profunc and the means with which the Department of National Defence (DND) planned to deal with perceived threats to Canadian security during the Cold War. The 1914 Act was instrumental in defining governmental regulation, control, and ownership in Canada throughout the twentieth century and into the twenty-first century. The government surveillance and state control over the individual that resulted from the Act elucidate how Operation Profunc was able to persist in secret as a security plan for several decades. With anti-communist sentiments serving as a backdrop, the targeting of perceived enemies and the surveillance of the individual was justified by wartime policy:

The ‘home front’ in World War II was thus an episode in a continuity of state coercion against the Communist left, heightened by the extraordinary powers placed in the hands of government and a wartime atmosphere of public intolerance of dissent. Far from being a period of popular front illusions soon to be shattered by the Cold War, as has often been asserted, the war on the home front was a prelude to the Cold War to follow.

following their arrests and were unable to telephone family or use a lawyer. William and Kathleen M. Repka, Dangerous Patriots: Canada’s Unknown Prisoners of War (Vancouver: New Star Books, 1982), 22.

Radforth, 219.

The Quebec October Crisis will be discussed in more detail in Chapter Five.

Whitaker, 136.
Indeed, while unprecedented in its scope and its execution, Operation Profunc was fed by a well-established culture of anti-communism and efforts to maintain security in Canada during wartime. The nature of the internment plan fit specifically with the themes of covert surveillance and vague opponents that characterized the Cold War culture of fear and anxiety.

Operation Profunc was unique from other Canadian internment and surveillance plans because of its scope and its context. Spanning from 1948 to 1983, and covering multiple provincial and territorial RCMP divisions, Operation Profunc underwent various revisions over the decades. While the focus on Communism and “subversion” as national threats consistently remained the focus of the plans, numbers of prominent functionaries under surveillance fluctuated and locations for reception centres and camps changed as the international climate shifted. A news source following the 2010 declassification of Operation Profunc stated that the plans prepared for the internment of 16,000 communists and 50,000 communist sympathisers. This was a focused operation compared to the more extensive RCMP surveillance of leftist and ‘subversive’ Canadians that stretched back to the First World War and continued throughout the Cold War. According to scholars Reg Whitaker and Gregory Kealey, for instance, RCMP files that were discovered in the late 1970s through the McDonald Commission indicated that the RCMP held security files on roughly 800,000 individuals and organizations in Canada throughout the twentieth century. This number was cumulative as the surveillance of Canadians fluctuated in intensity throughout the decades. A 1978 report on the history of the Canadian security service noted that by 1953 the information regarding communist subversion in Canada was overwhelming and officers found it impossible to maintain the files on suspect individuals and subversive organizations whose membership steadily increased throughout the 1950s.

---

73 Canada has a long history of confinement that extends beyond the prisoner of war and ‘enemy alien’ camps of the First and Second World Wars to include the relief camps of the Great Depression and the reservation and pass systems for First Nations going back to the nineteenth century.
75 Whitaker and Kealey, “A War on Ethnicity? The RCMP and Internment,” in Enemies Within: Italian and Other Internees in Canada and Abroad, ed. Franca Iacovetta, Robert Perin, and Angelo Principe (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2000), 141.
76 Reg Whitaker, Gregory S. Kealey, and Andrew Parnaby, Secret Service: Political Policing in Canada from the Fenians to Fortress America (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2012), 9.
properly maintain effective methods of surveillance, the Canadian security service “temporarily” de-activated thousands of files in 1954.\(^{78}\)

Numbers of prominent functionaries to be interned followed a similar pattern. Profunc’s numbers also indicated a gradual decrease in the later 1950s, followed by a sharper decline beginning in the late 1960s. A 1978 chart of Profunc statistics, covering the years between 1948 and 1978, illustrated this pattern of subjects under surveillance:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Approved Targets</th>
<th>Targets Not Approved</th>
<th>Special Cases</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Total Canadian Population(^{79})</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1951</td>
<td>1,316</td>
<td>2,129</td>
<td>nil</td>
<td>3,445</td>
<td>14,009,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1954</td>
<td>2,710</td>
<td>3,848</td>
<td>nil</td>
<td>6,558</td>
<td>15,287,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1957</td>
<td>2,792</td>
<td>3,415</td>
<td>nil</td>
<td>6,207</td>
<td>16,610,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1961</td>
<td>2,479</td>
<td>2,215</td>
<td>nil</td>
<td>4,694</td>
<td>18,239,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1964</td>
<td>1,161</td>
<td>528</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>1,723</td>
<td>19,291,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1967</td>
<td>991</td>
<td>384</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>1,420</td>
<td>20,701,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td>667</td>
<td>241</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>954</td>
<td>21,963,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1975</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>23,143,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1978</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>23,964,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Subjects under surveillance were categorized into “Approved Targets,” those established as “prominent functionaries,” and “Targets Not Approved.” Another category, “Special Cases,” was included in 1964 and was made up of individuals who the RCMP considered dangerous but could not confirm as threats. According to Operation Profunc, ‘Special Cases’ were “selected subversives whom we [Operation Profunc] consider a threat but whom we have insufficient evidence for apprehension […]. The residences or other premises of these persons will be searched with a view to locating evidence which would warrant their apprehension.”\(^{81}\)

The numbers, detailed in Figure 1, show an increase in total subjects in the mid-1950s, reaching a height in 1954 only to steadily decline in the 1960s, shifting from a total of 3,445 subjects in 1951 to a total of 68 subjects in 1978.\(^{82}\) Operation Profunc saw a decline of 3,377 subjects in less than 30 years. After 1957 the number of subjects that were not approved dropped

\(^{78}\) Betke and Horrall, *Canada’s Security Service*, 665.

\(^{79}\) This category was not included in the 1978 chart but has been added here in the interest of context.


\(^{82}\) “Profunc Statistics,” Ibid., LAC.
below those approved. The introduction of “Special Cases” after 1961 also demonstrated a shift in focus, likely resulting from the realization of the inefficiency of the earlier enthusiastic approach of the 1950s.

The mechanisms of a potential war also influenced Profunc plans, as a 1956 Headquarters Plan for “Apprehension of Persons Under the DOCR In the Event of War” demonstrated:

The Profunc operation was devised some eight years ago to meet the needs then prevailing. Although the plan has since been modified to a certain extent, it has become increasingly clear with the advent of the nuclear age that a fresh approach to this problem is required if we are to be in a position to exercise our fixed responsibility for internal security measures. We must, therefore, face the possibility of a surprise enemy nuclear attack without any formal declaration of war being given. 83

Earlier wartime internment plans were constructed following a declaration of war. Operation Profunc, on the other hand, was planned far in advance of a potential emergency. In preparing for surprise attack, planners had the additional stress of dealing with the quickly shifting conditions set by rapidly changing military technology in addition to the threat of spreading international Communism.

Operation Profunc’s management was one that attempted to maintain, in addition to complete secrecy, clear lines of communication between federal departments 84 and between Ottawa and the regional divisions. 85 Intelligence heads of the Security Service, and subsequently central figures in Operation Profunc, included Charles Rivett-Carnac at the end of the Second World War, and John Leopold, George B. McClellan, Joseph P. Lemieux, and Clifford Harvison through the 1950s. 86 While the Operation Profunc plans extended into the 1970s, the majority of

83 “Re: Apprehension of Persons Under the D.O.C.R. In the Event of War (Headquarters Plans),” report from J. Brunet to Officers Commanding “C” and “O” Divisions and Officer i/c “E” Division, 20 December 1956, 1. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-37-20, LAC.
84 Namely, the Department of National Defence, the Ministry of Justice, and RCMP.
85 Western Canada consisted of Divisions ‘E’ (British Columbia), ‘K’ (Alberta), ‘F’ (Saskatchewan), and ‘D’ (Manitoba and North-western Ontario). Central Canada consisted of Divisions ‘A’ (Eastern Ontario and parts of Quebec), ‘O’ (Southern Ontario), and ‘C’ (Montreal). The East Coast and the Northern Territories had a less focused defence plan for Operation Profunc, but for the purpose of this discussion Divisions ‘H’ (Nova Scotia) and ‘J’ (New Brunswick) were also involved, along with the occasional participation of Divisions ‘B’ (Newfoundland), ‘L’ (Prince Edward Island), and ‘G’ (Hudson Bay Region).
86 A report on the Operation Profunc Advisory Committee that addressed the Operation Profunc plans for surveillance and internment, listed the members of the committee throughout the 1950s and 1960s. 1950, when it was established as a committee, the membership included Deputy Minister of Justice F. P. Varcoe, along with three members of the Department of Justice, R. A. Olmstead, T. D. MacDonald, and A. J. MacLeod, and a Legal Advisor, Raoul Mercier. The committee was reconstituted in 1959, again in 1960, and in 1968 and each time included the Deputy Minister of Justice, other members of the Department of Justice, and a legal advisor. “Advisory Committee on Internments,” brief, from M. R. Dare to Robin Bourne, July 1973. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-37-20, LAC.
the internment plans were discussed between Ottawa and officers in charge of regional divisions across Canada during the 1950s. Control over the Operation was maintained through regular updates between Ottawa and the divisions, indicating a wider effort to control security. According to Operation Profunc records, the plan for arrests, detainments, and internments operated at the national level through the Intelligence Branch of the RCMP with the chain of command running from Ottawa to provincial, territorial, and regional RCMP divisions, and then to city and municipal sub-divisions. Like other surveillance programs of the era, Operation Profunc, in the event of its implementation, would be managed through the RCMP Security Service as well as the DND with advice from the Ministry of Justice.

Operation Profunc’s initial purpose was clearly stated: “This is a plan devised to cripple the communist movement in Canada in the event of surprise enemy attack and during the period immediately following any such attack.” To achieve this goal, Ottawa and the RCMP divisions had to move quickly and stealthily. According to the Operation Profunc plans, the internment process would begin immediately following the declaration of a national emergency. ‘M’ Day, or “Mobilization Day,” marked the starting point of RCMP arrests. Because the plans were top-secret, RCMP officers would have to be quickly briefed in this short time about Operation Profunc and the need to arrest a number of Canadian citizens who were supposed threats to national security. RCMP detachments across the country had Operation Profunc instruction booklets kept in their detachment strong box, to be opened only in the case of an emergency. Documents with the heading “Secret” often had the sub-heading that instructed, “May be downgraded to Confidential on ‘M’ Day.”

How to effectively arrest the suspect population while keeping Operation Profunc secure was a central point of discussion throughout the Cold War. One of the earlier plans from 1949 addressed this issue when proposing the need for simultaneous arrests across the country “to avoid Communist residents in different time zones receiving prior warning.”

---

89 J. Brunet, 20 December 1956, 2. LAC.
91 Report for ‘E’ Division, 1959. Ibid., LAC.
92 “Re: Apprehension of Persons Under the Defence of Canada Regulations In the Event of War (Plans ‘E’ Division),” memorandum from J. Healey to RCMP Commissioner Ottawa, 3 February 1949, 2. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-33-00, LAC.
specified that: “The greatest measures of success would undoubtedly be achieved if all Divisions could commence their raids at a time not earlier than 3:00 am.”93 The issue of time zones across Canada made simultaneous arrests at this optimal time impossible. According to the report, in order to maintain synchronized arrests that would occur at night, “when the persons to be apprehended will be home in bed,” the arrests would then begin at 5:00 am Atlantic time, 3:00 am Central time, and 1:00 am Pacific time.94 The energy spent on planning for the details of the arrest time pointed both to the desire to be prepared in the face of unprecedented disaster as well as to secure ultimate effectiveness in containing the perceived threat.

The RCMP “raiding teams” sent to arrest prominent functionaries also had to be efficient. These teams were to be made up of three men, one Security Service officer and two in uniform, in addition to a matron in cases where women and children were involved.95 While one officer arrested the prominent functionary, the others would perform a search of the premises – either the individual’s home or workplace – for compromising material, including communist literature, names of other members in a subversive organization, or subversive material indicating that the individual was a possible threat to national security. One set of operation orders from the 1960s clarified what pieces of evidence officers sought. These included: written articles, pamphlets, books, correspondence, documents, records, membership books or cards, photographs, tape recordings, and “reproduction type of equipment used in copy work, etc.”96 The orders specified that care be taken to “not seize innocuous material, although, if there is doubt as to the value of any material, it should be seized,” indicating the ambiguity of the evidence.97 The seizure of “enemy property” was a primary component of the arrest process. In 1959, ‘A’ Division Inspector H. S. Cooper provided the RCMP Commissioner in Ottawa with a sample notice for property seized during a raid. The proposed sign, to be placed on homes or businesses, would read:

These premises have been seized by the Government of Canada under the provisions of the Defence of Canada Regulations. Any person who enters or damages these premises without prior written authorization from the R.C.M.

93 “Apprehension of Persons, ‘E’ Division,” 1949. Ibid., LAC.
94 “Apprehension of Persons, ‘E’ Division,” 1949. Ibid., LAC.
97 “‘F’ Division,” 1968. Ibid., LAC.
Police violates the Defence of Canada Regulations and is liable, upon conviction, to a fine and/or imprisonment.

R.C.M. Police

In addition to this sample sign, Cooper provided the commissioner with specifications for its size (5 inches by 12 inches), noting that it should be in French and English, that it be printed on “Something more durable than paper,” and that “200 of them should satisfy requirements.” The planned seizure of “enemy property” evoked earlier internments during the World Wars while also indicating the level of preparedness within the RCMP Security Service to complete a thorough arrest and containment of leftist Canadians at the onset of a new war.

Each team was responsible for no more than two “detentions,” or arrests. Teams were to be dressed in plain clothes and be equipped with “hand gun, hand-cuffs, flashlights and notebooks.” A 1965 report noted that: “except in extreme circumstances, sirens and red lights will not be used during this operation.” This, in addition to the plain clothes of the officers, once more pointed to the need to complete stealthy and effective arrests. In preparation for “X-hour,” the point at which suspects would be arrested, teams were also ordered to take up positions close to the suspects’ houses to ensure a smooth procedure. The arrests, operating under Section 21 of the DOCR and later Section 40 of the Internal Security Regulations, would be without warrant. The 1965 report assured that “[officers] will be cloaked with the same powers and immunities as in any other investigation or arrest made in relations to a serious criminal offence. MEMBERS WILL BEAR IN MIND THE PRIME RESPONSIBILITY UNDER THIS PLAN IS THE APPREHENSION OF SUSPECTS.” The goal of the operation was clear with this final statement, in capped letters. Although individuals would be provided with a Procedure for Objection upon arrest, they would be treated as prisoners immediately. Once arrested, civilians would be processed, their personal information would be recorded on forms (such as that illustrated below) while the RCMP would fill out evidence forms for the material they found in the homes and offices of those under arrest.

99 Cooper, 12 June 1959. Ibid., LAC.
100 “‘A’ Division,” 1971, 13. LAC. Original emphasis.
102 “‘E’ Division Apprehension Plan,” 1965. Ibid., LAC.
103 “‘E’ Division Apprehension Plan,” 1965. Ibid., LAC.
104 “‘E’ Division Apprehension Plan,” 1965. Ibid., LAC.
105 This document was included in “‘E’ Division Apprehension Plan,” 1965. Ibid., LAC.
Once arrested, the isolation process would begin. Civilians under arrest would be denied visitors, telephone calls, letters, and any other form of communication outside of their detention. Additionally, officers would be given instruction to limit possibilities of covert communication between those arrested: “Every effort will be made to prohibit conversations in foreign languages between detainees.”

In this way, the detainee would be effectively contained, unable to spread or gain information from outside of their point of detention.

These plans for apprehension demonstrated the continuation of a significant history of Canadian internment into the Cold War era. While Operation Profunc plans were built upon the existing cases of historical ‘enemy’ internment, they were also influenced by the unprecedented global concerns posed by the two superpowers. In a period of a growing fear of infiltration through espionage and fifth column activity, in addition to the increased understanding of the potential damage created by nuclear war, Operation Profunc was both a product and a symbol of Cold War fears of contamination.

106 "E’ Division Apprehension Plan,” 1965. Ibid., LAC.
107 "E’ Division Apprehension Plan,” 1965. Ibid., LAC.
6. Conclusion

A 1956 memorandum to Inspector N. O. Jones addressed the challenges presented by the “new concept of war.” The memo articulated the magnitude of complications posed by potential war and how Operation Profunc was obliged to adapt to the new military developments:

In a war employing intercontinental missiles with atomic warheads, backed by the force of the hydrogen bomb, all defensive plans are largely speculative. The direct effect of such warfare, coupled with its by-products of homeless, hungry, dispirited, maimed and grieving people thronging everywhere, would seem to preclude any appreciable action on the part of our Special Branch. 108

One of the more concerning factors, the memo stated, was the potential panic that would result from nuclear attack and likely aggravate the spread of communism:

Areas not immediately attacked would soon feel the results of hysteria with resulting chaos. My experience in France in June 1940, make this very real and I can only imagine how much more terrible it would be in this nuclear age. No one would be immune and communists and communist sympathizers would be equally affected together with the law enforcement bodies and population generally. It is difficult to imagine just how the subversives in our midst plan to give effect to their ideology when the preservation of their very lives has become of the utmost importance. 109

The memo concluded that in the case of emergency, communism could prey on the weaknesses of a population in a period of compromised security:

It is relatively easy to embrace a disloyal crowd when it merely means a different set of ideas proclaimed in a country that has never been invaded. In the face of direct violent action, I am sure, there would be instantaneous wholesale defections. 110

The sergeant’s comments about the added factors of nuclear attack highlight the lack of precedence of a potential Cold War attack. Evident in his memo were attempts to predict the damage through his own experience in war-torn France during the Second World War. He extrapolates upon his memories to consider the added factors of communist infiltration and the by-products of nuclear attack.

The Cold War was a new type of conflict. In addition to threatening unknown levels of destruction through nuclear weapons, the mechanisms, politics, and weaponry of the war had an added psychological component. Indeed Operation Profunc’s plans for mass containment

109 “Re: Crash Action,” Ibid., LAC.
110 “Re: Crash Action,” Ibid., LAC.
reflected earlier episodes of arrests, detention, and internment of apparently enemy populations. But the powers influencing the decision to orchestrate a surveillance and internment plan that surreptitiously lasted for three decades operated in a different climate and context. While the threats of communism, socialism, and collectivism remained the primary targets for police surveillance, as they had since the late 1910s, the enemy of the Cold War was drastically different from that of the two World Wars. This was a covert enemy, one that could either infiltrate from the inside as a fifth column agent or take the country by surprise through a sudden military attack.

In Jackie Orr’s *Panic Diaries: A Genealogy of Panic Disorder*, she examined the growing study of collective panic during the 1950s. Referring to Alexander Mintz’s 1951 publication “Non-Adaptive Group Behavior,” Orr illustrated how group panic was not the result of emotional excitement but rather the group’s “reasonable and rational perception of their situation and its likely outcome.” While Mintz’s study was based on the panic of the Second World War it was applicable to the growing sense of panic and anxiety during the early Cold War. At the foundation of Operation Profunc were the wider efforts to maintain control in a conflict that threatened surprise attack and unparalleled levels of damage.

How Operation Profunc remained a covert plan over the course of three decades, escaping the knowledge of the public (and many politicians), was central to its function. There was little discussion of the operation within the government. Plans for emergency measures in the event of an attack on national security were understood, particularly in the wake of two World Wars, but the extent of Operation Profunc’s surveillance and internment plan was top-secret material. A later memorandum regarding Profunc plans and the Government War Book from 1971, for instance, indicated that Federal Departments and Ministries were aware

112 A memo from the Deputy Solicitor General to the Solicitor General in 1970 addressed the apparent fragility of the Operation Profunc plan as it existed amid changes in governmental departments at the time. The memo considered where the responsibility should lie in terms of detention, stating: “Any internment is bound to be unpalatable to at least some segment of the public and it may be that the public as a whole would prefer to see a system whereby the department charged with the actual holding of subversives was not involved in dealing with objections. On the other hand, for administrative simplicity it would seem preferable to have all operations respecting internment in one ’package’ rather than having responsibilities divided between two departments.” “Internment of Subversives,” memo, from Deputy Solicitor General E. A. Côté to Solicitor General, 9 September 1970, 2. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-39-34, LAC.
113 The War Book was a document initially drawn up in 1948 to outline various measures to be taken by governmental departments and agencies in the event of a national emergency, as proclaimed in the War Measures Act.
of plans for security measures in the event of a Communist attack on Canada.\textsuperscript{114} What likely remained hidden from most of these members was the scope of the plan which stretched back to the late 1940s, the level of preparation, and the initial large number of planned internees.\textsuperscript{115} Under Operation Profunc, the RCMP responsibilities, according to the War Book, were to maintain “internal security of Canada in all measures of subversion, espionage and sabotage.”\textsuperscript{116} What maintaining security entailed was not always apparent; Operation Profunc was visible or invisible at different levels within the government and the police.

In this dissertation, Operation Profunc is largely discussed in terms of its limitations in scope and its failed sense of ambition. It is necessary also to consider why it evolved the way it did. This program in many ways worked blindly to prepare for an attack and disaster that could not be entirely conceived. As one of the initial documents concerning Operation Profunc in the late 1940s stated, it was reasonable to suspect that there were Soviet agents and a sizeable group of undercover party members operating within Canada.\textsuperscript{117} The two ways to thwart the threat of enemy espionage and sabotage, an initial 1948 memo stated, were to break up existing espionage rings and arrest undercover party members thus impeding the flow of communism, ‘blinding’ the enemy, “most of his courier arrangements and upset[ting] his contact system.”\textsuperscript{118} While the memo allowed that little progress had yet been made, it acknowledged that it was important to “know these facts so that there may be no misapprehension as to our degree of preparedness.”\textsuperscript{119} With the threat of unprecedented destruction, either by nuclear war and radioactivity or the infiltrating forces of Communism, planners worked to prepare for the unknown. Through its

\textsuperscript{114} The meeting was chaired by Chief of Operational Plans, Emergency Measures Organization, Department of National Defence. Each department was reportedly responsible for drafting measures within their area. The sergeant writing the report noted that aside from the DND, the RCMP were the best prepared for emergency. This should not have been that surprising. “Re: Profunc – Plans,” memorandum, from Sgt. [redacted] to Supt. Chisholm, 5 November 1971. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-39-34, LAC.

\textsuperscript{115} The document presented the measures that included the custody of “enemy property,” reorganization of the RCMP on a wartime basis, apprehension of “persons dangerous to the state,” establishment of civilian reception centres and internment camps, dissolution of organizations considered dangerous to the state, along with discussions regarding the establishment of points of control, international measures, such as the seizure of enemy ships, the communication with NATO regarding Canada’s position and/or plans, prisoners of war, and Defence of Canada (Military) Regulations. “Re: Profunc – Plans,” 5 November 1971. Ibid., LAC.


\textsuperscript{118} “Re: Special Branch Organization,” 1948. Ibid., LAC.

\textsuperscript{119} “Re: Special Branch Organization,” 1948. Ibid., LAC.
efforts to work invisibly and covertly, Operation Profunc was the result of an effort to protect the nation and prepare for disaster in a logical manner. It was also a product of an era that glorified order as a means of combating unimaginable chaos.
CHAPTER TWO  Isolation, Functionality, and Control: Planning Operation Profunc From ‘M’ Day to the Camp

1. Introduction

The William Head Quarantine Station on Vancouver Island was, according to Operation Profunc, a virtually inescapable site. Not only was the institution built to confine, prohibiting both the spread of illness and the unauthorized movement of immigrants, but it was also built in a prime location for internment. In addition to the guards’ ability to surveil the region from their vantage point on the peninsula the station was surrounded by dense forest and the ocean. The water that bordered the station was recorded to be 42 degrees Fahrenheit (about six degrees Celsius), deterring potential escapees.¹ In fact, the 1951 ‘E’ Division report that promoted the institution’s virtually inescapable location to the RCMP headquarters in Ottawa referred to an earlier experiment that proved the complete isolation of the station’s residents, stating:

In this connection it is of interest that doctors at the Quarantine Station have conducted a number of experiments with rats to see if they were capable of reaching the far shores. It was found that the cold water exhausted their endurance in about 15 minutes and that because of the rough waters in no case had a rat been able to swim any appreciable distance.²

This reference to rats is compelling. The connection between the plight of the rat, an animal arguably much smaller than a human, and that of possible internees escaping the isolated institution via the frigid waters of the Juan de Fuca Strait, suggested an implicit link between communism and vermin.

Rodents were not uncommon subjects in medical experiments but the reference to rats in the context of a potential communist internment centre brings with it additional significance. Rats, commonly understood to be carriers of disease, have also frequently served a literary purpose in anti-communist rhetoric for this reason.³ The implied connections between rats,

² “Re: Internment Operations – General (Canadian Immigration Station at William Head, Vancouver Island),” 4 May 1951. Ibid., LAC.
³ Lianne McTavish and Jingjing Zheng discussed the contradictory portrayal of rats in relation to humans – at times as filthy undesirables and at other times as substitutes for humans in medical experiments in their article about Alberta’s anti-rat campaign of the Cold War. Lianne McTavish and Jingjing Zheng, “Rats in Alberta: Looking at Pest-Control Posters from the 1950s,” The Canadian Historical Review 92, 3 (September 2011): 515-546. Historian Murray Levin also refers to the depiction of “Red Conspirators” as “aliens, foreigners, Jews, vermin, lice, feces,
communists, and disease was particularly evident in Alberta’s contemporary campaign to stop the spread of rats into the province. Beginning in the 1920s, the Norway rat, an invasive European species, began to spread west across the Canadian prairies reaching the eastern border of Alberta in 1950. The quickly organized and implemented 1950 Alberta anti-rat campaign produced the following poster:

![Rats are coming!](Figure 3)

The illustration shows shadowy rats with glinting eyes bounding towards the province of Alberta, displayed as a clean white region in an otherwise grey and featureless continent. Its simple design depicted the Government of Alberta’s success in preventing the invasion of Norway rats from all sides and warned against the peril that Alberta would meet should it let down its guard. The swarming rats evoked both the dangers of spreading disease and international Communism. The ‘Us’ versus ‘Them’ dynamic that was unmistakeably illustrated in this poster and others equated the rat to an infiltrating alien agent. As historian Geoffrey Smith stated on the subject of Cold War threats, the binaries of ‘healthy’ and ‘ill,’ ‘clean’ and ‘dirty,’ and ‘free’ and ‘enslaved,’ were part of the American anti-communist ‘Us’ and ‘Them’ disease, plague, epidemic, mad geniuses, scum, filth, rats […]’ Murray B. Levin, *Political Hysteria in America: the Democratic Capacity for Repression* (New York: Basic Books, 1971), 151.


Provincial Archives of Alberta (PAA), Distributed by Field Crops Branch, Department of Agriculture, Government of Alberta, c. 1950.

McTavish and Zheng also observe that posters such as this one resembled wartime posters depicting “the potential invasion of the home front.” 543.
dichotomy of the 1950s. According to this rhetoric, Soviets, unlike Fascists before them, operated at a “nefarious” level, moving stealthily “much like unseen germs and viral agents – threatening to infect debilitated areas, especially those parts of Europe devastated during the war.”

A second poster from the same era explicitly referred to the dangers rats posed to health and society:

![Poster Image]

Figure 4

The rhetoric of peril, once more, applied to other contemporary concerns for invading species and poisons. This poster, also from 1950, referred to the rat as a singular destructive force to health, home, and industry. The poster’s slogans warn that complacency towards the destructive nature of the rat could lead to significant social, environmental, and industrial destruction – citizens should thus not ignore the rat. In addition to being a very real threat to Alberta’s agriculture, the rat was also a symbol of a larger concern of infiltration during the Cold War. Disease, filth, vermin, and communism were also symbolically united in the case of the William Head Quarantine Station – a facility that would, in the case of an emergency, effectively keep a destructive force contained.

Environment and space played a central role in Operation Profunc promising protection against invasive threats. Two of the primary factors of the plans for internment were the

---

9 PAA, Commissioned and Distributed by Division of Entomology, Department of Public Health, Government of Alberta, 1950.
imporance of maintaining secrecy throughout the preparation process and controlling security once the plan was in operation. With a few exceptions, internment camps would be largely located in areas far from highly populated centres.\textsuperscript{10} Planners looked to Canada’s wilderness as an asset in controlling the dangers of communist infiltration, in some cases following a well-established tradition of using parks as means of managing the spectre of public disorder.\textsuperscript{11} At the same time the plans called for a need to have proper infrastructure to contain the “prominent functionaries.” Working covertly and with little funding for camp construction, Operation Profunc looked to already existing sites of internment or possible containment. The focus on space and isolation indicated Operation Profunc’s belief that the prominent functionaries were a force to be contained in war, pointing to the larger understanding of Cold War communism as both an invading and contagious power. One ‘E’ Division memorandum dated 20 January 1951 noted that isolated locations could serve the purpose of maintaining camp security. These locations would reduce the problem of not having enough guards at the camps, an anticipated problem especially in wartime when the Department of National Defence (DND) would have other obligations, and would also “certainly reduce the possibility of riots or demonstrations being organized on behalf of the internees by Party members not interned.”\textsuperscript{12} In the case of Operation Profunc internment camps, the Canadian wilderness was a means for protection and defence against an invasive species.

2. Method and Focus

This chapter addresses the plans for internment camps in what is primarily Western Canada. With a few exceptions that demonstrate the extent of the program, the region of attention lies west of Northern Ontario, including Central Saskatchewan, Western Alberta, and Coastal and Interior British Columbia. This concentration is for two reasons: the program’s focus on the importance of space and the culture of anxiety that existed in these regions. Central to the plans for internment was the issue of space and the west had plenty of it. Locations on the

\textsuperscript{10} One document from ‘C’ Division in Quebec warned against establishing an internment camp close to civilians: “Unlike military prisoners of war, detenus [sic] will likely have sympathisers or friends outside attempting to approach or communicate with them. Escape is also to be considered and proximity to a built up area raises hazards which do not exist in open country.” “Re: Internment Operations,” letter from N. Courtois to Major Blaine, 13 July 1954. Reference no. A 2011-00179-09-00-41, LAC.


\textsuperscript{12} Letter, from Harvison to the RCMP Commissioner, 20 January 1951. Reference no. A 2011-00179-09-42-06, LAC.
prairies and British Columbia’s interior, in addition to several national and provincial parks in Alberta, had previously served as sites for internment camps.\textsuperscript{13} There was also a fundamental fear of attack in the west, especially along the coast, that was unique to the region. In terms of anxiety about an infiltrating threat from within, the prairies were home to several target organizations.\textsuperscript{14} In his thesis regarding anti-communist sentiment in the west during the Korean War, historian Marijan Salopek noted that the western provinces have experienced a long history of pacifist movements, many of which were led by minority groups such as the Mennonites and the Doukhobors prior to the Second World War.\textsuperscript{15} Co-operatives and farmers unions, such as the United Farmers of Alberta (UFA), were central to western Canadian politics throughout the twentieth century and parties such as the Co-operative Commonwealth Federation (CCF), later the New Democratic Party (NDP), grew after the Great Depression and into the postwar era.

This chapter focuses primarily on space in the west and how the desire to establish effective internment sites corresponded with local anxieties about infiltration and invasion. Western anxiety was especially evident in the spectacle of Cold War preparedness during the 1950s. Salopek explains in his research on Canadian civil defence during the Korean War that by the early 1950s Alberta and British Columbia’s defence plans were the most elaborate in the country.\textsuperscript{16} He suggests that this was the result of the provinces’ geographical distance and isolation from the rest of the country.\textsuperscript{17} There was also the issue of western resources under threat. Salopek notes that Alberta premier Ernest Manning feared that Alberta, with its oil refineries and its position as “gateway to the north” with its airport and Mackenzie Highway, could be the nation’s main target if Russian bombers were unable to reach central Canada.\textsuperscript{18} Salopek’s discussion of the strength of Alberta and British Columbia’s civil defence programs matched the provinces’ preparedness for communist internment, as was evident in the Operation

\textsuperscript{13} Waiser’s study of park internment includes the relief camps of the Great Depression, noting that “While the country was gripped by a seemingly unshakable economic malaise and the government search vainly for a cure, the Parks Department enjoyed the luxury of several hundred labourers, who toiled at a variety of development, recreation, and maintenance projects.” \textit{Parks Prisoners}, 84.
\textsuperscript{14} The significance of the ethnic and labour associations that grew in this region will be discussed in more detail in Chapter Six.
\textsuperscript{15} Marijan Salopek, “A Survey of Western Canadian Concerns and Fear During the Korean War, 1950-1953,” Master of Arts Thesis (Edmonton, University of Alberta, 1984), 92.
\textsuperscript{17} Salopek, Ibid.
\textsuperscript{18} Ibid.
Profunc records. While Ottawa had its own concerns as the nation’s capital, the western provinces’ concerns stemmed from a belief in their vulnerability through space and proximity to other targets. A sense of showmanship and exhibition was fuelled by this anxiety and was evident in well-publicized civil defence programs like Operation ‘Lifesaver,’ a staged evacuation of suburban Calgary in 1955.

Operation Profunc was much more covert than the widely broadcasted civil defence program. One way to track the level of preparedness for disaster in this highly secret operation is through its records on planned internees throughout the 1950s and 1960s. Within the records are a series of annual tables that break down the male and female populations of each division, indicating the number that were approved for ‘pick-up’ or were pending approval. Ontario’s ‘O’ Division was in the lead, as was to be expected considering the province had the largest population in the country, was the location of the nation’s capital, and was the heart of the Canadian manufacturing industry, a likely target in the case of a military attack. Interestingly, British Columbia’s ‘E’ Division consistently held the second highest number of planned internees, followed by Northern Ontario, then by Manitoba’s ‘D’ Division and Alberta’s ‘K’ Division alternatively. According to the Profunc files, British Columbia was one of the first prepared provinces for potential war. A 1938 letter to the RCMP Commissioner in Ottawa, for instance, referred to ‘E’ Division’s efforts to formulate a “comprehensive defensive plan for Pacific Coast area,” expressing desire for an action plan from either the RCMP or British

---

19 According to the files, British Columbia was one of the first provinces to become fully engaged with the program. By 1949, one year after the plan had officially begun, ‘E’ Division had listed 1,200 “prominent functionaries” (although had only filled out less than 400 identity cards for these potential internees). “Re: Prominent Functionaries in Subversive Organizations; Instructions re: Submission of Lists,” memo, from Commissioner L. H. Nicholson to O.C. RCMP, Vancouver, 24 November 1949. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-37-03, LAC. According to a memo in 1952, the RCMP Commissioner suggested that the province’s reception centre and camp be ready to accommodate a total of 3,000 individuals. “Re: Internment Operations – General ‘E’ Division,” memo, from L. H. Nicholson to O.C. Emergency Planning Branch, 20 February 1952. Reference no. A 2011-00179-09-42-06, LAC. A subsequent memo suggested that the expected number of persons to be interned in ‘E’ Division was closer to 330. “Re: Internment Operations – General ‘E’ Division,” memo, from George B. McClellan to RCMP Commissioner, 6 March 1952. Ibid., LAC. Ontario’s ‘O’ Division numbers were the highest in the country, given its population and centrality. ‘E’ Division’s numbers were the highest among the rest of the provinces. “Profunc Recapitulation,” lists, 1965-1976. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-37-20, LAC.


22 The 1951 table charts ‘O’ Division as having an expected number of 2,716 approved and unapproved internees, 1,538 for ‘E’ Division, and 1,134 for ‘D’ Division. “Profunc Recapitulation,” table, 1951. Ibid., LAC. A 1953 table charts ‘O’ Division at 3,574, ‘E’ Division at 1,918, and ‘K’ Division at 1,321. “Profunc Recapitulation,” tables, 1953. LAC.
Columbia’s Provincial Police “whereby, in the event of hostilities breaking out, any known spies or other aliens suspected of being engaged in subversive activities, could be forthwith picked up and turned over to the DND to be placed in internment camps.”

The RCMP Commissioner granted this request a few days later, drawing up a list of vulnerable points throughout the province. By contrast, the Maritime provinces were less involved in planning for communist internment, which was possibly the result of alternative methods of managing potential political threats. The territories were rarely, if ever, discussed in the Profunc reports.

As the first comprehensive study of Operation Profunc, this chapter is based on the material provided through an ATIP request. As with Chapter One, secondary sources provide historical context of previous episodes of internment in Canada. The available Operation Profunc documents on planned internment camps are informative but impeded through censorship. Generally comprised of correspondence between the regional RCMP divisions and the RCMP commissioner in Ottawa, the documents discuss possible locations for sites of reception centres and internment camps. Typically, the regional RCMP division would scope out an area or institution, either one that was currently in operation such as a school, heritage site, or prison, or a location that had been abandoned. The officers would write a report detailing the possible benefits and challenges of the site and submit it first to Ottawa. Should a spot be deemed a possibility, further research would be conducted, all undercover, bearing in mind the importance of keeping the operation secret.

Accompanying most reports in these files are maps and photographs of the suggested sites for detainment, processing, and internment. Unfortunately the quality of these documents is poor. Reproductions of the photographs, which are ultimately photocopies themselves, provide little illustration of what the sites actually looked like. They do, however, imply the amount of work that went into the process of vetting locations. Files on prisons, for instance, demonstrated the various attributes of the sites for both holding and occupying prisoners by including photographs of workshops, sleeping quarters, and cafeterias that showed the benefits of using a running institution.

Maps included in the Operation Profunc files are slightly more useful than

---

24 ‘F’ Division included a file of 15 photographs to accompany its reports on the penitentiary and farm camp in Prince Albert, Saskatchewan. About 6 of these are missing from the file. Those included are poorly reproduced and feature outside views of the prison and the farm camp, along with several rooms inside the facility such as the
the photographs, but are again poorly reproduced.\textsuperscript{25} The maps show the attention paid to detail for prospective internment camps, including the distances between buildings and the future locations of fencing and guard towers. The usefulness of these pictorial representations lies in their existence, indicating the extent of the plans and the focus of the Operation Profunc planners on finding secure, safe, and, in many cases, isolated sites for containment.

3. Maintaining Security through Isolation, Secrecy, and Location

At the height of Profunc planning in the mid-1950s, the expected timeline for national mobilization was 24 hours. Shortly after the state of emergency was established, either in the form of a declaration of war, foreign attack, or a communist uprising, the DND would notify RCMP divisions. At this order, the RCMP would access the information on prominent functionaries that had been gathered over the years, which would include home and work addresses, and set to arresting suspects, as discussed in Chapter One. Throughout the 1950s and 1960s, this arrest plan was a four-step process beginning with the RCMP arrests and ending with internment of prominent functionaries. Step one, the arrests, was to be completed within the first three days following the declaration of a national emergency. The second step involved the RCMP transfer of prisoners to reception centres across the country. These centres would be set up in cities and towns throughout Canada allowing for ready processing of prominent functionaries before their transfer to detainment centres and later to internment camps. The reception centres, often old immigration halls and offices in larger cities or buildings such as schools in smaller communities, would be operated by RCMP officers, along with medical and correctional staff. Here individuals would be processed, provided with uniforms, photographed, fingerprinted, and have their personal data recorded for the Profunc files. The legal advisor of the Advisory Committee in charge of Profunc planning would then examine these evidence briefs on prominent functionaries.\textsuperscript{26}

\textsuperscript{25} ‘E’ Divisions files, for instance, include maps that detail proposed security fencing features for a “typical internment camp for 400.” Map, Department of National Defence, Office of Area Engineer B.C. Area, 30 October 1959. Reference no. A 2011-00179-09-43-24, LAC.

\textsuperscript{26} Throughout the decades, in preparation for national emergency, members of the Security Service would send evidence briefs to the legal advisor for approval. “Advisory Committee on Internments,” brief, from M. R. Dare, Director General of Security Service, to Robin Bourne, Assistant Department Minister (Police and Security), July 1973, 2. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-37-20, LAC.
Processing internees was expected to take ten days. According to RCMP documents from the 1950s, the pace of arrests and detainment was paramount to the effectiveness of the operation, especially considering the other perils of a Communist-led attack on Canada. One such peril, nuclear attack, increased through the 1950s and affected the way in which isolation through internment was envisioned. A 1963 report for ‘F’ Division cited that one of the attributes of Prince Albert, Saskatchewan was that it was in Zone 6 on a map of potential nuclear targets. In the event of a nuclear attack on Canada, Prince Albert was relatively safe, having only a ten per cent chance of a seven-day dose of radiation in a non-protected area of 100 to 200 roentgens. The extra complication of a potential nuclear war was perceived to be more inhibiting to the plan for internment in a later brief from 1973 which stated that current developments in nuclear weaponry could make the whole internment plan irrelevant in the larger scheme of national protection.

Over the two weeks following ‘M’ day, when the internees would be lodged at reception centres, the RCMP would prepare for Step Three of Operation Profunc. This step involved deporting prominent functionaries to detention centres where they would be held for the amount of time it took to prepare the internment camps. After being held at the detention centres for an estimated four months, the prominent functionaries would then embark on the fourth and final step of Operation Profunc: their internment at prison camps across the country. The reception and detention centres would then close and the RCMP’s attention would turn to surveilling the subversives in remote internment camps. Separated from the larger public, unable to communicate with the outside world, the subversive population would then be effectively contained.

Operation Profunc and its functionality, or lack thereof, depended upon a broad definition of threat to Canadian security and a sense of optimism at containing this ambiguous threat. Unlike an ethnic population that could be determined through lineage or nationality, communists

---

29 Memo, from W. J. Fitzsimmons to Commanding Officer of ‘F’ Division, 18 December 1963. Reference no. A 2011-00179-09-00-41, LAC.
30 Memo, 18 December 1963. Ibid., LAC.
31 “Advisory Committee on Internments,” brief, from Dare to Bourne, July 1973. LAC.
32 “Report for ‘F’ Division,” from C. E. Rivett-Carnac to RCMP Commissioner, 30 January 1951. LAC.
or sympathetic individuals to leftist politics could not as easily be identified by the police. The plan to intern this unprecedented target, in size and in identity, was full of holes. Based on an earlier and out-dated model of internment, Operation Profunc was enthusiastic about the ability to effectively and efficiently collect, process, and imprison thousands of civilians in a matter of weeks.

Maintaining the secrecy of Operation Profunc was both paramount and a point of worry. Planners were concerned that the suggested three day time period to arrest subversives following ‘M’ day would be too short, allowing for high profile communists to go into hiding. Plans pointed to the need for efficiency in conducting the mass arrests. Throughout the decades Operation Profunc’s surveillance system created a categorization of the prominent functionaries focusing on their importance to the Communist Party rather than on evidence of their political activities. A 1949 arrest plan dictated the order in which prominent functionaries should be arrested following a national emergency.33 Those individuals central to the Party would be among the first to be arrested.34 This system would allow for the quick confinement of what the RCMP believed was the most radical population, followed by a more comprehensive internment of leftists. This system was also designed to halt a growing population of potential internees that could likely stifle the movements of the RCMP during a period of national emergency. When surveying prospective sites for internment camps, officers were cautioned to maintain the utmost secrecy of the plan. A 1951 ‘E’ Division document regarding RCMP survey operations of prospective sites in the province’s interior, referred to the strict instructions to travel in plain clothes, in an unmarked car, and to limit discussion of travel to tourist bureaus.35 When surveying potential sites in Quebec, officers in ‘C’ Division found it necessary to invent personalities and purposes for their visits far removed from their actual intention to inspect the prison-like attributes of structures and grounds. In late 1952, for instance, when RCMP officers

34 “In 1957 an alternative short list of some 160 ‘key people’ was created for use in case little time was available (‘Crash Plan’). In July, 1958 an Emergency Headquarters was secretly set up at nearby Pembroke up the Ottawa River to safeguard selected top secret records ‘including a complete set of Profunc cards, photo-ident cards, the original blanket and individual orders, and a copy of Censorship Watch List and Special Advisory Committee on Internments file.’” Carl Betke and S. W. Horrall, Canada’s Security Service: An Historical Outline, 1864-1966 (Ottawa: RCMP Historical Section, 1978), 674.
surveyed the Feller Institution at Grand Ligne, Quebec they did so under the pretence of educating students with a program entitled: “Youth and the Police.” The French Protestant School was a desirable institution for internment because of its past use as an officers’ Prisoner of War (POW) camp during the Second World War. This historical precedence assured planners that, in the event of a national emergency, the Feller Institution would be ready and capable to receive prisoners. Three officers arrived at the school on the pretext of surveying the grounds for a future showing of the educational film explaining the nature of police work. By maintaining a cover and disguising their visit’s purpose, the RCMP and Operation Profunc planners essentially worked as spies, vetting locations for potential internment of the perceived enemy.

Another example of covert RCMP surveillance of space was a 1954 survey of Fort Lennox, Quebec that the police performed in plainclothes. In the RCMP report detailing the reconnaissance mission, the officers noted that the caretaker “appeared to be under the impression that the group were engineers from the Department of National Parks.” The report remains coy on the subject of how the caretaker reached this assumption. Fort Lennox, located on the Île aux Noix in the Richelieu River, was a historical site under jurisdiction of the National Parks Board. With its heavy fortifications and isolated location it was, despite its need for several renovations, an ideal location for an internment camp. A similar ‘misunderstanding’ occurred during a 1964 survey of the Beaver Creek Correctional Camp outside of Gravenhurst, Ontario. Officers from ‘O’ Division wrote in their report that “[t]he real purpose of the survey was not made known to him [the superintendent] but rather the impression was conveyed that the information was required in the emergency planning for police accommodation.” Maintaining secrecy was vital for the operation’s success. It was subsequently part of the larger narrative of

---

37 “Re: Internment Operations – General – ‘C’ Division,” reports 11 November, 1952 and 13 December, 1952. Ibid., LAC. The documents also indicate that the site’s proximity to Montreal and well-traveled highways were not among the Institute’s attributes.
surveillance and undercover activity wherein the RCMP covertly managed a counter-subversion plan.

In addition to the importance of secrecy was the importance of location. The drawn-out discussions about the best locations for internment camps indicated the ways in which prominent functionaries were perceived and portrayed by Canadian security forces. While documents show that only a portion of the organizations under surveillance identified as communist, the measures taken to prepare for their secure confinement speaks to how the Cold War threat was constructed. While communists were typically portrayed as individuals with ‘character weaknesses,’ the RCMP and Operation Profunc officials planned for their internment in facilities matching those that imprisoned Nazi POWs during the Second World War. One of the weaknesses of the larger Profunc plan was the conception of the enemy and the subsequent hyperbolism of the threat evident in the misperceived need to treat civilian prisoners as militarily-trained soldiers. This classification of the communist Canadian as akin to a foreign combatant was evident in the methods used in preparing for the confinement of perceived enemies.

A 1963 Operation Profunc document detailing an RCMP training course on the legal aspects of arresting subversives provides evidence of how the RCMP and Profunc planners identified the potential internees as criminals upon the declaration of a national emergency. Individuals targeted as prominent functionaries would be arrested under the DOCR. The 1963 memo stated: “Once the War Measures Act was proclaimed and the D.O.C.R.’s came into effect, and should the Party be declared an illegal organization […] all property, rights, and interests of the Party would become vested in the Custodian of Enemy Property.” The memo went on to note that under new regulations, officers would not be required to hold search warrants when confiscating subversive material held by prominent functionaries because “there is no question regarding seizure of the funds as they would be held by the Party in contravention of the regulations once the Party is declared an illegal organization.” The 1963 document also indicated the expectation that the targeted individuals would be prepared for their arrests, stating:

---

42 The categorization of targets of surveillance as subversives will be discussed in more detail in Chapter Six.
44 “S & I Training Course No. 27,” from C.I.B. Legal Section, 4 November 1963. Ibid., LAC.
45 “S & I Training Course No. 27.” Ibid., LAC.
It is understood that this question [of whether copies of Regulation 25 of the DOCR be in the hands of field personnel or readily available after the apprehension] has been considered previously in the light of the possibility that without a copy of the order members may encounter difficulties in effecting the arrest in that after the arrest a quick application for habeas corpus may result in the release of some of these persons. It would seem logical that many persons subversively inclined would expect such action and would make arrangements beforehand to meet the eventuality; which arrangements conceivably could include applications for habeas corpus.\textsuperscript{46}

The document then went on to discuss how these quick applications could challenge the effective processing of prominent functionaries during a period of national emergency.\textsuperscript{47} By anticipating the preparedness of a subversive group, the Operation Profunc plans specified that throughout the detainment process, prominent functionaries would be treated as criminals. In believing that the potential internees would have the criminal mindset and preparedness to escape or outwit their guards, the Security Service and Operation Profunc planners prepared the incarceration of communists and communist sympathizers to match that of POW camps or prisons.

Arrests were to be swift and professional so as to collect the targeted population with no warning and draw little attention to the detainment process before the subversives were placed in reception centres. Operation Profunc planners focused on the importance of time management; officers were to quickly collect evidence and place individuals in custody in order to enable a swift launch of the wartime plan. The reception centres were also fundamental for the smooth delivery of prominent functionaries to the internment camps. These centres were the ‘processing’ sites for the prominent functionaries and sites where they would relinquish their personal property and officially become prisoners of the state. It was for this reason that planners deliberated over the advantages and shortcomings of various locations chosen for the reception centres. Unlike the camps, reception centres were planned for more central areas, often in the middle of cities, which could pose additional problems to security measures.

Alberta, for instance, chose to have centres in both of its primary cities: Edmonton and Calgary. By early 1950, ‘K’ Division decided on the Immigration Hall in Edmonton for one of its main reception centres. This building was capable of holding 400 persons and was, as an immigration hall, constructed with the purpose of processing large groups of individuals.\textsuperscript{48}

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{46} “S & I Training Course No. 27,” Ibid., LAC.
\item \textsuperscript{47} “S & I Training Course No. 27,” Ibid., LAC.
\end{itemize}
first choice for a reception centre in Calgary, meanwhile, was problematic. The Exhibition Grounds for the Calgary Stampede offered a great deal of space, but after a general survey, planners decided that the location was poorly maintained, unhygienic, uninhabitable, and posed security risks. This planned location and its limitations were reminiscent of the use of the Vancouver Pacific National Exhibition (PNE) grounds at Hastings Park as a holding space for Japanese-Canadians during the Second World War. In his memoirs of displacement from Woodfibre, a small mill-town north of Vancouver on the Howe Sound, Takeo Ujo Nakano described his experience at the grounds as uncomfortable, unsanitary, and inhumane. Recalling his experience entering the reception centre, he stated: “There our nostrils were immediately offended by a strong stench of cows and horses. We soon realized why, as we were promptly herded into the building normally used to house livestock exhibited at the annual Pacific National Exhibition.” The use of the PNE grounds during the 1940s was the result of a quick and disorganized mass internment of civilians, governed by panic and prejudice. Being an elaborate pre-emptive approach to disaster, Operation Profunc allowed time for reconsideration and by late 1950 ‘K’ Division planners turned their attention to the General Electric Building in downtown Calgary. This location was deemed a safer option, but still required renovations. What the ‘K’ Division plans for reception centres demonstrated was the importance of having a well-situated and capable location for processing a mass population of prospective internees during a national emergency, indicating both the scope of the plan and the expected intensity of a potential disaster.

Once internees were processed, and once the camps were ready to receive their new residents, the prominent functionaries would then be divided according to gender and transferred to regional camps. The map displayed (Figure 5) was created circa 1951. Labelled here as “Out of Date” the map provides an important visual document of how Operation Profunc was imagined in the early 1950s:

---

49 “Re: Apprehension of Persons under the D.O.C.R. in Event of War (Reception Centres),” memorandum, from C. W. J. Goldsmith to Officer Commanding of ‘K’ Division, 7 November 1950. Ibid., LAC.
50 Takeo Ujo Nakano and Leatrice Nakano, Within the Barbed Wire Fence: A Japanese Man’s Account of His Internment in Canada (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1980), 14.
51 “Re: Apprehension of Persons under the D.O.C.R. in Event of War (Reception Centres),” 7 November 1950. One of the problems of the General Electric Building was that it had no kitchen facilities. Planners, however, decided that the staff and prisoners could acquire food from a nearby civilian restaurant. “Internment Plans: Alberta Area,” report, from Lieutenant-Colonel M. R. Dare to Officer Commanding ‘K’ Division, 21 May 1951. Ibid., LAC.
The map includes an estimation of internees in ‘E’ Division (300-400), reception centres across the country (labelled: No. 1 Halifax, No. 2 Montreal, No. 3 Toronto, No. 5 Port Arthur, No. 6 Winnipeg, No. 7 Regina, No. 8 Edmonton, No. 9 Calgary, and No. 10 Vancouver), and internment camps in what is possibly Kamloops (male), Kelowna (female), Lethbridge (male), Neys (male), Burwash (male), Niagara (female), Rawdon (male), and Parry Sound (protected persons).

Once in the camps, the prominent functionaries had to be managed. Central to plans for controlling the internees was the subject of physical labour and employment opportunities at the internment camps. The Profunc organizers planned to provide internees with activities to keep them occupied during their containment period. Labour, they believed, would circumvent the boredom that could lead to riots, rebellions, and escape. During the Second World War, prisoners at internment camps across the country logged, farmed, and manufactured goods. In Northern Ontario, for instance, a number of POW logging camps were situated inland from Lake

---

52 “Out of date” map of planned reception centres and internment camps across Canada, c. 1951. Map, reference no. 2011-00179-09-54-13, LAC. A larger version of the map is available in the Appendix.
53 These plans were directed toward the predominantly male population and little is mentioned about employment opportunities at the female camps.
54 It was not enough to hold prisoners during wartime, it was important to keep them busy. Waiser, Parks Prisoners, 2.
Superior. In British Columbia, Profunc planners suggested that fruit and vegetable farms could assist the “smooth operation of the internment camp or the war effort that would be in progress.” ‘E’ Division planners noted that British Columbia required internment sites that allowed for physical labour, stating that while internees might “not accept employment” it was an important factor to consider because “camp boredom and in some cases financial necessity might lead to a portion of the internees being willing to work, and it is considered that where possible, planning should provide this possibility.” Similarly, sites such as the Saskatchewan Farm Camp in Prince Albert were considered promising for prospective internees for the same reason. The ‘F’ Division surveyors described the apparently innovative nature of the farm in their 1963 report, stating that the Farm Camp was “a self-sustaining operational and administrative component. The [prison] inmates, while quartered and assigned here, have no contact with the inmates [censored] and, as will be seen and deduced, can serve their sentence in a much less confined and restricted atmosphere.” While demonstrating the consistent desire to manage the interned population through work, the 1963 plan also illustrated an evolving concept of containment in wartime that allowed for a less constricted environment.

Keeping the prisoners occupied was one task; enforcing their imprisonment was quite another. Documents hinted at the decision to have extreme punishments for escapees, but plans generally emphasized the importance of maintaining the regulations of the Geneva Convention. While the internees would have been arrested, detained, and imprisoned with complete disregard to habeas corpus, records indicated that prisoners would be allowed to appeal their arrests.

57 “Re: Internment Operations – General ‘E’ Division,” memorandum, from Inspector W. Dick to Assistant Commissioner S. Bullard, 15 June 1951. Reference no. A 2011-00179-09-42-06, LAC. In discussing the problematic sites of Comox and Bella Bella, one planner defined one reason to avoid these locations as the following: “The internees will not be able to grow beets or apples at either Comox or Bella Bella, but I still hold to my previous point that their output wouldn’t be very great in any event.” Personal letter from Harvison to Dick, 1 June 1951. Ibid., LAC. This plan harkened to the earlier use of Japanese Canadian labour through incarceration that, as scholar Mona Oikawa notes, helped alleviate labour shortages caused by men fighting overseas in the war. Mona Oikawa, “Cartographies of Violence: Women, Memory, and the Subjects of the ‘Internment,’” Canadian Journal of Law and Society 15, no. 2 (2000): 55.
59 This is evident in the previously mentioned discussion by ‘E’ Division regarding the best location of internment camps in memorandum from Dick to Bullard, 15 June 1951. LAC.
Nevertheless, records showed a firm intolerance of escapees. In the plans for the William Head Quarantine Station, planners optimistically noted that:

A further advantage [of the location] is that a considerable amount of property immediately adjacent to the peninsula is owned by the Department of National Defence who have troops and gun emplacements in that area. Escapees would be faced with the necessity of making their way through an area in which troops could be very readily alerted.  

Whether or not these guards would be encouraged to shoot the escapees, as guards at Second World War POW and ‘enemy alien’ internment camps were, is not entirely clear. What surfaces from these documents was an apparent lack of consensus for how the prisoners were to be treated. Undoubtedly the planners were uneasy about imprisoning a group of predominantly Canadian-born citizens in a manner that had historically been reserved for ‘enemy aliens.’ This conundrum and the changing perception of the civilian as a threat reflected the fluctuating nature of warfare in the atomic era. In North America, the Cold War battlefield was the civilian and this transfer of target displayed itself not only in efforts to protect society, evident in civil defence plans, but also the classification of the enemy.

Minimizing physical contact through isolation in space, communication, and thought in order to prohibit the possibility of fifth column activities, espionage, and the spread of subversive ideas at a time of national emergency, were paramount to the internment plans. A 1959 General Plan for internment at Chilliwack, British Columbia specified that prisoners would not be allowed radios and that telephone conversations between internees and “persons outside” were forbidden.  

Within the internment camp, packages addressed to internees would be opened and examined while newspapers, along with personal correspondence, would be thoroughly inspected for hidden messages and compromising information. If necessary, letters and newspapers would be censored before reaching the internees. Some of the orders even noted that lamps could be used for signalling and would, like radios, be prohibited in the internment

60 “Re: Internment Operations – General (Canadian Immigration Quarantine Station at William Head, Vancouver Island),” letter, from Harvison to RCMP Commissioner, 4 May 1951. 3. Ibid., LAC.
61 During the Second World War communist internees were provided with uniforms that had targets painted on them: “Civilian clothes were removed and uniforms issued: blue denim pants and jackets and shirts with large red circles on the back – handy targets for guards shooting at the would-be escapees.” Ian Radforth, “Political Prisoners: The Communist Internees” in Enemies Within: Italian and Other Internees in Canada and Abroad, ed. Franca Iacovetta, Robert Perin, and Angelo Principe (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2000), 203.
63 “General Plan and Standing Orders for the Chilliwack Internment Camp,” plan, 1959. LAC.
64 Ibid., 1959. LAC.
Preparations for controlling the enemy were built through the imaginations of planners who speculated about the possible avenues of deception and espionage that could be committed by potential internees.

Considering that the foundation of Operation Profunc was the movement of large groups of prisoners to remote locations, transportation was a significant element of the internment plans. The mode of transportation moving detainees had to act as a temporary internment facility between reception centre and the camp. Two later examples from 1963 and 1971 indicated a consistent preference for commercial bus companies for transporting prisoners, over car, train, or plane. A report on ‘D’ Division from 1963 pointed to the limited transportation options within Saskatchewan stating that “Methods of transportation to Prince Albert, other than by car, leave much to be desired.” The diesel train and commercial air company that flew from Saskatoon were unreliable according to the report that stated that the services were in an “almost constant state of revision and there is no assurance that this means will always be available, even under peacetime conditions.” While the RCMP aircraft was reliable, it could only accommodate five passengers at a time, making it ineffectual in transporting a large population of people to what was an isolated but desirable location for internment. In this case, the RCMP and Operation Profunc planners settled on a charter bus service as the best option, a solution also reached by ‘C’ Division planners in Montreal according to a 1971 report.

Evident in the ‘C’ Division plan for transport was that as the number of planned internees decreased, as they did through the 1960s and into the 1970s, the plans for internment became more concrete and secure. The plan to move prisoners from Montreal to internment camps at Joyceville and Warkworth, Ontario, was detailed in terms of costs and the treatment of prisoners. Treatment included care for prisoners and care for security. The report suggested that in addition to guards and matrons, doctors and nurses would accompany prisoners in the

---

65 Ibid., LAC.
66 Included in the some of the Operation Profunc records are several overviews and information booklets on cross-Canada transportation, often including time-tables and routes for various travel companies.
68 “Re: Internment Operations, Saskatchewan,” Ibid. LAC.
69 According to the appendix, the four busses carrying female prisoners from Montreal to Joyceville and male prisoners to Warkworth, and returning guards and matrons back to the city came to a total of $1,393.30. NCO i/c E Planning Section, Sgt [redacted], memo to Officer i/c of C.I.B. (Criminal Investigation Branch) “Re: General Internment Operation,” 19 July 1971. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-42-16, LAC.
cases of medical emergency or health care needs. While army transport buses were secure, they had no toilet facilities, making them both inefficient for transporting a group of people and a security risk, as stops along the route could very well jeopardize the security of the operation. A local commercial bus company, therefore, was a far more attractive option, although, as the report noted, the door to the toilet on the men’s bus would be removed for security reasons. In addition to this, internees would be handcuffed in pairs to prevent “unnecessary movements and reduce possibilities of escape.” Evident in these reports was the attention to detail in the treatment of potential prisoners, likely drawing from past experiences of internment. At the base of all of these plans, including the focus on remote locations, importance of prisoner work programs, and security of transportation, were the larger efforts to control what could be an extremely insecure situation. Operation Profunc was a plan built and managed in the throes of defence anxiety that anticipated multiple types of attack and imagined the damages of invasion and infiltration.

4. Neys, Prince Albert, and Comox: Planned Internment

The fluctuating plans and disagreements between planners were the result of apprehensions regarding the accessibility, management, and general secrecy of Operation Profunc. While there were divided opinions on the location of certain camps, the general consensus was that internment camps holding communists and subversives should be in remote but accessible locations. Throughout the 1950s and 1960s, Operation Profunc evaluated and re-evaluated different locations across the country. Proposed camps in Northern Ontario, Saskatchewan, and British Columbia epitomized the level of concern for prime locations that maintained isolation and the secrecy of the operation. One early report suggested that internment camps be located well outside of settled centres since “the location of internment camps in isolated areas would reduce the guard problem and it would certainly reduce the possibility of riots or demonstrations being organized on behalf of the internees by Party members not interned.” Throughout the 1950s, the RCMP studied prospective locations along British

---

70 Interestingly, written in the margin of the report beside this suggestion is the comment: “We hope not.” Ibid., 3. LAC.
71 Ibid., Appendix. LAC.
72 Ibid. LAC.
73 “Re: Civilian Internment Camps – General,” memo, from Harvison to RCMP Commissioner, 20 January 1951, 1. Reference no. A 2011-00179-09-42-06, LAC. In this document, Harvison also referred to possible issues with future internees, noting that they “would probably do everything in their power to create disturbances and difficulties.” Ibid. Although not mentioned in the documents that discuss civilian protests, it is possible that the planning
Columbia’s coast and interior in an effort to find sites that benefited from the province’s naturally isolating landscapes but were not inaccessible. During this time, planners also looked to Neys, Ontario as a viable camp location, but later discarded it as a possibility in the 1960s as the area became a popular site for tourists. Sites such as the Prince Albert Penitentiary in Saskatchewan, on the other hand, were introduced later in the 1960s indicating several developing concerns regarding location, funding, and facilities. These three locations illustrate the influence of contemporary domestic and international developments on the defence plan as well as the continued utilization of Canada’s wilderness and landscape as a means of protecting the nation.

The issue of location was especially prominent in British Columbia’s plans for internment. With its diverse landscape, the Pacific Ocean and Coastal mountain range to the west, the Rockies to the east, and the dry interior between, British Columbia posed several boons as well as limitations to potential internment. Unlike the previous internment operations during the Second World War, Operation Profunc was not necessarily obligated to remove the volatile population from the coast. ‘E’ Division camps could capitalize on the natural barriers of ocean, heavy forests, and mountains. When the plan to establish the William Head Quarantine Station as a location failed shortly after it was introduced in 1951, ‘E’ Division turned to other locations on Vancouver Island and along the mainland coast. ‘E’ Division and the RCMP Headquarters in Ottawa, however, disagreed on the remote locations of the Comox naval establishment on the east coast of Vancouver Island for female internees and Bella Bella located on Campbell Island along the central coast of the province for male internees. The remoteness of these locations catered to the planners’ desire to keep the subversives quarantined from the general public, but they were also nearly inaccessible. The issue of transportation from these sites, which would be over water, was addressed in a memo from 1951: “[it] might prove a considerable problem as well as a grave inconvenience when one considers transporting internees to appear before the Appeal Board, no doubt sitting in Vancouver. This, of course, is only one of many transport problems when one considers supplies and rations etc.”

committee’s apprehension to the possibility of protests might have stemmed from the demonstrations by the wives of interned communists during the Second World War. Radforth, 217.

The 1951 document outlined criteria regarding the location of an internment site, stating that it should be close to road or rail transportation, reasonably close, “but not in the immediate vicinity,” to Army camps in order to facilitate drawing rations and supplies, and that the camps should offer employment options for the internees. The memo also stressed that ‘E’ Division should keep the internment camps on the mainland as opposed to locating them on the Island where there were a number of military installations, including radar bases and shore batteries. In the interest of security, the memo suggested that prisoners should be located far from these areas while another stated quite plainly that “‘The RCMP definitely prefer the Mainland.’” Camps had to be remote, but not completely isolated. In this way, ‘E’ Division’s plans for internment demonstrated both the benefits and limitations of British Columbia’s naturally isolating environment in a large-scale plan to confine.

Prison camps from the Second World War seemed to be a logical choice for Cold War internment because they met the Operation Profunc criteria to provide a secure location for the quarantine of subversives from the public for the duration of a war. The primary concern about these sites, however, was their decrepit state from years of abandonment. Moving inland from the coast, ‘E’ Division planners looked to areas around Kelowna and Chilliwack, in addition to the location of the Second World War Japanese-Canadian internment camp “Tashme” by Hope. After a brief evaluation in 1951, planners decided that the ex-internment camp would be insufficient for the purposes of Operation Profunc: “It will be recalled that the buildings had been destroyed and the area levelled. This location, on a main highway would, it is submitted, be totally inadequate.” Nevertheless, planners re-evaluated the location again in 1959, concluding once more that there was insufficient water and that the site had become even less secluded and therefore less desirable because of the region’s highway and orchard development.

A similar instance happened in Alberta when ‘K’ Division considered using wartime camps. In October 1950, ‘K’ Division focused its attention on Lethbridge as the site for a future internment camp. While the most useful buildings from its Second World War internment camp

77. Ibid., LAC.
78. Planners also considered the Okanagan Indian Reserve in this region. LAC, report from Nicholson to O.C. ‘E’ Division, 21 June 1951. Ibid., LAC.
had been removed or deteriorated over time, a November 1950 report indicated that the Operation Profunc survey saw potential in the remaining drill halls: “At present time there are two large drill halls still on the site which in the event of an emergency within the next two or three months could be quickly converted to an internment centre. As both buildings have sewer, water, gas and electricity laid on.”

In June 1951 ‘K’ Division gave the orders to plan for the future layout of a communist internment camp at Lethbridge. A decade later, however, the Lethbridge plan was cancelled and ‘K’ Division looked towards Fort MacLeod as a potential site instead. A more remote location, Fort MacLeod offered what Lethbridge, a growing centre, could no longer provide in the 1960s. This was a typical pattern for prospective sites discussed in the Profunc files. Over time sites became less desirable through a mixture of neglect and changing environment.

Across the country the RCMP Security Service studied several prisons and jails for potential use in the event of a national emergency. Unlike wartime internment camps these institutions were ‘living’ and functional, presenting little need for renovation and repair. Educational institutions were also valued because they, like prisons, provided the means required for holding large groups of individuals, such as spaces for sleeping, eating, and recreation. Prisons had the additional benefit of being secure. The main problem with these institutions, however, was that they were currently in use. While students could be sent home in the event of a national emergency, emptying prisons for the sake of filling the institutions with communist and subversive internees was far more problematic. This concern was evident in ‘F’ Division’s plans to use the Prince Albert Penitentiary and Farm Camp for communist internment during the 1960s. ‘F’ Division’s plans for internment developed in the early 1960s, interestingly in the same time period of the growing NDP influence within the province.

---

81 “Re: Apprehension of Persons under the D.O.C.R. in Event of War (Reception Centres),” memorandum, from C. W. J. Goldsmith to Officer Commanding of ‘K’ Division, 7 November 1950. Reference no. A 2011-00179-09-47-50, LAC.

82 Memorandum from C. W. J. Goldsmith to RCMP Commissioner, 15 June, 1951. Ibid., LAC.

83 Examples of prisons and schools that were considered for possible internment sites include, by division, the following institutions: ‘A’ Division’s Gatineau Correctional Camp, St. Cecile de Masham, and Landry Crossing Correctional Camp; ‘C’ Division’s St. Gabriel de Brandon, Feller Institute, St. Paul l’Hermite, and Fort Lennox; ‘D’ Division’s Provincial Women’s Gaol (at Portage la Prairie), Headingly Provincial Gaol, Drumheller Institution, Joyceville Institution, Warkworth Institution, and Neys; ‘F’ Division’s Prince Albert Penitentiary; and ‘O’ Division’s Beaver Creek Correctional Camp.

84 A 1951 memorandum from ‘D’ Division articulated that, at the time, there was to be no internment camps planned for Saskatchewan. Personal letter, from George B. McClellan to J. D. Bird, 19 January 1951. Reference no. A 2011-00179-09-41-00, LAC.
plans, the Saskatchewan division expressed interest to the DND and the Ministry of Justice to use provincial correctional institutions as potential internment sites. While the prairies had at least two prisons existing before the Cold War, including Manitoba’s Stoney Mountain Penitentiary (1877) and the Saskatchewan Penitentiary in Prince Albert (1911), the 1960s saw the construction of several new institutions in the region including Prince Albert’s Riverbend Institution (1962), Manitoba’s Rockwood Institution (1962), and Alberta’s Drumheller Institution (1967).85 The 1960s were a lucrative era for penal institutions.

After conducting a preliminary survey of the Prince Albert Penitentiary in the winter of 1963, ‘F’ Division wrote a report highlighting the attributes of the facility. The penitentiary was a maximum-security institution and the Farm Camp was minimum security. Prince Albert, a community north of Saskatoon, was a relatively remote area in a predominantly rural province, thus making escape from the institution an undesirable option, particularly during the long prairie winter. The 1963 survey noted that the landscape surrounding the buildings enabled guards to effectively survey the grounds, stating that the “immediate surrounding land is flat and the buildings can be easily viewed from all directions.”86 The location, with the security provided by the penitentiary and its pan-optical vantage over the land, was ideal for containing the prairie prominent functionaries.

What made the RCMP later question the feasibility of using the Prince Albert location as an internment site was precisely what drew ‘F’ Division to it in 1963: it was a penitentiary. While the structure suited the purpose of the internment program, the reality that internees would have to share the space with existing inmates of a maximum-security prison was cause for reconsideration. The planning committee grew uneasy with the prospect of dividing the facilities between the inmates of the penitentiary and the prominent functionaries, some of whom would be women with young children. While the location of the camp was generally deemed favourable, the unfavourable components of the site were stated to be the following: “female and male internees in the same building at such close proximity to each other; effect on inmates having knowledge of internees in building or within Penitentiary walls; effect on inmates of

---

85 In British Columbia, the increased governmental funding for correctional institutions during the 1950s gave Division ‘E’ planners the idea to request for funding to build new internment facilities. “Re: Civilian Internment Operations – General,” memorandum, from Harvison to RCMP Commissioner, 31 January 1951. Reference no. A 2011-00179-09-42-06, LAC. This request was denied on account of limited federal funds. Ibid.

being deprived of an area they normally have access to for recreation purposes.”87 While maintaining control of potential communist infiltration into the general public at a time of war, the infiltration of prominent functionaries into the prisons, guided by the Operation Profunc planners, could result in chaos.

The internment of children was a particularly contentious subject of debate among planners. Some planners considered placing children of interned communists in the care of the state. This had been practiced in other situations, including the internment of Jehovah’s Witnesses during the Second World War when children of internees who were deemed threatening for their questionable loyalty at a time of war were placed in the care of child welfare services.88 In the case of a massive internment of communists and communist sympathisers, however, the state would not be able to manage a massive influx of children. As a top-secret organization Operation Profunc and the Security Service were unable to prepare child welfare services across the country for an arrival of several thousand children during the 1950s and 1960s.89 The second suggestion was to pass children to friends and relatives.90 Planners, however, realised that there could easily be complications with this solution as friends and relatives could be unavailable at the time of the arrests or could be prominent functionaries themselves. The course of action to which most of the Profunc planners agreed was to intern the children with their parents as protected persons under the Geneva Convention.91 The documents discussing this plan clearly articulated the desire to avoid any possible criticism for inhumane activity at the internment camps. As stated in orders from 1968: “THE UTMOST CARE WILL BE GIVEN CHILDREN TO ENSURE THERE IS NO CRITICISM IN RELATION TO THEIR TREATMENT.”92 This statement, written in caps, conveyed an awareness of possible public condemnation of the internment process and the growing complexity of managing a group of

‘enemy aliens’ in the case of a war. Whether they would have adhered to this principle in the event of an emergency is questionable.

The final example of space and security as imagined by Operation Profunc is Neys. Located on the north shore of Lake Superior, Neys was an example of a site that combined all three of the components of an ideal internment camp. At the time of its initial evaluation in the early 1950s it was a jail. During the Second World War it had both a POW camp for German officers and a work camp for Japanese-Canadian men.\(^93\) It was also located far from large cities and communities. These combined attributes made Neys an attractive option for the site of an internment camp but also provided the planners with additional challenges. Changing transportation technology in the postwar era allowed Canadians more access to previously secluded locations across the country, particularly remote areas such as Neys, which became a Provincial Park in 1965. Like the William Head Quarantine Station Neys, with its short life-span in the internment plans highlighted what Operation Profunc considered to be ideal elements to protect Canadian security at a time of war.

In August 1950, ‘D’ Division planners inquired about the possibility of placing camps at Nipigon, Neys, and Red Rock, Ontario. By October 1950, following a series of “discrete inquiries” about former camps at Red Rock, Angler, and Neys, along with reconnaissance missions of the Nipigon area in northwestern Ontario and Camp Hughes in Manitoba, planners decided that the only suitable location for a potential internment camp was Neys. Operation Profunc envisioned, Neys as a site for male internees from British Columbia and the prairie provinces. With its closest neighbour being the fishing town of Coldwell, Neys was remote, a feature that had already been exploited to intern in previous decades. During the Second World War, Neys was known as ‘Camp 100,’ a high security prisoner camp. German POWs at this time were categorized into two groups: ‘greys’ and ‘blacks.’ While ‘greys’ were simply German soldiers, ‘blacks’ were Nazis and were, as a result, considered high risk for violence or escape.\(^94\) Camp 100 was one of nine ‘black’ camps in Canada and the site was enclosed by three separate barbed-wire fences, which were three meters in height and had guard towers at each corner.\(^95\)

After the Second World War ended, Neys served as a processing camp for the POWs before

---

\(^{93}\) It was one of 26 camps across Canada between 1941 and 1946 that held German POWs and interned Japanese Canadians. Chisholm, Gutsche, and Floren, *Superior: Under the Shadow of the Gods*, 161.

\(^{94}\) Chisholm, Gutsche, and Floren, *Superior*, 166.

\(^{95}\) Chisholm et al., 166.
turning into a minimum-security work camp for prisoners from the Thunder Bay region. By October 1952, the Ontario government had dismantled the Neys Camp as a Provincial Institution and Operation Prof unc continued its discussions of converting the old camp into a place of wartime internment. The combined factors of Neys’s isolated location and its history as a POW camp met the criteria of Operation Prof unc planners for constructing and maintaining a new “Black Camp” which would hold prisoners who threatened Canada’s security and safety in a time of war.96

By the mid-1960s, however, plans to convert Neys into a communist internment camp ceased reflecting a number of similar changes in focus across the country at the time. The increase of provincial parks in remote areas such as Neys during the 1960s greatly altered Prof unc planning. Accompanying these developments was the improvement of travel technology in Canada, evident in the construction of routes such as the Trans Canada Highway that officially opened in 1962 and was fully completed by 1971. What resulted was tension between the growth of tourism and a covert plan for containment.

By all accounts, Neys was the ideal camp for Operation Prof unc because of its location, the facilities available, and the site’s historical precedence as a prison camp.97 The changing North American culture of car travel and wilderness camping during the 1960s, threatened the plan’s need for secrecy, and shifted the attention away from Neys to other regions. Over the 1960s, as the remnants of Second World War internment camps continued to crumble, Operation Prof unc turned its attention away from locations such as those north of Lake Superior to others in more urban settings such as Prince Albert. The changing focus of the proposed sites indicated the increasing problems with finding remote areas as well as the changing threat of attack. Operation Prof unc’s focus throughout the 1950s was one of optimism. It changed to pragmatism by the

---

97 Oddly enough there is little, if any, mention in the Prof unc plans about the prisoner escapes from the Second World War internment camps in Northern Ontario. There were a number of attempted escapes from Neys throughout the 1940s, but the most epic escape was from the camp at Angler in April 1941. The operation included a 45-meter tunnel leading from the huts to outside the camp wall and involved 80 prisoners in a camp of 559. The plan resulted in the successful escape of 28 men. Five of the escapees were shot, two of whom succumbed to their wounds and died soon after. Most of the escapees, dressed in civilian clothes, managed to board boxcars on the trans-continental railway that passed the camps. While the RCMP apprehended most of the escapees early on, two prisoners managed to travel by rail all the way to Alberta before they were caught. Their intent was to continue on to Vancouver and then to Japan. Chisholm et al., 161-164.
mid-1960s as it shifted its attention to consider the realistic challenges to proposed sites’ security and seclusion.

5. Conclusion

Cold War defence planning imagined threat and potential disaster in an effort to protect national security. Operation Profunc prepared for disaster by attempting to anticipate potential attack, imagine the way in which prominent functionaries would behave, and envision how space could be used to quarantine the spread of disorder and infiltration in Canada. One of the more central aspects of Operation Profunc, in addition to its scope of surveillance and its expansive planning over three decades, was that it was a wartime plan organized during peacetime. The level of planning and the attention to detail, as discussed in the past two chapters, defined the seriousness of the plan. The extent of preparation also demonstrated the limitations of anticipating attack – regardless of the detail paid towards potential damages and disaster, a surprise attack would still be a shock. The issue of secrecy in planning was both a strength and impediment to the plan. Working covertly, the RCMP could prepare for disaster, conducting sudden and unanticipated arrests on ‘M’ Day. But complete secrecy also limited the plan’s ability to prepare working institutions for internment and additional resources to manage the large numbers of internees processed at reception centres and travelling across the country to various camps. Isolation and containment were central factors in managing a potentially volatile population and protecting the plan itself.

The use of space was central to the question of how to manage the threat. Canada provided much in the way of remote wilderness, and less in the way of infrastructure for transporting and containing the apparently volatile population. The prominent functionaries were a population of individuals who were ultimately civilians and not necessarily militant. The planned internment of this population pointed to the way in which the “prominent functionary” and communism were perceived as threats to national security. The implied connection between communists and rats during the 1950s was one with deep symbolism. The rat, a small mammal, was effective in its destruction of resources and health. It was clever, moved quickly, propagated rapidly, and swiftly dominated a region. The effort to control the spread of communism through efficient arrests followed by imprisonment in isolated and fortified camps defined the perceived nature of the threat as one that would quickly control a compromised nation. Operation Profunc was Canada’s containment plan, fitting into an era of feared contamination of alien forces. In this
sense, Operation Profunc was a relic of both Canadian Cold War security and the era’s collective anxiety about impending disaster.

Containment was a key aspect of Cold War defence. In the form of isolation, as was evident with the Soviet Union and other Communist powers, or in the effort to overpower the spread of global Communism, the elements of containment were foundational to Cold War politics, military planning, and anticipation for potential disasters. Compared to the exaggerated anti-communism of the United States, Canada’s Cold War on communism has appeared understated, from a historical perspective. Operation Profunc, however, provides different dimensions to both Canada’s participation in Cold War anti-communism and defence through containment. This plan adapted the ideals of containment on several levels. It worked to control an interned population through work, isolation from information, and imprisonment. On another level, Operation Profunc thrived on containment through its own isolation within the RCMP, DND, and the Ministry of Justice. Secrecy and seclusion were paramount for both securing the prominent functionaries at a time of war and the plan itself in peacetime.
CHAPTER THREE Psychiatric Containment: Robert E. Turner and Efforts to Medicalize Homosexuality

1. Introduction

Established in 1956, the Toronto Psychiatric Hospital’s Forensic Clinic was innovative in its categorization of sexual crime and so-called deviancy as illnesses that could be treated, cured, and studied. At this time, homosexuality was classified as a criminal offense in Canada. The clinic, running from 1956-1966, opened a few years after the initial 1952 inclusion of homosexuality in the DSM. How homosexuality was related, or rather unrelated, to other forms of sexually ‘deviant’ behaviour was a dilemma for clinicians and researchers. Unlike offenses such as pedophilia, homosexual activity could happen consensually and, unlike exhibitionists and voyeurs, homosexuals at the clinic regularly sought psychological help and without court order. Most importantly, the largest population at the clinic was made up of homosexual males.\(^1\)

Homosexuality was often referred to in reference to the clinic as the “most common deviation.”\(^2\) Prior to its removal from the DSM in 1974, persistent attempts to pathologize and understand homosexuality, to link it to psychiatric conditions or infectious disease, signified both the popular faith in scientific method and fear of ‘abnormality.’ Within the clinic, this effort to define was evident in the attempts to categorize sexual ‘deviancy’ and homosexuality into ‘types.’

This dissertation addresses the struggle to classify and control homosexuality in three different ways over a period of three decades, beginning in the early 1950s. This chapter examines control through psychiatric terminology and classification, as it existed in Dr. Robert E. Turner’s papers from the Toronto Psychiatric Hospital (TPH) Forensic Clinic and from the non-professional public’s perspective. This discussion is complemented by Chapter Four, which addresses control through clinical identification, and Chapter Seven, which examines control through surveillance. The attempts of Turner and his colleagues to define homosexuality’s etiology are an important example of Cold War era science and psychiatry. What was evident in this case of a fully functioning clinic and its etiological conundrum was the effort to use

---

psychiatric method to address the unease about abnormality. This discomfort existed on the part of Turner and other professionals who sought to define homosexuality, on the part of the homosexual patient who accounted for the larger part of the clinic’s population, and on the part of a larger society that was both fascinated and fearful of deviations from normalcy. Homosexuality was defined and controlled in public and professional spheres by the language of illness, contamination, and subversion.

The research for this chapter is based primarily on material gathered at the Centre for Addiction and Mental Health (CAMH) Archives in Toronto. This clinic is unique to both the history of mid-twentieth century Canadian psychiatry and sexual psychiatry. For this reason my research at these archives was conducted initially to determine both the clinic’s and the Ontario Psychiatric Association’s (OPA) reactions to the American Psychiatric Association’s (APA) de-medicalization of homosexuality in the 1970s. What I found was a collection of documents, from the 1950s into the late 1970s, which addressed the difficulties psychiatrists faced of defining what homosexuality was, how it manifested itself within the individual, and how it related, or did not relate, to other forms of ‘sexual deviancy’ studied at the clinic. The Dr. R. E. Turner fonds, along with the Dr. Donald Blair Coats fonds, are part of a larger collection of papers accumulated between the late 1930s and the 1980s. They include papers presented at conferences and universities throughout the late 1950s and into the early 1970s on the subject of the clinic, criminology, homosexuality, and psychiatry. The collections also include articles and papers published in a variety of journals (principally focusing on criminology, psychiatry, and medicine) on the subject of sexual offenders and homosexuality in the court, Canadian legislation, and psychiatry. The public’s understanding of work at the clinic is evident in a collection of clippings from the Globe and Mail and other newspapers which discuss the efforts of clinicians and researchers to treat the mentally ill as an alternative or supplement to jail sentences. The collection also includes chapters from books on sexual deviation, both Canadian and international, along with booklets about specific sexual offenses. Finally, the collection includes correspondence from the 1970s between members of the OPA concerning recent developments made by the APA to remove homosexuality from the DSM. While this last was initially the focus of my study, the material detailing Turner’s and his colleagues’ efforts to understand homosexuality as a psychiatric condition during the 1950s and 1960s were too prevalent to overlook.
This chapter explores the theme of Cold War containment and control as it related to the medicalization of homosexuality and its understood potentiality. Operation Profunc shows only one side of how Cold War anxiety was manifest in points of authority. As an explicit plan to arrest and intern a ‘deviant’ population, Operation Profunc exemplified the political side of Cold War anxiety and disaster planning. But the Cold War was more than political – the threat was more than communism and espionage. From a methodological perspective, sexual psychiatry, through the Forensic Clinic and the APA’s DSM debates, demonstrates an expansion of Cold War themes of covert and overt deviancy. This chapter moves the thesis from the acknowledged threat of international communism to consider another primary target of surveillance. Popular descriptions of homosexuality were similar to the description of communism as deviant – both were portrayed as destructive to society through the corruption of the individual. Many medical texts from the TPH Forensic Clinic viewed homosexuality as the result of social problems, social environments, and heredity.\(^3\) While several forms of ‘deviancy,’ including drug use, juvenile delinquency, and crime,\(^4\) were linked to communism during the Cold War the tie between communism and homosexuality was, I argue, related to the larger anxiety about control over the communication of subversion. The fears about homosexuality’s covertness ran parallel to contemporary fears for espionage – homosexuality’s “subversion” of normalcy was defined through the clinic as illness.

While the TPH Forensic Clinic was unique, the question of how to understand homosexuality as illness or disease was not limited to that institution. One of the more illustrative examples of the link drawn between homosexuality and illness in this era was Canadian physician Marvin Wellman’s 1956 article in the Canadian Medical Association Journal (CMAJ). In this article the physician stated: “In spite of the fact that homosexuality gets little frank attention, it has been said to be as commonplace as tuberculosis.”\(^5\) The overt

---

\(^3\) In one study on the implications of families with gay sons, for instance, researchers suggested that it could also be the fault of hereditary of a weak father. D. J. West, “Parental Figures in the Genesis of Male Homosexuality,” Reprinted from The International Journal of Social Psychiatry 5, no. 2 (Autumn 1959), Box F27, File 6.17, Turner fonds, CAMH.


comparison of homosexuality to an infection, a contagious one at that, was likely not by accident, though the author was careful to state that homosexuality was not a disease. Wellman’s association of homosexuality to a highly infectious disease, requiring isolation and treatment to cure, presented homosexuality as pervasive but curable. Wellman’s article, “Overt Homosexuality with Spontaneous Remission,” presented an odd case of homosexuality that turned out to be a symptom of a deeper psychological issue. The article expressed both the medical and lay concerns for homosexuality, which mirrored larger uncertainties during the Cold War, namely the susceptibility to deviancy or subversion. Wellman’s article detailed a long-term investigation that began with a medical examination of a young man suffering from a sprained ankle. In the article, the man’s appearance, behaviour, and neurotic condition underwent a transformation following this minor condition resulting in an increase of homosexual activity. Wellman’s article described how the symptoms of an otherwise invisible disorder, a neurotic condition, were visually defined by its physical manifestations in the individual. Once the patient’s neurosis was addressed, he was cured of his apparent homosexuality, losing the weight he had gained and becoming manlier in appearance and character.

According to Wellman’s comparison of homosexuality to a highly communicable disease, homosexuality was common, in many cases difficult to detect, and, as many feared, could be catching.

Evident in Turner’s papers from the TPH Forensic Clinic are both a confidence in contemporary psychiatry to ‘cure’ and yet, conversely, a lack of assurance of how to deal with a condition that was not easily confined within psychiatric terminology. Reports and papers written and collected by Turner address the apparent pervasiveness of homosexuality as well as the covertness of homosexuality as a condition. In his 1959 paper, “A Review of Homosexuality,” Turner addressed its etiology and the difficulty of pinpointing its causes. In this paper he also discussed the character of the homosexual. Stating that one “seldom sees the ‘typical type’ of homosexual,” Turner focused on the complexity of the condition, noting that it went beyond character. Clinicians and researchers, he argued, had to “accept the view that

---

6 Wellman, Ibid.
8 R. E. Turner, Paper, “A Review of Homosexuality,” (20 January 1959), 7. Box F27, File 6.12, Turner fonds, CAMH. In this paper Turner also refers to some tests conducted to establish the psychological characteristics of homosexuals, most notably a masculine-feminine mental trait test which, based on two different groups of incarcerated homosexual men, yielded two different scores – one feminine and one masculine. This was not surprising because, as Turner noted: “the first group were chosen from those in jail, many of whom were homosexual prostitutes; the second group were aggressive criminals from Alcatraz. Need more be said.” Ibid., p. 8.
homosexuality is a universal potential that may develop in response to a wide variety of factors. Unlike the comparison of homosexuality to a contagious disease, Turner focused on the spread of homosexuality through susceptibility of the individual. Much like espionage and fears of the ‘enemy within,’ homosexuality (specifically male homosexuality), as described by Turner, could easily develop given the correct environment and situation.

Turner’s papers present the larger question of how to treat homosexuality through psychiatry from a Canadian perspective. The Toronto Forensic Clinic for “sexual deviants” was the most explicit example of the growing force of sexual psychiatry during the Cold War in Canada. The TPH Forensic Clinic had a clear social and medical purpose: to prevent sexual crime and treat those suffering from sexual pathology. Following the winter of 1955 and 1956, after the sexual assaults and subsequent deaths of three Ontario children, the Forensic Clinic was established at the hospital with the aid of the Ontario Government and the Ontario-based Parents Action League (PAL). The out-patient clinic, which focused on treating sexually ‘abnormal’ individuals instead of condemning them, was symbolic of the changing atmosphere surrounding crimes, criminals, and mental health in the 1950s. Turner was director of the Forensic Clinic from 1958 until 1966. A specialist in psychiatry, Turner provided out-patient therapy first at the Forensic Clinic, then the Clark Institute, and later at the Centre for Addiction and Mental Health. Evident in Turner’s writing and research is the process of medicalization in attempting to control or ‘cure’ the onset of ‘abnormal’ sexuality, behaviour, and psychology. This was especially symbolic of the era, which experienced conflicting pulses of excitement and fear about how scientific and medical discoveries could ‘improve’ society, health, and the individual.

The contemporary enthusiasm for psychiatry and the desire to have an unwavering definition of health and normalcy defined through science was symptomatic of the Cold War dichotomy between enemy and ally. As the conflicts progressed through the 1950s and into the 1960s from the war in Korea to the war in Vietnam, from the atomic bomb to the hydrogen bomb, and from bombers to deliver nuclear weapons to the advent of ICBMs (Intercontinental Ballistic Missiles), the principles of ‘Us’ and ‘Them’ disintegrated. Dr. Thomas Szasz, famous

9 These could include the following: “(1) neurotic fears of sex, (2) disappointment in love, (3) an all-male or all-female background, (4) guilt about women, (5) plus the classical unresolved Oedipal complex-mother fixation.” Turner, “A Review of Homosexuality,” 7. CAMH.
for his 1960 text *The Myth of Mental Illness*, was critical of modern psychiatry and its focus on mental disorders as diseases akin to physical illness. He was also critical of the medicalization of homosexuality that, as he stated, “legitimized a new kind of witch-hunt where ‘the physician has replaced the priest and the patient the witch.’” Szasz’s observation captured the contemporary faith in scientific methodology while echoing the other witch-hunt that was prevalent in an era of anti-communism. As patients, homosexuals were confined by pathology and labelled as ill in an era that glorified health and normalcy.

This chapter introduces the focus on homosexuality as a threat to normalcy in the context of psychiatry from three angles. The first is a discussion of theory and the philosophy of science as it relates to the social construction of truth during the mid-twentieth century. The second is a brief exploration of the mixed fascination and fear of sexual ‘deviancy’ as it corresponded to the culture of science as truth in the early Cold War. And finally, this chapter examines Turner’s papers and discussions of homosexuality at the clinic. This chapter seeks to understand how the classification of homosexuality as a mental illness and the reasoning behind it related to contemporary efforts to control civilians through different points of authority. In this way the TPH Forensic Clinic was part of a larger pattern of containment during the 1950s and 1960s.

**2. Method and Focus**

This chapter and the next develop the themes of sexual contagion, control, and confinement within the spheres of science, psychiatry, and sexuality. Through these themes the similarities between the twin threats of communism and homosexuality during the Cold War became evident. As other scholars have noted, both ‘subversive’ conditions were constructed as “character weaknesses.” Similarities between the two perceived dangers to national security and society, however, went much deeper to expose profound concerns for how the ‘enemy’ operated and threatened the very nature of North American society and safety. Cold War containment was an effort to control potential destruction to normalcy and health, not simply through global politics but through mental, physical, and sexual norms.

---


As a study about control this analysis of medicalization, like the chapters discussing communism, is focused on the point of authority, examining how homosexuality was framed by the psychiatric profession in Canada and the United States. Based on textual analysis of medical literature, this research draws on post-structuralist methodology and the linguistic turn. The link between the spread of viruses and the so-called threat to society during the Cold War tied together fears of social or political infiltration with vectors of disease and bodily abnormalities. As a cultural history, this study of homosexuality and its pathologization is based on text and rhetoric, working to advance the discussion of Cold War subversion and surveillance to consider the growing power of science and medicine during the Cold War. The primary examples in Chapters Three and Four are Turner’s papers from the TPH Forensic Clinic and the DSM’s classification of homosexuality as a psychological condition. Within these cases, there are explicit links between homosexuality and the ‘enemy within.’ Whereas communism was a political contagion that could imperil the state – compromising the civic body – homosexuality was defined as a disorder that compromised and corrupted the individual body. Homosexuality was seen as a threat to wider societal norms and morals, but this so-called subversion was through the individual, resulting in a compromised self.

Central to the study of the Forensic Clinic, and therefore to this dissertation, is Elise Chenier. Chenier’s *Strangers in Our Midst: Sexual Deviancy in Postwar Ontario* addresses the history of postwar psychiatry at a clinical level. In her study, Chenier followed efforts to control public fears and anxieties about sexual criminals through the growing influence of clinical and forensic psychiatry. She provided a series of case studies regarding encounters between women, children and youths, and sexual criminals and deviants. Chenier addressed the contemporary questions of how to view the victims of sexual crime and how to understand the perpetrators of such crimes. Like Chenier, I also examine Turner’s work at the Forensic Clinic. Unlike

---

16 Also central to the study of psychiatry, the DSM, and the pathologization of sexuality is Hannah Decker’s *The Making of DSM-III: A Diagnostic Manual’s Conquest of American Psychiatry* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013). This book will be discussed in more detail in Chapter Seven.
17 The role of the media and the public role of the medical professional were evident in the opening pictorial essay featuring articles from Canadian magazines such as *Maclean’s*, newspapers, and Parents’ Action League pamphlets. Elise Chenier, *Strangers in Our Midst: Sexual Deviancy in Postwar Ontario* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2008), xiii-xvii.
Strangers in Our Midst, which focuses on a variety of sexual ‘deviations’ and the clinic’s contributions to criminology as a field, this dissertation focuses on homosexuality and psychiatric etiology and nomenclature. It examines how clinicians and researchers sought to explain the condition of homosexuality and thus control its spread. This dissertation is also a study of linguistic and technical control. Central to this study are the strong links that existed between political, scientific, and military cultures during the Cold War and how they in turn affected social, cultural, and sexual understandings of normalcy and threat.

The perception of homosexuality as a form of political or medical deviance was, I maintain, part of a larger pattern of constructing and maintaining fear within society. The construction of the Cold War enemy was not necessarily a collection of isolated sexual, political, and military elements; rather it was part of a broader fear of both the unknown and contagion. The fear that something seemingly familiar could in fact be inherently dangerous challenged and broke the carefully built Cold War boundary between ‘Us’ and ‘Them.’ The connection defining homosexuality and communism as Cold War threats extended beyond concerns about ‘character weakness’ and deviancy. Anxiety about abnormality influenced efforts to maintain control and authority over individuals and the larger society. Moreover there was the fear of how a society could very easily be infused with ‘otherness.’

The sources for this chapter are largely based on two types of medical and psychiatric material: the Canadian Medical Association Journal and Turner’s papers. With additional support from contemporary sources from the APA and the DSM, along with various cultural resources, these two Canadian sources demonstrate the complications and uncertainties surrounding sexual psychiatry during the Cold War. The CMAJ is a valuable resource for its wide readership and its diverse material. The journal, devoted to a variety of medical issues, included contemporary discussions about psychology, psychiatry, and studies of sexuality revealing questions and concerns at the time about the field and its future. Between 1950 and 1973, the CMAJ contained ten articles on the subject of homosexuality. As homosexuality became more established as a mental disorder, it appeared in medical literature more often, demonstrating a complex definition of sexual deviancy. The significance of these articles should

---

18 This is out of 339 articles. Between 1950 and 1954, the CMAJ published monthly with about 16 original articles each (not counting case reports, book reviews, obituaries, etc.). In 1955 the journal began to publish biweekly articles with about 9 articles per issue. In 1960 the Canadian Medical Association again expanded its journal to weekly issues with about 7 articles per issue.
not be underestimated based on their limited presence in the *CMAJ*. Their importance is their context – they were written at a period when North American psychiatry determined homosexuality to be the source, symptom, and result of mental illness.

The *CMAJ*’s articles also demonstrated the spectrum of medical opinions, some more educated than others, about homosexuality along with the growing medicalization of sexuality throughout the 1950s and 1960s. Evident too was the confusion of how both homosexuality and psychological issues related to the larger field of medicine in Canada. Sexuality, psychiatry, and mental health were relatively new subjects to health discourse at this time, and the amalgam of opinions surrounding these discussions in the *CMAJ* illustrated the fluctuating attitudes about science and medicine in society. The TPH Forensic Clinic, meanwhile, is a fitting example of the history of containment and medicalization during the Cold War. Documents from the Forensic Clinic, papers and reports by clinicians and researchers, point to the faith in and limitations of psychiatry’s ability to solve the various problems of the human mind and behaviour.

This dissertation is influenced by studies in the philosophy of science and medicine, especially those that address the subjectivity of science, technology, and medicine in society. Although psychiatry was not a hard science, scientific method was still important to discussions of normalcy and health. Discussions about sexuality within these spheres were bolstered by biological, anthropological, and scientific studies about human behaviour in the broader effort to understand the ‘normality’ of human sexuality. Works such as those by Ludwik Fleck, Thomas Kuhn, Michel Foucault, and Susan Sontag are a small selection of a large field that focuses on the deconstruction of science and truth, and the social understanding of disease and contagion. While works by these philosophers are not completely related in terms of

---

19 The journal detailed the professional backgrounds of each of its writers. Samuel Laycock was, in 1950, Dean of Education and a professor of Educational Psychology at the University of Saskatchewan. He was also Director of the Division of Education and Mental Health of the Canadian Mental Hygiene Association. B. Kanee and C. L. Hunt were, in 1951, respectively a consultant syphilologist and director at the Department of Venereal Disease Control of the Province of British Columbia. Marvin Wellman was at the time of his 1956 article Surgeon Commander of the Royal Canadian Navy. According to his obituary in the journal from 1970, Wellman received certification in psychiatry by the Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons of Canada in 1945. He served the Canadian Navy from 1941 to 1959. Herbert Pascoe was a sessional instructor in psychiatry at the University of Alberta and, in 1961, a consultant in psychiatry at the University of Alberta Hospital.

20 Arguably, psychiatry has never become a hard science. But, as Decker discusses (and as will be addressed in Chapter Seven), the DSM-III was an effort to make psychiatry more scientific.

21 Also central to the discussion and critique of the objectivity of psychiatry is Thomas Szasz’s *The Myth of Mental Illness: Foundations of a Theory of Personal Conduct* (1961). In this text Szasz questioned the classification of mental illness. Szasz later supported the anti-psychiatry movement and joined forces with the likes of L. Ron Hubbard to form Citizens Commission on Human Rights that believed that the psychiatric profession should be
subject matter, they are relevant and central to the discussion of how threat has been equated to disease and contagion.

Polish philosopher of science, Ludwik Fleck, for instance, wrote on the subject of science’s cultural conditioning. This subject, relevant to the postwar state of psychology, society, and the construction of the medical expert, was explored in the years leading up to the Second World War. Fleck’s 1935 monograph, *Genesis and Development of a Scientific Fact*, studied the treatment and diagnosis of syphilis.\(^{22}\) In it, Fleck used the clinical studies of the disease to exemplify how the social perception of a disorder greatly influenced scientific studies about it. Fleck stressed that science, a study commonly perceived as objective and universal, was structured by subjective views and assumptions. Fleck, who was Jewish, published his research at a time of increased social division; individuals were segregated according to hierarchies of race, ethnicity, sexuality, politics, and health as defined by the rising power of European fascism. As a member of society who was defined as racially inferior by the biological and racial determination of that era, Fleck sought to critique how biological sciences were dependent on the scientist’s point of view. He stated that human assumption governed scientific observation and spectators cannot be separated from their experiments.\(^{23}\) Fleck noted that truth was subjective, stating that the definition of observation as subjective or objective was based on the authority of the speaker according to his or her perceived normalcy: “We are supposedly in possession of ‘correct thinking’ and ‘correct observation,’ and therefore what we declare to be true is ipso facto true. What those others such as the primitives, the old people, the mentally ill, or the children declare to be true seems to be true only to them.”\(^{24}\) According to Fleck there was no indisputable truth. Rather, topics and their relevance were based on the status of those who presented them instead of on the quality of the topics in question.

Writing during the Cold War, an era of different, albeit strong social and cultural divisions, American philosopher of science Thomas Kuhn reflected the increased segregation of condemned. Hannah Decker, *The Making of DSM-III: A Diagnostic Manual’s Conquest of American Psychiatry* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013), 15-17. Also relevant to the critique of psychiatry and the social construction of disease are R. D. Laing’s work that reflected his anti-psychiatry views that developed from his research on schizophrenia. While not explored in this dissertation, Laing’s work is significant to the anti-psychiatry movement considering his argument that schizophrenia was a label, rather than an indication of a condition or illness. R. D. Laing, *The Divided Self: An Existential Study in Sanity and Madness* (1959).

\(^{23}\) Fleck, *Genesis and Development of a Scientific Fact*, 89.
\(^{24}\) Fleck, 50. Original emphasis.
global mentalities into ‘Us’ and ‘Them’ in his work on truth and scientific theory. In his 1962 discussion of scientific paradigms, *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*, Kuhn illustrated how one scientific truth becomes obsolete with the discovery of a newer, better, and more accurate scientific truth.\(^25\) Kuhn describes the “paradigm shift” as one that happens when a universally recognized scientific achievement is disputed and replaced by another – newer – scientific truth. The basis of this shift is that two paradigms cannot co-exist, much in the same way that two truths cannot co-exist. This understanding of one prevailing truth mirrored the Cold War view that there ought to be only one global superpower. In the wake of the nuclear developments of the 1950s, such as the hydrogen bomb and the ICBM, the early 1960s witnessed building tensions between the superpowers.\(^26\) But with the amplified complexities of the Cold War conflict, the well-defined camps of ‘East’ and ‘West,’ or ‘Us’ and ‘Them’ began to crumble. The damages of nuclear war would extend beyond its target having global consequences.\(^27\) Kuhn’s poststructuralist analysis of truth as a construct reflected the fading borders of a previously clearly divided conflict between the Soviet Union and the United States.

---

\(^{25}\) Kuhn states: “Today in the sciences, books are usually either texts or retrospective reflections upon one aspect or another of the scientific life. The scientist who writes one is more likely to find his professional reputation impaired than enhanced. Only in the earlier, pre-paradigm, stages of the development of the various sciences did the book ordinarily possess the same relation to professional achievement that it still retains in other creative fields.” Thomas S. Kuhn, *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* (Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 1996 [1962]), 20. Fleck states something similar, “Against this we would argue that there is probably no such thing as complete error or complete truth. […] Furthermore, whether we like it or not, we can never sever our links with the past, complete with all its errors.” Fleck, 20.

\(^{26}\) 1961 saw the invasion of the Bay of Pigs, which later led to the 1962 Cuban Missile Crisis when the superpowers very nearly engaged in outright nuclear war. The Berlin Wall was also constructed in 1961 and was a blatant representation of the strong divide between the east and west.

\(^{27}\) Increased studies of nuclear fallout led to the understanding that a potential nuclear conflict would affect both superpowers and would place global citizens in peril. One example of this is the 1963 text, *The Fallen Sky: Medical Consequences of Thermonuclear War*. An edited collection of essays for Physicians for Social Responsibility, *The Fallen Sky* was devoted to the question of whether or not life on earth and human society could survive a thermonuclear attack. Articles used the 1945 atomic attacks on Hiroshima and Nagasaki as examples of the potential destruction, acknowledging in the process that a hydrogen bomb would bring with it exponentially higher levels of destruction and radiation. Saul Aronow, Frank R. Ervin, and Victor W. Sidel, *The Fallen Sky: Medical Consequences of Thermonuclear War* (New York: Hill and Wang), 1963. Canadian physician J. S. Tyhurst also wrote on the subject of nuclear winter and the spread of radiation around the globe, concluding that in addition to destruction, radiation and resulting illness that would be rampant in the wake of a thermonuclear war, there would be high levels of psychological and social damage as well. J. S. Tyhurst, “Psychological and Social Aspects of Civilian Disaster,” *Canadian Medical Association Journal* 76 (1 March 1957): 385-393. From a cultural perspective, Australian author Nevil Shute’s famous novel *On the Beach* challenged the notion that the Southern Hemisphere would be safe from radiation in the case of nuclear war in the Northern Hemisphere. Shute’s research on trade winds concluded that radioactive fallout from a thermonuclear war would be global. Nevil Shute, *On the Beach* (New York: Ballantine Books, 1957).
The intricate links between disease, the individual, and society are evident in works by Michel Foucault and Susan Sontag. Michel Foucault’s *Madness and Civilization: A History of Insanity in the Age of Reason*, for instance, addressed the perception of threat within society through a discussion of illness.28 In this 1961 text, he examined the changing conception of the social pariah through illness in an age of scientific and philosophical enlightenment. Here Foucault analysed a shift in the French public’s perception of social stigma. Foucault centred his study on the creation of the Hôpital Général and the ‘great confinement’ in 1657, establishing this as a central point when the foremost personification of social misfortune and shame transferred from leprosy to madness. While leprosy is a highly visible disease, madness is a much less perceptible disorder. Observable through behaviour, madness was defined as abnormal because of its departure from socially acceptable or reasonable conduct.29 The movement from the collective fear of a visible and outwardly perceptible illness to an invisible and less tangible illness reflected the growing complexities in the definitions of disease, health, and the methods of diagnosis.

Susan Sontag provided another example of how the stigma of disease, in this case AIDS, was aggravated by fears of amorality and contagion within society.30 AIDS, a highly transmittable illness because of the means of contamination through blood and other bodily fluids, was popularly characterized within the media as the result of so-called socially deviant behaviour such as intravenous drug use, sexual promiscuity, and male homosexuality.31 In *AIDS and its Metaphors*, Sontag stated, “The unsafe behaviour that produces AIDS is judged to be more than just weakness. It is indulgence, delinquency – addictions to chemicals that are illegal and to sex regarded as deviant.”32 Contamination in the case of AIDS, therefore, went beyond the physical disease; it was perceived by Conservatives, in the era of Reagan, Thatcher, and Mulroney, as a symptom of social decay and the loss of morality. The disease, therefore, was

---

31 Throughout the late twentieth century and into the twenty-first century, the West has used HIV/AIDS to heterosexualize Black Africans by portraying the epidemic in Sub-Saharan Africa as the result of lack of education on sexually transmitted infections rather than focusing on the spread of the virus through medical contamination as the result of a poor medical infrastructure. Eileen Stillwaggon’s work on western perspectives of AIDS in Africa examines the way in which radicalized ideas of sexuality distorted early research and disease prevention. Eileen Stillwaggon, “Racial Metaphors: Interpreting Sex and AIDS in Africa,” *Development and Change* 34, no. 5 (November 2003): 809-832.
seen as not just infecting the individual but as contaminating the whole society. The belief that disease resulted from “amoral” activity, and in turn affected the larger society, was hardly new, but as concepts of both disease and deviancy became more complex, so too did the effort to explain its transmission and blame those who suffered from it.

Historians offer a different approach to the fear of infiltration, and how it related to communism, sexuality, and other Cold War fears. Within the context of the wider fear of subversion, by subtle but sinister forces, communism and homosexuality were considered akin to one another and caused by faulty character and unreliability. Daniel Hurewitz’s *Bohemian Los Angeles and the Making of Modern Politics* provides one of the most comprehensive studies illustrating intricate connections between politics, society, sexuality, race, culture, and space throughout the early twentieth century. Hurewitz’s research revealed that the combined fears of communism and homosexuality in the United States existed prior to the Cold War. The links between homosexuality and communism were strengthened with the changing conception of sexuality. On top of this, ‘deviant sexuality’ was often referred to as a conspiratorial society that could easily recruit new members. One example of this was the growing concern about morality within Los Angeles that often conflicted with similar concerns about political extremism. The dreaded ‘red smear’ was liberally applied as a result of a loose and flexible definition of radicalism. The connection between homosexuality and communism was backed by police findings that key early homophile members were communists and that the Mattachine Society (an early homosexual organization) was modeled on Marxist cells. In his book, Hurewitz illustrated how the fear of subversion, or perversion, was not that of a lone figure but of a larger system that threatened social order and mainstream society.

The connection between homosexuality and communism was circumstantial but long-lasting. The most famous incident linking homosexuality with communism occurred in 1951 when two gay British diplomats, Donald Maclean and Guy Burgess, defected to the Soviet Union. Although, as historian Robert D. Dean noted, the detail of the men’s sexuality was not the focus of the story when their defection to the Soviet Union was first publicized. Robert D. Dean, *Imperial Brotherhood: Gender and the Making of Cold War Diplomacy* (Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 2001), 89.
histrionic witch-hunts. It was used as one of many ill-conceived justifications for vetting homosexuals in the civil service and the military during the Cold War. The misunderstood connection between homosexuality and communism in Canada was particularly evident in the case of John Watkins, as discussed in Chapter One.

American historian Robert D. Dean deconstructed the McCarthy era’s ‘lavender scare’ within the United States in *Imperial Brotherhood: Gender and the Making of Cold War Diplomacy*, a text that initiated a more nuanced study of American Cold War diplomacy. Dean analysed how the targeting of homosexuals accompanied the ‘red scare’ as a means of further discrediting the liberal American government during the McCarthy era. According to his study, between January 1947 and January 1953 President Harry Truman oversaw the firing or forced resignation of over 400 State Department employees. This included ambassadors, senior Foreign Service officers, clerks, and secretaries, all dismissed for “real or imagined homosexuality.” This number was almost twice the amount of employees dismissed because of communist ‘sympathies’ or any other offence. The ‘lavender’ witch-hunt, Dean stated, only escalated through the 1950s. The number of dismissals on the basis of homosexuality accentuated the stark reality that homophobia contributed to a massive purge within the American government. The ‘lavender scare’ was the product of a widespread dislike and fear of homosexuality that extended beyond McCarthy’s supporters.

David K. Johnson’s study about purges of gays and lesbians within the American government during the 1950s also challenges previous assumptions about McCarthy’s role in the ‘lavender scare.’ In his 2004 book, *The Lavender Scare: The Cold War Persecution of Gays and Lesbians in the Federal Government*, Johnson goes further than Dean by showing the American government’s actions against gay and lesbian workers initiated a systematic institutionalization

---

38 Dean quoted the Senate’s 1950 *Employment of Homosexuals and Other Sex Perverts in Government*: “It is the opinion of this subcommittee that those who engage in acts of homosexuality and other perverted sex activities are unsuitable for employment in the Federal Government. This conclusion is based upon the fact that persons who indulge in such degraded activity are committing not only illegal and immoral acts, but they also constitute security risks in positions of public trust.” Dean, *Imperial Brotherhood*, 63.

39 Dean, 66.

40 Ibid.

41 Apparently the bulk of civil servants that McCarthy forced to resign were gay, not communist. Out of the 600 accused, only 205 were known communists. Hurewitz, 233.

of homophobia in Washington. At the same time, purges and investigations were hidden in plain view behind euphemistic language in newspaper reports.\(^\text{43}\) Examining the ambiguous terms such as ‘security risk’ that was used to describe homosexuality, Johnson revealed how the Lavender Scare permeated 1950s political culture. Rather than being a marginal by-product of the larger ‘red scare,’ homophobia became routinized. Johnson’s study integrates political, cultural, and social history to illustrate how the “containment of sex was central to 1950s America as containing communism.”\(^\text{44}\)

Canadian scholars Gary Kinsman and Patrizia Gentile offered a different analysis on the vetting of homosexuals during the Cold War in *The Canadian War on Queers: National Security as Sexual Regulation*.\(^\text{45}\) Based on the idea of character weakness, Kinsman and Gentile examined how gay men and women were targeted under the guise of national security. The 1969 Mackenzie Commission argued that, in the “‘interest of the state,’” homosexuals should not be granted clearance at higher levels.\(^\text{46}\) According to Kinsman and Gentile, the RCMP classified homosexuality into three levels: suspected, alleged, and confirmed.\(^\text{47}\) These categories mirrored the classification of Canadian leftists during the 1950s and 1960s including categories of suspected, alleged, and confirmed communists. This categorization into different groups was according to suspects’ level of perceived danger to national security and the speed at which they should be arrested in the event of a national crisis. Similarly, the RCMP also monitored “high security areas,” such as the Department of Agriculture, the Post Office Department, and Department of Transport for communists and communist sympathizers\(^\text{48}\) and, as Kinsman and Gentile note, homosexuals.\(^\text{49}\) The link between the two perceived threats can also be traced through the focus on “hot spots” such as the NFB and the CBC, which, as Reg Whitaker and Gary Marcuse note in *Cold War Canada: the Making of an Insecurity State*, were carefully

\(^{43}\) Johnson, 7.  
^{44}\) Johnson, 11.  
^{46}\) Kinsman and Gentile, *The Canadian War on Queers*, 46.  
^{47}\) Ibid., 3.  
^{48}\) The list also included the Central Mortgage and Housing Corporation, Department of National Health and Welfare, the Public Works Department, and the Unemployment Insurance Commission. “Re: Civil Security – Special Branch Protection of Vital Points,” memorandum, from Cpl [redacted] to O.C. Special Branch, 10 August 1949, A 2011-00179-11-37-03, unprocessed collection, Library and Archives Canada (LAC).  
^{49}\) Kinsman and Gentile, 3.
monitored for alleged communist activity to the point of crippling the Canadian film industry.\(^50\)
The similarity between these perceived threats to national security indicated how specific groups were deemed radical and liable to spread ideologies, subsequently endangering society.

Historian Mary Louis Adams, like Elise Chenier, focused on the nature of fears about sexual deviancy and the subject of society, psychiatry, and the construction of ‘normal’ sexuality in postwar Canada. In *The Trouble with Normal: Postwar Youth and the Making of Heterosexuality*, Adams addressed the growing concern for youth and maintaining the structure of the nuclear family.\(^51\) *The Trouble with Normal* discusses how healthy heterosexual conduct was seen as fragile in the postwar era. Healthy sexuality had to be cultivated, nurtured, and maintained in order to avoid ‘abnormal’ or deviant behaviour.\(^52\) Adams’s study presents the medicalization of sexuality at a cultural level.

The desire to isolate perceived threats extended beyond Kennan’s Containment Theory into the realm of medicine and science where the individual was classified and contained through medical nomenclature.\(^53\) Pathologizing homosexuality was also the result of a larger movement to construct threats to normalcy as contaminants. Medical literature of the era did not equate homosexuality with a threat to national security or to communism but it presented homosexuality as abnormal in a period that stressed sexual and gender normalcy as a way to maintain the health of the nation. The dread of social breakdown, accompanying concerns about morality in the postwar era, established homosexuality as a potential threat. As with Operation Profunc’s effort to contain ‘potential subversives,’ medical and psychiatric literature sought ways to classify, contain, or cure sexual subversion.

---


\(^{51}\) Adams discusses the prevalence of Christian values that “underlay recurring arguments that placed the heterosexual nuclear family at the centre of a secure future for both individuals and the nation.” She refers to a Toronto mayor who in 1948 promoted good citizenship by declaring “Christian Family Week.” An ad in the *Toronto Daily Star* also exhibited this view: “If our country is to fulfill its destiny: family life, founded on Christian ideals and principles, must be preserved.” Evident in this campaign for Christian ideals and the family was that family life would shield Canada from “the threat of ‘outside turmoil.’” Adam, *The Trouble with Normal*, 21.

\(^{52}\) According to Adams, this process was evident in the advice for teenagers which stressed sexual normalcy: “[…] the symbolic positioning of teenagers as ‘the future,’ as those who could carry the 1950s forward, made them a likely target of interventions meant to maximize normality and therefore minimize stability and social order against the uncertainties of modern life.” Mary Louise Adams, *The Trouble with Normal*, 87.

\(^{53}\) Kennan’s Containment Theory and the Domino Effect were discussed in Chapter One.
3. Sexuality, Normalcy, and the Fascination with ‘Deviance’

Central to the history of science within society during the Cold War is the dichotomy of fascination and fear with contemporary developments and what they meant for humanity. According to historian Andrea Tone, the 1950s and 1960s were:

> the golden age of applied science, when the fruits of the laboratory research seemed bountiful. These well-publicized triumphs provided tangible evidence of the wonders wrought by pharmaceutical science. […] No problem seemed beyond science’s reach.\(^{54}\)

Advancements included the war-ending technology of the atomic bomb (as it was considered prior to the 1949 Soviet atomic test), DDT, the 1948 Nobel Prize-winning insecticide, penicillin, and the subsequent wonder drugs: corticosteroids, broad spectrum antibiotics, anti-depressants, and pills to treat hypertension and diabetes.\(^{55}\) But while medical progress promised to save countless lives, current military technological developments threatened global nuclear war and the spread of radiation.\(^{56}\) Accompanying the excitement for science’s seemingly unlimited advancements was fear for the future. Within the conflicting culture of medical enthusiasm and apprehension was the pathologization of sexuality and classification of homosexuality as a mental illness. The medicalization of sexuality and its subsequent categorization into groups of ‘healthy,’ or ‘normal,’ versus ‘sick,’ or ‘deviant,’ established a clear connection between sexuality, science and medicine, and the omnipresent Cold War fear of covert threats and subversion. Medical and scientific efforts to uncover and expose the hidden elements of humanity and nature, such as one’s mental health or sexual desires, were driven not just by a passion for scientific development but also by anxiety. This conflicted fascination was reflected in the public’s morbid curiosity with various sexual and gendered differences, including transgendered people like former G.I. Christine Jorgensen who, in the early 1950s, transitioned

---


\(^{55}\) Along with the technology for blood transfusions, which improved during the 1930s, and the introduction of penicillin during the Second World War, the 1950s saw the development of open-heart surgery and of a polio vaccine that contributed significantly to the eradication of a disease in the United States and Canada that had long plagued children and adults.

\(^{56}\) The dangers of science and ‘progress’ became more convoluted in the 1960s with Rachel Carson’s bestselling *Silent Spring* that systematically evaluated the impact of pesticides on the environment and recent scientific developments on the future of the planet. She addressed the dangers of the quickly progressing developments, stating that the “rapidity of change and the speed with which new situations are created follow the impetuous and heedless pace of man rather than the deliberate pace of nature.” Rachel Carson, *Silent Spring* (Greenwich, Connecticut: Fawcett Publications, Inc., 1962), 17.
from man to woman. She was the first person in the United States to be widely known for sex reassignment surgery, gaining celebrity status across the country and internationally.\(^{57}\)

The 1950s were not, contrary to assumptions, sexually conservative nor disinterested in sex outside of marriage. Historians of gender and sexuality have for decades challenged perceived paradigms of sexual openness and prudery, arguing that rather than continually assenting towards a teleological point of sexual freedom, the history of sexuality has instead experienced a variety of periods alternating between liberation and restriction.\(^{58}\) George Chauncey and Daniel Hurewitz have demonstrated in their studies of gay and lesbian culture in New York and Los Angeles respectively that same-sex activists and self-defined gay and lesbian communities existed well before the Second World War. David K. Johnson addresses something similar in his study of Washington prior to the ‘lavender scare,’ illustrating a period of relative freedom among gay and lesbian couples within the city and the workplace during the 1930s.\(^{59}\)

Similarly, in his book *One of the Boys: Homosexuality in the Military during World War II*, Paul Jackson provided a comprehensive overview of how, in specific contexts, conditions, and spaces, relaxed attitudes towards same-sex activity in wartime influenced postwar expressions of same-sex love and sex.\(^{60}\) Still, sex as it was viewed in the 1950s was unique. The decade opened with publications of Alfred Kinsey’s blockbusters about male and female sexuality. Those books were significant not just for their subject matter but also for their delivery, offering a non-judgemental and seemingly scientifically objective view of sexuality.\(^{61}\) While their use of evidence has since been challenged, Kinsey’s widely published reports startled medical practitioners and the general population alike with the apparently common occurrence of same sex activity and experimentation in American society.\(^{62}\)

\(^{57}\) A sense of awesome incredulity about the transition was evident in the title of an article in the *New York Daily News* from 1 December 1952: “Ex-GI Becomes Blonde Bombshell.” The title played with the juxtaposition of the two identities, marveling in both the bizarreness of human biology and the wonders of modern science.


\(^{59}\) Johnson, 52.


\(^{61}\) Kinsey’s studies will be discussed in more detail in Chapter Four.

Kinsey’s reports were only one aspect of the discussion of sexuality, human biology, and behaviour during the Cold War. The search for homosexuality’s causes within both the clinic and general society betrayed explicit concern for its contagious qualities and its need for containment and study. A 1951 article in the *CMAJ* took a different approach to the concern that homosexuality could be ‘catching’ by attributing the increase of venereal disease to the increase of male same-sex activity. Physicians B. Kanee and C. L. Hunt, who worked for British Columbia’s Department of Venereal Disease Control, proposed in “Homosexuality as a Spread of Venereal Disease,” that the rise of gonorrhoea within the province was the result of lax sexual morals in society. Homosexuality, the article claimed, was “increasing to an alarming extent” on account of the perceived freedom from disease fed by the success of penicillin. This was, they stated, “a practice […] unfortunately very liable to spread in a youthful community” on account of changing attitudes towards associations between men and the increased abuse of alcohol and drugs. Unlike other contemporary articles discussing homosexuality in the *CMAJ*, Kanee and Hunt’s study referred to homosexuality not as mental illness but as physical disease. Through this comparison, the physicians drew a connection between the escalation of physical illness in society and an apparent increase in sexually amoral activity, defined here as male homosexuality.

Kanee and Hunt also addressed the fear of contamination that was currently prevalent in discussions of threat and potential disorder. The physicians stressed not only the dangers of sexually transmitted illnesses but also the apparent increase of homosexuality. The element of contamination here was both that of a physical disease, gonorrhoea, and a practice that apparently defied sexual norms and morals. Morality and the fear of social destruction were the driving force behind this article like in many psychiatric studies about sexuality at the time.

---

64 Kanee and Hunt, “Homosexuality as a Source of Venereal Disease,” 139.
65 Kanee and Hunt, 139.
66 Kanee and Hunt, 139.
67 This point of view was not necessarily embraced by the psychiatric community. British physician Edward Glover, in his booklet “The Problem with Homosexuality,” commented on the importance of separating concepts of crime and sin when looking at homosexuality. Edward Glover, ed. “The Problem with Homosexuality,” (Institute for the Study and Treatment of Delinquency, no date), 7. CAMH. The study also addressed homosexuality as a condition whose illegality was disputable at the time. It noted that in a questionnaire, the majority of the 34 participants (professional staff at the Portman Clinic and the Institute for the Study and Treatment of Delinquency) saw homosexuality as illegal only under certain circumstances. These included cases when non-consenting minors were
This fear of contamination was particularly characteristic of the Cold War with its concerns for radiation poisoning and communist infiltration.\textsuperscript{68} Beyond the insistence of equating homosexuality with physical contagion, a practice that extended beyond Kanee and Hunt’s discussion of gonorrhoea into the era of HIV/AIDS, were the psychiatric discussions of homosexuality’s etiology through environment and behaviour.

According to several studies during the 1950s and into the 1970s, clinicians and researchers believed homosexuality spread through methods of improper parenting and was contracted through seduction.\textsuperscript{69} Several psychiatrists, regardless of their expertise in the field of sexuality, adopted the idea of parental influence and home environment on a child’s sexual development. Wellman’s 1956 article “Overt Homosexuality with Spontaneous Remission,” for instance, addressed the case study of a man diagnosed with a form of sexual deviancy who had a troubled relationship with his overbearing mother. While the scientific value of Wellman’s article is questionable, it reflected contemporary concerns about abnormal sexuality resulting from incompetent mothers.\textsuperscript{70} The emphasis on changing society and gender roles, and the impact they had on the child’s sexuality was evident in Dr. P. G. Thomson’s response to one of Turner’s papers in the early 1960s. In his comments, Thomson pointed to the dangers of suburban life where the “softening” of men disrupted the gender balance within the home:

Another social phenomenon which might be pursued is the decline in status of the father in modern North American society. It has been said that many modern fathers who commute from the suburbs see their young children neither in the morning nor at night. Thus, the care of the child is totally given over to the educated and emancipated modern American female.\textsuperscript{71}

\begin{itemize}
\item involved, in cases of rape, or cases of violence. Breach of public decency was another one as was the issue of male prostitution. Glover, “The Problem with Homosexuality,” 12-13.
\item The infiltration of radiation into the environment and the genetic make-up of humans added a new dimension to warfare where the victims of attack were the future generation. Frances Reilly, “The Consumption of Science and Technology: Canadian Atomic Culture during the Cold War” Master of Arts Thesis (Edmonton, University of Alberta, 2008), 42.
\item In addition to causing homosexuality, “momism” also apparently ruined the modern state of American society. This concept was the basis of Philip Wylie’s Generation of Vipers (1942). Although written during the Second World War, Wylie’s discussion of the destructive force of wives and mothers on America’s masculinity was often applied to postwar American society. Geoffrey S. Smith, “Containment, ‘Disease,’ and Cold War Culture,” in War in the Twentieth Century: Reflection at Century’s End, ed. Michael A. Hennessy and B. J. C. McKercher (Westport: Praeger Publications, 2003), 107-108.
\item P. G. Thomson, Commentary on “The Sexual Offender” by R. E. Turner in Forensic Psychiatry and the Doctor (Kingston: Queen’s University, 1963), 4. Box F27, File 6.17, Turner fonds, CAMH.
\end{itemize}
Too much feminine influence, particularly from “educated and emancipated” modern women, was damaging to the child.\textsuperscript{72} In a discussion about historical explanations for homosexuality, Turner referred to a booklet originally published in 1730 which attributed the “vice” of sodomy to the “mollycoddling of boys, and the cultivation of feminine habits by young men” adding that the “influence of the Italian opera was also regarded as pernicious.”\textsuperscript{73}

In addition to the feminization of society was a concern for homo-social environments through which homosexuality could spread. Historians Peter Conrad and Joseph Schneider explained the nineteenth-century concern about homo-social environments and their effect on the individual. The all-boys boarding school, for instance, was “spoken of in a kind of contagion model,” and was seen as an environment that bred an ongoing chain of sexual corruption of younger boys by older boys.\textsuperscript{74} Similarly, prisons were viewed as environments where the prohibition of contact between genders caused inmates to engage in same-sex activity.\textsuperscript{75}

Psychologists and other researchers often viewed sexual activity within the prison in terms of domination and abuse, or as a means of dealing with segregation from the opposite sex and society.\textsuperscript{76} Several APA documents focused on same-sex activity in prisons – alternatively using these situations as examples of homosexuality or arguing that sex occurring in homo-social environments differed from homosexuality. One report from the National Institute for Mental Health (NIMH) Task Force on Homosexuality indicated that the members were unsure of whether or not to use prisons in their study of homosexuality because of the seemingly rampant shift in sexuality that occurred between inmates.\textsuperscript{77} The researchers believed this behaviour to be more an issue of space rather than psychology.

The subject of same-sex activity at all-boys and all-girls schools was also considered to be ambiguous – not solely a form of ‘moral corruption’ but possibly a form of abuse and domination in a homo-social environment. Culturally, private school crushes and same-sex

\textsuperscript{72} As Clay Poupart writes in his thesis, Wylie’s book was “a long misogynist rant assailing the damage wives and mothers did to American men, referring to them as ‘spiritual saboteurs’ and coining the term ‘Momism’ to describe their impact on society.” Poupart, “When will my turn come?: The Civil Service Purges and the Construction of a Gay Security Risk in the Cold War United States, 1945-1955,” 35-36.

\textsuperscript{73} Turner, “A Review of Homosexuality,” (1959), 2. CAMH.


\textsuperscript{75} Turner, “A Review of Homosexuality,” 2. CAMH.

\textsuperscript{76} Report, “The Problem of Homosexuality.” Box 1, Folder 13, ONE National Gay and Lesbian Archives, Los Angeles, California. Letter from Anthony Wallace to Evelyn Hooker, 26 November 1968, Box 21, Folder 1, Charles E. Young Research Library, University of California Los Angeles.

\textsuperscript{77} Transcript, no date. Box 1, Folder 3, ONE National Gay and Lesbian Archives.
affairs were one of the more popular subjects of gay and lesbian pulp novels. More than one pseudo-psychiatric sensationalist pulp novel of the era played on the fear of lesbianism and homosexuality at the boarding school. One in particular, *The Lesbian: A Frank, Revealing Study of Women Who Turn to Their Own Sex for Love* by “Dr. Benjamin Morse,” presented the story of Angela, a student at an all-girls college. *The Lesbian* was a lurid collection of fictional ‘case studies’ written for a predominantly heterosexual male audience, mimicking contemporary psychiatric and behavioural studies. Angela’s story voyeuristically depicts her initiation into an intimate society of girls and her eventual seduction into an “insidious” network of lesbianism. In this fictional account of psychoanalysis, the expert concludes that nothing could reverse the effects of Angela’s new lesbian behaviour. Typical of the pulp novel punishment for abnormality, Angela’s life was irrevocably altered:

To state this more pointedly: if Angela Pierce had read this book during her senior year at high school, she would never have found herself in bed with Lucia Whitecomb. The seeds of seduction which Lucia planted grew to maturity because they were tossed upon virgin soil. A more knowledgeable girl would have recognized Lucia’s advances for what they were and would have squelched them permanently at the onset.

In a society that valued defined gender roles and divisions, the spectre of homosexuality was feared to be rampant within certain problematized spaces. More than that pulp novels, medical literature, and psychiatric writing depicted homosexuality as a “condition” that could easily spread to the most vulnerable individuals who lacked immunity or awareness of its potential dangers. This concern was expressed less overtly in documents from the TPH Forensic Clinic, which saw homosexuality as a universal potential lying within the individual. According to researchers like Turner, it was possible for homosexuality to develop in most people given the correct psychological conditions and background.

Homosexuality, whether defined as behaviour or a symptom of a deeper mental illness, was feared. Like other forms of ‘deviance,’ such as communism, homosexuality threatened to

---

79 This was a pseudonym for pulp writer Lawrence Block who wrote under a number of other pen names including “Jill Emerson.” Many of his pulp novels followed the theme of same-sex love, lesbianism, and the pseudo-psychoanalytical study of sexuality, typically featuring ‘case studies’ which allowed for gratuitous accounts of sexual activity. *The Lesbian* will be discussed in more detail in Chapter Four.
81 Morse, 20.
82 Turner, “A Review of Homosexuality,” 7. CAMH.
undermine North American society. The belief that ‘deviant’ sexuality, like communism, had to be contained to avoid widespread contamination shaped understandings of health and normalcy through the Cold War. In an age of scientific and medical advancement, psychiatric aid was deemed the most effective method to treat this so-called threat. Amid the growing panic about sexual predators, much of the enthusiasm for apparent progress towards ‘curing’ homosexuals, ‘sexual deviants,’ and sexual criminals was championed by non-psychiatrists. 83 Related to this concern of the feared spread of sexual crime and ‘deviancy,’ however, was the desire among clinicians and researchers to understand its causes in order to ultimately control it. Psychiatrists in Canada were well aware that they had not found a cure for sexual deviancy and crime. As J. W. Mohr stated in a 1961 seminar at the University of Toronto, in the “scientific pursuit of knowledge there are not absolute facts or, at least, we dare not think in terms of absolute facts.” 84 The schism between belief in scientific method and the inability to properly explore homosexuality as a psychological condition cultivated the conundrum of how to treat homosexuality within the clinic.

4. Turner and Defining the “Most Common Deviation”

The Turner Papers at CAMH have been useful in studying the Canadian perspective on pathologizing homosexuality. To understand Turner’s papers, and his influence over the clinic, it is necessary to provide a biographical background. Robert E. Turner (1926-2006) was a Canadian psychiatrist and recognized pioneer of forensic psychiatry. After earning a degree in medicine at the University of Toronto in 1952, Turner did postgraduate work at the University of Bristol, earning a Diploma in Psychiatry, followed by certification as a specialist in the field, in 1957. He became a resident and then staff psychiatrist at the TPH Forensic Clinic in the same year. Impressively, in late 1958 Turner became the Forensic Clinic’s second director, 85 a position that he kept until 1966 when the Clark Institute of Psychiatry was formed. Turner’s work at the clinic combined the fields of law and psychiatry – he participated in court hearings and trials, and taught students of medicine. The combined attention to law and psychiatry pointed to the clinic’s central purpose: to address the problem of ‘deviant sexuality’ by studying the origins and reasons behind sexual ‘abnormality’ in order to find a means of treating so-called deviants.

83 Chenier, Strangers in Our Midst, 19.
84 Mohr, “Psychiatric Treatment as an Alternative to Imprisonment.” CAMH.
85 Dr. Peter Thomson was the first director of the TPH Forensic Clinic. Pascoe, 208.
According to Turner, psychiatrists at the clinic were interested in an “‘intensive study of the psychodynamics of sexual deviation, its causes and cure.’” The primary goals for treatment of the homosexual, as presented by Turner in a later paper from 1972, included: changing the direction and intensity of the sexual urge, “greater discretion,” and “adaptation to the sexual problem and to life in general.” These goals were broad, leaving room to compensate for what Turner saw as a variety of ‘types’ of homosexuality and ‘deviation.’ He concluded the paper with a quotation from a 1961 CMAJ editorial: “‘Homosexuality is the source of much suffering. It is the privilege (though not the prerogative) of the physician to alleviate suffering by whatever technical and personal means are at his disposal. Only thus does he justify the confidence, respect and gratitude of his patients.’”

This mandate was clear in Turner’s and his contemporaries’ discussions about homosexuality as it existed in society. Shortly after becoming second director of the clinic, Turner drew attention to the devastating implications of being discovered, or ‘outed,’ as homosexual within society including the danger of being driven to suicide or, in some cases, executed. Turner’s discussion on this matter implied that not only did he question the idea that homosexuality was the result of society and social behaviour, as some researchers claimed in their discussion of environment and upbringing, but that punishment for homosexuality was extreme and unnecessary. In Canada, the criminal code classified homosexual acts as illegal until 1969. But even following these amendments, the classification of ‘legal’ homosexual acts was extremely narrow.

The TPH Forensic Clinic was part of a larger effort to address sexual ‘deviation’ and crime in a manner that fit the individual. But researchers also struggled with how to fit homosexuality into this ‘enlightened’ and ‘humane’ manner of treating disorder. Unlike the other conditions studied and treated at the Forensic Clinic, homosexuality evaded easy classification, shattering the clear paradigms of illness and wellness. As Turner stated in his 1959 “Review of Homosexuality”: “It is very confusing when reading the literature and its many attempts at

89 Turner, “A Review of Homosexuality.” CAMH.
90 Turner, “A Review of Homosexuality,” 2. CAMH.
91 In August 1971 Toronto Gay Action (TGA) protested the limited amendments to the Canadian Criminal Code that emphasized the legality of same-sex acts in private. The Canadian gay movement demanded that “sexual orientation” be included in the Canadian Bill of Rights as a prohibited ground of discrimination.
92 Mohr, “Psychiatric Treatment as an Alternative to Imprisonment.” CAMH.
classifying homosexuality and homosexual behaviour. Classifications run into one another and are sometime descriptive, sometimes dynamic and sometimes causal.”

Turner’s papers through the 1950s and into the 1970s indicated both the continued discussion about the difficulties of classifying and identifying homosexuality’s etiology and the steadfast belief that homosexuality was a psychiatric condition or, at the very least, a symptom of a deeper psychological disorder.

In regards to homosexuality, the comparatively large number of patients with this so-called condition at the TPH Forensic Clinic was the subject of several papers. In his 1965 paper, “A Spectrum of Sexual Problems in an Out-Patient Setting,” Turner addressed a recent decrease in the patient population. At the same time, he noted, while the total population at the clinic dropped, the population of homosexual patients, the largest single group at the clinic, rose over the span of two years. Turner noted that most homosexual offenders were charged under a number of other offenses including “gross indecency, indecent assault male, and contributing to juvenile delinquency.”

A 1967 article co-authored by Turner stated that as the “most common deviation,” homosexuality was “prone to overgeneralization,” and that its “etiology is unclear, mainly because a number of different phenomena are grouped under the term.”

A 1969 booklet co-written by Turner, titled Sex Offenders on Probation: Homosexuality, declared that while homosexuality was by far the “most common deviation” there was still more to discover about it. Here, homosexuality was presented as a medical mystery, as something to study and whose causes were largely discussed and debated. What set homosexuality apart from other sexual

---

94 In some cases homosexuality was referred to as a ‘natural form’ of deviancy that could not be described as ‘disease.’ Glover, “the Problem with Homosexuality,” 6. CAMH.
95 Types of sexual crimes and deviancies studied at the clinic and discussed in Turner’s paper included pedophilia and exhibitionism, along with sadomasochism, voyeurism, transvestism, fetishism, incest, “multiple sex perversions,” and frotteurism. R. E. Turner, “A Spectrum of Sexual Problems Found in an Out-Patient Setting” in Interdisciplinary Problems in Criminology: Papers of the American Society of Criminology (Columbus: Ohio State University, 1965), 137. Box F27, File 6.17, Turner fonds, CAMH.
96 Turner, “A Spectrum of Sexual Problems Found in an Out-Patient Setting,” 137. CAMH.
97 Turner, Ibid. CAMH.
98 Ibid. CAMH.
99 Johann W. Mohr and R. E. Turner, “Sexual Deviations: Part II – Homosexuality,” in Office Management of Psychiatric Problems (February 1967), Box F36, File 8.12, Dr. Donald Blair Coats fonds, CAMH. Several other psychiatrists commented on the mis-labelling of homosexuality as other conditions such as pedophilia. Herbert Pascoe, “Deviant Sexual Behaviour and the Sex Criminal,” Canadian Medical Association Journal 84 (1961): 206. During the Middle Ages in Europe, sexual vice was categorized according to the ‘natural.’ Essentially, acts that could result in conception, such as heterosexual rape, would thus fulfill the understood purpose of existence and would be considered a ‘natural’ sexual crime. Same sex activity on the other hand was classified as ‘unnatural.’ De Block and Adrians, 278.
100 A. K. Girgeroff, Johann W. Mohr, and R. E. Turner, Sex Offenders on Probation: Homosexuality (1969), Box F27, File 6.28, Turner fonds, CAMH.
‘deviancies’ was how the symptom of ‘illness’ was defined. Unlike voyeurism and exhibitionism, homosexuality was not simply based on action but on the tendency or possibility of committing sexually ‘deviant’ acts.

The TPH Forensic Clinic for ‘sexual deviants’ was part of a small but growing trend of forensic clinics in Canada. Throughout the 1950s and 1960s, clinicians and researchers identified forensic clinics as the future of criminology. As Turner stated in a paper given at the 1966 Fourth International Congress of Psychiatry: “In both forensic psychiatry and criminology it is essential to maintain an objective approach and to develop knowledge on the firm basis of valid data.”

Behind the fascination with the forensic clinic and its research was the promise to define, understand, and at last control what had previously been out of reach: the criminal mind. This enthusiasm, however, was muted in Turner’s documents. While acknowledging the power of psychiatry to uncover the foundations of mental illness there was also the issue of shame that inhibited many patients, particularly men, from discussing their sexuality to psychiatrists. Here social definitions of morality and deviancy interfered with psychiatric study. These perceptions of sexual deviancy were also what supported the clinic’s existence. The clinic, in its effort to understand so-called deviation, was the result of a growing focus on psychopathic care and legislation in North America. Throughout the 1920s and 1930s, the apparent threat of homosexuality and sexual criminal psychopathy was the focus of medical reform, regardless of the significantly lower number of sexual offenders within the larger psychopathic body at primary institutions such as the TPH. Criminal psychopath legislation – beginning first with the State of Michigan’s introduction of such a law in 1937, later followed by the Canadian Parliament’s introduction of it to the Criminal Code in 1948 – was adopted by most of North America by the end of the 1950s. The driving intent to ‘cure the disease’ pointed to public

---

102 Homosexuality was often seen as an underlying symptom of other psychological issues. Turner, “Homosexuality,” 2. CAMH.
103 Turner, Ibid., 11. CAMH.
104 Gordon Watson, John Rich, and Kenneth G. Gray, A Study of Forensic Cases (Toronto: University of Toronto, Department of Psychiatry, 1957), Box F27, File 6.17, Turner fonds, CAMH. This booklet discusses the growing field of studies on sexual deviation and how clinics in North America such as TPH Forensic Clinic were looking to provide services and research specifically to the field.
105 Chenier, 25. Between 1923 and 1933, of the 3,622 admitted, half were court referrals and half of that, 150 patients, were sex offenders. Ibid.
106 Ibid., 18.
faith in scientific method and medicine. Within the clinic the solutions, and at times the problem, were less clear.

What finally gave institutions such as the TPH the medical expertise to define the nature of sexual pathology and its impact on society was government funding. Following the Second World War, the Mental Health Division allocated funding to support the “development and maintenance of mental health research and programs across the country.”

Funding for institutions in Canada following the Second World War highlighted several components that characterized the era: an increased focus on scientific methodology, postwar affluence, and fear of social decay following decades of economic depression, war, and general domestic upheaval. The “increasing overt interest in our civilization regarding sexual matters,” as Herbert Pascoe stated in his 1961 article in the CMAJ, was mixed with a growing interest in what caused “sex crimes.”

According to Turner’s 1966 report to the Fourth International Congress of Psychiatry on forensic psychiatry and criminology in Canada, research at the Toronto Forensic Clinic was extensive and focused on sexual crime and ‘deviation.’ Research included follow-up studies of sexual offenders, a twelve-month study of sexual offenders before the Metropolitan Toronto courts, “sexual deviation and legal process,” and the “potentially dangerous sexual offender-patient,” among others. The Toronto clinic was a rare facility, but not the only one of its kind in Canada. In 1955 the McGill Clinic in Forensic Psychiatry, part of the out-patient department of the Allan Memorial Institute in Montreal, began research work. Its projects were similar to those at the Toronto Forensic Clinic in that they dealt with psychopathy of the criminal, but they

---

107 Ibid., 29. Annual funding rose from $25,000 between 1947 and 1948 to $175,000 between 1949 and 1950. By 1954, the reported combined amount spent on provincial and federal mental health programs was $30 million. Ibid.

108 Pascoe, 206.

109 These other studies were: parent-child relationships, and sexual deviation, effects of alcohol on higher mental functions, a national survey of Canadian psychiatrists’ opinions regarding the psychopathic personality, a study of the youthful offender in the Toronto courts, mental illness and homicide, and group psychotherapeutic methods in treatment of pedophilia. Turner, “Forensic Psychiatry and Criminology in Canada,” 5. CAMH.

110 A 1960 article about psychiatric “day centres” referred to the development of out-patient clinics across Canada, stating that after 1957 there were nearly thirty of these units in operation. The article proclaimed that these clinics lessened the stigma of mental illness, the fear of psychiatric disorder and mental hospitals. It went on to say that the model of the day centre was first adapted in Canada by the Allan Memorial Institute from similar programs that developed in Russia during the 1930s. A. L. Jones and M. E. Miller, “Day Centre in Toronto for Psychiatric Patients,” Canadian Medical Association Journal 83 (1960): 846-848.
concentrated less on sexual ‘deviancy.’ Turner also referred to British Columbia’s and Manitoba’s plans for forensic clinics which reflected the growing interest in forensic psychiatry across Canada. What made the Toronto Forensic Clinic unique, both within Canada and internationally, was its focus on sexuality and sexual ‘deviancy.’

In 1965, the Globe and Mail published an article by journalist Barbara Moon about the TPH Forensic Clinic entitled “Defining the Sex Offender.” In it, Moon addressed the changing conception of sexual ‘deviancy,’ noting that “[the public] have learned to think of the sex criminal not as depraved but as diseased.” She referred to the public’s tendency to see crimes in terms of “folklore,” gravitating to “unscientific” and “inexact” material. Her discussion about the work at the TPH Forensic Clinic provided information about the clinic and demonstrated the contemporary ideas of scientific progress and enlightenment. At the time Moon’s statement that sex criminals were “diseased” was progressive. It acknowledged the importance of science and medicine and claimed that so-called sexual deviants and criminals were ‘curable’ or, at least, not responsible for their actions on account of mental illness; a sympathetic view perhaps, but most certainly patronizing. This view of the medical or psychiatric professional’s role to protect the ‘deviant’ through research within the field was echoed in several histories of homosexuality and psychiatry from the clinician’s perspective. The lingering belief that by medicalizing ‘deviancy’ homosexuals suffered less ostracism ignored the element of normalcy and control while simultaneously elevating the field above criticism.

The success of the clinic was debatable. Part of this was dependent on how conditions were identified and, consequently, how they were to be treated. Debates between clinicians and researchers about the etiology and nature of homosexuality as a condition was at times overt and at other points implicit in the inability to properly determine how to treat homosexuality. A booklet in Turner’s collection from the British Medical Association’s Department Committee on

---

111 According to Turner’s paper, the McGill clinic’s projects since 1958 focused on the psychopathy of crime, criminality in the family, and the history of crime and punishment in French Canada. Turner, “Forensic Psychiatry and Criminology in Canada,” CAMH.
112 Turner, CAMH.
114 One such history, American Dr. Ronald Bayer’s 1981 Homosexuality and American Psychiatry: The Politics of Diagnosis, for instance, expressed his feelings of betrayal as a medical professional in light of the challenges to the DSM. Referring to recent protests against American psychiatry, Bayer stated: “Like so many other client populations, homosexuals turned on those formerly perceived as protectors, their sense of self-confidence enhanced by an awareness that they were part of an upsurge of protest directed at every social institution in America.” Ronald Bayer, Homosexuality and American Psychiatry: The Politics of Diagnosis (New York: Basic Books, Inc., Publishers, 1981), 8.
Homosexual Offenses and Prostitution, *The Problem with Homosexuality*, for instance, acknowledged the rudimentary nature of studies on the possible treatment methods of homosexual patients. One of the main problems with the experiments, the book stated, was the lack of contact with patients following treatment, which made it difficult to determine whether or not the treatment was successful. According to some of Turner’s reports he did keep professional contact with homosexual patients and many continued their treatment over many years, at the TPH Clinic and later at the Clark Institute. Despite the clinic’s mandate to study the psychodynamics of sexual deviation, its causes, and cure, Turner’s understanding of successful treatment, however, appeared to be unique to the patient. According to some of his reports, the goal was not so much to ‘cure’ the patient of homosexuality, as it was to cure the underlying condition of which homosexuality was the symptom.

It is important to consider the clinic and its motivations in relation to the larger environment of science, technology, and medicine during the Cold War. Within this cultural and professional devotion to medical progress and scientific definition was the acceptance of scientific method as an Archimedean point of perspective, or *punctum Archimedis*, a vantage point of complete objectivity. The ideal of completely removing oneself from the object of study assumed both the elitism of the scientist and elitism of the study. As Fleck argued, this faith in the power of knowledge, which cast the knower as conqueror, was based on the misconception that the observers and observations were neutral. He stated that pure observations do not exist since even the first observation of a scientific problem is, in fact, an assumption.

---

115 Edward Glover, ed. *The Problem with Homosexuality* (The Institute for the Study and Treatment of Delinquency, c. 1955), Box F27, File 6.17, Turner fonds, CAMH.
116 Turner, “Homosexuality,” 5-6. CAMH.
117 This is a central point of discussion within the history and philosophy of science and the deconstruction of science’s role as ‘truth’ and ‘fact’ within society. Using Emile Durkheim’s study of the sacred and profane, philosopher David Bloor’s *Knowledge and Social Imagery* (1976) analyses how science has gained the place as society’s unquestionable sacred. His work addresses science as a type of religion, one that holds the role of ‘truth’ in society. Anthropologists Clifford Geertz and Robin Horton both confront the idea that logic is universal demonstrating how human thought is based on experience and society, Clifford Geertz, *Local Knowledge* (1983) and Robin Horton, “Traditional Thought and Western Science” *Africa: Journal of the International African Institute* 37, no. 2 (April 1967): 155-187.
118 Fleck, 84.
119 Ibid., 89-90. “One might think that the statement, ‘Today one hundred large, yellowish, transparent and two smaller, lighter, more opaque colonies have appeared on the agar plate,’ could in our case be regarded as a description purely of what is observed, devoid of any assumptions. But the statement contains much more than ‘pure observation’ and much more than could in the first instance be claimed with certainty. It anticipates a difference between the colonies, which could actually be established only at a later stage of a long series of experiments. The difference of course – and this is very important – was ascertained as of quite another kind than that anticipated.” 90.
Similarly, in Cold War sexual psychiatry diagnoses were constructed and influenced by the personal and authoritative opinions of medical experts and established social norms. While medical experts believed in medical and scientific neutrality, the politicization of psychiatry and the study of sexuality challenged the construction of science and medicine as objective studies of human nature. This politicization was most evident in the DSM debates of the early 1970s that challenged the inclusion of homosexuality in the manual.\footnote{120}

Twentieth-century psychiatry, despite its stress on science, was dependent on the traditional Judeo-Christian conceptions of morality to define mental health and normalcy. At the same time, the environment of modern psychiatric method and public understanding of scientific impunity controlled sexual psychiatry. This was particularly evident in a 1975 meeting of the Ontario Psychiatric Association of which Turner was president. Under the heading “New Business” the minutes of the June 1975 meeting addressed the issue of “Homosexuality and Mental Illness.” Central to this discussion was the question of whether or not there was sufficient evidence to continue identifying homosexuality as a diagnostic classification in Ontario clinics. Dr. Saul Levine led this discussion at the meeting. He requested that the council make specific recommendations on the matter of homosexuality and mental illness in light of the recent decisions by the APA to declassify homosexuality from the DSM. The three motions adopted acknowledged the importance of civil liberties and the importance of adapting nomenclature to the changing knowledge within the field. One motion in particular, however, captured the overall attitude towards homosexuality within the psychiatric field despite these assertions:

\begin{quote}
Whereas medical nomenclature must be continually changed in the light of increasing knowledge, there is not sufficient increase in our present state of knowledge of homosexuality to warrant any change in its current position in medical nomenclature.\footnote{121}
\end{quote}

Levine stated that within the Canadian Psychiatric Association (CPA) and the OPA, there was “still a very strong attitude that homosexuality per se represents a psychopathological disorder when there is no evidence in literature to back that attitude.”\footnote{122} Despite significant substantiation that homosexuality was not a mental illness or symptom of such, researchers and clinicians were reluctant to acknowledge the shift in knowledge, even following its decriminalization. At the

\footnotesize{\begin{itemize}
\item \footnote{120} This will be discussed in more detail in Chapter Seven.
\item \footnote{121} Minutes: Ontario Psychiatric Association, “Meeting of Council held in the Board Room, Clarke Institute of Psychiatry,” (13 June 1975), 12. Box, F27, File 4.15, Turner fonds, CAMH.
\item \footnote{122} Ibid., 12-13. CAMH.
\end{itemize}}
same time, as was evident in Turner’s files between the mid-1950s and into the early 1970s, the question of how homosexuality classified as mentally ill or as sexual deviancy was constant.

5. Conclusion

As Globe and Mail journalist Joan Holloban noted in reference to the TPH Forensic Clinic in 1961: “Sex has been a major subject of academic study ever since Freud and unscientific conversation since men developed language, but remarkably few scientific facts are known about it once the emotions and the theories are dispersed.”123 The reality was also that the subject of sex, even at the clinical level, was dominated by emotion and subjectivity, evident in critical statements of the study from within the field itself.124 The belief that technological and methodological progress dominated modern psychiatry, evading subjectivity, was evident in the pathologization and treatment of homosexuality along with sexual ‘deviation’ and crime, these were modern expressions of moral persecution subsequently influenced by contemporary politics and social concerns. Methods of identifying and containing individuals through pathologization therefore were simply old methods dressed up in modern “scientific” garb.

The clinic’s drive to treat ‘sexual deviants’ and criminals pointed to the faith in modern psychiatry to uncover individuals’ hidden behaviours reflecting in the process the larger Cold War desire to expose the invisible threat.125 In this way, the pathologization of homosexuality was instrumental in the larger attempts to control “deviancy” and, by proxy, normalcy. While the connection between the attempts to contain political and sexual deviancy was related to the character weakness of the individual, it was also based in methods of defining deviance. What comes across in Turner’s documents was a mixed sense of confidence, confusion, and persistence in the methods of dealing with homosexuality. Confidence was evident in the belief that this was a humane way of treating a population that was otherwise deemed criminal. While many clinicians, especially those appearing in Turner’s papers, believed that homosexuality should not be judged as sin or crime, there was less agreement about how it was a psychiatric condition. What comes out in Turner’s documents from the TPH Forensic Clinic was the ambiguity surrounding the medicalization and treatment of homosexuality. The desire for

124 Mohr, “Psychiatric Treatment as an Alternative to Imprisonment.” CAMH.
scientific objectivity and the devotion to paradigms prevailed in the efforts to medically define deviancy as it did in the RCMP definition of political subversion. In an era that worked to contain and surveil ‘others,’ the medicalization of homosexuality was part of the larger history of subversion and observation in North America.
CHAPTER FOUR  The Invisible Menace: Mental Illness, Sexuality, and the Fear of Deviancy

1. Introduction
In an essay titled “Sexuality and Homosexuality in Women,” published in Dr. Judd Marmor’s 1965 text *Sexual Inversion: The Multiple Roots of Homosexuality*, American clinician May E. Romm postulated why women were typically missing from studies of homosexuality. She stated:

As most writers on psychoanalytic and psychiatric subjects are men, it is possible that the idea that women may libidinally prefer members of their own sex may be unacceptable to them. It could also be that, because society is not so alert in discovering and censoring the sexual preferences of homosexual women, such women have less anxiety about their inversion and therefore seek psychiatric help less frequently than do male homosexuals. Or perhaps authors are still under the impression that sexual expression is not so important to women as it is to men and that a woman who is not married and has no heterosexual life can relax in her celibacy and completely sublimate her sexuality.¹

Romm addressed several fundamental aspects of the contemporary social and psychiatric understanding of women and sexuality. The combined assumptions of male sexual dominance and female passivity that existed within sexual psychiatry and postwar society in many ways denied the existence or relevance of female sexuality and homosexuality. Most compelling was Romm’s second explanation, which was echoed within the National Institute of Mental Health (NIMH) Task Force on Homosexuality’s discussions of lesbianism. The smaller number of female patients seeking psychiatric help for their sexuality resulted in a considerable lack of focus within the psychiatric studies of homosexuality. In this sense, because those concerned about their so-called condition sought psychiatric help, the identification of homosexuality as a condition equated anxiety. Confirmed and categorized through the clinic, pathologized homosexuality was open to study and examination. When it existed as a medical condition, homosexuality was less of an ‘invisible menace’ – it could be identified, controlled, and, ultimately, cured.

*Sexual Inversion* is a text devoted to shedding “light on one of the most challenging problems in the field of psychiatry - that of homosexuality.”² The collection’s editor, Judd

---

Marmor (1910-2003) was a psychoanalyst who had worked with gay and lesbian patients throughout the 1940s and became a leading figure in the declassification of homosexuality as a mental illness in the 1970s. He was at first hesitant to agree with psychologist Dr. Evelyn Hooker’s idea that homosexuality was not pathological. In 1957, Hooker (1907-1996) published her report, “The Adjustment of the Male Overt Homosexual,” challenging the idea that gay men were inherently maladjusted and pathological. By studying gay men outside of the clinic and within the context of the gay community, Hooker concluded that there was little difference between the pathologies of homosexual and heterosexual men. This report was fundamental to studies on homosexuality and one of the primary arguments against the medicalization of homosexuality from a scientific perspective.

In Sexual Inversion, Marmor demonstrated a significant shift in his idea about mental illness and sexuality. He stated at the end of his introduction: “The tendency so frequently in the literature to delineate a specific ‘homosexual personality’ will some day, I am convinced, appear as archaic as the old description of the ‘typical’ tuberculous or epileptic personalities now appear.” Sexual Inversion included a variety of discussions about homosexuality, and while many of the researchers who contributed to the study believed that homosexuality was indeed an illness, such as Irving Bieber, others, such as Thomas Szasz, viewed it as a wider social problem. The book presented a variety of opinions on definition, treatment, and medicalization. Most indicative of Marmor’s changing opinion was his final statement regarding the visibility of homosexuality through the clinic and within society: “We must recognize that homosexuals seeking psychiatric treatment represent only a small fraction of the total number of homosexuals

---

3 Herb Kutchins and Stuart A. Kirk, Making Us Crazy, DSM: The Psychiatric Bible and the Creation of Mental Disorders (Toronto: The Free Press, 1997), 64.
5 Paul Cameron and Kirk Cameron have more recently argued that despite its influence within the APA, Hooker’s study was fundamentally flawed. This study, they note, was misrepresented for over 40 years and related more to ideology than science. Paul Cameron and Kirk Cameron, “Re-Examining Evelyn Hooker: Setting the Record Straight with Comments on Schumm’s (2012) Renalaysis,” Marriage & Family Review 48, no. 6 (2012): 491-523. In response to, Walter R. Schumm, “Re-examining a Landmark Research Study: A Teaching Editorial,” Marriage and Family Review 48, no. 5 (2012): 465-489.
in our society. The vast majority of homosexuals does not seek or wish such treatment."  

By acknowledging Hooker’s significant study, Marmor acknowledged the role of the clinic in the medicalization of homosexuality and how rather than providing an objective gaze of the patient, the perspective of the clinic was influential in casting homosexuality as ill by definition.

Similar to many of the other essays in Sexual Inversion, Romm addressed the medical and clinical aspects of homosexuality. Despite her critique of the approach and focus of male clinicians and researchers, her study centred on the psychological aspects of female homosexuality. In this way, her work focused on clinically “visible” homosexuality, defined by individuals who sought psychiatric help through the clinic and the clinician. Romm concluded her paper, which presented several case studies of women who engaged in sexual activity with other women, by stating that while it was relatively easy to pinpoint the etiological factors in the development of a particular case of homosexuality, clinicians should not be “deluded into accepting the specific experiences that occurred in their particular patients as axiomatically the causative factors in all homosexuals.”

Referring to the importance of treatment for what she described as predominantly psychologically damaged women, Romm identified female homosexuality as “a psycho-sexual aberration.” She ended the article stating that if a woman was unable to make the shift to heterosexuality she should then “reconcile herself to her homosexual pattern with adequate self-esteem and dignity.”

Like many of the articles on homosexuality at the time, Romm’s work sought explanations and guidelines for identifying a condition that did not necessarily fit into the larger category of mental illness.

2. History: Medicalizing Sexuality

This chapter acknowledges instances of imprisonment on the basis of ‘abnormal’ or ‘deviant’ sexuality but focuses on a different type of containment from that within the prison or the clinic. While people were physically contained within psychiatric institutions, this chapter examines a separate form of medical containment. Rather than addressing those who were sent to clinics and asylums to be ‘treated,’ this chapter looks at the ‘voluntary’ admissions. The reason for this approach is twofold: first, the largest population of patients at the Toronto Psychiatric

---

10 Romm, 291-293.
11 Ibid., 298.
12 Ibid., 300.
13 Valerie Korinek, “‘We’re the girls of the pansy parade’: Historicizing Winnipeg’s Queer Subcultures, 1930s-1970,” Histoire Sociale/Social History 45, no. 89 (May 2012): 146.
Hospital’s Forensic Clinic were voluntarily admitted gay men. Women, who were less likely to seek psychiatric aid for homosexuality, were increasingly viewed as unseen spectres within psychiatric studies. Second, this is a study of control in a period of anxiety – two themes that were explicit in nosological discussions about how homosexuality was or was not an illness. By focusing on individuals who committed themselves, or considered themselves ill, this chapter addresses medical containment through definition rather than through physical experience within the clinic.

The question of whether homosexuality was or was not an illness or symptom of mental disorder was a constant subject of discussion within the field of psychiatry throughout the mid-twentieth century. The Kinsey reports on human sexuality, *Sexual Behavior of the Human Male* (1948) and *Sexual Behavior of the Human Female* (1953), characterized both the clinical and social fascination with the complexity of sexuality. The two studies were significant in their attempts to transition beyond the classification of normal and abnormal behaviour, wellness and illness, and instead examine and identify the wider scope of human sexual behaviour. As a result, Kinsey’s studies presented the normalcy of sexual activity as existing within its diversity, rather than within the model of heterosexual monogamy.

Although Kinsey and his team were not the first researchers to address the complexity of sexuality, their studies of male and female sexual behaviour were more popularly consumed than other contemporary studies or previous ones. The reports addressed the difficulties of conducting studies on homosexuality, namely because of the social taboo surrounding same-sex activity. Kinsey’s report on male homosexual activity was limited in that it did not focus on the number of homosexual or gay men within the American population, but on the number of men who had engaged in some form of sexual activity with other men. The analysis was also racially and culturally limited, focusing on white American men. Essentially, Kinsey’s study on homosexuality was one on homosexual experiences, focusing on action rather than psychology or identity. While this study was based on the physical aspects of same-sex activity, the element of homosexuality’s possible invisibility through its hidden pervasiveness fascinated the public.

---

17 Kinsey, Pomeroy, and Martin, 650.
and clinicians alike. The statistics presented at the end of the chapter on homosexual activity were moderate: 63 per cent of adult American white males apparently never engaged in sexual activities with other men while 37 per cent did.\(^\text{18}\) The way in which this material was presented, however, portrayed the statistics as something more significant, stating that the 37 per cent of men accounted “for nearly 2 males out of every 5 that one may meet.”\(^\text{19}\) The element of hidden experience and covertness implicit in this statement – that 37 per cent of the American male population could effectively hide their homosexual experiences – played with the lack of definition and visibility of sexuality.

Science, medicine, and psychiatry were all popularized during the Cold War. A quintessential image of the atomic era is of Nevada’s citizens watching the atomic-tests from Las Vegas rooftops. Historian Andrea Tone draws attention to the popularization of tranquilizers as acceptable medicine for the average American and as symbolic of the era.\(^\text{20}\) The Cold War also saw the popularization of both medicalized sexuality and of risqué material through the pulp novel. Salacious tales of sex, both same-sex and otherwise, were often carefully guised as popularized psychiatric studies similar to the Kinsey reports in order to get past censors. Benjamin Morse’s 1961 pseudo-psychiatric pulp novel, *The Lesbian* is a perfect example of this genre. The book declared on its back cover: “Whatever she is, there are no quick answers, no sudden cures, no psychiatric wonder drugs which will correct her condition now and forever.”\(^\text{21}\) Amid the lurid descriptions of women who engaged in same-sex activity, the book promoted the growing contemporary belief that homosexuality was a mental illness. It also reflected the mounting popular interest in psychiatry, the medical and lay belief in sexual contagion, and a general appetite for sensationalized sexuality. Copying contemporary clinic reports, Morse divided his book into a variety of ‘studies’ identifying so-called types of lesbians.\(^\text{22}\) This unofficial medicalization of homosexuality in pulp novels echoed the contemporary desire to categorize and identify what was an otherwise invisible condition. Morse’s pulp novel, and others like it, demonstrated the link between medicine and popular culture during the 1950s and

\(^{18}\) Ibid.

\(^{19}\) Ibid.


\(^{21}\) Benjamin Morse, *The Lesbian: A Frank, Revealing Study of Women Who Turn to Their Own Sex for Love* (Derby: Monarch Books, 1961), back cover.

\(^{22}\) These included the college girl, as discussed in Chapter Three, the tomboy, the ‘man hater,’ the bohemian, the prostitute, the ‘unsuccessful heterosexual,’ and the ‘frigid abstainer,’ among others.
1960s. Sexuality psychiatry was cultural as much as it was medical. In Morse’s faux-scientific case studies, the ‘other’ was portrayed as a threat and something medical.

The imperceptibility of homosexuality as discussed within these texts, both medical and cultural, reflected the larger Cold War fear of infiltration and subversion. The nature of this overwhelming concern, evident in anxieties about ‘abnormal’ sexuality, ‘deviant’ politics, and radiation, was what connected the history of homophobia, anti-communism, and the nuclear bomb. Historian Geoffrey Smith compared the fear of radiation to the fear of communism as an unseen spectre:

[R]adiation, of course, was invisible, as concealed from the naked eye as germs and viruses, as evanescent as the ideology that […] ‘caused’ communism […]. We couldn’t see any of these things, and they might in fact get us. […] This dread of atomic radiation fused easily with the fear of communism. Both were hidden adversaries, both lethal.

American historian George Chauncey made a similar observation about gay identity in his history of New York City’s gay culture preceding the Stonewall riots in 1969: “The fact that homosexuals no longer seemed so easy to identify made them seem even more dangerous, since it meant that even the next-door neighbor could be one. The specter of the invisible homosexual, like that of the invisible communist, haunted Cold War America.” Robert D. Dean also drew a clear connection between homosexuality, communism, and invisibility:

Unmasking secret sexual behavior, thus revealing a ‘true’ but concealed identity that belied a man’s public pose of conformity to social norms, became a weapon wielded against political enemies, linked in a form and function to the unmasking of ‘secret communists’ that formed the more visible dimension of the Red Scare.

---

23 Similar books from this era include: Richard C. Robertiello’s *Voyage from Lesbos* (1959), Doris Hansen’s *Homosexuality: International Disease* (1965), Lucius B. Steiner’s *Sex Behavior of the Homosexual* (1964), and Benjamin Morse’s, *The Homosexual* (1962).
24 The women in Morse’s novel, for instance, became lesbians through compromising situations and environments. Romm’s lesbian was clinically ‘invisible’ compared to the more studied male homosexual and could thus exist outside of clinical or scientific scrutiny.
26 George Chauncey, *Gay New York: Gender, Urban Culture, and the Making of the Gay Male World, 1890-1940* (Boulder: Paradigm Publishers, 2006), 360. Kinsman and Gentile also addressed the invisibility of sexuality and how it was construed as a threat to security in their reference to Moran’s study of the portrayal of homosexuals as in Britain during the 1950s: “The very invisibility of homosexuality which, earlier, had provided some protection for homosexual men, was now taken as a danger. Moran points out that the homosexual’s ‘sexuality is produced through its invisibility’ and that this ‘invisibility becomes the sign of sexuality.’” Gary Kinsman and Patrizia Gentile, *The Canadian War on Queers: National Security as Sexual Regulation* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2010), 52.
Part One: Chapter Four

purges.\textsuperscript{27}

David K. Johnson refers to how the concealment of the American government’s homosexual purges fed the popular idea that gay men and women, “even more than Communists, were phantoms, ciphers upon whom could be projected fears about the declining state of America’s moral fibre.”\textsuperscript{28} Evident in these discussions of the Cold War threat was the pervading fear of the invisible menace. The fear of the unknown or the threat that crept through society, environment, and the body like a virus connected the individual fears of Cold War vulnerability. The psychiatric efforts to understand and treat homosexuality denoted the contemporary faith in science and medicine to expose the unseen. Indeed psychiatry was not a science, but the efforts to build the field and promote its ability to be empirically methodological echoed the contemporary sentiments about the importance of scientific objectivity in promoting social, mental, and sexual normalcy in the efforts to contain a threat and maintain safety.

Smith, Chauncey, Dean, and Johnson all draw the link between homosexuality and communism, or communism and radiation. Their discussions about homosexuality, like many within this scholarship, are limited to men and masculinity. By addressing the discussion about female homosexuality within the APA and psychiatric scholarship, or the lack thereof, this chapter expands the theoretical boundaries of the fears of imperceptible and uncontrolled ‘deviancy.’ The question of where women fit into the narrative that connects homosexuality (read, gay men) with communism is an important one. Several historians of sexuality have noted that unlike male same-sex activity, female same-sex activity has produced less historical documentation and evidence.\textsuperscript{29} This chapter maintains that the absence of women within the clinics epitomizes the contemporary concerns about the “visibility” and “invisibility” of disorder and abnormality.

\textsuperscript{27} Robert D. Dean, \textit{Imperial Brotherhood: Gender and the Making of Cold War Diplomacy} (Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 2001), 66.
\textsuperscript{29} In her study of the erotic relationships between women, \textit{Intimate Friends: Women Who Loved Women, 1778-1928} (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004), scholar Martha Vincinus addresses the complexities of conducting a historical study of same-sex love between women prior to the use of the term ‘lesbian.’ Her study, based on the coded correspondence and writings of famous women from the late eighteenth-century to the publication of Radclyffe Hall’s \textit{Well of Loneliness} in 1928, deals with the issue of historical evidence. Quite unlike the study of male same-sex relationships, whose evidence is primarily court documents detailing sexual activity, the study of female same-sex relationships is cloaked in ambiguity and is in many cases lost for its lack of concrete historical documentation.
This chapter takes a wider view of the pathologization of homosexuality during the 1950s and 1960s, extending what is primarily a Canadian study into the United States. In addition to sources from the Toronto Psychiatric Hospital’s Forensic Clinic and the *Canadian Medical Association Journal*, this chapter examines discussions within the American Psychiatric Association and NIMH about how homosexuality can or cannot be related to mental illness. While an American publication, the DSM is still relevant to the history of surveillance and containment of gays and lesbians in Canada. This is partly because of the growing relevance of the APA and the DSM in psychiatric professionalism and standardization throughout North America during the Cold War, as evident by how the TPH, while a distinctly Canadian institution, was closely tied to American psychiatry. A letter from Dr. Saul V. Levine to the Secretary of the Counsel for the Ontario Psychiatric Association indicated a link between the Canadian associations and American psychiatry. The letter, written in 1975 in response to the APA’s decision to demedicalize homosexuality, expresses annoyance at the “council’s pussy-footing and unfortunate reluctance to endorse the stance of the American Psychiatric Association on ‘Homosexuality.’” Levine referred to the numerous studies and the large body of scientific literature over the past decade from various disciplines that have “overwhelmingly pointed towards a radical change in traditional psychiatric thinking on this subject.” This evidence, he stated was enough to constitute a change in the Canadian diagnosis, noting that it would not be necessary to wait for similar research conducted by the Canadian Psychiatric Association. The letter, displaying a sense of frustration about the possible “anachronistic, tradition-bound, and irrelevant” nature of the association pointed to the trend of Canadian researchers and clinicians to watch the developments as they unfolded in the United States. The TPH Forensic Clinic had less in common with institutions in other parts of the country, such as the Allan Memorial Institute in Montreal and psychiatric institutions in Saskatchewan that, instead of confining their

---

30 Internationally the DSM roughly aligned with the World Health Organization’s *International Classification of Diseases* (ICD). This manual is revised each decade in consultation with health officials from several countries, providing a list of diseases as well as mental disorders. Kutchins and Kirk, *Making Us Crazy*, 40.
31 Dr. Saul V. Levine to Dr. John K. Clayton, 20 March 1975, Dr. R. E. Turner fonds, Box F27, File 4.15, Center for Addiction and Mental Health (CAMH) Archives. Toronto, Ontario.
32 Levine to Clayton, 20 March 1975, CAMH.
33 Levine, Ibid, CAMH.
treatments to Freudian analysis, psychopharmacology, and methods popularized by the APA, experimented with psychedelic psychiatry.\(^{34}\)

By using these combined sources this chapter examines the scope of sexual psychiatry during the Cold War. As discussed in the previous chapter, sexual psychiatry was, by the 1950s, still a relatively new field and one that had little consolidation in method and categorization. The way in which clinicians and researchers sought to define homosexuality and find the so-called solution to the problem of homosexuality in modern psychiatry pointed to a growing understanding of the complexity and diversity of sexuality. It also pointed to the continued faith in psychiatric and scientific methodology to uncover the secrets of human sexuality and psychology. This was an era when the enthusiasms and fears of the bomb itself permeated North American culture and fears of radiation governed political, social, and medical concerns. Science was powerful but it had to be controlled. In order to understand homosexuality, it too had to be controlled, only in this case through pathologization.

3. The Spectre of the Invisible Homosexual

The discussion of sexuality’s invisibility emerged in several contemporary medical and psychiatric studies of gays and lesbians. In his 1950 article in the *CMAJ*, Samuel Laycock worked to dispel the myth that homosexuals could be identified by their appearance and behaviour. He stated:

> It is commonly believed that homosexual males are feminine in their movements, have high-pitched voices, are artistic, sensitive, and emotionally unbalanced, and are interested in the more feminine occupations. Likewise, it has been thought that homosexual females are masculine in appearance and movement and are interested in more masculine occupations. While these criteria are not without foundation, they must be used with very considerable caution.\(^{35}\)

Essentially, Laycock presented homosexuality as a condition rarely visible to the naked eye. Unlike several of his contemporaries, Laycock addressed the sexual stereotypes pertaining to both genders, drawing attention to the active profiling of gay women and lesbians as well as that of gay men within society.\(^{36}\) He went on to clarify that individuals who acted like members of

---


\(^{36}\) According to Valerie Korinek’s study on *Chatelaine*, Laycock’s sensationalist article, “How to Protect your Children from Sex Deviates” in *Chatelaine*’s April 1956 issue was the first explicit reference to lesbianism in the magazine. Laycock’s use of “female homosexual” was also considered uncommon, versus the more typical “female sex deviate.” Korinek notes the ambiguity of this terminology, casting lesbians as abnormal but not overtly
the opposite sex were not necessarily homosexual and that “many homosexuals do not deviate noticeably from the norms of their own sex in either appearance or manner.” By debunking the myth that homosexuality could be identified by stereotypical traits, Laycock presented it as evasive and complex.

The NIMH Task Force on Homosexuality, established in September 1967, approached the topic of homosexuality’s visibility from a different angle. This task force set out to gain a wider understanding of homosexuality in the interest of national health. The group, made up of eleven psychologists, psychiatrists, professors, and other professionals specializing in fields such as law, anthropology, and sexology from across the United States, recognized that homosexuality was more than a medical condition. The members of the NIMH Task Force on Homosexuality included Evelyn Hooker, Chair of Psychology at the University of California in Los Angeles, and Judd Marmor, Director of Divisions of Psychiatry at Cedars-Sinai Medical Center in Los Angeles. These two clinicians proved to be essential players in the decision to declassify homosexuality as a mental disorder. The NIMH Task Force on Homosexuality addressed the problems within the medical and psychiatric nomenclature that classified homosexuality as a mental illness or disorder. In the discussions that sought to deconstruct the ways in which the so-called condition was a disorder, members of the task force focused on the similarities and differences between homosexuality and psychoneurotic disorders within the DSM, illustrating how homosexuality’s presence within the manual was inconsistent with individual behaviour and experience. The task force members recognized the social concerns of the era that contributed to the classification of homosexuality as a mental disorder, along with the psychiatric methods of medical professionals in diagnosing individuals as having sociopathic personality disturbances.

As historians George Chauncey and Daniel Hurewitz noted, Kinsey’s studies influenced a wider social and professional consideration for the spectrum of sexuality. On this spectrum was establishing them as sexual predators. Valerie Korinek, “‘Don’t Let Your Girlfriends Ruin Your Marriage’: Lesbian Imagery in Chatelaine Magazine, 1950-1969,” Journal of Canadian Studies 33, 3 (Fall 1998): 88.

37 Laycock, 247.

38 The rest of task force was comprised of the following professionals: Morris Ploscowe (Adjunct Professor of Law, New York School of Law), John Money (Associate Professor of Medical Psychology and Pediatrics, Johns Hopkins), Edward Auer (Professor of Psychiatry, St. Louis University), David L. Bazelon (Chief Judge, U.S. Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit), Clelland Ford (Professor of Anthropology, Yale), Jerome D. Frank (Professor of Psychiatry, Johns Hopkins), Paul Gebhard (Director, Institute for Sex Research, Inc., Indiana University), Seward Hiltner (Professor of Theology and Personality, Princeton Theology Seminary), and Robert Katz (Chair, Department of Human Relations, Hebrew Union College).
Chauncey’s unidentifiable gay man of the Cold War.\textsuperscript{39} Perhaps even more subtle and, for many psychiatrists, confusing, was female sexuality that was rarely included in studies about homosexuality or listed under the larger category of ‘homosexual.’\textsuperscript{40} Quite simply, the topic of female sexuality was not the primary focus of medical studies on homosexuality nor was it deemed a primary target for police surveillance within the world of Cold War politics.\textsuperscript{41} Long considered to be sexually passive, women were another type of Cold War spectre within the separate spheres of sexual psychiatry and everyday society. As historian David Halperin noted, the term ‘lesbian’ was “by far the most ancient term in our current lexicon of sexuality.”\textsuperscript{42} The term was only recently used to describe women who love women; until the early 1920s ‘lesbian’ was typically used in a heterosexual context to describe “female sexual abandon,” indicating a general disbelief among a male elite that sexuality could be present or active without men.\textsuperscript{43} Kinsey, Pomeroy, and Martin note in their 1948 study: “Although there can be no objection to designating relations between females by a special term, it should be recognized that such activities are quite the equivalent of sexual relations between males.”\textsuperscript{44} This was an unpopular opinion at the time.

The predominant focus on men in the medical discussion of homosexuality was evident in the chiefly male patient population at the TPH Forensic Clinic. According to a 1961 article in the \textit{Globe and Mail} by journalist Joan Holloban describing the TPH Forensic Clinic, thirteen percent of the patients were women.\textsuperscript{45} Little is said about these female patients in the article or in Dr. R. E. Turner’s files. Whether these female patients were at the clinic because of same-sex activity or for other reasons remains unclear. ‘Problematic’ female sexuality was defined by either too much activity, as in the case of nymphomania, or too little, as in the case of frigidity.

\textsuperscript{39} Chauncey, 360.
\textsuperscript{40} In their study of religious and cultural law against same-sex activity, Conrad and Schneider note that many of the laws were based on the importance of preserving lineage and the male role in procreation. According to their study, for the Mesopotamians, anal sex was not uncommon between men and women, and between men. But this practice was only deemed acceptable after the individuals had fulfilled their duties of procreation. Conrad and Schneider note that the Ancient Hebrews, a particularly male-dominated society, were influential in shaping western attitudes towards sex and that consequently, with the focus on men and male activity, sex between women was hardly a point of focus when dictating sexual rules or norms. This general indifference towards female sexuality evident in ancient Hebraic society persisted in several societies throughout western history. Conrad and Schneider, 172-173.
\textsuperscript{41} Kinsman and Gentile, 57.
\textsuperscript{42} David Halperin, \textit{How to do the History of Homosexuality} (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2002), 49.
\textsuperscript{43} Halperin, \textit{Ibid.}
\textsuperscript{44} Kinsey, Pomeroy, and Martin, 613.
The feminine sexual threat was arguably different from the masculine sexual threat, based more in the realm of seduction rather than violence. It is hardly facetious or hyperbole to refer to American psychiatry’s incomprehension of the existence of female sexuality. The subject of lesbianism and the problem of imperceptibility surfaced a number of times within the NIMH Task Force on Homosexuality’s analysis of psychiatric categorization within the DSM, indicating both the lacuna and the desire to uncover this elusive ‘condition.’ Marmor for instance made several observations during the discussion of etiology and nomenclature in the late 1960s, that women were able to hide their so-called sexual defect better than men. In a 1967 draft report on the “Psychodynamic Aspects of Homosexuality,” Marmor asserted women’s ability to fake being heterosexual, claiming that:

female homosexuals are ordinarily capable of having heterosexual relations even if they do not enjoy them. In contrast, the exclusively homosexual male is often faced with a psychological block which renders him totally unable to perform heterosexually. Thus he cannot conceal his ‘defect’ in an intimate relationship with the opposite sex, as can the female homosexual.

Marmor’s ignorance about women’s sexuality was evident in his confusion of sexual functionality and performance with sexual desire, keeping with the field’s focus on behaviour. He did, however, effectively cast ‘female homosexuals’ as operating invisibly, able to hide their true nature and masquerade as sexually ‘normal.’ Marmor’s analysis was typical in its portrayal of an apparent passivity found in lesbianism and female sexuality in general. His depiction of women as sexually passive was indicative of the psychiatric community’s lack of awareness of

---

46 During the Second World War, educational pamphlets distributed to Canadian soldiers explicitly identified women as the sole source of VD, stating that it was not possible to judge a woman’s health (or safety) by her appearance and that all prostitutes, including those with certificates of health, were a menace. Jackson, 60-61. An information booklet about exhibitionism issued by the Government of Ontario solidified the belief that women could not threaten people with their bodies in the same way as men. Among other acts such as streaking and males exposing themselves to other males, the booklet stated that exhibitionist acts do not include females who expose themselves. Government of Ontario, Exhibitionism, no date. Box F27, File 6.17, Dr. R. E. Turner fonds, CAMH Archives. A woman exposing herself could be an indication of mental illness; however it was not viewed as a form of sexual crime, indicating among other things the perceived vagueness of female sexuality, pointing more to the danger of her action to herself rather than to others.


female sexuality and urge. Women, even those identified by their sexual orientation, were viewed as non-sexual.

Marmor portrayed female sexuality as fluid, remarking on the tendency of some women to seek the “homosexual route” to flee from the “psychological and cultural demands of heterosexuality” or because of “reasons of unattractiveness, shyness, fears of rejection or lack of available men – they feel shut off from the heterosexual satisfactions they might otherwise prefer,” indicating women’s easy transition from one sexuality to the other. In his influential text on the Great War and culture, historian Paul Fussell stated:

After the war women dramatically outnumbered men, and a common sight in the thirties – to be seen, for some reason, especially on railway trains – was the standard middle-aged Lesbian couple in tweeds, who had come together as girls after each had lost a fiancé, lover, or husband.

Fussell’s illogical observation captures the allusion of female sexual ambivalence that was often interpreted as benign and unassuming with the discussion of female sexual desire safely out of sight. Marmor’s depiction of the fluidity or ‘make do’ component of female sexuality was not an uncommon one.

Through the late 1960s, the NIMH task force, as with other contemporary studies of sexuality, addressed the question of why there was no comprehensive psychological research on lesbian communities. Some researchers reasoned that studies on women were less prominent because of a smaller population of lesbians seeking psychological help, compared to the large number of gay men, which presented fewer options for study. The NIMH task force suggested possible studies, including a comparison of male and female homosexuality. The question remained, however, of who to study and where the researchers could find proper representation of female sexuality and lesbian communities. Hooker referred to the unwavering focus on the

---

49 Korinek observes that lesbians were typically viewed as simply lacking the desire to be with men and ultimately antosexual. Conversely gay men were viewed as hypersexual. Korinek, “‘Don’t Let Your Girlfriends Ruin Your Marriage,’” 93.

50 Marmor, “Notes on Some Psychodynamic Aspects of Homosexuality,” 56. UCLA.

51 Paul Fussell, The Great War and Modern Memory (New York: Oxford University Press, 1975), 316. Fussell’s reference to English literature of the era neither comments on the prominence of women within society nor on the tendency of women to find companionship with each other but rather the apparent loss of sexuality with the loss of men and the ways in which women ‘make do.’ As a study of culture, literature, and war based primarily on the work of male soldiers, Fussell granted more agency to male same-sex activity, or even male desire that was fostered within homo-social comradeship. Fussell, 304-306.

52 Marmor, “Notes on Some Psychodynamic Aspects,” 56-57. UCLA.

53 “Recommendations of the Task Force on Homosexuality,” no date. Box 21, Folder 1, UCLA.
Daughters of Bilitis as subjects, noting that the group, as one of the more overt lesbian societies within the United States, was exhausted and overused in studies on female homosexuality and not representative. The researchers’ difficulty in finding subjects for a study that matched that of Hooker’s earlier examination of gay men and their culture indicated the apparent elusiveness of female sexuality and lesbianism as it existed outside of the medical context.

Another concern was research methodology: how should a researcher conduct a comprehensive study of lesbian culture outside of the clinic? Marmor proposed a comprehensive study of lesbian culture in a 1968 letter to Richard Sallick. In this he stated that he had recently been approached by some “female homosexuals” whom he had “known peripherally over the years” who asked him if he would be interested in conducting a field survey of the female homosexual community like Hooker had done for the male community. Marmor asked Sallick if he thought it would be a feasible study, asserting that it was important considering the lacuna within the studies of sexuality as well as his own lack of knowledge on the subject of female homosexuality. The question of feasibility was an interesting one as Marmor combined the question of cost with the issue of gender roles and visibility within a new environment. Referring to Hooker’s earlier study on gay male culture, Marmor noted that she “in her capacity as a woman” did not have to pay at the gay bars where she conducted her studies. Although he conveyed his apprehension at making the project “ambitious” on account of the potential costs, Marmor asked if there would be funding available for him to pay for drinks at female establishments, a role he believed he would be expected to take considering his gender. While Hooker researched gay men in the 1950s and was comfortable within their community, male researchers were hesitant to conduct a similar study within a lesbian community. Although

54 The Daughters of Bilitis, founded in 1955, was the first American organization for lesbian civil and political rights. Marcia M. Gallo, *Different Daughters: A History of the Daughters of Bilitis and the Rise of the Lesbian Rights Movement* (New York: Carroll & Graf Publishers, 2006), xx. This period also witnessed the formation of the homophile organization the Mattachine Society in 1950, devoted to the improvement of rights for gay men. It is important to note that the 1950s and 1960s were not simply a period of negativity for gays and lesbians and queer communities. The duality of the era extended beyond the mixed diagnosis and prescription for what was ‘wrong’ with homosexuality – either as amoral, criminal, or illness. Gays and lesbians formed and maintained strong networks and communities during the 1950s and applied new means of expressing their sexuality socially, culturally, and politically.

55 “NIMH Task Force on Homosexuality” transcript of meeting, no date, 23. Box 1, Folder 3, ONE National Gay and Lesbian Archives, Los Angeles, California.


57 Letter from Marmor to Richard Sallick, 1 February 1968. Ibid. ONE Archives.

58 Letter from Marmor, Ibid. ONE Archives.
female clinicians like Romm conducted research on lesbian patients, few female scientists could
risk such a study within queer communities.

Mary Louise Adams’s article “Margin Notes: Reading Lesbianism as Obscenity in a Cold
War Courtroom,” details the relatively rare public discussion of female sexuality in a Canadian
trial for obscene literature during the early 1950s. According to the article, the trial provided “a
unique and relatively lengthy consideration of female homosexuality, a topic that, in the 1940s
and 1950s, rarely made it into public discourse.”59 The discussion of lesbianism at the trial in
1952 was uncommon for two reasons. First of all homosexuality was new to public discourse in
the postwar era. While Kinsey’s study of male sexuality was recently published in 1948, the
subject of homosexuality seldom made headlines or was publicly discussed prior to this period.60
Kinsey’s second study, to be published in 1953, was unprecedented for its open discussion of
female sexuality, a subject that was equally uncommon in public discussion and which remained
elusive even within the medical world.61 Secondly, the acknowledgement that “some
homosexual ‘perverts’ were actually women” was virtually unheard of in the early 1950s.62
Female sexual activity, imperative to population growth, was rarely discussed, never mind in
terms of desire or same-sex activity. With few clinical studies on lesbianism and female
sexuality, the topic of female same-sex activity remained a scarcely articulated but persistently
perceived threat to the health of the nation throughout the Cold War.63 The medical portrayal of
lesbianism and female sexuality was strikingly similar to that of Cold War threats: they were
difficult to detect and the belief was that they were easily contracted.64 The fear that gay women

59 Mary Louise Adams, “Margin Notes: Reading Lesbianism as Obscenity in a Cold War Courtroom,” in Love,
Hate, and Fear in Canada’s Cold War, ed. Richard Cavell (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2004), 136.
60 According to Ian Young, the gay magazines during this era had a small readership and gay themes seldom made it
to radio or film. Gay novels, therefore “provided just about the only public information on homosexuality apart from
the sensationalist newspaper accounts of prosecutions and scandals.” Ian Young, Out in Paperback: A Visual
61 Unlike the study of male sexual behaviour, which in some cases referred to female behaviour by way of
comparison, Kinsey et al.’s text on female sexual behaviour was contextualized by marriage. In the 1953 text, female
sexual behaviour was classified in terms of pre-marital, marital, and extra-marital status. Despite acknowledgment
of the existence of female sexuality, therefore, the studies were based on the contemporary social and cultural
context of female sexual activity.
63 Korinek’s studies of Chatelaine Magazine in the postwar era addresses the contemporary concerns for female
sexuality, although she also notes that the magazine, which was typically known for its traditional view of women,
did in fact offer a more nuanced view of female sexuality and lesbianism.
64 Marmor, “Notes on Some Psychodynamic Aspects,” 55-56. UCLA.
and lesbians would target and corrupt heterosexual women played to the panic surrounding morality, sexual and gender normalcy, and the climate of contagious threats.\textsuperscript{65}

Because of its inability to be visually identified and its perceived subversive nature, homosexuality was feared in a climate that stressed sexual and gender normalcy. As Adams wrote, in the era of the Gouzenko Affair and communist spy rings in North America, homosexuality was perceived as undermining the “homogenization that was seen to be central to Canada’s strength as a nation.”\textsuperscript{66} According to her studies on Cold War sexuality, the perceived strength of the nation lay within the confines of heterosexual normalcy and the nuclear family. This prominent view of the era focused on the role of women as mothers, implying a form of confined heterosexuality that did not extend beyond married family life. Female sexuality that went beyond this restricted area was considered deviant and threatening. More than this, female sexuality was difficult to define and identify in a society that in many ways denied its existence, as was discussed in Romm’s 1965 article.

This concern about sexual invisibility, particularly in the case of female sexuality and lesbianism, was found in two particular forms. As the classification of sexuality shifted between action and intent, clinicians and researchers addressed the lack of physical identifiers of human sexuality. Regardless of this categorization, the concern for invisible sexual ‘abnormality’ persisted in medical literature during the 1950s and 1960s. The changing understanding of female sexuality and the growing awareness of a lack of information on women and lesbianism within the study of sexuality also indicated concerns about the pervasiveness of an imperceptible sexual ‘abnormality.’\textsuperscript{67} One of the more infamous examples of Canada’s Cold War targeting of homosexuality was the ‘fruit machine,’ a device through which scientists sought to properly identify homosexuality in civil servants. The device was developed at Carleton University in 1961 and measured pupillary responses, among others, to religious, artistic, and pornographic images. As Kinsman wrote in \textit{The Regulation of Desire}:

\begin{quote}
During the 1960s there was an attempt to develop a more efficient and ‘scientific’ way of detecting lesbians and gay men which came to be known as the ‘fruit machine.’ This was both a continuation of and a shifting of earlier psychiatric and psychological practices for ‘detecting’ homosexuals or ‘sex deviates’ which had been institutionalized in the military in detection and disposal strategies for
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{65} This was a typical theme in contemporary lesbian pulp novels during the 1950s and 1960s that equated lesbianism to deviancy. Jaye Zimet, \textit{Strange Sisters: The Art of Lesbian Pulp Fiction, 1949-1969} (Viking Press, 1999), 24.
\textsuperscript{66} Adams, “Margin Notes,” 138.
‘psychopathic personalities with abnormal sexualities.’ The fruit machine, therefore, was one of the Cold War’s disturbing efforts to quickly identify an invisible threat. The very invention of the device exemplified the Cold War value and faith in technology and detection, combining the history of profiling a threat, in this case homosexuality, with the history of technology and labour-saving devices. The fruit machine was fundamentally flawed in its mechanism, for instance interpreting pupillary responses only in terms of desire and not as a physiological response to changing levels of light from the slides shown in quick succession to the subjects of the experiment. Its invention, however, pointed to the perceived need to have a Geiger Counter-like device to identify the hidden menace of homosexuality. The instability of the Cold War era was captured in the fear of the invisible and the equally strong desire to detect, identify, and demystify the unseen.

The connection between sexuality and the invisible threat indicated the connection between politics, sexuality, and science. Despite the concerns about female sexuality, there was a general lack of understanding. This incomprehension contributed even more to the feared element of invisibility associated with lesbianism in an age that glorified the ideal mother and wife, and condemned those who were anything different. Assumptions of normalcy confined women within psychiatric rhetoric and definition as sexually passive. Medicalized homosexuality was limited to the patients within the clinic demonstrating an assumed connection between same-sex activity and anxiety.

4. Invisible Threat of Mental Illness

The Cold War enthusiasm for medicine and science was in part fed by constant assertions of advancement, progress, and improved treatment of patients in modern medical practice. This was evident in the belief that psychiatry in 1952 was more humane than earlier methods of treating those suffering from mental disorders and illnesses. Indeed by the time the APA published its first edition of the DSM in 1952, the fields of medicine and psychiatry had progressed well beyond the ‘great confinement’ of the mid-seventeenth century. This development was not altogether surprising given the significant period of time between the two eras; however the consistent assurance of ‘humane’ treatment in the mid-twentieth century

69 Frances Reilly, “The Consumption of Science and Technology: Canadian Atomic Culture during the Cold War” Master of Arts Thesis (Edmonton, University of Alberta, 2008), 58-60.
pointed to a skewed understanding of compassionate patient management. The history of health and medicine can easily fall prey to the tendencies of teleology and Whig history that presents the past as a series of progressive advancements leading to the present, a period of unprecedented achievements.\textsuperscript{70} To adopt this view would be to ignore the rippling patterns of the past and to remain otherwise uncritical of the present condition. Medical practice has indeed improved over the centuries in terms of the treatments available, but it has not experienced a consistently upward progression. Rather, as methodologies have become more elaborate with the improvement of technology, the understanding of illness, disease, and disorder has become multi-layered. This intricacy within the history of medicine was evident in the classification and declassification of homosexuality as a mental illness. Despite the increased pathologization of ‘deviant’ sexuality in the 1950s, there was a lack of clarity in the definition of both homosexuality and mental illness.

Twentieth-century sexual psychiatry promoted the teleological view that medicine was endlessly progressing. As sexuality became medicalized in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries, the process of pathologization was accompanied by the understanding that through pathology the patients who were previously defined solely as criminals were now observed with a sense of enthusiastic benevolence. Beginning in the mid-nineteenth century, there was a growing understanding that acts of sexual deviancy should be treated and ‘cured’ rather than punished.\textsuperscript{71} Treatments and ideas for treatment varied, resulting from an environment that depended on the medical classification of normalcy and a faith in modern medicine and technology to cure abnormality.\textsuperscript{72} This patronizing perspective ignored the methods with which patients were to be ‘cured,’\textsuperscript{73} and the reality that many individuals were still viewed as criminal for same-sex activity.\textsuperscript{74} To be classified as ‘sick’ in an era that glorified normalcy and health was to be socially, medically, and biologically inferior.

\textsuperscript{71} The history of shock therapy goes back to ancient Rome. Aside from various experiments on electricity beginning in the eighteenth century, electroconvulsive therapy was reintroduced into medical and psychiatric practice by Ugo Cerletti in Rome, April 1938. Edward Shorter, \textit{A History of Psychiatry: From the Era of the Asylum to the Age of Prozac} (Toronto: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 1997), 218.
\textsuperscript{73} These included aversion therapy, electric shock therapy, hallucinogenic drugs, among other treatments. Kutchins and Kirk, \textit{Making Us Crazy}, DSM, 59.
\textsuperscript{74} Or, as Kinsman and Gentile point out, the RCMP systematically targeted gay men and women.
Faith in medical technology was evident in the enthusiasm that continued into the mid-twentieth century, and saw the medical treatment of sexual ‘deviants’ as more humane than imprisonment. As historians Herb Kutchins and Stuart Kirk noted, the medical treatment for homosexuality was a source of difficulty and pain for individuals since it was first categorized as medically abnormal in the nineteenth century. Treatment involved several types of interventions, including surgical, chemical, and psychological procedures, among others. In addition to psychoanalysis, treatments of homosexuality included physical methods such as hormone therapy, electric shock and drugs for aversive conditioning, electroshock therapy, lobotomy, and ‘therapeutic castration.’ The medical assertion that homosexuality needed to be cured contradicted Freud’s recommendation that physicians abstain from trying to ‘fix’ homosexuality, which at its very root was ironic considering the majority of psychiatrists and psychoanalysts at the APA who supported the medicalization of homosexuality in the early 1970s were self-identified Freudians. Freud apparently held an ‘equivocal position’ on homosexuality’s status as a disease, an idea that was supplanted by a growing consensus in American psychiatry that the condition was a serious psychopathy that produced anguish and unhappiness. His position on homosexuality was particularly evident in the widely published “Letter to an American Mother” from 1935 where he responded to a woman’s concerns about her son’s homosexuality. Freud wrote: “Homosexuality is assuredly no advantage, but it is nothing to be ashamed of, no vice, no degradation, it cannot be classified as an illness; we consider it to be a variation of the sexual function produced by a certain arrest of sexual development.” Freud classified same-sex activity as sexual immaturity and noted that psychiatrists could neither promise a cure nor could

---

75 This would include surgeries of the sexual organs such as castration, vasectomy, clitoridectomy, sterilization, or hysterectomy, along with lobotomies. Kutchins and Kirk, *Making Us Crazy*, 59.

76 Chemical intervention included both hormonal and drug treatments, such as sexual stimulants or sexual depressants, hormone injection (such as estrogen, testosterone, pregnant mare serum, desiccated thyroid, or pranturon), pharmacological shock, or LSD. Ibid.

77 Psychological intervention was diverse in its methodology including encouraging abstinence, as well as therapies such as adjustment therapy, psychoanalysis, hypnosis, aversion therapy (influenced by hypnosis, shock, emetic, and desensitization methods – one of the stranger methods being covert sensitization where the patient would be encouraged to imagine pictures of homosexuals and vomiting on them), group therapy, primal therapy, and desensitization using pornographic materials. Ibid.

78 These procedures could include electroshock therapy, anaphrodisiac (cold sitz baths), and “Homo-Anonymous,” a therapy group patterned after Alcoholics-Anonymous. Ibid.


80 Conrad and Schneider, *Deviance and Medicalization*, 187.

they predict the result of treatment. In spite of this, both psychoanalysis and physical attempts to cure homosexuality have marked the period of homosexuality’s medicalization throughout the late-nineteenth century and into the mid-twentieth century.

The importance of finding, classifying, and studying sexual ‘abnormalities’ was especially significant in an age defined by technological development and medicalization. The APA’s DSM, for instance, captured the era’s assumption that study of the invisible, in this case mental illness, was increasingly possible thanks to modern psychiatric techniques. Central to the study of sexual psychiatry during the 1950s and 1960s was the idea that because of contemporary technological and scientific developments, the classification of ‘abnormalities’ was no longer defined by moral judgement and law but through an objective scientific view of the natural world.

The ‘invention’ of homosexuality as pathology in the late-nineteenth century influenced the classification of the so-called condition as a mental illness in the mid- to late-twentieth century. Once established as a medical condition, homosexuality metamorphosed into a state defined less by action than by character and mentality. As scholars Peter Conrad and Joseph Schneider wrote in 1980, the diagnosis that came from this invention “gave support to the notion that these names [homosexuality] represent a disease entity, a ‘thing’ people can ‘have’ or ‘get.’” The DSM, while at first a manual limited to institutional psychiatric practice within the United States, reflected the growing power of medical nomenclature within society. Homosexuality played an important role in the history of the DSM’s classification and nomenclature. Included in the first edition of the DSM in 1952, only to be removed in 1974, homosexuality was the first listed ‘condition’ in the manual to include a concrete definition of mental illness and the first to be officially declassified. The significance of this transition was both medical and societal. Public debates in the United States over the classification of homosexuality as a mental disorder began in 1970 and continued for the next three years. What started as a protest led by gay and lesbian activists at an APA annual general meeting was later taken up by psychiatrists and medical professionals who, for a mixture of personal and methodological reasons, disagreed with the manual’s method of medical classification.

---

83 Conrad and Schneider, 183-184.
84 The process of the de-medicalization of homosexuality is discussed in more detail in Chapter Seven.
The first edition of the DSM in 1952 categorized homosexuality under “Sociopathic Personality Disturbance” under the larger category of “Psychoneurotic Disorders,” as a “Sexual Deviation.”85 In 1968, following discussions between Chair Dr. Robert Spitzer (1932-2015), researchers on sexuality, and sexual activists, homosexuality was again listed under “Sexual Deviations,” only this time officially as “Sexual Orientation Disturbance” in the newly published DSM-II.86 Within this manual there was a separate diagnosis of homosexuality, which was listed as the first of ten sexual deviations that were also carried over from the first edition of the DSM. The new edition offered no new description of homosexuality; it only offered a new category.

Regardless of the alteration in 1968, the so-called condition was still identified as ‘homosexuality’ in the manual. The official change in nomenclature was accompanied by a brief explanation stating that homosexuality was not, by definition, a mental illness.87 The DSM likely included this clarification to acknowledge the growing etiological turmoil existing within the APA in 1968, which eventually contributed to the 1970s DSM debates. The DSM stated that the term ‘Sexual Deviations’ was inconsistent “with the change in thinking” that led to the substitution of Sexual Orientation Disorder for “Homosexuality.” As there were no specific recommendations made for changing the category or definition, “Homosexuality” stayed in the DSM for the time being.88 The reference to the unstable categorization of homosexuality within the manual indicated the mixed opinion about conflating the nomenclature for sexuality with a mental illness within the APA. Despite this development, homosexuality was not officially removed from the DSM until 1974. This did not end the controversy. Replacing homosexuality was “Ego-dystonic Homosexuality,” a condition pathologizing homosexual individuals who were dissatisfied with their sexuality. Through this condition researchers and clinicians focused

---

85 Sociopathic Personality Disturbance was described in the DSM as a condition suffered by individuals who were “ill primarily in terms of society and of conformity with the prevailing cultural milieu, and not only in terms of personal discomfort and relations with other individuals” while also suffering from severe underlying personality disorders. DSM, 1952, 38. Psychoneurotic Disorders were defined as those of “psychogenic origin or without clearly defined tangible cause or structural change,” such as a brain disorder from physical trauma. American Psychiatric Association, Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (Washington, D.C.: American Psychiatric Association,1952), 7. Listed under “Sexual Deviation,” homosexuality was, like conditions such as “Antisocial reaction,” “Dysocial reaction,” alcoholism, and drug addiction, listed under “Sociopathic Disturbance.”

86 With its questionable acronym, Sexual Orientation Disorder (SOD) was listed as the first of nine conditions including: Fetishism, Pedophilia, Transvestitism, Exhibitionism, Voyeurism, Masochism, “Other Sexual Deviation,” and “Unspecified Sexual Deviation.” The conditions were listed on a sliding scale from the mild (Voyeurism) to the severe (Pedophilia).

87 This will be discussed in more detail in Chapter Seven.

on sexual anxiety as a symptom rather than orientation. For a time in the 1980s, the DSM-III medicalized the individual’s distress over homosexuality, essentially defining homosexuality as anxiety.\footnote{This condition will be discussed in more detail in Chapter Seven.}

In addition to the changing status of homosexuality in the DSM, and its unprecedented removal from the manual, was the vague definition of mental illness. The first edition of the manual in 1952 contained no working definition of mental illness, although the DSM’s description of Sexual Deviations was “in fact one of the rare occasions where the editors hinted at a definition of mental disorder.”\footnote{DeBlock and Adriaens, 286.} The initial inclusion of homosexuality in the DSM officially established it as a medical condition, a disease, and an abnormality. A process of social ‘othering’ that was previously dominated by religion and law was articulated by modern psychiatry and medicine during the early Cold War. While homosexuality was officially removed from the DSM, there remained a continued focus on diagnosing perceived abnormalities in the manual. The DSM-III mushroomed in size and in detail.\footnote{The first two editions of the DSM in 1952 and 1968 were just over 130 pages each. The 1980 edition of the manual was nearly 500 pages in length with 265 diagnoses. Hannah Decker, \textit{The Making of DSM-III: A Diagnostic Manual’s Conquest of American Psychiatry} (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013), xvii.} With the publication of the DSM-III, the APA viewed their manual as a medical guide to be used by clinicians and researchers globally, in public institutions and private practice. Through this significant series of changes, the classification of homosexuality shifted considerably. This expansion has continued into the twenty-first century with the DSM-V, published in the spring of 2013, listing over 300 conditions in 947 pages, a significant development from the first edition of the DSM’s 106 listed disorders in 130 pages. Listing conditions such as ‘Disruptive Mood Dysregulation Disorder,’ a medicalization of toddler temper tantrums, and ‘Minor Neurocognitive Disorder,’ a medical term for geriatric forgetfulness,\footnote{While some conditions like the former can be treated with medication, others, such as the latter, have merely become medically identifiable.} the DSM-V is a manual that continues to focus on defining and diagnosing normalcy.

5. Conclusion

Evident in the vetting of communism and homosexuality was an overwhelming fear of dissidence. The fear of the invisible or covert threat, from communist espionage, gays and lesbians who defied stereotypical identifiers, and mental illness, spoke of a larger fear of social
upheaval. The desire for control was evident in the urge to properly identify homosexuality through accepted codes of gender normalcy. Throughout the Cold War, beginning in the early 1950s into the early 1980s, homosexuality was essentially diagnosed in terms of anxiety. The visibility of homosexuality, evident especially with the predominantly male population who sought psychiatric help at institutions such as the TPH Forensic Clinic for their homosexuality, skewed both the understanding of homosexuality as a male condition and as pathology. Consequently, those individuals who did not conform to the medical and social stereotypes of homosexuality denied detection. In this way, the DSM illuminated the spectre of invisible sexuality moving beyond the pathologization of sexual activity, which in many ways mirrored previous forms of condemnation through religious morality and criminal law. Through modern psychiatry homosexuality could be controlled through the medicalization of desire. This form of power over the individual was, as will be discussed in the next few chapters, controlled through surveillance.

The clinical classification of homosexuality as a mental disorder was not only part of the larger Cold War fear of the ‘other’ and abnormality, but of hidden threats in a war fuelled by espionage and concerns about nuclear radiation. In the case of homosexuality and sexual ‘deviancy,’ the Cold War fears of invisible or covert threats and contagions were coupled with the contemporary enthusiasms for the unprecedented powers of science and medicine to detect and uncover ‘abnormalities.’ Historian Gerald Grob demonstrated how the hopes of gaining power through psychiatric classification was part of a larger desire for power through knowledge: “The search for a definitive nosology, therefore, may simply be an expression of the perennial human yearning for omniscience – an attribute eagerly sought by many but never found.”93 This tireless enthusiasm, combined with an overwhelming focus on sexual, gender, and political normalcy, also fed the fear that what appeared to be ‘normal’ could in fact be something much more insidious.

---

PART TWO:
Surveillance
CHAPTER FIVE From Dale of the Mounted to the Crash Plan: The RCMP and the Technology of Cold War Spying

1. Introduction

[The atom] was one of the most marvelous finds of mankind. It had a potential that served a double purpose, in that it could be used for many peaceful pursuits or be flung into a war that could only mean the utter destruction of every living thing on the face of the globe. It was both a boon and a terror.¹

So is young Constable Dale Thompson’s realization in the 1959 children’s book Dale of the Mounted: Atomic Plot. The book, one of several in a series by Canadian Joe Holliday, was about a crime-solving RCMP officer who thwarted planned sabotage at the nuclear facility in Chalk River, Ontario. In the book Dale saves the reactor, a visiting Pakistani scientist, and Canadian-Pakistani relations from radical Indian nationals, all the while learning about the basics of atomic energy and nuclear science. His reflection on the atom as “a boon and a terror” captured the mixed enthusiasm and anxiety about science that was Cold War atomic culture. Dale learns that while nuclear science can indeed be dangerous, it is only the humans who use it that are either good or evil. Atomic Plot concludes that although science could be politicized, or used as a political tool, it was ultimately an objective force.

Atomic Plot is important to this dissertation for two reasons. First, it displayed the contemporary atomic culture in Canada in a way that was uncommon in other contemporary books and is lacking in studies about Cold War Canada. This cultural source is important to a study of Cold War threats because of its prevalent discussion of nuclear science and weaponry as it related to Canadian society. Second, this book and another from the Dale of the Mounted series – DEW Line Duty – effectively articulated the Cold War threat in terms of its visibility and invisibility. The identification of the Cold War threat as described in Holliday’s two books relates to this dissertation both in terms of the infiltrating danger, through radiation and espionage, and the ease of determining the threat to national security. The description of radiation in Atomic Plot as an infiltrating force reflects contemporary ideas of danger. Both books feature dangerous visitors to Canada that were racially and ethnically different from Anglo-Celtic Canadians. Unlike this simple portrayal of threats, Operation Profunc faced a far more confusing ‘enemy.’ This children’s series also offers counterpoint to the reality of RCMP

¹ Joe Holliday, Dale of the Mounted: Atomic Plot (Toronto: Thomas Allen, Ltd., 1959), 156.
surveillance in Operation Profunc. Dale was an overt and positive presentation of the Canadian cultural icon of the Mountie, while Operation Profunc’s Mountie was covert and less heroic.

The discussion of nuclear research in *Atomic Plot* and its positive and negative properties provided a surprising level of nuance regarding atomic energy for a 1950s children’s book. It also offered interesting parallels with the advantages and disadvantages of international relations in this era. While working as a bodyguard for the visiting scientist Doctor Rami, Dale learns about radioactive waste:

Dale gathered that the biggest headache for atomic scientists was how to get rid of deadly radioactive leftovers in liquids, solids, gases and vapors. It was silent, could not be smelled, touched or tasted. Everything that this waste came in touch with was contaminated. Wastes could not be thrown away because of this danger.²

Dale discovers that the underlying danger of nuclear science is radioactive contamination and its imperceptibility. The threat of a silent danger was at the centre of this adventure along with radiation and police surveillance. The story had a pervading sense of innocence and optimism about nuclear energy, evident in Holliday’s dedication to “those workers at Chalk River, Ontario, who are putting the mighty atom to work for peaceful uses on behalf of mankind – and a better world.”³ Still, *Atomic Plot* captured the era’s concerns about infiltration and invisible poisons, which threatened the safety of Canadian society, environment, and sovereignty. This was unlike other contemporary children’s books on atomic energy, such as the 1956 Walt Disney-sponsored *Our Friend the Atom*. Through this book, and its accompanying cartoon, Disney sought to present the atom for the American public through the genre of “science factual,” as opposed to “science fiction.”⁴ While engaging, and definitely informative for the child fascinated with science, *Our Friend the Atom* took an arguably less critical view of the future. The book, for instance, does not include a description of the dangers of radiation and related sicknesses. Instead *Our Friend the Atom* presents the splitting of the atom as part of the teleological process of science beginning with the Ancient Greeks.⁵ Dangers associated with nuclear energy barely make their way into Disney’s production.

---

By contrast, Holliday’s adventure book is full of danger. In addition to presenting the science behind the reactor, *Atomic Plot* maintained its role as a children’s adventure book during the 1950s. In an era of increased postwar immigration, *Atomic Plot* portrayed the mixed fascination with and fear of non-Anglo-Celtic groups – mirroring the divisive cultural impressions of nuclear science during the 1950s. In Dale’s adventure at Chalk River, Pakistani and Indian scientists were the ‘other.’ Like nuclear science, their danger was defined by politics and action; the ‘good’ ones supported a scientific and technological relationship with Canada while the ‘bad’ ones violently disputed this relationship on the basis of radical and fanatic politics. In this book, as with others in the series, the danger of the ‘other’ lay not solely within the different cultures, which were at times viewed as exotic curiosities. Rather, the danger lay in the misleading sense of innocence, epitomized by characters posing as something that they were not.

That Constable Dale Thompson was an RCMP officer is not the sole reason for including Holliday’s books as cultural sources in this chapter that addresses the scope and mechanisms of police surveillance through Operation Profunc. In *Atomic Plot* both radiation and the Indian spies working against the visiting scientist epitomized the force and danger behind the hidden threat, demonstrating the inherent similarities between the dangers of foreign infiltration and nuclear radiation. Throughout the 1950s into the 1970s the RCMP struggled to keep up with threats to national security that seemed to be increasingly pervasive and difficult to define. The fear of the collective and of the radical left manipulated the RCMP focus. While casting a wide net to include all manners of leftist ideology, the definition of threat, as articulated by Operation Profunc, was limited. In the struggle to identify the threat to national security, it was identified as an elusive force defined by ideology rather than action. This was evident in three particular methods of surveillance and focus from the 1950s to the 1980s. First, the RCMP established the “Crash Plan” in 1957 to identify the more dangerous individuals under surveillance and to allow

---

6 A 1952 ad in the *Globe and Mail* proclaimed that 12,000 copies of the Dale of the Mounted books had been sold in Canada. *The Globe and Mail* (1 November 1952).
7 Holliday, *Atomic Plot*, 12-13. France Iacovetta addresses the conflicting attitudes towards assimilation and multiculturalism in her book on postwar immigration, *Gatekeepers*. She notes that while there was a genuine interest among Anglo-Celtic Canadians for the cultural traditions and ethnic foods of the newcomers, greater was the effort to assimilate them into Canadian society. France Iacovetta, *Gatekeepers: Reshaping Immigrant Lives in Cold War Canada* (Toronto: Between the Lines, 2006), 30-31.
for a more efficient process of containment in the event of a national emergency, such as a Communist-led attack on Canada. Second, the use of RCMP informants exemplified the elusiveness of the Cold War threat to national security and the manner of surveilling perceived enemies of the state, thus inverting the role of infiltration from suspects to police. And finally, following the October Crisis in 1970, the creation of the Special Identification Program illustrated the dangerous limitations of RCMP surveillance and identification of the enemy.

2. Method: Surveillance

To study the construction and maintenance of Cold War threats is to study surveillance and deconstruct the gaze and the power gained through it. Part Two of this dissertation examines the gaze and control over the subject of surveillance in two contexts: the police gaze of the civilian, evident in RCMP surveillance of “prominent functionaries,” and the medical gaze of the patient, evident in the psychiatric surveillance of “sexual deviancy.” Present in both of these contexts was the expectation of threat and preparation for disaster. In terms of Operation Profunc, disaster was defined as espionage leading to potential Communist attack on Canada. In terms of sexual psychiatry the threat in question was mental illness, sexual disorder, and the havoc they could wreak on society. Both threats were defined by their potentiality and how their damage could be inflicted on the nation or on the individual.

Operation Profunc was a significant chapter in the history of Canadian surveillance. The project sat at a central point in the development of a new and modern Canadian security system following several decades of RCMP spying and categorization of radical civilians and organizations. During the Cold War, the Canadian security system moved from a police-based operation, the RCMP through the 1950s, 1960s, and 1970s, to the civilian-based agency, Canadian Security Intelligence Service (CSIS) in 1984. Operation Profunc’s life span covered this period, ending in 1983. By its end, Profunc was deemed inept and organizers desired a better way of monitoring persons of interest.9 Profunc documents stressed the importance of maintaining consistent surveillance over prominent functionaries, including being continually aware of residences and places of work.10 Operation Profunc was also difficult to maintain – the focus was limited to communism, while the definition of communism was too broad, resulting in a shortsighted but heavily operated project. One 1965 report on the apprehension plan for ‘E’

Division, while undeniably positive about the expected success of this project, recognized its possible limitations:

From the outset we will not have sufficient manpower to concurrently and effectively give individual attention to all these commitments, however, we can by a swift and efficient programme in this regard achieve our same purpose by removing the onerous and immediate needs of other projects.\textsuperscript{11}

The report went on to note that:

In the initial stages of an emergency some time will elapse prior to the bulk of our manpower being required for regular but expanded police duties, i.e. traffic control, anti-riot patrols, etc., it is before and during this build-up of regular responsibilities that, if not all, many apprehensions can be made. As members discharge their assignments under this plan, i.e. arrests, incarceration, search and seizures, they will be immediately released for regular police duty.\textsuperscript{12}

It is important to note that this report, addressing the weaknesses of Operation Profunc, was written about thirteen years after the program’s conception, showing a degree of self-consciousness about its limitations.

As with the previous chapters on Operation Profunc, this is a cultural and textual study of the history of surveillance. This approach is necessary, especially when considering documents that are censored. An analysis of what is missing from the documents is as important as an analysis of what is available. This is also a cultural study of Canada’s Cold War. The importance of a children’s series such as \textit{Dale of the Mounted} should not be lost amid official records of police surveillance, documentation, and policy. Holliday’s Dale was a positive and sympathetic portrayal of the Canadian Mountie and RCMP surveillance. It played to the popular image of the Mountie, for children and adults alike, as a ‘helping hand.’ \textit{Dale of the Mounted} also provides an important resource to the study of Canadian Cold War culture for another reason. Holliday’s 1957 \textit{DEW Line Duty} and 1959 \textit{Atomic Plot} distilled for children, specifically boys, the underlying concerns for security and safety during the Cold War. Dale is also a uniquely Canadian hero in a period when ‘atomic culture’ crept in from the United States in the form of comic books, Hollywood films, and pulp novels. At this time Canadian children’s libraries were primarily comprised of British and American literature. In each book of Holliday’s unquestionably Canadian series, the intrepid constable visits a different Canadian region, experiencing and learning about Canada’s industrial diversity. The books celebrate technological


\textsuperscript{12} “Top Secret ‘E’ Division Apprehension Plan,” 1965. Ibid., LAC.
modernity and relish the force of Canadian security through the young Mountie’s adventures in a period of increasingly complex threats. Through these books Holliday worked to portray Canada as a nation that had moved beyond its hinterland stereotype and become one that participated in international and scientific developments. The book’s adventures were based on contemporary events in Canada and the Cold War such as scientific developments at Chalk River and postwar immigration.13

As mentioned earlier, Canadian atomic culture and Canadian anti-communism has often been overlooked in the face of the more prominent and theatrical American versions. Yet Canadian cultural products existed. Hugh MacLennan’s *The Watch that Ends the Night*, for instance, was another prime cultural example of contemporary anxiety in Canada. The book, winner of the Governor General’s Award in 1959, is an artefact of this era of Canadian culture. MacLennan’s epic novel of romance and politics captured the experience of the generation of Canadians who survived the Great Depression and then struggled to fit into the domesticity of the 1950s. Unlike *Atomic Plot*, *The Watch that Ends the Night* contains few references to atomic science and the “boon and terror” of the atomic age. It does, however, clearly reflect the era’s anxiety. The book follows the saga of a love-triangle between George, a CBC reporter and McGill professor, Jerome, a surgeon and communist, and Catherine, a beautiful but invalid painter who suffers from a rheumatic heart. The story begins with George walking home from work on a winter’s night, contemplating the evening ahead with his family:

I wanted no crisis. For years Catherine and Sally and I had lived knowing that at any instant Catherine might collapse with her face twisting up and her insides writhing and that I would have to rush to the phone for the doctor, then the ambulance would come and there would be the pain, misery and shame of a fearful illness, and possibly even death. I wanted no external crisis to disturb the calm spells.14

Amid the otherwise calm and ordered domestic life that Catherine, George, and their daughter Sally share, Catherine’s illness holds her and her family hostage. George, in many ways an autobiographical character, is ever prepared for eventual disaster. In addition to reflecting the personal experience of MacLennan’s struggles with his wife who suffered from a rheumatic heart, Catherine’s condition captures the Cold War culture of fear and the overwhelming concern

---

13 The level of Holliday’s research on Chalk River was evident in his inclusion of actual scientists such as McGill professor, Dr. David Arnold Keys, into his book. Holliday, *Atomic Plot*, 66.
of disorder lurking beneath the seemingly ordered setting of domesticity and affluence. This sense of unease is also symbolized by Jerome who, by returning to Canada, reminds the characters of the 1930s, communism, and their past.

Holliday’s children’s books and MacLennan’s novel are not the same as the official documentation of police surveillance in the available Operation Profunc records. They are nevertheless significant in their portrayal of the deeper sense of unease that existed within Canada at the time. While these books articulate the civilian discomfort during the Cold War, Operation Profunc’s documents present the RCMP’s discomfort in managing and preparing for disaster.

RCMP surveillance tactics of the Cold War were the result of only a few decades of spying on subversives. In the decades following the First World War the RCMP developed a system of monitoring suspected individuals and gathering evidence of their activities. The surveillance process was achieved generally through means of monitoring personal communication, which included opening mail, tapping telephones, and planting listening devices in public and residential spaces. While technically legal police procedures under Section 39 of the DOCR, these methods of surveillance often involved illegal activities, such as breaking into private residences. Phone tapping went back to the 1930s and was equally controversial, as was the planting of listening devices. These methods of surveillance originated with the 1914 War Measures Act and the DOCR. The laws that allowed for these activities, such as accessing personal mail in 1954, were also met with conflict.

By the Cold War, RCMP observation was no longer the secret that it was during the First World War and many individuals were aware they were subjects of surveillance. As historian Julie Guard noted in her research on the Housewives’ Consumer Association (HCA), this was not necessarily a failure of the surveillance program. Guard noted that this knowledge of surveillance and targeting proved to be destructive to associations such as the HCA. Ridiculous

15 CATHEDRAL was code name for the best known surveillance program for gaining access to personal information and it operated on three levels: A) checking the name and address of personal mail; B) examining the exterior and photographing it; and C) opening the letter or envelope and examining the contents. Steve Hewitt, Spying 101: The RCMP’s Secret Activities at Canadian Universities, 1917-1997 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2002), 31.

16 This form of surveillance became even more problematic when the DOCR expired in 1954 and the RCMP continued these actions despite no longer having the legal authority to do so. Hewitt, Spying 101, Ibid.

claims tying the Housewives to a ‘Red Fifth Column,’ for instance, damaged their credibility on a political level, discrediting their association and their requests. But in terms of Operation Profunc, these wide definitions of threat and subversion also proved to hinder the surveillance program itself. The continued focus on communism was detrimental to the operation and, by the late 1960s and early 1970s, the RCMP was aware of this. This chapter’s examination of Operation Profunc’s definition and surveillance of the threat demonstrates both the program’s initial efforts to maintain a grip on the ambiguity of the Cold War enemy and its later efforts to look past the Cold War paradigms to consider other potential enemies to the state.

3. The Mountie as Spy: 1957 and Growing Anxiety

The character of Dale epitomized the glorified role of the Mountie. In Atomic Plot and DEW Line Duty, Dale ‘upholds the right’ in spite of the complications that the Cold War presented him. This image of the polite and righteous officer is clearly depicted in Dale’s introduction in DEW Line Duty. The book opens to an immigration hall in Montreal filled with Hungarian refugees who fled following the 1956 revolution:

Also part of the welcoming party was a tall, youthful Constable of the Royal Canadian Mounted Police, Dale Thompson. His scarlet uniform tunic was a warm and bright note in contrast to the drab dress of the newcomers. […] Dale smiled in friendly fashion at the refugees […]. They appeared timid and a bit frightened of his uniform. For them a police uniform had always meant trouble. They hadn’t yet got used to the idea that in their new country a policeman signified a helping hand, a friend in need when trouble came.\(^\text{18}\)

The persistence of the myth of the friendly Mountie in Canadian history has been the subject of several studies. In his book about the On-to-Ottawa-trek and the Regina riot of 1935, Bill Waiser addressed the continued cultural expectations of RCMP peacekeeping despite their history of brutality.\(^\text{19}\) Keith Walden, in his history of the international and national image of the Mountie, addressed the tenacity of myth as one that confirms an already persistent belief. To confront the image of the red-coated Mountie as a hero, Walden noted, would be like attacking the nation itself.\(^\text{20}\)

To stay true to his role as a Mountie and “uphold the right,” Dale is obliged to spy on those he deems suspicious. This activity is paramount to the plots involving counter-espionage

\(^{19}\) Bill Waiser, All Hell Can’t Stop Us: The On-to-Ottawa Trek and Regina Riot (Calgary: Fifth House Publishing, 2003), x.
and maintaining Canadian security against a radicalized and foreign threat. Holliday takes care to justify Dale’s behaviour of rifling through suspects’ belongings and listening at doors: “Because of the peculiar things that had been going on, and the highly suspicious way these Indians had been behaving, Dale had no scruples about staying there and listening.”21 Throughout the series Dale is the ideal Canadian lad in addition to being an emblem of Canadian diplomacy and order, a character that was to appeal to boys as well maintain the wider national mythology of the stalwart Mountie. Race plays a central role in both books. The villains of both Atomic Plot and DEW Line Duty were defined by their race and ethnicity, symbols of the contemporary geopolitical strife. In addition to being a helpful and kind diplomat, Dale’s primary role was to protect Canada from the ‘other.’ Holliday’s Mountie was a mirror to the reality where the RCMP actually monitored civilians and visiting groups.22 But whereas the books’ villains were identifiable by their ‘otherness,’ the targets of RCMP observation through Operation Profunc often defied simple definition.

Holliday’s books offer compelling contrast to the reality of Operation Profunc and RCMP surveillance. Atomic Plot’s villain is Doctor Rami’s secretary Kelomé. The fact that the villain was a pretty young woman causes discomfort for Dale and, undoubtedly, the reader on two levels. One was that the multicultural delegation of which she was part was not what it seemed. Early in the book Dale comments on the cultural diversity between the Muslim scientist, the Hindu secretary, and the Sikh bodyguard, to which Doctor Rami replies by expressing hope for Pakistan’s future: “‘We three, Kelomé, Chaudri and myself, are examples of what can be accomplished.’”23 Kelomé ruins this utopian image through her radicalism. The other aspect of discomfort was that, had Dale been less observant, Kelomé would have escaped suspicion as she operated covertly, hiding behind what the rest of the characters mistook for innocence.24 Unlike the “fierce-eyed” Indian and Pakistani men around her, Kelomé attacks through her unassuming

22 The portrayal of Dale as innocent and at times ignorant of the wider world was also not too far from the truth. As late as the 1960s, the RCMP educational requirements were as low as grade 8, preferably grade 10, levels of education. Hewitt, Spying 101, 24.
23 Holliday, 23.
24 It should be mentioned that none of the female characters are favourably portrayed in this book. Women are either covert spies fighting to the death, like Kelomé and her colleague Miss Sabra, or annoyingly in the way, like the few young female students who either ‘squealed excitedly’ at the thrill of radiation (80) or, like the one student who unfortunately happened to be a girl, ‘elbowed’ her way into the session. Holliday, 78.
and almost invisible position as her victim’s secretary. Kelomé, like the radiation that gets her in the end, infiltrates silently. At the same time, she is defined by her racial ‘otherness.’

*DEW Line Duty* presented both the radicalized danger of international communism and the perils of modern military technology. This story followed Dale’s adventure tracking a member of the Hungarian secret police through Canada’s north. Dale’s surveillance of the Hungarian spy, Giorgy Kovass, is portrayed as heroic and the result of RCMP cunning and expertise. As with Dale’s surveillance of the suspicious Indians at Chalk River, the RCMP surveillance of Kovass is justified to the readership. While the Hungarian refugees at the Montreal immigration hall are presented in a sympathetic, if at times patronizing, light Holliday holds nothing back when he presents the story’s villain:

Giorgy Kovass was a chunkily-built man. His hair was thick and unkempt. There was a sort of squint to his eyes, the look of a man who had been accustomed to wearing spectacles. His skin, dark and swarthy, had an unhealthy tone, and his lips, thick and jutting, held a touch of cruelness in the arrogant way they thrust forward.\(^{25}\)

According to this description, Kovass is dangerous, or at the very least dislikeable. He is defined as racially separate from Anglo-Celtic Canadians like Dale. But there remains a sense of the ambiguity in the identification of this character as a threat – Kovass might have easily blended with the other Hungarians, appearing as merely another bedraggled refugee. Throughout the story, Kovass masquerades as various trustworthy figures such as officers and missionaries. RCMP surveillance was thus justified as the threat was ultimately dangerous. When identified, Kovass was defined as an ugly foreigner but when hidden, he was frightening and threatening.

*DEW Line Duty* was published in 1957, a significant year for many reasons. The failed revolt against the Hungarian Communist regime in 1956 resulted in the mass immigration of Hungarians to Canada, which was the largest influx of refugees since the end of the Second World War.\(^{26}\) 1957 was also a significant year in the world of science and nuclear defence.\(^{27}\) It saw the completion of the extensive joint radar system in Canada’s north that was funded by the United States: the DEW Line. It also witnessed Soviet inventions leading to the first Intercontinental Ballistic Missile (ICBM) that later rendered the DEW Line useless. In the fall of


\(^{26}\) Iacovetta, *Gatekeepers*, 43.

1957 the Soviet Union launched Sputnik, the first human-made satellite. As historians Andrew Ede and Lesley B. Cormack stated:

In addition, science was now a public commodity. Sputnik [...] was a beacon in the night proudly proclaiming the scientific and technological superiority of the USSR. Publicity, prestige, and national pride were now linked to scientific achievement in a much more public way than seventeenth-century natural philosophers had found in their patrons’ courts. Interest in science sent ripples through popular culture with the appearance of movies and novels about spies stealing secret formulas or smuggling researchers out of foreign countries. [...] The Nobel Prizes, which had for the most part been a minor news item before the war, made newspaper headlines around the world.28

Sputnik established the Soviet Union’s place in the lead of the space-race creating a mixed sense of terror and amazement in the west: terror for what the Soviets could now be capable of and amazement at scientific progress. In terms of disaster planning, 1957 also saw the establishment of the Canadian Emergency Measure’s Organization (EMO) that prepared civilians, security forces, and the government for potential disaster.29 And finally, but significantly, 1957 saw the creation of the Crash Plan. This was a strategy to keep Operation Profunc on track. It worked to maintain an effective surveillance program in the nuclear age that required a “fresh approach” to the problem of internal security measures.30

The Cold War began with a clear division between the communist ideology of the Soviet Union and capitalist views of the West. Within this context, Operation Profunc focused its efforts on a series of groups and individuals who were either communist or associated with the communist ideology. This broad focus, however, became problematic as surveillance resources were spread too thin by the mid-1950s. According to a historical outline of the Canadian Security Service from the late 1970s, prior to the Crash Plan the RCMP had, by 1953, 21,000 active files on individuals and 2,300 on organizations.31 The number of listed subversives increased annually. Inundated by this material, the RCMP and Profunc planners had to redirect their focus and efforts to select groups and individuals. Once they saw that the sheer volume of records on communist subversion inhibited the quality of surveillance and intelligence work, in the mid-

30 “Re: Apprehension of Persons Under the D.O.C.R. In the Event of War – Crash Plan,” brief, from J. Brunet to Officers Commanding ‘C’, ‘E’, and ‘O’ Divisions, 2 May 1957. Reference no. 2011-00179-11-37-20, LAC. The process of narrowing the focus was discussed in Chapter One.
1950s the RCMP laid aside over 17,000 files considered less active in order to allow for closer evaluation and analysis of more important files requiring consistent investigations. These ‘de-activations’ were followed by a 1958 review that was launched “in order to ‘dead-sheet’ and destroy hundreds of organizations and thousands of individual files no longer considered useful.” The individuals and organizations that remained under surveillance were again ranked according to their threat to national security. The more subversive figures were categorized under the Crash Plan and in the event of a national emergency would be the first arrested. These were, as the RCMP stated, “the most important and dangerous functionaries within the Communist movement.” Noting that the Crash Plan’s effectiveness was in part keeping the plan at the very minimum, the RCMP wrote a list of requirements for those placed under this category: the individual had to be a member of the national executive (and in some instances, the provincial executive) or a recognized Communist organization and had to be active in subversion. According to the RCMP, the detention of these individuals at the outset of a national emergency was vital to national security.

The vagueness inherent in terms such as ‘subversion’ was also met with criticism within the Canadian government and was a subject of debate among politicians throughout the Cold War. At the foundation of these arguments was the question of how to deal with a national threat. When Conservative leader George Drew suggested to Parliament in 1949 to use the term ‘sedition’ as a legal trap for communists, the response was hesitant. A year later Drew suggested that legislation be created against communist and ‘related activities’ making them punishable by the Criminal Code. Again, the loose terminology, in this case ‘related activities,’ was met with criticism. The proposal to outlaw a political party was met with apprehension.

---

32 Betke and Horrall, Ibid. The purging of files likely caused the significant decline in citizens under surveillance after 1957. This was illustrated in Figure 1, “Profunc Statistics,” in Chapter One.
33 Betke and Horrall, Ibid.
34 As one report stated, the Crash Plan was “a first sweep of subversives under the time limitations once anticipated in a nuclear attack, a lead time which intelligence can no longer be reasonably expected.” The plan not only took into account the dangers of a subversive population at large during a Communist attack but the possible dangers that a nuclear attack could pose to technology that would enable the RCMP’s arrests. “Re: Advisory Committee on Internment,” attachment to memorandum, from M. R. Dare, to Robin Bourne, April 1974. LAC.
36 “Advisory Committee on Internments,” 1973, 5. Ibid., LAC.
38 Whitaker and Marcuse, Cold War Canada, 191.
Steve Hewitt addressed the changing definition of a national security threat in his article on the ‘Key Sectors’ program, a counter-subversion system developed in the 1960s. The ‘Key Sectors’ program was a surveillance operation that functioned with the growing recognition that to focus solely on communism as a threat was to limit the fight against new dangers to Canadian security. The program, however, was a failure primarily through its poorly defined terms which “did not define what constituted subversion or, for that matter, what characterized a threat to the State.” This method was in complete opposition to the clear definition of and emphasis on ‘communism’ in the early 1950s. At the same time, the ‘Key Sectors’ program acknowledged that threats to the State were more complex by the mid-Cold War than they were at its beginning. Drew’s suggestions for a wider terminology for a national threat, although seen as problematic in the early Cold War, foreshadowed the later and equally problematic term, ‘subversive.’ According to Hewitt the idea of subversion had prevailed since the beginning of RCMP surveillance during the First World War. The act of classifying specific groups as inherently untrustworthy had a long history and while the categorization of the threat changed, the focus remained the same.

For Operation Profunc, the use of ‘subversive’ was common throughout the 1950s, but the description of subversive activity broadened into the 1970s. In the late 1960s, the Security Service started to call into question the unwavering references to communism. The small modifications of the terminology in the early 1970s led to the eventual removal of references to communism altogether by the end of the decade. While Operation Profunc still officially defined the primary threat to Canadian security as foreign-influenced and communist, documents began to remove explicit references to political or ethnic and national groups from the

---

41 Hewitt, 167.
42 An example of this would be the following document: “Re: Apprehension of subversives and outlawing of Organizations in the event of war,” memorandum, from L. H. Nicholson, Commissioner, to W. R. Jackett, Deputy Minister of Justice, 10 December 1957. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-42-35, LAC.
44 This included, the substitution of “trade union” with “labour organizations.” “Profunc,” memorandum, from S. V. M. Chisholm, Officer i/c ‘D’ Branch, to A/D.S.I., 24 September 1970. Ibid., LAC.
45 “Special Identification Program,” report, January 1977. Ibid., LAC.
guidelines of the security program. By the end of the 1970s, the RCMP Security Service guidelines stated that the program was to maintain a system of identification of individuals and organizations that may or may not be “planning to engage in activities detrimental to the State in the event of regional, national, or international emergencies.” The broader and more vague the terminology, the wider the net was for monitoring and surveilling a national threat.

While the problems with Operation Profunc’s focus were a topic of debate for a number of years, they were especially prevalent following the 1970 October Crisis. In a 1973 memo, M. R. Dare, Director General of the Security Service, expressed his concern for the datedness of Operation Profunc. He stated, “Considering that these plans were formulated in 1948 it is not surprising that time and technology have combined to render them unworkable, proof of which was reflected in the 1970 F.L.Q. crisis when they were virtually ignored.”

Dare continued on to say:

Suffice it to observe that increasingly the threat to Canada’s internal security has emanated from a proliferation of violence prone groups not at all necessarily linked with the world communist movement. Our efforts over the years to revise PROFUNC criteria so as to be consistent with these new threats have met with only limited success and we are thus left with a set of contingency plans that no longer serve the purposes for which they were created.

This was the beginning of the end for Profunc.

Operation Profunc’s limited scope was evident in the RCMP documents and led to the development of the Special Identification Program. Documents advocating for a more specific focus used the FLQ Crisis as a perfect example of why focusing on communism alone was detrimental to the safety of the nation. Operation Profunc, which had struggled to maintain control over an ambiguous threat during a large part of the Cold War, by the 1970s had to further widen its definition to consider the broader possibilities of subversion and attack.

4. Police Infiltration and Maintaining Normalcy
The RCMP would often use undercover officers for surveillance. In the case of Operation Profunc, one example, among many, was the RCMP surveillance of the People’s Co-operative Ltd. in Winnipeg during the early 1950s. Reports on the group came from an undercover officer.

---

47 “Special Identification Program,” report, January 1977. LAC.
49 “Advisory Committee on Internments,” 1973. Ibid., LAC.
50 LAC, Government of Canada, Memorandum, 31 October 1980, 2. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-28-08, LAC. The FLQ was also a highly secure organization that operated through a network of individual cells; there was minimal contact and communication between the cells to avoid police infiltration and internal subversion.
who attended the meetings at the Hebrew Sick Benefit Hall on Selkirk Avenue. The documents of the meeting were detailed and read like minutes. The report read in part: “[Censored] opened the meeting by stating that we are very fortunate in having [censored] present wo[sic] will speak to us about her recent trip to the USSR. She was a delegate of the Trade Unionists to visit the Soviet Union.” The report went on to state:

[Censored] opened [sic] her speech by stating that she was very pleased when she had been informed that she was a delegate of the Trade Unionists to visit [sic] the Soviet Union. She said that she learned the truth about the Soviet labourers, how they work, live and enjoy life. She stated that the working conditions in the USSR are far superior to those in this country. The factories are roomy, air conditioned, good lighting and have recreation facilities. The medical care is free and a good hospital [sic] is located near each factory. The wages for men and women are equal and the state provides free nursery for working women.

One of the more noticeable aspects of this report, aside from the poor typing, was the apparent tone of objectivity. The report contained few if any judgements. More than that, there was a sense of inclusion noticeable in the earlier quotation wherein the officer used “we” to describe the experience in the meeting. The officer took note of the attendees, identifying those he could, along with the license plates of cars parked outside of the meeting hall.

The RCMP’s also used informants in organizations that were surveilled for possible espionage. Informants, essentially spies, proved to be a valuable source for the RCMP and challenged pre-conceived notions about the surveillance process: “The belief by some of the people being spied on that this was being done primarily through electronic means was a human response that masked a far more difficult truth: the most valuable information in RCMP reports came from people labelled ‘human sources.’”

Another use of human sources was evident in Operation Profunc’s June 1952 report on the Congress of Canadian Women (CCW). In this document the RCMP thanked the efforts of one attendee at the 1945 Women’s International
Democratic Federation (WIDF) Conference in Paris for providing information on the organization:

Thanks to a comprehensive report of [a member of the CCW], who from November 26th to December 1st, 1945, had attended the foundation of the WIDF in Paris on behalf of a group of interested Canadian women, valuable information is available on the Federation. It appears from her report that the foundation meeting of the WIDF in Paris was organized by the French Communist-dominated ‘Union des Femmes Francaises’ [sic] (Union of French Women) who for obvious reasons admitted only left-wing representatives as full-fledge delegates, while democratic and liberal-minded women could attend merely as observers.\(^{55}\)

The RCMP report does not specify whether or not the CCW member was an intentional informant, whether she was asked to gather information or was later persuaded to recount her experiences, whether her report was written for the RCMP or whether it was intercepted. Nevertheless, the police use of material gathered by a member of the organization spoke to the importance of human sources, particularly for a women’s group that was inaccessible to male officers for observation. In an age that profiled espionage and communist contamination as the primary threat to national security it was significant that through the calculated act of infiltration the police became the threat to Canadians.\(^{56}\)

In their study on RCMP surveillance of gays and lesbians, Gary Kinsman and Patrizia Gentile argued that the Cold War was a war of normalcy, stating that it was “part of the hegemonic production of a white middle-class way of life on a global scale.”\(^{57}\) This white middle-class way of life, symbolized by the nuclear family, the suburban lifestyle, and postwar capitalism, was also exemplified by the way in which organizations that opposed or challenged


\(^{56}\) In their book on Cold War sexual regulation, Kinsman and Gentile discussed the ways in which citizens were used to gather information for the RCMP during the Cold War. They illustrated how the RCMP in Ottawa were more interested in gathering names of people in queer communities than arresting them for ‘criminal’ activities. The surveillance process was sustained by blackmail, where individuals were threatened with arrest and being ‘outed’ unless they provided the RCMP with more names and information about the gay and lesbian networks. Gary Kinsman and Patrizia Gentile, The Canadian War on Queers: National Security as Sexual Regulation (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2009), 2. In the case of RCMP surveillance of gay men and lesbians, therefore, it was the targets themselves who became human sources.

\(^{57}\) The mixture of “hot” and “cold” wars against Third War liberation movements and for neocolonialism, Kinsman and Gentile state, was at its base “the defence of capitalism, whiteness, the patriarchal family, ‘proper’ forms of masculinity/femininity, and heterosexuality. These were wars for normalcy and against political, gender, and sexual deviance.” Kinsman and Gentile, The Canadian War on Queers, 23.
these values were in turn profiled as national threats.58 During the Cold War, groups campaigning for world peace, workers’ rights, social security, and equal racial, gender, and sexual rights were typically categorized as ‘subversive’ and subsequently considered advocates against ‘normal’ democratic Canadian society and values.59 Criticisms of the American Military Industrial Complex and Western imperialism were interpreted as dissenters, subversive, and, by this logic, communist. Several groups under surveillance were considered guilty for their discussions about including Communist countries in trade agreements and on the global problems arising from the paradigmatic divide of the superpowers.60 This categorization of the national threat was too broad in its definition of subversion and too narrow in its scope with its view that the enemy existed only in left-wing political groups.

The history of Operation Profunc reveals an accordion-like constriction and expansion of surveillance method. This was evident in the early focus on all groups apparently linked to communism, to the subsequent narrowed perspective of the RCMP’s Crash Plan. The later development of the Special Identification Program (SIP) attempted to identify an increasingly elusive enemy in the late Cold War.61 Its objective was to immobilize either “an attack or other hostile action against Canada by a foreign power,” or “an insurrection, apprehended insurrection or widespread public disorder in Canada.”62 Operation Profunc demonstrated the struggle to both monitor and define the national enemy. As the Cold War developed, the concept of a distinct enemy became more multifarious and the national security program based on these simplistic assumptions of threat relied more and more on the concept of guilt through association.

58 Hewitt notes that after 1968 there was increased surveillance covering a variety of movements including Black Power, Red Power, Quebec separatists, and several feminist organizations, most of which were questionable although the Women’s International Terrorist Conspiracy from Hell were a likely target. At the same time, the national threat was still seen in terms of activities and group mandates that challenged Canadian politics and social norms. The term “subversion” was still closely tied to communism. Hewitt, Spying 101, 158. Hewitt also states that in December 1970 the RCMP had microfilmed the complete records of 16,000 students. 146.


60 This will be discussed in more detail in Chapter Six.

61 “Commission of Inquiry Concerning Certain Members of the R.C.M.P.,” memorandum, from the Officer i/c ‘D’ Division, to the Officer i/c Task Force Security Service, 24 August 1978. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-42-35, LAC. This memo addressed the deficiencies and recommendations for amendment, referred to 1973 when “representation was made through channels to have the system abandoned or updated to bring it into line with current realities. Subsequently, criteria for the Special Identification Program (SIP) were developed to replace PROFUNC and presented to the appropriate governmental committees. S.I.P. has received approval in principle, however, until such time as it receives official sanction, the old PROFUNC system remains in effect.”

62 “Special Identification Program,” report, January 1977. LAC.
In his 1989 report on CSIS, political scientist Reg Whitaker evaluated the effectiveness of the new surveillance program that, interestingly, was developed in 1984 and replaced plans for the SIP. Regarding the efficiency of CSIS as a surveillance program, Whitaker noted that the RCMP’s “highly moralistic sense of anti-Communist mission […] did not always mix well with good security intelligence work.”

Whitaker also discussed the role of the United States and American security in Canada’s Cold War surveillance. He described how the American paradigmatic view of the world extended to Canada and how, as a result, Canadian intelligence took on the view of global forces as clearly divided between the West and Communism. Canadian intelligence, Whitaker stated, has been nothing more than raw data processed by the United States since the end of the Second World War. Together with the American governance of Canadian security and the limited understanding of a national threat, Whitaker described how the American Technical Intelligence Program (TECHINET) required a target to function. TECHINET’s unwavering focus on a specific target highlighted its lack of flexibility; after establishing an enemy, TECHINET could not easily redirect focus onto another target and therefore the focus remained on communism.

American influence over Canadian security was evident in the earlier cases of Herbert Norman and John Watkins, and in the construction of the DEW Line. The level of American influence within Operation Profunc, however, was questionable. From the documents available, there was little, if any, reference to American security and influence. This was a Canadian program. More importantly, what Whitaker’s analysis of TECHINET demonstrates is the problematic focus of the security operations throughout the Cold War. Devotion to maintaining domestic communism as the official threat despite evidence otherwise spoke to an inability to shift gears and recognize a changing political environment. The RCMP had a vested interest in maintaining the status quo. In many ways this steadfast attitude towards communism ran parallel to contemporary psychiatrists’ reluctance to acknowledge the paradigm shift happening within their field at the same time with regard to homosexuality.

---

63 Reg Whitaker, “Submission to the Special Committee on the Review of the CSIS Act, House of Commons” (1989), 4. Earlier in the report Whitaker notes that the term “subversion,” “a symptomatic Cold War concept,” points more to the “idea of moral and ideological integrity of states being corrupted from within by the disloyal local agents of hostile states […].” Whitaker, 2. Essentially, the term subversion had a moralistic base that spoke less to the fear of political espionage and more to the understanding of normalcy and social acceptability.

64 Whitaker, 5.
Operation Profunc focused on communism through the 1960s, missing the growing Québécois political radicalism that led to the October Crisis in 1970. Indeed the purpose of Operation Profunc was to monitor ‘prominent functionaries of the communist party’ – but following 1970 planners, now aware of its limitations as a program, called into question its continued significance. The program’s persistent belief was that it could easily monitor targets that were clearly outsiders, like those described in Holliday’s children’s books, blurred the focus of the surveillance program. Instead, the October Crisis, the most notable terrorist attack on the Canadian government in this era, came form unanticipated by Profunc. Throughout the 1960s, the Front de liberation du Québec (FLQ) attacked symbols of English imperialism, ultimately, in 1970, targeting British Trade Minister James Cross and Quebec Minister of Labour Pierre LaPorte. The October Crisis was an episode that exemplified the poor communication between police and government. While the RCMP was aware of the growing severity of the situation, the Canadian government fell short. As Whitaker writes: “To suggest that the RCMP had ‘failed’ if they could not prevent two hostage takings is to set impossible standards for any security intelligence service in similar circumstances.”

Despite information provided, the Canadian government failed to properly guard officials in the wake of the first FLQ kidnapping. This, Whitaker notes, indicated the lack of “effective co-ordination between intelligence agencies and the consumers of the intelligence product” mixed with “the ‘instinctive belief it can’t happen here.”

Identification of the threat was also poorly managed by the police in the wake of the events of October 1970. Regardless of the FLQ’s mandate, local and provincial police (the Montreal city police and the Sûreté du Québec) profiled the organization as having roots in the Canadian Communist Party, Trotskyism, and Marxist-Leninism. While the RCMP Security Service gave particular attention to possible communist involvement, their assessments indicate

---

66 Whitaker, “Apprehended Insurrection?,” 237.
67 This is an inclusive term for ‘Communist Party of Canada’ and the ‘Labor Progressive Party.’ Throughout the twentieth century the name changed from one to the other.
68 Betke and Horrall, 672. “Re: Advisory Committee on Internment,” attachment to memorandum, from M. R. Dare, to Robin Bourne, April 1974. LAC.
that there was little connection to communism in the FLQ movement.\textsuperscript{69} Regardless, local and provincial police misused their power under the War Measures Act.\textsuperscript{70} This fabricated link to communism was further solidified in the minds of authorities by the arrests of several communists and supporters of socialist organizations in Quebec following the events of October 1970, regardless of the fact that they had no connection to the FLQ.\textsuperscript{71} These arrests pointed to several integral components of Canada’s Cold War management of threats, including the police’s abuse of the War Measures Act when it used the emergency to arrest long-targeted individuals and organizations listed in Operation Profunc files.\textsuperscript{72} The arrests also called into question the legitimacy of the claim that communist groups and ideology dominated the FLQ. For Operation Profunc, the October Crisis was a catalyst highlighting the unavoidable problems with the program’s system of categorizing and targeting national threats.

Despite Operation Profunc’s determined focus on communism, what was evident in its reports from the 1970s was increased self-consciousness and self-awareness on the part of the operation organizers. Despite Operation Profunc’s purpose of monitoring prominent functionaries of the communist party, as one report from 1974 stated, this target of surveillance was becoming less relevant:

Times have changed. The system remains. Pro-Soviet ideological thought and the threat of Soviet aggression are factors, but not the sole factors, relative to Canada’s internal security. Yet the aging functionaries of the Communist Party of Canada and its Front organizations are the only ones covered by this system; the only ones for whom warrants have been issued.\textsuperscript{73}

The prominent functionaries were steadily getting older and groups were starting to disband or simply become irrelevant.\textsuperscript{74} These targets were, as the 1974 report stated, “revolutionaries of a

\textsuperscript{69} In terms of foreign influence over the FLQ, the RCMP apparently cited Cuba as having links to terrorist activity and Algeria as having influence over national liberation movements, but noted that by the end of the 1960s the most foreign interest was from France. Whitaker, “Apprehended Insurrection?,” 235.

\textsuperscript{70} Whitaker, 239.

\textsuperscript{71} Following the October Crisis police raided both the homes of Quebec separatists and members of the New Left. Hewitt, “Reforming the Canadian Security State,” 178-179.

\textsuperscript{72} CBC’s program on Operation Profunc interviewed some Quebec communists who were arrested and whose homes were raided following the October Crisis despite there being no evidence of their involvement with the FLQ or even Quebec separatism. “Enemies of the State,” the fifth estate, CBC, 15 October, 2010.

\textsuperscript{73} “Re: Advisory Committee on Internment,” from Dare to Bourne, April 1974, 3. LAC. The self-consciousness of this report is also evident in its description of Operation Profunc’s origins and the establishment of a review committee of the program: “With the advent of the Cold War, the U.S.S.R. and its satellites were considered to be Canada’s sole adversaries. Conventional or limited nuclear war were considered possible, if not probable. To meet the times – and with criticisms of the handling of the Japanese-Canadian situation in World War II fresh in mind – a system was devised to provide outside scrutiny of RCMP intent in regard to the maintenance of internal security in the event of hostilities.”
bygone era, peripheral to events."  Legislation had to change and adapt to consider new targets and regional breakdowns which were “much more prevalent in the Canadian experience and much more likely to recur.”  As the targets became less relevant threats to national security, Operation Profunc became less significant a force in protecting national security.

Times were changing. A 1980 memo from the Director of Protective Policing to the Security Service stated:

The problem with this system [Operation Profunc] is that it was developed when the USSR and its satellites were considered to be Canada’s sole adversaries. But times have changed. Pro-Soviet ideological thought and the threat of Soviet aggression are factors, but not the sole factors, relative to Canada’s internal security.

The memo went on to state that under the system of Operation Profunc, terrorism:

which is of considerable concern to security forces today, does not fall within the scope of PROFUNC. Regional societal breakdowns – such as the ‘October Crisis’ of 1970 – which are more prevalent in Canadian experience and much more likely to recur are likewise ignored, unless the Government chooses to invoke the War Measures Act.

The references to ‘regional society’ breakdowns pointed to the diversity of threats to Canada. In a new era, the vast and diverse nation had a variety of concerns that extended beyond a far-reaching threat like communism.

By the late Cold War, the Security Service’s categorization of a national threat had expanded to include nationalist, extremist, and terrorist organizations, although in the case of Operation Profunc, many of these were still tied to communist organizations, Communist States, and Eastern European nations. Operation Profunc tentatively identified groups such as the Croatian National Resistance – International, the Croatian Revolutionary Brotherhood International, the Croatian National Council, and the Serbian Youth Movement for Freedom as terrorist threats. The 1980 memo discussing these organizations identified them as having the potential to carry out domestic or international terrorist attacks against diplomatic missions, or their representatives, stating: “It must be stressed that the targets of these groups are not

---

74 “Re: Advisory Committee on Internment,” 4. Ibid., LAC.
75 Ibid., LAC.
76 Ibid., LAC. The report pointed to the historical precedent of such breakdowns such as the Winnipeg General Strike, the Regina Riots, and the October Crisis.
78 Government of Canada, 31 October, Ibid., 2. LAC.
Canadian as such but such terrorist actions could seriously upset both Canadian ethnic community or our bilateral relations.”

81 From this description, the threat was no longer infiltration or contamination but damaged international relations and Canada’s unstable global position. Still, the intent of the SIP was to be an “all-inclusive, Security Service-wide mechanism.”

82 The SIP seemed to address issues that Operation Profunc could not because of its narrow view of the national threat. The Officer in charge of ‘D’ Operations wrote in a 1980 memo:

You will note that unlike the old PROFUNC system, SIP has been developed to cover organizations and individuals who span the entire spectrum of subversive and/or terrorist activity, as well as to accommodate individuals with no direct organizational affiliations but who are believed to be capable of committing acts of violence, terror or sabotage.

83 The SIP was, in short, an indiscriminate surveillance program. This program marked the disintegration of the well-defined divide between ‘Us’ and ‘Them’ that fed the prominent view within national policing and surveillance.

In addition to its preoccupation with communism throughout the Cold War, Operation Profunc’s surveillance and intelligence programs were run by a non-specialized police force: the RCMP. While active in Cold War surveillance, as a mere police force the RCMP was not a specialized security intelligence agency and was ineffective in its surveillance operations. Operation Profunc attempted to process more information than it could handle, had a limited understanding of subversion and was run by a police force that was untrained as a professional intelligence agency. The RCMP surveillance of suspect subversive Canadians was further complicated by officers’ poor educational background and lack of job security, two elements which fostered a misunderstanding of leftist organizations and socialist-sympathetic programs.

84 The anti-intellectual attitude of the police caused several problems with the ways in which individuals were targeted and monitored.

85 This attitude was evident in the profiling of various...
individuals and organizations that were critical of western governments and militaries. In the surveillance reports, the RCMP and Operation Profunc portrayed these groups as eager to lure innocent and uneducated Canadians into a world of political subversion. As Hewitt stated in his study on the evolution of Canada’s security forces since 1919, “In Canada, old security services do not fade away, they just get absorbed by other ones.” The creation of the SIP addressed the increasing problems surrounding the definition of the ‘threat to national security.’ The shift in policing was also the result of a problem of professionalism in national surveillance. The 1981 McDonald Commission, or the “Royal Commission of Inquiry into Certain Activities by the RCMP,” dealt with, among other things, the illegal activities committed by RCMP officers in their investigations of subversives. Operation Profunc officially ended in 1983, but in the years leading up to the Solicitor General’s discovery of the program it was already beginning to fall apart.

5. Conclusion

The Cold War altered the way in which national threats were considered and monitored in Canada. In the wake of the October Crisis in 1970 and the realization that the current threat to Canadian security at the time was both domestic and non-communist, the RCMP Security Service and Operation Profunc planners evaluated the usefulness of the disaster plan in dealing with the increasingly elusive threat to national security. In early 1980 it was agreed within the Security Service that the Profunc system was unsuccessful and that it was “a matter of urgency to implement a mechanism whereby the Security Service could, if required, immobilize organizations and individuals whose interests are detrimental to Canada.” The concentration on communism as a primary threat to Canadian security had persisted well into the late 1970s, causing several concerns among security officials about Operation Profunc’s ability to function in the face of changing global relations. The importance of Operation Profunc in this sense was not so much that it failed, but how it failed. The obsession with communism and leftist ideology as the ultimate threat to Canada was a compelling one. While this chapter examined how this

87 This will be discussed in more detail in the Chapter Six.
88 Hewitt, Spying 101, 203.
89 Whitaker, “Submission to the Special Committee,” 4-5. Some of the Operation Profunc files were subject of review during the late 1970s, some including a form at the beginning of the file indicating that Justice McDonald had reviewed its contents in 1978. A 2011-00179-11-42-35 and A2011-0179-11-43-42, LAC.
mentality was damaging to the larger considerations of threat, the next chapter examines how this mentality allowed for the continued surveillance of three groups in particular. Expecting and planning disaster went beyond preparing for enemy containment to stifle the flow of subversion – it anticipated what the enemy might be doing in the time leading up to ‘M’ Day and how it might be doing it.

Cold War defence was in part anticipating disaster – fearing the potentiality of prominent functionaries. In a similar way to how Civil Defence programs anticipated the possible destruction wreaked upon society by nuclear weapons, Operation Profunc tried to anticipate how to combat a possible communist uprising or attack. In addition to the Operation Profunc documents that demonstrate the changing way in which the enemy was defined as a security threat, contemporary Canadian culture reflected this sense of the danger. The Dale of the Mounted series and MacLennan’s Watch that Ends the Night were significant products of this era. These books provided different cultural expressions of the Cold War from American films, comic books, and pulp novels of the same era that typically define atomic culture. Holliday’s Dale of the Mounted offers a positive cultural representation of RCMP surveillance at a time of espionage and covert subversion while addressing the larger fears of the anticipated and ambiguous menace. Dale’s faith in scientific objectivity in Atomic Plot and in upholding the right throughout the series were more than expressions of Canadian nationalism. These traits, depicted in children’s books, reflected the conflicting culture of enthusiasm and fear in the atomic era and the efforts to maintain order in an increasingly complex environment. The deeper sense of unease present in both Holliday’s and MacLennan’s works pointed to the pervasiveness of apprehension and anxiety of the 1950s.
Norris, an English immigrant to British Columbia, worked as a cartoonist for the *Sun* throughout the 1950s and into the 1970s. Over these years, his work captured the contemporary politics, culture, and society. This cartoon, published at the height of Cold War anti-communism, was apt given the subjects’ sense of self-consciousness and the cartoonist’s awareness of ongoing police surveillance of suspected communists and front organizations. More than this, the cartoon pointed to the zeal of Cold War anti-communism resulting in the over-surveillance of citizens and an ambiguous understanding of the domestic threat to national security.

---

1 Len Norris, “You don’t suppose if we play ‘Peace on Earth’ we’ll be regarded as a Communist front organization …?” *The Vancouver Sun* (21 December 1954).
Norris’s cartoon is more playful than biting satirical; the facial expressions of the characters betray a sense of tired annoyance rather than outright fear or anxiety. Regardless of the humour, the cartoon depicts both the concern for being watched and the danger associated with the broad definition of communism and threat during the Cold War. The idea that the RCMP would monitor a Christmas brass band because of “Peace on Earth’s” possible political interpretation was humorous. Readers of the paper, however, were likely aware of the context and that citizens had to be careful about the organizations to which they belonged. They also probably would have known that the peace movement was subject of RCMP surveillance at this time raising questions about the ‘success’ of their surveillance and efforts to remain covert. Opposition to nuclear war, one of the primary agendas of the peace movement, was often interpreted as a lack of support for western military powers. Indeed there was physical conflict during the Cold War, namely the proxy wars fought to assert the superpowers’ control over foreign territory. A psychological element also characterized the Cold War, evident in the threat of nuclear annihilation and the danger of the dissolution of one superpower into the other. The conflict between the superpowers could not be resolved by military action as it might have been in an earlier era. Additionally, the threat of communism was that it could spread, infiltrating peace movements and various other civilian organizations. In the eyes of the RCMP Security Service, fears of such developments necessitated surveillance of organizations such as peace, labour, and cultural associations.

These attitudes about the seductive qualities of communism were evident in propagandist pamphlets throughout the Cold War. These were likely taken seriously by a few Canadians, ignored by some, and lampooned by others. A 1947 booklet titled The Communist Threat to Canada noted that Canadians were endangered by their own innocence and were liable to pick up enemy ideology on their travels abroad. The pamphlet stated: “Befuddlement of the public is increased by certain naïve tourists who visit Russia, are shown about by the master showmen of the NKVD, and emerge with innocent enthusiasm for what they have seen.” The communist threat to Canada, then, was not only pervasive but also preyed on ‘innocence.’

---

2 As with earlier chapters, “communism” will be spelled with a small ‘c’ when referring to the ideology and with a capital ‘C’ when referring specifically to Communist governments.


4 No Author, The Communist Threat to Canada (Montreal: The Canadian Chamber of Commerce, 1947), 18. The “NKVD,” Narodnyy Komissariat Vnutrennikh Del or “People’s Commissariat for International Affairs,” was the Soviet law enforcement agency from the late 1930s to the mid-1940s.
knowledge and awareness of the dangers of communism would enable its spread, a sentiment echoed in warnings of other forms of deviance. Communism in this case was described in a sexual and predatory manner; like the contemporary alarmist literature warning against seductive homosexuals leading ‘straights’ astray, this pamphlet portrayed communism as seductive and ultimately dangerous to innocents unaware of deviation and subversion. The belief in communism’s fluidity was at the centre of the American containment theory discussed in Part One. It was also the foundation of the surveillance of several groups and organizations under Operation Profunc, such as the Workers Benevolent Association, the Congress of Canadian Women, and the Canadian Peace Congress. These three organizations had ties to the left and were openly critical of the government. For these reasons, they were classified as tied to Communism, either as mass-language groups or as communist front organizations.

2. Method and Focus
To address how Operation Profunc conceptualized communism as a threat, this chapter examines how the three groups were monitored through the 1950s and 1960s. This chapter draws on RCMP reports written between 1951 and 1962 covering the groups’ activities and publications. Whereas previous chapters have addressed plans for arrest, preparation for internment, and the methods of RCMP surveillance over the decades, Chapter Six turns the focus to Operation Profunc’s targets. How were those under surveillance identified as threatening? What were these people doing and what was it about these groups that aroused suspicion? In focusing on this aspect of Operation Profunc, this chapter completes the study of policing “prominent functionaries” through an examination of the targeted organizations and individuals from the police perspective. This cultural examination of the surveillance reports illustrates how the RCMP Security Service portrayed domestic communism as infectious and seductive. As Elaine Tyler May noted in *Homeward Bound*, communism was considered, in popular and academic culture alike, as a force that weakened America:

> Ideologues were ‘soft, not hard,’ and displayed ‘the weakness of impotence,’ compared to tough-minded American capitalists. Communism was ‘something secret, sweaty and furtive like nothing so much, in the phrase of one wise observer of modern Russia, as homosexuals in a boy’s school.’

---

The portrayal of communism as both catching and predatory evoked the dangers of sexuality – something that could both be caught and could corrupt the innocent.

RCMP surveillance of leftist organizations, workers associations, and Eastern-European language groups has been the subject of several studies in the context of the Second World War. There also exists a growing body of scholarship on surveillance of Canadian protest and activist groups throughout the late 1960s and into the 1970s. A smaller body of scholarship exists on surveillance of various organizations immediately following the Second World War and into the Cold War. Chapter Six fits into this latter category. The 1950s are a compelling period for surveillance. But while anti-communism and nuclear fear characterized the decade, epitomising the culture of paranoia, historical studies of surveillance in Canada tend to miss this quintessential period, typically falling on either side of the decade. These studies examine the overt internment of ‘enemy aliens’ during the Second World War and the police vetting of activist and protest groups emerging from the 1960s. Rather than being the passive period existing between two dominant decades of police vetting, the 1950s capture the very essence of watching and being watched.

---

6 One of the first publications addressing Canadian wartime internees who were not ethnically connected to the Japanese, Italians, or Germans, but were targeted for communism and socialism, was William and Kathleen Repka’s Dangerous Patriots, published on the fortieth anniversary of the communist prisoners’ release from internment in Canada. William and Kathleen M. Repka, Dangerous Patriots: Canada’s Unknown Prisoners of War (Vancouver: New Star Books, 1982). Another personal account was Ben Swankey’s, published the same year: Ben Swankey, “Reflections of a Communist, Canadian Internment Camps,” Alberta History 30, no. 2 (1982): 11-21.


8 Julie Guard and Tarah Brookfield have both examined women’s organizations under surveillance in Canada during the Cold War years. Julie Guard, “Women Worth Watching: Radical Housewives in Cold War Canada,” in Whose National Security? Canadian State Surveillance and the Creation of Enemies, ed. Gary Kinsman, Dieter K. Buse, and Mercedes Steedman (Toronto: Between the Lines, 2000): 73-88 and Tarah Brookfield, Cold War Comforts: Canadian Women, Child Safety, and Global Insecurity 1945-1975 (Waterloo: University of Waterloo Press, 2012). The Congress of Canadian Women appears in their studies, but is not the primary focus. Reg Whitaker and Gary Marcuse have looked at organizations like the Canadian Peace Congress and the profiling of prominent members such as James Endicott, along with his wife Mary and father Rev. James Endicott Senior, in Cold War Canada: The Making of an Insecurity State, 1945-1957 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1994). This book is useful in its discussion of anti-communism in the Canadian context as well as providing additional historical information about the Peace Congress.

9 American historian Joanne Meyerowitz addresses the way in which the 1950s have been overlooked in studies of public protest and feminism in her collection of essays, Not June Cleaver: Women and Gender in Postwar America, 1945-1960 (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1994). In the Canadian context, Valerie Korinek has addressed this issue of missing the 1950s in terms of feminism and the history of women in Roughing it in the Suburbs: Reading Chatelaine Magazine in the Fifties and Sixties (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2000), while Erika Dyck has effectively demonstrated that the 1950s were anything but boring in her study of LSD in Saskatchewan asylums in Psychedelic Psychiatry: LSD from Clinic to Campus (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2008).
The Workers Benevolent Association was among the more obvious targets of police surveillance during the Cold War because of its affiliations to labour politics and the Soviet Union through cultural and ethnic affiliations. The Congress of Canadian Women and the Canadian Peace Congress, on the other hand, were considered threatening for more subtle reasons. Both of these organizations were identified by their socialist policies and their outspoken criticisms of the West in terms of Canada’s selective trade relations and the American military presence that interfered with domestic conflicts in Southeast Asia. As Reg Whitaker and Gary Marcuse discuss in *Cold War Canada*, the limitations of Canadian liberal democracy in the early 1950s were evident in the vilification of those who challenged the existing divide between East and West in the name of peace.\(^\text{10}\) Criticism of government and military operations was deemed incriminating. Referring to E. P. Thompson’s 1982 *Beyond the Cold War*, Whitaker and Marcuse presented the dilemma faced by Canadians and other citizens of the West who were attracted to the peace movement.\(^\text{11}\) While the United States, with its superior strategic position, championed the cause of ‘freedom,’ the Soviet Union, with its inferior strategic position, championed the cause of ‘peace,’ despite obvious issues of human rights. Western peace activists had to deal with the apparent divide between ‘peace’ and ‘freedom,’ and the hypocrisy of the two superpowers. With this background, Norris’s cartoon becomes a little less funny.

The Operation Profunc documents categorized the perceived severity of the communist threat in the Workers Benevolent Association, the Congress of Canadian Women, and the Peace Congress through their respective mandates and platforms, their activities, and their membership. In the process, these documents expose what the security program believed to be a threatening communist network hiding under the cover of social, cultural, and peace organizations. In reality, the connections drawn between these organizations and the Soviet Union were predominantly fuelled by the idea that any left-of-centre organization was communist. The belief that communism’s founding principles challenged Canadian values supported the idea that communist Canadians would have stronger ties to the Soviet Union than to their own country.\(^\text{12}\)

One communist member was enough to cast doubt on an entire organization.

---

\(^{10}\) Whitaker and Marcuse, *Cold War Canada*, 364.

\(^{11}\) Whitaker and Marcuse, 365.

The documents used for this chapter have been subject to redaction. The information available, however, shows significant discussion on the part of the RCMP indicating that they were invested in tracking the influence behind the organizations through leadership and funding. While names of citizens slated for internment are not available, records do provide lists of some of the executive memberships. Despite censorship, the Operation Profunc records are valuable sources as they illustrate how the RCMP perceived the different organizations and the RCMP’s anxiety about the spread of communism within Canadian society. The reports detailed and commented on the organizations’ mandates, at times including material from the organizations themselves. To obtain information on suspected groups, the RCMP analysed speeches at conventions and conferences, articles in party newspapers, and communications between group members to determine their connection to communism. Occasionally the reports focus on prominent figures such as Dr. James Endicott and Rae Luckock. Though they were often unable to identify them as ‘card carrying communists’ they did their best to equate their socialist platforms with communist politics. The sections typically redacted from the records are details about the organizations’ financing. In many cases financing and membership, more than group platforms, indiscriminately proved for the RCMP the links to the Canadian Communist Party.  

While this connection was often weak, particularly in terms of communist financing, the element of association was seen as enough reason to deem the group a potential national threat. The surveillance records, through their analysis of memberships and individuals’ relationships to different organizations, crystalized the image of what the RCMP feared: a communist network that reached into all facets of Canadian society.

3. Workers Benevolent Association: Ukrainian Labour Associations and Socialism

Established in October 1922 in Winnipeg as the Ukrainian Labour Association, the Workers Benevolent Association (WBA) had a strong connection to labour politics and established roots within the Slavic community which were for many years two of the RCMP’s primary targets. The WBA was established at the point where the greater Ukrainian-Canadian

---

13 As in earlier chapters, this is an inclusive term for ‘Communist Party of Canada’ and the ‘Labor Progressive Party.’

14 The introduction to Prophets and Proletarians, a compilation of periodical articles between the early 1900s and the years following the Second World War, pointed to the rise of Ukrainian movements in the early twentieth century. These predominantly left-wing and labour-oriented groups were the result of a significant number of Ukrainian men who immigrated to Canada between 1906 and 1914, 60 per cent of whom worked as labourers. John Kolasky, ed. Prophets and Proletarians: Documents on the History of the Rise and Decline of Ukrainian Communism in Canada (Edmonton: Canadian Institute of Ukrainian Studies Press, University of Alberta, 1990),
labour organizations began to extend their societies from predominantly adult male membership to include women, children, and youth.\textsuperscript{15} By 1929, the WBA had 111 branches with a total of 7,500 members.\textsuperscript{16} By the Second World War, what had started as a movement confined to Western Canada had extended to a number of pro-communist mass organizations across the country.\textsuperscript{17} The Canadian government and RCMP Security Service established the WBA as a communist threat to national security during the Second World War, classifying it, along with many other leftist groups, predominantly Ukrainian, as a compromised organization under the Defence of Canada Regulations. Thus, by the Cold War, the WBA was a well-established RCMP target. Although it was less radical in the postwar era, the WBA’s history of communism during the 1920s and 1930s still marked it as a possible threat to Canadian security. For example, in their 1951 report on the organization, the RCMP provided evidence from the 1930s when the WBA’s \textit{Ukrainian Labor News} encouraged members to read Lenin and Marx.\textsuperscript{18} Given its roots as a labour organization and the “[p]rivation, Anglo-Saxon chauvinism and a sense of cultural isolation,” it was not surprising that the WBA, like other Ukrainian organizations at the time, turned to pro-communist ideology.\textsuperscript{19}

The Second World War internment of leftists\textsuperscript{20} affected how the WBA expressed its politics following the war.\textsuperscript{21} Operation Profunc reports from the early 1950s interpreted this hesitation not as the result of the current climate of anti-communism but as suspicious:

Until the suppression of the Ukrainian Labour Farmer Temple Association in 1940 the leaders of the WBA were more outspoken in supporting the Communist ideology (class fight, etc.) than in the post-war period. During the past number of years they concentrated on issues such as the peace campaign, agitation for outlawing the A-bomb and propaganda for ‘Slavs solidarity’ all of which are in line with Soviet Russia’s policy and the Communist Party line. This moderation in their attitude can be ascribed to a desire to keep the WBA intact so that in the event of the Association of United Ukrainian Canadians being suppressed the WBA could carry on.\textsuperscript{22}

\textsuperscript{xvi} Kolasky identified the most influential period of the organizations as between 1918 and 1956. \textit{Prophets and Proletarians}, xv.
\textsuperscript{15} Ibid., xix.
\textsuperscript{16} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{17} Ibid., xxii.
\textsuperscript{19} Kolasky, xxi.
\textsuperscript{20} The internment of Canadian leftists is discussed in more detail in Chapter One.
\textsuperscript{21} This is perhaps reflected in the declining membership of Ukrainian organizations in the 1950s. By the 1960s youth sections of these organizations had all but disappeared. Kolasky, xxvi.
The RCMP’s focus and definition of subversion was clear in this quotation. The reasoning was shaky at best, ignoring, for instance, some of the more obvious reasons to oppose the atomic bomb. It was more than the incendiary factors of communism, labour politics, and Eastern European ethnicity that established select Canadian organizations as potential threats in the eyes of the RCMP and Operation Profunc. From the perspective of the RCMP, a mixture of praise for Soviet social, labour, and peace programs, and criticism of the West’s adherence to nuclear war, capitalism, and imperialism firmly established organizations and individuals as possible, if not probable, threats to Canadian national security. To Operation Profunc and the RCMP, therefore, the WBA’s recommendation to ban nuclear weapons was an expression of potential disloyalty in the event of war with a Communist power.\(^{23}\) The philosophy behind the WBA’s mandates were clear in the organization’s resolutions which the RCMP quoted in a 1952 report:

The WBA thereby takes the initiative in the struggle for the protection of the health of people, whole-heartedly supports the demands for larger pension for the old people – our pioneers and parents, cares for the health of the children of the working class parents, scans the possibilities for establishing summer vacation camps, cares for the sports activity of the younger people, organizes medical health examinations, publishes literature on how to maintain sanitation and to preserve health, supports the struggle of the trade union and farmers’ organizations against the lowering of the living standard, because this results in poverty and diseases, actively supports the struggle for peace, because war brings death, etc. etc.\(^{24}\)

The focus and simplicity of the WBA’s final statement, “because war brings death, etc. etc.,” seemed to have been lost in the RCMP report.

The WBA’s aims and objectives, as outlined in its constitution and bylaws of March 1949, were threefold. It was a fraternal benefit society “organized solely for the purpose of rendering assistance to its members, their beneficiaries and their families.”\(^{25}\) The association also believed that in order to remain true to its mandate it was important to establish and maintain homes for members in need, such as the elderly, infirm, poor, and orphans of deceased

\(^{22}\) “The Workers Benevolent Association (W.B.A.),” March 1951, 8. Ibid., LAC. “Up to the war the ideological Communist background of the WBA was freely, sometimes even boastfully displayed in statements made by its leading members or in press articles which appeared on the pages of the Ukrainian Communist press. […] With the outbreak of the war, however, a more cautious attitude was adopted by the leadership of the WBA.” “The Relationship Between the WBA and the AUUC After the War,” report, 25 February 1952. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-26-18, LAC.

\(^{23}\) “Workers Benevolent Association of Canada,” report, 16 October, 1953, 18. Ibid., LAC.

\(^{24}\) “The Relationship Between the WBA and the AUUC After the War,” report, 25 February 1952, 5. Ibid., LAC.

members. And finally, the association was responsible for fostering among its members “a spirit of mutual co-operation, assistance, friendship and solidarity.” Hardly radical notions, but given the fear of Stalinist Russia, the RCMP quickly linked these socialist platforms to Soviet Communism. A 1952 Operation Profunc brief reviewing these platforms stated: “It is not difficult to perceive that the official programme of the W.B.A. goes far beyond purely benevolent activities,” and expressed a concern for events such as “fraternal cultural-education organizations” that were carried on by the association, also indicating an underlying suspicion of the benevolence.

Adding to the WBA’s apparent guilt was the link between its activities and those of the labour organization, the Association of United Ukrainian Canadians (AUUC). According to Profunc records, together the two organizations resolved to extend their political influence to the nation’s youth, an eventuality that troubled the RCMP given the possibilities of future subversion, never mind the larger concerns for the younger generation in the postwar era. Perhaps most troublesome for the RCMP were the plans to use WBA funds to sponsor youth delegates to travel to Prague, Czechoslovakia. The RCMP believed that trips to the Soviet Union and Eastern Europe provided dangerous exposure to communist information. Advertised as cultural excursions intended to promote cultural understanding in a period of global upheaval, these trips still made the RCMP suspicious. The RCMP’s concern and focus in this matter was not espionage or the exchange of military secrets, but the transmission of ideas, a fear also presented in the 1947 pamphlet, The Communist Threat to Canada.

26 “W.B.A.,” 1953, Ibid., LAC.
27 “W.B.A.,” 1953, Ibid., LAC.
28 “W.B.A.,” 1953, 3. Ibid., LAC.
29 “The Relationship between the WBA and the AUUC after the War,” 3. Ibid., LAC.
30 “The Relationship between the WBA and the AUUC after the War,” 6. Ibid., LAC.
32 According to a Profunc report, in 1956, when travel to the Soviet Union was opened, the Federation of Russian Canadians (FRC) planned to sponsor a three-year visit to the Soviet Union. More worryingly, by the early 1960s the FRC decided to extend eligibility for sponsored trips to the Soviet Union beyond its Russian-Canadian members. The organization’s reach then extended to Anglo-Canadians and other citizens who did not belong to the Russian-Canadian community, apparently developing the reach of Soviet Communism to the larger Canadian population. “Federation of Russian Canadians, June 1957-April 1960,” report, May 1960, 13. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-23-16, LAC. Additionally, the FRC planned for youth trips to ‘Iron Curtain’ countries through its affiliated association, the Russian Canadian Youth Organization. “The Federation of Russian Canadians, 1952 to mid-1957,” report, November 1957, 5. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-13-16, LAC.
33 “The Relationship between the WBA and the AUUC after the War,” 23. LAC.
The expectation that ideological contamination would occur between Canadians and Eastern Europeans on international trips was also evident in Profunc discussions about membership networks between the groups and other left-wing organizations. In some cases the link to communism went back to the organization’s roots. A link between the WBA and communist groups was drawn from the organization’s paper, *The Ukrainian Labour News*, a periodical that, according to the RCMP, “rather boastfully underline[d] the Communist character of the program underlying WBA activities.” The WBA and the Communist Party were seen as having comparable political and educational endeavours, related press organs, literature, youth and children’s groups, and similar rhetoric. Additionally, there was a shared membership: “The organic connection existing between the Association of United Ukrainian Canadians and the WBA on the one hand and the Ukrainian Communist Press on the other, is well illustrated by the choice of the men who fill the key positions in the WBA.” Evidence of the link between the WBA and the Canadian Communist Party had to be determined through something more than ideology. As for many of its targeted organizations, Operation Profunc provided a series of membership lists drawing links between the organization and other leftist or communist groups. An earlier report on the WBA from 1951 focused on the links between the WBA executive membership and the Labor Progressive Party (LPP). The newly elected president of the WBA, Antony Bilecki, for instance, was a member of the Manitoba Provincial Committee of the LPP and a Provincial Secretary of the AUUC, in addition to being classified by the RCMP as a “prominent figure in the Communist field.” The national secretary of the WBA and previous head of the organization, George Krentz was described in the document as being “a Communist of old standing,” while the treasurer, Mike Seychuk, was also a member of the LPP and vice president of the Manitoba Provincial Committee of the AUUC. Three other organizers of the WBA were identified by their connection to communist organizations, thus establishing the link between the association and groups such as the AUUC through communist ideology. In a 1962 report on the WBA, Operation Profunc established that out of twenty-four executive members

34 “The Workers Benevolent Association (W.B.A.),” March 1951, 5. LAC.
36 “The Workers Benevolent Association (W.B.A.),” March 1951, 26. LAC. More information on the WBA’s support for the Communist Press can be found in the February 1962 report, 7. LAC.
37 “The Workers Benevolent Association (W.B.A.),” March 1951. LAC.
across the country, seventeen were members of a branch of the Communist Party of Canada (CP of C).\textsuperscript{38}

Despite a 1953 report on the WBA wherein the RCMP allowed that there was no evidence of a clear link between it and the Canadian Communist Party,\textsuperscript{39} their overlapping membership lists convinced the RCMP of the WBA’s communist backing. But even without its socialist mandates it is unlikely that the WBA could have evaded RCMP surveillance. The organization’s ethnic and labour origins condemned it to police suspicions in a period of anti-communism. Although its activities were declining in the years following the Second World War, its history of socialism and RCMP surveillance made the WBA a target of Operation Profunc.

\textbf{4. Congress of Canadian Women: Subversion from within the Home}

The Congress of Canadian Women (CCW) was founded in Toronto in 1947. The organization was the Canadian chapter of the Women’s International Democratic Federation (WIDF), an organization established in Paris in 1945 with the platform to protect the rights of women and children around the world and ensure world peace.\textsuperscript{40} In a June 1960 report on the organization, the RCMP noted that: “In spite of its continued decline in activity, this brief will show that, as a women’s front organization, the CCW is a potentially influential force in the Communist movement.”\textsuperscript{41} The CCW was profiled as a compromising organization that promoted communism to Canadian women.

As the only women’s group consistently surveilled by Operations Profunc, its reports contained a certain element of derisiveness that did not appear in surveillance records of other organizations. This was particularly apparent in snide references to the organization’s “struggles.”\textsuperscript{42} Implicit in these comments was the idea that the CCW was misguided and ignorant of world politics. This attitude towards the CCW was not limited to the RCMP. An article published in the \textit{Toronto Evening Standard} in 1947 discussed the CCW’s foundational meeting, taking a didactic tone and warning women against “‘becoming both dupes and tools of

---

\textsuperscript{38} Of the executive members who were not direct members of a communist party, two were members of the Federation of Russian Canadians (one of which was a “suspected member of the CP of C”), three were members of the AUUC, and one was “active in AUUC and CP of C circles.” “Workers’ Benevolent Association: October 1953 to June 1961,” 7 February 1962. LAC.

\textsuperscript{39} “Workers Benevolent Association of Canada,” 16 October 1953, 12. LAC.

\textsuperscript{40} “Congress of Canadian Women,” report, June 1952, 1. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-26-55, LAC.


\textsuperscript{42} “The Congress of Canadian Women, 1952-1960,” 11. Ibid., LAC.
propaganda, the aim of which is to destroy freedom and spread tyranny.’”

The article, entitled, “Canadian Women Should be Careful What Causes they Support,” stated that enough time had passed since the Second World War for citizens to be rid of earlier illusions about the Soviet Union as an ally. Overall the article, as with the RCMP reports, comes off as judgmental and ultimately uncomfortable with the organization’s existence. The surveillance reports did their best to portray the CCW as a fiendish and fickle organization with its multitude of international causes and apparent attacks on the Canadian government. For example the CCW’s reaction to the Canadian government’s 1956 refusal of entry to a delegation of Soviet women visiting Canada on CCW sponsorship sparked condemnation. According to the 1960 Profunc report, the organization “quickly exploited this incident for propaganda purposes. This ‘arbitrary’ action, the CCW stated, was a deliberate effort to prevent international understanding between Canadian and Soviet women.”

The calculated choice of words in this report and others worked to diminish the members and their platform as dangerous and emotional. Portraying an organization as having an emotional approach to politics, ultimately being too ‘feminine,’ was generally reserved for both women and communists.

Women’s groups and activism were often deemed suspicious during the Cold War, particularly when they challenged the carefully organized gender paradigms of postwar society. Historian Julie Guard notes that the Housewives’ Consumer Association (HCA) and its activism countered popular warnings that communists were foreign radicals who destroyed society. She states: “The full time homemaker was thus a normative model for real women and a powerful cultural symbol of stability, security, and democracy.” The transformation of this symbol of comfort into a national security threat was illustrative of how the Cold War “construction of communism was deployed in the interests of the state.” As a result of this perception, it was not

43 Quoted in “The Congress of Canadian Women,” June 1952, 3. Ibid., LAC.
44 “The Congress of Canadian Women,” June 1952, 3. Ibid., LAC.
47 Brookfield, Cold War Comforts, 10. Because of this understood gendered social dichotomy it is easy to view the 1950s as devoid of feminism, but in the same way that the 1940s and 1950s were the breeding grounds for peace movements that became famous in the 1960s, so too did it cultivate female activism and the second-wave feminist movement. Brookfield, 28. This is also evident in Korinek’s Roughing it in the Suburbs.
49 Guard, 77.
50 Ibid.
surprising that Operation Profunc considered the CCW with its connection to the WIDF as a “handmaid in Soviet service.”

During the World Wars, when women’s labour moved into spheres previously held by men, women took on employment within Foreign Service and security positions. Jobs within these sectors were predominantly secretarial work, but this development led to a growing concern among a few officials that sensitive information could be at risk, in the hands of women, who were characterized as unprofessional and ultimately untrustworthy. Women were often portrayed as frivolous and liable to accidently spill important secrets through idle gossip. Whereas men’s weaknesses were tied to feminization (either as weakness or as homosexuals), which was closely tied to communism by both American and Canadian governments, women working within national security were regarded as threatening for a variety of character flaws.

Outside of the traditional roles of wife and mother, femininity lost the boundaries that contained it safely within a hetero-normative society emphasizing the structure and security of the nuclear family: “As producers and reproducers of future citizens, women were considered central to the social organization of the national security state, especially through the institution of the

51 “… the fight for peace, on which the Congress concentrated all its efforts, paralleling the Soviet world propaganda for peace. In this endeavour the CCW met with similar activities of the WIDF, which from the time of its foundation in 1945, was destined, as a series of broadcasts and announcements from Moscow indicated, to be a handmaid in Soviet service.” “Congress of Canadian Women,” June 1952, 4. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-26-55, LAC.

52 Gary Kinsman and Patrizia Gentile, The Canadian War on Queers: National Security as Sexual Regulation (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2009), 54. The increased employment of women in sensitive positions is evident in scholar Peter Galison’s deconstruction of the meaning and terminology of objectivity in science. In his study, Galison provided the example of the employment of women to do astronomical calculations for scientists in the 1910s. While he acknowledged that this practice can be and has been studied as a “labor-historical chapter in workplace history,” Galison addressed the implications behind the nineteenth-century influenced practice of hiring “unskilled” workers as a “tacit guarantee that these data were not a figment of a scientist’s imagination, or the results of a pre-existing philosophical commitment. In this respect, the workers were identified with the machines, and like the machines in their ‘emptiness’ they offered transparency through which nature could speak.” Peter Galison, “Judgment Against Objectivity,” in Picturing Science, Producing Art, ed. Caroline Jones and Peter Galison (New York: Routledge, “1998), 342-343. The women’s ‘lack of skill’ made them agents of scientific objectivity in the eyes of their employers. Women working in administrative positions during the Cold War were viewed in a similar light – unable to properly process the information but able to effectively transfer data between important individuals. But individuals, such as those described by MacKenzie, perceived women to be ignorant and therefore dangerous to national security on account of their apparent frivolity and inability to comprehend the severity of classified information.

53 Kinsman and Gentile, The Canadian War on Queers, 54.

54 One example was the RCMP’s profiling of Canadian historian Frank Underhill as feminized, lacking moral courage, and of questionable masculinity when he wept when censured by the police. Steve Hewitt, Spying 101: The RCMP’s Secret Activities at Canadian Universities, 1917-1997 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2002), 62.
During the Cold War, women were seen as moral compasses for society. When the domestic construction of women crumbled, so too did the understood security of society.

Throughout Operation Profunc’s reports, which covered the CCW’s activities and mandates, the RCMP vehemently repeated the idea that this ‘seemingly innocent’ gathering of women was a communist front organization. The June 1960 report, for instance, concluded: “Although the CCW has officially denied that it is a Communist front organization, it is, in practice, an integral part of the Canadian and International Communist movement.”

Regardless of the group’s official statements, it was considered a communist organization largely because of its close association to other organizations with socialist and peace-oriented agendas, such as the Workers Benevolent Association and the Canadian Peace Congress. The CCW was targeted because of its ability, the RCMP believed, to sow the seeds of communism amongst Canadians.

The CCW’s platforms and mandates reflected the desire for peace in a period of political and military upheaval. It lobbied for safety for women and children domestically and internationally. The congress’s policies covered three areas: peace, improvement of living conditions, and the rights of Canadian women and children. Platforms that were organized in the interest of citizens’ welfare were not radical but they were linked with communism and hence suspicious. Evident in the vetting of the CCW was the lack of nuance that existed for

55 Kinsman and Gentile, 54.
57 This classification was also expressed in Brookfield’s work that referred to the CCW as a “communist-led women’s organization that listed peace as one of its aims.” Cold War Comforts, 78.
58 Under the heading “Peace” were the following platforms: a) Disarmament; b) Ban on testing and manufacturing of nuclear weapons; c) Recognition of Red China; and d) Peaceful negotiation among nations. Report, June 1960, 7-8. LAC.
59 Under “Improvement of Living Conditions” were the following: a) Need for a National Health Plan; b) Increase in Family Allowances; and c) Increase in Old Age Pensions. Ibid., 7-8. LAC.
60 And under “the Rights of Canadian Women and Children” were: a) The right to work with equality of job opportunities; b) Equal pay for equal work; c) The right to all social security benefits; d) Equal right with men in marriage; e) The right to full education; and f) Increased day care and nursery facilities for all children. Ibid., 7-8. LAC.
61 The police surveillance of the Federation of Russian Canadian’s paper Vestnik (Herald) also indicated how socialist platforms could be deemed radical and suspect. Headlines recorded in the Profunc report indicated a combination of the paper’s interests in the Soviet Union and concerns for the state of the Western world in a period of military imperialism. Headlines included: “There is no Unemployment in the Soviet Occupation Zone of Germany,” “The Rapid Reconstruction and the Swift Industrial Rise of the USSR,” “Electrical Highways in the USSR,” “England is Concerned about the Possibility of a Crisis in USA,” “The Head of the French Professional Unions on the Impending Crisis in USA,” and “The German War Industrialists let off Scot-free.” “Russian Canadian Youth Organization and Brief: The Federation of Russian Canadians,” report, 1955, 12-13. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-23-16, LAC. The socialist focus of the group was evident in these headings; however the RCMP’s focus
peace operations in the late 1940s and 1950s. According to the Operation Profunc records, socialist organizations were either working as foreign agents of communism in Canada or were blissfully unaware of the dangerous ideals they were promoting. The CCW was often portrayed as the latter.

At other points in their records, the RCMP portrayed the CCW as less than innocent. A 1952 Profunc report observed that the long range of resolutions adopted by the 279 delegates at the initial meeting “reflected a general policy running parallel to the main objectives of the LPP program.” A later Profunc report from 1960 stated that the CCW was directly tied to communist organizations on two fronts: at home through the Canadian Communist Party and internationally through the WIDF, an “International Communist ‘front’ organization.” The report went on to state that under the WIDF the CCW, “since its inception, reflected the strategy and objectives of Soviet foreign policy. In domestic matters, the influence of the Communist Party of Canada (CP of C) has been unmistakable.” The majority of the CCW membership, regardless of their socialist politics, would not have agreed that their organization was linked to the Soviet Union. The first WIDF convention in Paris was organized by a French socialist women’s group, but the presence of the Soviet delegates put most of the other members ill at ease. According to an informant’s report of this meeting, little solidarity existed between the western women and the Soviet women who arrived “[d]ressed in male uniforms of army officers and laden with full-sized medals of war […].” The discomfort caused by the Soviet delegates’ masculine appearance echoed contemporary fears of lesbianism. These women were identified by the western delegates as ‘others’ – for their politics as well as their questionable femininity. The women, who were apparently permitted to leave the Soviet Union for the first time since the war, took advantage of the situation, bringing with them “a great pile of propaganda material which they distributed among the foreign delegates.” According to the lukewarm meeting on the federation’s criticism of the German war industrialists pointed to the confusion of ‘communist’ and ‘capitalist’ binaries.

---

62 “The Congress of Canadian Women,” June 1952, 7. LAC.
63 Report, June 1960, 1. LAC.
64 Ibid., LAC.
65 Report, June 1952, 3. LAC.
66 Unlike the other Allied women forces, some women in the Soviet army actively participated in combat.
67 Report, June 1952, 3. LAC. What these women brought back to the Soviet Union (literature, clothing, cosmetics or other items of “western” capitalism unavailable in Russia) is never mentioned or suggested in the Profunc reports. The flow of propaganda, according to these reports, only moved in direction.
between the Western and Soviet women, it was clear that a strong connection between the WIDF
and actual Soviet Communism did not exist, at least not for the delegates at the meeting.

The CCW, with its links to the WIDF, functioned at both domestic and international
levels. In lobbying against nuclear weapons, the CCW published several types of literature such
as pamphlets and, until 1956, a newsletter entitled *Women’s Voice*. In addition to their
publications, the CCW organized public events on International Women’s Day and International
Children’s Day, collaborating with women’s groups around the world to celebrate the right of
global citizens to world peace. From the perspective of Profunc’s 1960 report on the
organization, however, these internal celebrations apparently were an effort to amalgamate all of
the communist women’s groups together and thus join forces against the West. The international
component of the CCW was particularly worrying for Operation Profunc. As with other
organizations’ sponsored trips to Communist Europe and attendance at international and non-
governmental peace talks, the CCW’s interactions with similar-minded individuals on an
international scale threatened to bring communist ideology home through the home.

Several members of the CCW also attended the World Peace Congress in Warsaw in
1951. As the 1952 Profunc report detailed, shortly after returning to Canada, Rae Luckock and
secretary Libbie C. Park organized for all CCW chapters and “affiliated organizations” to attend
the Second All-Canadian Women’s Conference in March 1951.68 Profunc’s 1952 report stated:
“The main objective of the Conference was the drafting of a peace charter for Canadian women
along the lines adopted in the resolutions of the Warsaw Peace Congress.”69 As Tarah Brookfield
stated in her book on Cold War Canadian women’s activist groups, “Understanding that the Cold
War was caused by an out-dated us-versus-them attitude, other activists purposely extended open
arms and made it a point to find common interests with ‘enemy’ women in the Soviet Union,
mainland China, and North Vietnam.”70 This sense of comradeship was not evident in the WIDF
convention in Paris. In that case, the ‘Us’ versus ‘Them’ paradigm was contested through the
lack of unity between the western socialists and the Soviet communists – both groups were on
the left, but they were hardly the same. Brookfield’s study examines the relationship between
women’s groups as the Cold War developed into increasingly ugly proxy wars and nuclear
standoffs. In the meantime, to challenge Cold War paradigms was to defy the Cold War concept

---

68 “Congress of Canadian Women,” June 1952, LAC.
69 “Congress of Canadian Women,” June 1952, LAC.
70 Brookfield, *Cold War Comforts*, 8.
of the enemy and thus pose a threat to national stability. The anxiety about this uncertainty was evident in Profunc’s persistent effort to find solace in a clear and concrete enemy.

The RCMP and Operation Profunc made several attempts to establish a financial connection between the Canadian Communist Party and the CCW. The Communist Party’s sponsorship of Canadian women to attend WIDF conventions overseas, however, was apparently non-existent or, in the words of the Profunc report, “fragmentary.” Records indicated that the CCW did receive funding, particularly for international conferences, but that the Finnish Order of Canada and Federation of Russian Canadians, both listed as mass-language organizations, appeared to be the only communist connection to the organization. The CCW’s other apparent links to communism were the various communist front and mass-language organizations that were represented at CCW national conventions.

The CCW’s membership yielded more results in Profunc’s search for communist infiltration and involvement than did the organization’s financial connections. One Profunc report suggested that the CCW president in 1950 was a puppet. The “real work,” the report stated, was left to a member of the CCW, “Mrs. Jefferson” Hurley who also belonged to the LPP. According to the reports, Hurley’s husband was an officer of the Union of United Electrical Workers, an organization that was disbanded for being “communist infiltrated.” The reports also pointed to the strong connection between the CCW and the Peace Congress, particularly through the Endicott family. Some of the data regarding members’ ties with other apparently radical organizations were discussed in terms of membership crossovers. A list of the 1957 National Executive showed that out of the fifteen executive members, twelve had, at some point in their lives, been members of either the LPP or the CP of C. Three of these had experience as executive members of either communist organization. A remaining three executive members had no direct membership in either the CP of C or the LPP, but one was a member of the Workers Benevolent Association and apparently a regular attendee of CP of C meetings. Another was a member of the Finnish Organization of Canada, and Mary Endicott, wife of James Endicott, was a member of the Canadian Peace Congress. What differed between these membership lists and those for other organizations was that they included a history of the executive members’

72 Report, June 1960, 7. LAC.
73 Report, June 1952. LAC.
74 Ibid., LAC.
75 Report, June 1960. LAC.
Part Two: Chapter Six

affiliations with other groups, accentuating concerns about personal connections. Operation Profunc’s reports drew connections between the CCW’s membership affiliations to communism on the basis of their husbands’ politics and ethnicities, pointing to a personal infiltration of communism from the home into the organizations and vice versa.

The 1960 Profunc report on the CCW referred to the group’s on-going efforts to have a wider appeal to non-political Canadian women. In discussing this perceived role of the CCW to bring communist propaganda to the average Canadian woman, the Profunc report explicitly referred to the CCW as an infiltrating force. It stated that in order to attract new members the “CCW has been encouraged by the CP of C to make a greater effort to infiltrate Parent-Teacher Associations, church and civic groups, and various other women’s organizations.” In its concern for Soviet and communist infiltration in Canada, Operation Profunc portrayed the spread of enemy ideology as rapidly making its way through a vast network of subversives. This portrayal of an elusive but quickly spreading ideology through what the RCMP described as ‘seemingly innocent’ civilian organizations spoke to a comprehensive fear of a covert infiltration that infected seemingly unsuspecting sectors of society.

5. Canadian Peace Congress: Undermining the Superpowers through Pacifism

The targeting of the Canadian Peace Congress (CPC) was indicative of the continued association Operation Profunc made between pacifism and subversion. The RCMP and Canadian government’s aversion to the cause of peace during the late 1940s and 1950s was especially apparent in the police surveillance and profiling of the CPC and its members. Established on 8 May 1949, a symbolic date since it was the fourth anniversary of Victory over Europe (VE), the CPC was an organization that promoted military restraint in the nuclear age. Once more, the humour of Norris’s editorial cartoon was in the hyperbole. But therein also lay the danger. Despite inherent nationalism in the opening rhetoric of the Peace Congress, declaring the organization’s inception on the anniversary of VE Day and dedicating its cause for peace to the

---

76 Ibid., LAC.
77 The 1952 report on the CCW, for instance, began with an observation that given the stance of the organization to “fight against Fascism and for Peace” to have a sponsoring committee dominated by LPP members, one of whom, H. Infeld, was identified as such because of her Polish-born husband, Dr. Leopold Infeld, who “suddenly returned in 1950 to Communist Poland under rather mysterious conditions, to assume an important position on the World Council.” Report, June 1952. LAC.
78 Report, June 1960, 9-10. LAC.
79 Ibid., LAC.
memory of Canadians who fought and died in the Second World War, the CPC was subjected to surveillance and suspicion. The CPC praised the Soviet peace movement and criticised the American, British, and Canadian governments for their militant perception of the Soviet Union. For this reason, Operation Profunc classified the Peace Congress, led by Canadian peace activist Dr. James Endicott, as a communist front organization.

A pacifist and academic, Dr. Endicott, a former missionary for the United Church in China, was a primary target of surveillance. He was by many accounts personable and a skilled and charismatic speaker. According to Whitaker and Marcuse, even Endicott’s worst enemies had to admit this and acknowledge his ability to gather an audience: “It is a tribute to these qualities, as well as a reflection of the deep concern about the question of war in the nuclear age, that he was able to draw surprisingly large and appreciative crowds wherever he went.” While the RCMP worked to prove that Endicott was a ‘card-carrying member of the Communist party,’ there was little evidence. Surveillance records of the CPC stated that Endicott remained “aloof from the CP of C,” but confirmed that “the same cannot be said for his family.” The report pointed to the activity of Endicott’s wife Mary and stated that she and their four children had all “at one point or another, been associated with subversive organizations.” The documents also portray Endicott as unwittingly being used by communists and, by proxy, posing a potential threat to Canadians through his apparent ignorance of the ‘dangers’ of communism. A document presented to the House of Commons, which referred to Endicott’s speech against germ warfare in June 1952, debated whether or not he should be prosecuted and stated that he was “obviously permitting himself to be used as a tool by which the propaganda of the atheistic communist party is spread throughout the world.” According to the RCMP Security Service, Endicott, through his innocence and optimism for world peace, was a carrier of communism. Given the context of

---

81 “The government felt strongly enough about attempts to undermine the war effort in Korea that the cabinet seriously considered laying a charge of treason against Dr. James Endicott of the Canadian Peace Congress for remarks alleging American use of germ warfare in North Korea. […] only the magnitude of the penalty – death – deterred the ministers from such a drastic action.” Whitaker and Marcuse, Cold War Canada, 199.
82 Whitaker and Marcuse, 367.
83 Whitaker and Marcuse, 369.
85 These groups included CP of C clubs, communist groups such as National Federation of Labour Youth and World Federation of Democratic Youth, and “front organization” Congress of Canadian Women. The report included the families memberships between 1948 and 1959. “The Canadian Peace Congress, 1951-1959,” 5 and 6. LAC.
86 “Germ Warfare: Statements of Dr. ENDICOTT – Decision Concerning Legal Action,” Appendix A, Debates House of Commons Dominion of Canada, 25 June 1952. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-26-44, LAC. The document goes on to state that the Canadian Peace Congress would likely have very little effect on public opinion.
anti-communism, campaigns for peace were no longer just that; they were tools in the Soviet war against the west.

Nuclear warfare was central to the peace dilemma. While anti-nuclear protests, beginning in the late 1940s, reached a peak in the 1950s, the majority of Canadians saw the bomb as a tool to maintain peace. Support for the bomb was encouraged despite obvious threats and dangers of potential war. Historian Sarah Fox’s book, *Downwind: A People’s History of the Nuclear West*, examines the situation that many Americans faced living downwind from nuclear testing sites and uranium mines through the Cold War. In addition to the corporate and governmental interests in the nuclear industry and military weaponry, civilians were caught between supporting their nation’s war effort and the widespread damages the nuclear industry caused. An organized effort to reduce knowledge of the dangers of radiation was further fuelled by the Atomic Energy Commission’s manipulation of information regarding damaged livestock, crops, and declining health of ranchers and uranium miners within the affected regions. This connection between patriotism and support for nuclear weapons was also evident in contemporary civil defence programs. Despite medical and scientific evidence that proved otherwise, civil defence programs provided civilians with out-dated information, simplified solutions, and euphemistic language emphasizing the possibility of surviving nuclear attack. As was evident in Canadian Civil Defence and Emergency Measures Organization booklets from the 1950s and 1960s, the rhetoric encouraging civilians to accept both the possibility of nuclear war and their ability to survive attack promoted a sense of controlled anxiety. Controlled anxiety pushed civilians to fear the likelihood of nuclear war only so much as to support North American nuclear programs in the hopes of protection from similar enemy weaponry, rather than pushing civilians to support nuclear disarmament. Andrea Tone discussed the way in which civilians confronted the fear of nuclear attack by anesthetizing the growing panic of inescapable doom through tranquilizers and civil defence rituals:

Americans prepared themselves to withstand a nuclear attack, if only because they believed they could. Call it patriotism; call it denial; some later called it foolish.

---

87 Whitaker and Marcuse, 364.
88 Sarah Alisabeth Fox, *Downwind: A People’s History of the Nuclear West* (Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press, 2014), 172.
89 Fox, *Downwind*, 65-66.
90 Frances Reilly, “The Consumption of Science and Technology: Canadian Atomic Culture during the Cold War” Master of Arts Thesis (Edmonton, University of Alberta, 2008), 45.
These readiness rituals [such as civil defence] reflected an equal measure of terror and faith. The apocalypse could be prepared for. And with the right tools and techniques, the nuclear devastation might be endured.\(^92\)

The bomb was to be feared only when in the hands of the enemy. Consequently, nuclear war was essential to the existence of the CPC. The organization was formed shortly following the dawn of the nuclear age in 1945 and a few years before the commencement of the nuclear arms race in 1949. The CPC was therefore established at a time of military asymmetry when only one superpower had the atomic bomb. By the time the hydrogen bomb was invented, the CPC was no longer as popular as it was in the late 1940s given its status as one of the RCMP’s primary targets.\(^93\) Nevertheless, the invention of a more deadly weapon further drew the public’s attention to the need for peace in the nuclear age.

RCMP reports characterized the CPC’s platforms as thinly veiled expressions of pro-Soviet rhetoric. A 1951 Profunc report, for instance, stated that there was “no reasonable doubt” that the CPC was organized by officers of the LPP and that it had remained under communist control ever since its inception.\(^94\) In this case communism was clearly confused with peace activism and rhetoric. The CPC openly criticised the power of American military imperialism and “war mongers,” such as General MacArthur, whose views on nuclear and biological weaponry and the implicit right of American military powers were well known. Profunc quoted a 1949 CPC item that compared the American military powers to Nazis.\(^95\) The piece in question, entitled “Peace Manifesto Adopted by Continental Congress in Mexico,” from the journal of the Bureau of the Committee of the World Congress of the Defenders of Peace, stated: “‘The warmongers are spreading the same racial and anti-Communist propaganda as did the Nazis, in order to split and sow confusion in public opinion and to conceal their true aims.’”\(^96\) The report also recorded the CPC’s sacrilegious profile of Winston Churchill as a “goulish [sic] old man who lusted for more bloodshed” and Louis St. Laurent as “the individual with nationalistic ideas who had formed an unholy alliance with the Vatican, and declared that Canada was being led into a war.”\(^97\) This comment likely raised ire for a number of reasons, namely the critique of a

---

\(^{93}\) Whitaker and Marcuse, 382.
\(^{94}\) “Brief: Canadian Peace Congress,” 2 June 1951, 1. LAC.
\(^{95}\) “Brief: Canadian Peace Congress,” 2 June 1951, 21. LAC.
\(^{96}\) Ibid., LAC.
\(^{97}\) Ibid., 12. LAC.
wartime British prime minister and of the relationship between church and state, identified here as an expression of anti-Catholicism. It did not, however, indicate a tie to the Soviet Union or international Communism.

The CPC was adamant that nuclear weapons should not be tested and used in war.\textsuperscript{98} Dr. Endicott openly criticised the West’s support for American General MacArthur. He proposed a set of resolutions that included the following: “‘The immediate prohibition of the atomic bomb as a weapon of warfare—.’ ‘Condemnation, specifically of Canada’s interference with the legitimate struggles of the people of China, Indonesia and other nations by support of their suppressors.’”\textsuperscript{99} In addition to its public praise for the Soviet peace programs, the CPC criticised western politicians for using ‘peace’ rhetoric for purely imperial and military means.\textsuperscript{100} The CPC was part of a larger organization called the World Peace Council which, in representing eighty-two nations, was referred to as a “People’s United Nations.” This organization presented its manifesto at the Warsaw Conference in 1950 and called for an end to American and French military action in Southeast Asia, an international tribunal to examine MacArthur’s actions, a banning of weapons of mass destruction, the reduction of armies and armaments around the world, a cease-fire withdrawal of foreign armies in Korea, and the inclusion of China in UN talks.\textsuperscript{101} Essentially, this organization, as with the larger peace movement, saw the proxy wars not as wars against communism, as they were portrayed within western media, but as imperialist conflicts that could lead to unprecedented global destruction.

Within this context, the CPC advocated for stronger lines of international communication. The North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO), for instance, prohibited open communication between the Soviet Union and the West. Within this context, Endicott and the CPC openly opposed treatises such as the Atlantic Pact. Such treaties, they believed, were agreements that prohibited the Soviet Union from entering international discussions, leaving no opportunity for negotiation while trapping the Soviet Union in the role of opponent.\textsuperscript{102} Canadian delegates, including Endicott, travelled to Mexico City in 1949 for a Continental Peace

\textsuperscript{98} Interestingly there is no record available in the briefs of the CPC’s reaction to the 1949 Soviet atomic bomb test, which was likely negative and indicative of a lack of support for Soviet military action against the west.
\textsuperscript{99} “Brief: Canadian Peace Congress,” 2 June 1951, 18. LAC.
\textsuperscript{100} Ibid., 25. LAC.
\textsuperscript{101} Ibid., 4-5. LAC.
\textsuperscript{102} “Brief: Canadian Peace Congress,” brief, 2 January 1951, 18. Reference no. A 2011-00179-11-26-44, LAC.
Congress. Endicott also travelled to Moscow in the same year as a member of the World Peace Congress where he and other representatives of the organization presented a peace appeal before the Supreme Soviet. This event was followed by the World Peace Committee in Stockholm that produced the “Stockholm Appeal,” a petition advocating for the prohibition of atomic weapons. At the second national convention of the CPC in May 1950, the “Ban the Bomb” petition that was launched in Canada at the end of 1949 had reached 164,000 signatures, and the “Stockholm Appeal” was launched with the goal of reaching 500,000 names from Canada. Throughout the early Cold War, Endicott and the other Canadian delegates who attended international conferences demanding world peace, returned home with information about the global peace movement. This information was then distributed across Canada in a series of Peace Congress talking tours in an effort to help organize local peace councils across the country. In addition to door-to-door distribution of CPC pamphlets and public meetings, the CPC also had several opportunities to spread its ideology through radio broadcasts, at least, as Whitaker and Marcuse write, “in the early years of the Peace Congress before ‘Communists’ were in effect banned from the air waves.”

As with the Workers Benevolent Association and the Congress of Canadian Women, the RCMP surveillance team closely monitored the CPC’s membership. Members clearly stated in The Canadian Tribune that the CPC was without party affiliations and that it was run without membership:

Our Canadian Peace Movement is not a membership organization. We do not wish to limit in any way, any group or individual who desires to work for peace. We hope rather to act as co-ordinators and as focus for all those organizations and individuals wishing to find avenues of expression against the war makers and for peace and prosperity in our country.

Despite the above 1949 statement from CPC delegate Mary Jennison, Operation Profunc closely surveilled individual connections between the Peace Congress and other presumably radical organizations. One 1951 brief on the organization quoted passages from an official directive

---

103 “Brief: Canadian Peace Congress,” brief, 2 January 1951, Ibid., 10. LAC.
104 “Brief: Canadian Peace Congress,” 2 January 1951, 11. LAC.
105 “Brief: Canadian Peace Congress,” 2 January 1951, 4. LAC.
106 Whitaker and Marcuse, 367.
107 “Brief: Canadian Peace Congress,” 2 January, 1951. LAC. Passage taken from an address given by CPC delegate Mary Jennison at Mexico City in 1949.
released by the Trade Union Committee of the LPP, pointing to the organization’s connection to the CPC:

Only such an organized and all-embracing peace movement can act as an affective [sic] barrier to the plotters of another war and save our country from being battered into an unwholly [sic] war such as the fascists waged so disastrously.

But that in turn is dependent upon the extent of active trade union participation in the Peace Congress. The trade unions and working-class are decisive factors in the fight for peace and must play an active and leading role in it, for only the labor movement can give the peace movement flesh and blood, give the strength, cohesion and direction necessary to prevent Canada and the Canadian people from being embroiled in an imperialist war.\textsuperscript{108}

From several angles, the above statement from CPC secretary William Kashtan expressed concern for the welfare of Canada.\textsuperscript{109} Despite the clear anti-fascist statement, the real cause for concern was the connection drawn between the labour movement and peace movements. In the same Profunc brief, the RCMP made several connections between the CPC’s membership and that of other more volatile organizations, referring to the organization’s opening meeting in May 1948 that was “presided over by Mrs. Rae LUCKOCK, President of the Housewives’ Consumers Association (Communist front) and a member of the National Council for Canadian Soviet Friendship.”\textsuperscript{110} According to the same 1951 brief on the CPC, of the twenty-five members who attended the 1950 World Peace Council, fourteen were members of the LPP.\textsuperscript{111} In her work on the HCA, Guard noted that several of its members had ties to other organizations, sometimes through their own membership but quite often through the activity of their husbands. The provincial president of the Alberta chapter of the HCA, for instance, was “Mrs. Ben Swankey” who was not only a member of the LPP, but whose husband also had been head of the Communist party of Alberta and was interned during the Second World War for his politics.\textsuperscript{112} According to Guard, however, while some women were indeed communist, they identified primarily as women, challenging the RCMP’s understanding of the predominance of leftist politics over the organization’s other functions.\textsuperscript{113}

\textsuperscript{108} “Brief: Canadian Peace Congress, 1951.” LAC. Quoting Secretary William Kashtan. Original emphasis.

\textsuperscript{109} Kashtan later became leader of the Communist Party of Canada (1965-1988) and helped push Endicott out of the CPC leadership because of his criticism of the Soviet Union.

\textsuperscript{110} “Brief: Canadian Peace Congress,” 2 January, 1951. LAC.

\textsuperscript{111} “Brief: Canadian Peace Congress,” 1951. LAC.

\textsuperscript{112} Ben Swankey’s experiences in the internment camp were discussed in Chapter One.

\textsuperscript{113} Guard, 75.
The CPC was intent on attracting the awareness of average Canadians in order to draw attention to what was a dire global military situation. The CPC tried to encourage Canadian citizens to support peace movements. By promoting the view that Soviets were civilians like Canadians, the CPC worked to undermine international policies and possible future military endeavours that would capitalize on the paradigmatic view of the world divided between Communism and democracy.\footnote{Considering Canada’s military role in Korea during the 1950s, the CPC’s efforts were not entirely successful.} In addition to the organization’s international activities, the RCMP also monitored smaller events such as local social gatherings and parades. These were generally frequented by a largely apolitical population: however the precedent set by more ‘suspicious’ activities such as organized trips between Canada and the Soviet Union from the perspective of the RCMP raised suspicion of these more ‘innocent’ occasions.

6. Conclusion

Through its focus on various civilian groups, Operation Profunc expressed the fear that what appeared as innocuous might be in fact dangerous. Within this misperceived web-like network of subversion, the targeted individuals and groups were considered guilty for their implicit and often vague associations with “volatile” organizations. More insidious was the classification of leftist beliefs and ideals as dangerous to national security and the overwhelming assertion that benevolence and social systems were actually exercises in hiding a deeper and darker agenda.

At the basis of Operation Profunc was the expectation of subversion. In the documents available, the most incriminating elements of suspicious organizations were their support of socialist ideology, pacifism, and ethnic ties to the Soviet Union. These were the condemning links that tied them to the larger confirmed communist organizations such as the Canadian Communist Party or Communist governments abroad. At the foundation of this surveillance program was the classification of groups such as the Workers Benevolent Association, Congress of Canadian Women, and Canadian Peace Congress as subversive because of the fluidity of communism and membership. Ultimately, the Operation Profunc surveillance records reflected the belief that organizations, regardless of their political affiliations, could be ‘infected’ by subversive membership.

Despite the levels of censorship of the Profunc documents and the limitations of the information currently available through the records, this collection of data is useful to illustrate
the way in which Operation Profunc conceptualized the Cold War threat. These records provide an impression of what the Profunc organizers believed could or might be happening within organizations across the country, namely communist infiltration and control. This expectation for disaster, Canadians’ subversion to the cause of Soviet Communism, was foundational to the Cold War notion of threat and impending destruction. What the Profunc documents on these groups demonstrate was that surveillance continued despite a lack of concrete evidence of the link with communism. Employing a model of political contagion and notions of how communism was transmitted like a virus, namely guilt by association, the RCMP surveilled suspected organizations and citizens.
CHAPTER SEVEN  Medicalization and Surveillance: The Expert, the Self, and the Culture of Anxiety

1. Introduction
   In a 1962 article published in the *Canadian Medical Association Journal*, an anonymous writer provided a personal response to the existing structure of sexual psychiatry in Canada. The article, “Living with Homosexuality,” presented the personal, social, and medical tribulations of a man who identified himself as a “healthy young male of 30 handicapped by homosexuality.”\(^1\)

   The author’s use of term ‘handicapped’ was significant as he self-identified not only as sexually disabled but also as medically abnormal.\(^2\) The writer addressed some of the more troubling aspects of sexual psychotherapy in Canada and the search for a ‘cure’ for homosexuality. In his article, he confronted several assumptions regarding the etiology of homosexuality, its nomenclature, and its nature as a condition. He asserted that it was not caught, learned, or adopted but rather innate – he was born with it. At the same time, he referred to homosexuality as a medical condition, evident in his use of “handicapped” to describe his situation. This rhetoric indicated less his view of sexuality and more the contemporary perception of ‘normal’ sexuality and how it affected the individual living outside of its tightly defined boundaries.

   Offering his personal experience and understanding of sexuality, along with his own background in psychology, the writer addressed the psychological and physical harm caused by the medicalization of sexuality in Canada. The article demonstrated the power of self-surveillance through the medical control over sexuality and the individual.

   The 1950s and 1960s were a crucial period in the histories of sexuality and psychiatry. This was an era of social, cultural, and scientific transition. “Living with Homosexuality” was therefore a significant article as it captured this period of flux. While the writer’s experience was hardly universal for all gay men, it effectively demonstrated the experience of a well-educated man who was caught between the multiple and conflicting definitions of homosexuality during this period as sinful, criminal, and ill. Most startling about the article was the author’s sense of

1 Anonymous, “The Other Side: Living with Homosexuality,” *Canadian Medical Association Journal* 86 (12 May 1962): 875. Reference to C. Allen, *Homosexuality, Its Nature, Causation and Treatment* (London: Staples Press, 1958). The author’s demographics are not entirely clear since there is no reference to where he is from, where in Canada he lives, and or his ethnicity. Still, the article indicates that the man was university educated. He also was a member of the Air Force, although it is unclear where he served in addition to Canada.

2 His choice of words echoes S. R. Laycock’s use of the term in his 1950 article, “Homosexuality – a Mental Hygiene Problem,” as discussed in the Introduction.
self-awareness and emotional turmoil resulting from self-surveillance. He made the alarming statement that, upon discovering his sexuality as a young adult, “I felt that I must be mentally diseased, immoral and sinful to have such desires. Plans to castrate myself or to end my life altogether were frequently on my mind.”³ In a university psychology class he developed a scientific perspective of homosexuality that challenged his moralistic understanding. This education, however, did not necessarily dismiss well-established myths about gay men. Despite his education, persistent portrayals of gay men as pedophiles and perverts still affected how he saw himself. His perception of this “disorder” eventually ruined his career as a schoolteacher. He then devoted himself to the Air Force full-time, aware that the constant movement that is required for the occupation would make it difficult to form relationships.⁴ Unfortunately, a few years later, the writer’s Commanding Officer discovered his romantic relationship with another man and dismissed the writer from service.

Throughout the article the author, having now come to terms with being homosexual, described his past desires to fix or end his so-called condition. He also emphasized how these desires resulted from the power of the public’s perception of homosexuality that was further strengthened by the medicalization of sexual behaviour. He stated that “as a homosexual, I did not consider it right to go on teaching, even though children do not attract me and I can keep my overt behaviour under control.”⁵ In addition to a fear for how he might be treated by the law and the psychiatric community, the writer expressed a fear of himself. His concern for how he could function within society indicated a deeper implication of the psychiatric diagnosis of homosexuality as a mental disorder.

In addition to public and medical perceptions about homosexuality in Canadian society, the anonymous writer addressed the difficulties of navigating one’s own sexuality given the contemporary emphasis on the dichotomy between ‘healthy’ and ‘unhealthy’ sexuality. The writer observed a noticeable lack of consensus between clinicians as to what he should do about his sexuality. Psychiatrists, for instance, disputed advice he had received from a psychologist to embrace his sexuality.⁶ This discrepancy in opinion indicated the divisions between the fields along with the multiple theories and few points of agreement regarding what homosexuality was

³ Anonymous, 875.
⁴ Ibid., 876.
⁵ Ibid.
⁶ Ibid., 877.
Part Two: Chapter Seven

and how it should be treated. Throughout his twenties, the writer experienced a variety of therapies extending beyond psychoanalysis or talk therapy, including the use of LSD.\(^7\) In addition to a mixed response about the possible severity of his perceived psychological issue, the writer noted that he was, at age thirty, apparently too old and poor to benefit from treatment.\(^8\) For several clinicians, curing wayward or ‘abnormal’ sexuality had to be achieved in the earlier stages of the patient’s life.\(^9\)

In addition to a lack of medical consensus on treatment, the writer also noted that the Canadian psychiatric community failed homosexual patients with a lack of resources. While homosexuality was profiled as a problem and a threat to modern society, few individuals could successfully find treatment. Referring to Kinsey’s figures, the writer reasoned that in Canada there were in 1962 close to 350,000 gays and lesbians between the ages of fifteen and sixty years: “This is a staggering figure, and if they all sought treatment it would probably take up the working time of all the therapists in the country.”\(^10\) The reality was that not all gays and lesbians sought help and only a portion of the population considered themselves sick, while others denied their sexuality, adopting a straight lifestyle. Still others lived as openly gay as society would allow. The writer also noted that despite the apparent focus on homosexuality as a mental disorder, psychiatrists were generally aware that there was little chance of finding a cure for the condition. While the medicalization of sexuality was emphasized and encouraged within the medical and psychiatric communities, the practical process of pathologization was incomplete. The definition of sexuality and sexual behaviour as an inherent representation of the individual’s psychosis, while emphasized, was still new and in many ways still in its nascent period.

“Living with Homosexuality” was unique to the CMAJ in that it presented the issue of homosexuality and its pathology from a personal perspective.\(^11\) The article was about the clinic, but from the perspective of the patient. Rather than focusing on being homosexual, the writer

---

\(^7\) Ibid.
\(^8\) Ibid.
\(^9\) Mary Louise Adams discusses this clinical emphasis on sexual development in childhood and adolescence and refers to G. Stanley Hall’s views about the need to control adolescent sexuality: “He claimed that youthful passions were malleable or ‘plastic’ and could easily be directed into non-sexual occupations and pursuits like religion, the arts, or athletics.” Mary Louise Adams, The Trouble with Normal: Postwar Youth and the Making of Heterosexuality (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2003 [1997]), 45.
\(^10\) Anonymous, 877.
\(^11\) Despite its uniqueness, however, the journal contained little response to the article save for a letter to the journal from an Anglican Reverend who disputed the writer’s claim that the Church of England did not view homosexuality as a sin. John F. H. Stewart, “Letter to the Journal,” Canadian Medical Association Journal 87 (1 September 1962): 517.
addressed the larger issue of being medicalized. The article was also significant because it demonstrated the level of surveillance that resulted from the medical process, which extended beyond the institution and into society and personal life. The medicalization of homosexuality within modern psychiatry continued a long-established trend of self-surveillance of mental health and sexuality. The power found within the authority of sexual psychiatry lay in the process of watching oneself and others for ‘abnormal’ or ‘sick’ behaviour. The power of the clinic over the gay individual did not end with the declassification of homosexuality from the DSM but continued for a short time into the early 1980s with the new condition, Ego-dystonic Homosexuality. Backed by APA Chair Dr. Robert Spitzer, Ego-dystonic Homosexuality reflected the continued focus on homosexuality as medically and psychologically ‘abnormal.’ Even though it existed within the manual for only a short time, the introduction of Ego-dystonic Homosexuality was central to comprehending the American system of pathologizing and treating homosexuality. Self-surveillance was a crucial element to the authority gained by the psychiatric community, evident in the creation of the new pathology as well as the power gained through medical diagnosis of a mental illness. Once more the threat was not the overt, in this case same-sex activity, but what lay below the surface – mental discomfort. Additionally, the stubborn focus on homosexuality as a symptom of mental illness or as ‘abnormal’ through the 1970s paralleled Operation Profune’s continued attention to communism as the ultimate threat to national security – despite evidence indicating otherwise. As with the concurrent case of RCMP surveillance of leftists, psychiatric surveillance of the individual through the DSM was reluctant to make the shift away from the paradigm of homosexuality as illness.

2. Method and Focus

This history of medical surveillance is based on rhetoric and implied meanings. Unlike the other historical studies discussed in this chapter, this dissertation examines the DSM and sexual psychiatry from a cultural and theoretical perspective. This chapter uses documents from the American Psychiatric Association (APA) meetings about homosexuality in the DSM, and the National Institution of Mental Health’s (NIMH) discussions about the definition of homosexuality as an illness. Largely based in the 1960s and 1970s, these documents illustrate a crucial period in the medicalization of homosexuality: the debate about whether it related to

12 Judd Marmor Papers, 1923-2000, Charles E. Young Special Collections, University of California, Los Angeles and Judd Marmor Collection, ONE National Gay and Lesbian Archives, Los Angeles, California.
other conditions in the APA manual. This chapter also examines the culture of self-surveillance and how pathologizing homosexuality affected the individual. In this chapter, self-surveillance will be explored through psychiatric and sexual perspectives. As with Chapter Four, the sources used extend beyond the Canadian context and focus on the machinations at the APA because of their influence on Canadian psychiatry, especially at the TPH Forensic Clinic. While still referring to Turner’s work, this chapter moves into the broader North American experience of self-surveillance and control through the clinic and medicalization.

One of the most famous cultural examples of self-surveillance and self-censorship is British writer George Orwell’s 1949 novel *Nineteen Eighty-Four*. Orwell coined the term ‘cold war’ to describe the global divide following the Second World War. His fictional account of control, surveillance, and fear both reflected the current era and amplified it as the novel depicted the dangers of a society driven by anxiety, forced into submission by sensationalism, suspicion, and limited information. *Nineteen Eighty-Four* opens to the protagonist, Winston Smith, evading state surveillance within his home while attempting to express his thoughts on paper. Quickly the reader understands the extent of surveillance in the fictional superpower Oceania. ‘Thought Police’ monitor subversive ideas. Civilians surveil one another. Most disturbingly, children watch their parents for questionable behaviour. Beyond the “thought crime” are “facecrimes,” the horrific point at which one’s own body betrays oneself:

> The smallest thing could give you away. A nervous tic, an unconscious look of anxiety, a habit of muttering to yourself – anything that carried with it the suggestion of abnormality, of having something to hide. In any case, to wear an improper expression on your face (to look incredulous when a victory was announced, for example) was itself a punishable offence. There was even a word for it in Newspeak: *facecrime*, it was called.\(^{13}\)

In his novel, Orwell revealed how for the civilian, the self can become a weapon of the state both physically and mentally. As Winston observes, “Your worst enemy […] was your own nervous system. At any moment the tension inside you was liable to translate itself into some visible symptom.”\(^{14}\) The theme of watching and monitoring one’s own thoughts was not an uncommon one in postwar science and speculative fiction. It captured the era’s anxiety about technologies of control and authority.\(^{15}\) The fear of reading or controlling another’s mind echoed contemporary

---


\(^{14}\) Orwell, *Nineteen Eighty-Four*, 54-55.

\(^{15}\) This theme is also evident in Ray Bradbury’s 1950 short story collection, *The Martian Chronicles*. In this book humans colonize Mars, only to become isolated on the red planet when an atomic war destroys Earth. The chronicles...
concerns about Communist brainwashing and mind control. Mechanisms such as the infamous fruit machine also capitalized on the growing belief that thoughts (or one’s body) could be monitored and analysed, betraying the individual who tried to keep them hidden. The fruit machine was a derisive failure based on its simplistic understanding of sexuality and physiology. But the conception of the machine was most sinister. It demonstrated the alarming faith in science and technology to spy on an individual’s private thoughts and desires.\textsuperscript{16}

Emphasis on the expert was central to the Cold War culture of medical authority. Part of the expert’s authority lay in the power of medical nomenclature and professionalization.\textsuperscript{17} As the psychiatric understanding of sexuality became more nuanced, clinicians and researchers recognized that the medical understanding of homosexuality was limited to gay and lesbian patients who sought psychiatric aid, as discussed in Chapter Four. In a report titled “Recommendations of the Task Force on Homosexuality,” the NIMH task force suggested that in regard to “Taxonomy of homosexual experiences and behavior,” there be “special emphasis on the development of better sampling methods to cover the total range of homosexual phenomena.”\textsuperscript{18} The critique of the limited perception of homosexuality was also evident in a draft of Dr. Judd Marmor’s “Etiological Roots of Male Homosexuality.” Marmor stated that one of the major reasons for doubting the validity of traditional psychoanalytic formulations was that they had been “based almost entirely on clinical experience with homosexual patients in therapy, and thus represent a skewed sampling of the total homosexual population, most of whom neither want nor seek therapy for their sexual preference.”\textsuperscript{19} Medical surveillance of sexuality, therefore, was limited to those who considered themselves ill, or were unwillingly incarcerated, and was defined by the perception of the self as it related to sexual and psychological wellness.

Central to my analysis of medical surveillance is Michel Foucault’s\textit{ Birth of the Clinic: An Archaeology of Medical Perception}. In this text Foucault deconstructed the nature of

---


\textsuperscript{17} Herb Kutchins and Stuart A. Kirk, \textit{Making Us Crazy, DSM: The Psychiatric Bible and the Creation of Mental Disorders} (Toronto: The Free Press, 1997), x.

\textsuperscript{18} Report, n.d., 4, Box 21, Folder 1, Charles E. Young Special Collections, University of California, Los Angeles.

\textsuperscript{19} c. 1983 Box 1, Folder 7, Judd Marmor Collection, ONE National Gay and Lesbian Archives, Los Angeles, California.
discourse and perception within the field of medicine beginning in the mid-eighteenth century. Foucault examined what was being said and what was being spoken about within the clinic, and how these patterns of identification and articulation of medical observation changed with time. More importantly, this text examines the relationship between the invisible and visible in medicine and how the perception and identification of each affects the observer’s cognition and technique as clinician and physician. Foucault examined what he called the “mutation of discourse.” He identified this process to occur in:

the region where ‘things’ and ‘words’ have not yet been separated, and where – at the most fundamental level of language – seeing and saying are still one. We must re-examine the original distribution of the visible and invisible insofar as it is linked with the division between what is stated and what remains unsaid: thus the articulation of medical language and its object will appear as a single figure.\(^{20}\)

This shift in identification and articulation of disease and illness also followed a significant transformation in the construction of the medical expert through changing technology and science surrounding the field of medicine. The patient and physician were first separated by language and expertise or status, and then by devices that further disabled verbal communication between the two.\(^{21}\) Instead of using patients to describe symptoms and physical unease, the medical expert turned to new technology to detect ailments and disorder. This pattern was perhaps best captured by scholar H. M. Collins’s proposition: “‘Distance lends enchantment’” in his discussion about science and its networks in *Changing Order: Replication and Induction in Scientific Practice*.\(^{22}\) The distance that Collins referred to can be that between the scientist and everyday society, or the expert and the general population. The creation of knowledge from an individual separated by their genius or expertise from lay society would bring with it a sense of authority and fascination to those outside of the area of speciality.

The medical use of technology to translate illness, as well as the promotion of technological shifts in society, is evident in *Technopoly: The Surrender of Culture to Technology*. In this study, scholar Neil Postman took a critical stance on the history of technology. By addressing the unease and apprehension that met various technological

---


\(^{21}\) Foucault, *The Birth of the Clinic*, 8.

Part Two: Chapter Seven

inventions, Postman deconstructed the narrative surrounding the history of development. Postman’s discussion of the history of technology, from tool-baring societies onward, challenges the positivist notion that equates technology with progress. His analysis of technological shifts explains the creation of the medical expert in the nineteenth century. Taking the seemingly minor invention of the stethoscope in 1816, for instance, Postman demonstrated the changing relationship between the doctor and patient as it was influenced by technology. His book discusses the distrust of the device from both the medical professional and the patient: “Patients were often frightened at the sight of a stethoscope, assuming that its presence implied imminent surgery, since, at the time, only surgeons used instruments, not physicians.” While technological and scientific change have traditionally been presented optimistically in history, in reality there was much unease in transitional moments. Recognizing this unease allows for more nuance in what was an otherwise simplified story of innovation casting the present as the pinnacle of development. Postman’s work points to the role medical technology played in separating the patient from the doctor, as well as growing faith in equipment that translated pain and discomfort into a new language of diagnosis. This language was the purview of the expert clinician.

While the role of the medical and scientific expert gained authority through the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, so too did public concern for the extent of this power. In Subjected to Science: Human Experimentation in America Before the Second World War, historian Susan Lederer questioned the development of ethical standards in science and medicine leading up to the mid-twentieth century. The Nuremberg Code following the Second World War often eclipsed the history of scientific and medical ethics. As Lederer indicated, however, the public’s concern for changes in medicine and the role of the physician began much earlier.

---

23 One of the terms that Postman addresses in his book is ‘Luddite.’ This term, he states, is one that “has come to mean an almost childish and certainly naïve opposition to technology,” when in reality Luddites were “people trying desperately to preserve whatever rights, privileges, laws, and customs had given them justice in the older worldview.” Neil Postman, Technopoly: The Surrender of Culture to Technology (New York: Vintage Books, 1992), 43.
24 Neil Postman, Technopoly, 98. Postman goes on to note: “Doctors had several objections, ranging from the trivial to the significant. Among the trivial was the inconvenience of carrying the stethoscope, a problem some doctors solved by carrying it, crosswise, inside their top hats. This was not without its occasional embarrassments – an Edinburgh medical student was accused of possessing a dangerous weapon when his stethoscope fell out of his hat during a snowball fight. A somewhat less trivial objection raised by doctors was that if they used an instrument they would be mistaken for surgeons, who were then considered mere craftsmen. The distinction between physicians and surgeons was unmistakable then, and entirely favorable to physicians, whose intellect, knowledge, and insight were profoundly admired.” Postman, Technopoly, 98-99.
Her study also counters the idea of an unquestioning faith in medicine, illustrating instead the public fear and newfound horror of medical and scientific discoveries achieved through the public exposition of animal and human experimentation in the early twentieth century. Her text examines the redefinition of the ideal physician in the form of a practitioner, whose authority was based on clinically informed judgement, to a scientist, whose authority came from specialized knowledge gained from experimentation.

For a conflict built around covert surveillance and espionage, the internalization of threat and self-monitoring were central themes in the Cold War. Self-surveillance and the resulting anxiety were also central to the history of mental illness and psychiatry. Foucault’s *Madness and Civilization* addresses the inversion of surveillance when the individual becomes aware of his or her lack of reason. With the continued emphasis on reason in the Age of Enlightenment, patients and inmates began to watch themselves and each other for irregularities and abnormal thoughts, not dissimilar to the characters in Orwell’s dystopian novel. Centuries later, the continued diagnosis of behaviour and mental health during the mid-twentieth century matched the growing medicalization within society.

Medical surveillance led to more sexual and behavioural self-monitoring on the part of the targeted individual. Daniel Hurewitz’s study addresses the sexual self-surveillance of individuals in an era of sexual medicalization as it took shape in the 1930s. Hurewitz noted that by this decade, Los Angeles female-impersonator Julian Eltinge experienced restrictions on his stage performances. He was no longer applauded for his ability to dress and perform as a woman on stage, as he had been two decades earlier. These restrictions were indicative of a more asserted sense of personal identity linked to sex and sexuality. Hurewitz’s book also refers to a distinct shift in the public’s perception of homosexuality in Los Angeles and California during the 1930s with the incorporation of new legal sanctions, arrests, imprisonments, and institutionalizations. Additionally, this transition saw the transformation of the meaning of homosexual desires and activity within a culture and society overwhelmingly afraid of sexual psychopaths. What had previously been uncomplicated entertainment was now, thanks to

---

26 Lederer, Subjected to Science, 1.
28 Hurewitz, Bohemian Los Angeles, 117.
29 Hurewitz, 132. Hurewitz also notes that this period saw a significant change in sexual identity, most significantly the gradual disintegration of the paradigm that divided male sexual identity by role. Within this clear division of
Part Two: Chapter Seven

power of pathologization, categorized as abnormal, as illness, and potentially dangerous to society. These sentiments increased into the 1950s with stronger assertions of ‘normal’ and ‘abnormal’ behaviour and identity. Gary Kinsman and Patrizia Gentile have addressed the internalization of surveillance of gays and lesbians during the Cold War, illustrating that sexual profiling was in fact part of a larger culture of discrimination and solidification of cultural, social, political, sexual, and racial norms. Sexual surveillance in the context of the Cold War, with its emphasis on normalcy, was influenced and managed by the changing medical technologies that identified what was ‘abnormal.’

Medical surveillance was realized by both the medical expert’s observation of the patient and the individual’s self-observation. Similar to the way in which police surveillance became a covert threat to leftists and the politically radical, as discussed in Chapter Six, so too did medical authority lurk in the background for gays and lesbians who sought or avoided medical treatment in the same era. The two types of surveillance resulting from the establishment of a medical definition of sexual normalcy – the expert’s professional observation and the individual’s internal surveillance – created a new type of Cold War threat. In the medical expert’s surveillance of the patient’s sexuality, the expert became the covert threat for the individual in the same way that the RCMP spy did for leftist Canadians in the same era. At the core of this surveillance was anxiety about subversion. In a climate that emphasized ‘normal’ and healthy sexuality, homosexuality was not only deemed abnormal but a symptom of deeper character and personality flaws. Individuals’ concerns over their sexuality, therefore, aided medical surveillance and medical interpretations of ‘healthy’ sexuality. Anxiety, in this case, was both the result of medicalization, from the patient’s awareness of his or her pathology, and the target of continued pathologization, a symptom of a deeper disorder.

3. Sexual Psychiatry, Anxiety, and Self-Surveillance

The culture of anxiety during the Cold War, as discussed in this dissertation, was two-fold: destruction and fear of subversion. This sense of unease, which germinated at two separate

activity and identity, masculinity was not defined by the gender of one’s sexual interest but how a man portrayed himself sexually. ‘Sissies’ and ‘fairies’ were seen as less masculine, taking on the ‘female’ passive role, while the men who had sex with more effeminate men were still considered masculine as they maintained their dominant ‘masculine’ role. With this shift in identity was a growing sense of public knowledge or understanding about sexuality and sexual deviancy. This understanding both resulted from and led to stronger restrictions in cultural representations of sexuality, whether in erotic films or within mainstream film and literature. Hurewitz, 73.

levels, focused both on what was happening on the geopolitical stage and what happened internally – both within domestic society and within the self. Encircling this culture of fear was the anticipation for destruction. As the bomb threatened unparalleled ruin, abnormality, whether social, sexual, psychological, or political, challenged the domestic comforts that were the homefront in a war of uncertainty. This chapter highlights the ways in which medical authorities struggled to maintain control over patients and in doing so reflected the larger system of Cold War surveillance. While some psychiatrists clung to conservative concepts of sexuality, defining it as a procreative urge governed by morality, others were more expansive and viewed sexuality as a key human trait. For some individuals, however, variation from ‘normative sexuality’ provided psychiatrists an opportunity to help and ‘cure’ what they believed to be a symptom of mental disorder and illness.\(^{31}\) The changing medical classification of homosexuality during the 1950s and 1960s coincided with shifting psychiatric methodology within the APA, an association that was currently gaining power within the international psychiatric community. The struggle to maintain control over the definition of homosexuality was both a result and symbol of the APA’s larger struggles to maintain control over psychiatric methodology.

The medicalization of same-sex activity, first through the pathologization of homosexuality and later through the creation of ‘Ego-dystonic Homosexuality,’ encouraged self-surveillance. On a medical level this new condition centered on the individual’s fears of abnormality and illness. Contrary to its language of science and objectivity, the psychiatric classification of homosexuality as a mental disorder was based more on the traditional moralistic view of sexuality.\(^{32}\) The effect of the psychiatric diagnosis of homosexuality and sexual distress were strengthened through the social perception of ‘normal’ sexuality in the age of the nuclear family.\(^{33}\) As the psychiatric interest in the subject of homosexuality increased through the 1960s, clinicians and researchers began to acknowledge that psychiatric studies on sexuality were flawed. The chief problem was that few studies included men and women who were comfortable with their sexuality and thus never presented for treatment. Rather, the individuals that were studied within psychiatric communities, as discussed in Chapter Four, provided overwhelming


\(^{32}\) This view is particularly evident in Irving Bieber’s article, “Clinical Aspects of Male Homosexuality,” in *Sexual Inversion*, 254-255.

\(^{33}\) Adams, *The Trouble with Normal*, 84.
evidence that patients’ anxieties were often based on fear of being abnormal.34 The diagnosis of homosexuality and later Ego-dystonic Homosexuality, a condition based primarily on personal discomfort, continued this pattern of focusing on patient anxiety.

Debates regarding homosexuality and its pathologization were fought on multiple fronts. The gay and lesbian liberation movement throughout the 1960s and 1970s was a key proponent of de-medicalization.35 A significant portion of the DSM debate over homosexuality, however, was also fought within the psychiatric associations. Clinicians and researchers with a personal connection to the larger liberation movement, those who were sympathetic to the cause, and still others who saw the issue as purely one of etiological considerations were invested in the debate.36 The DSM debates of the 1970s were unprecedented in both process and outcome. The eventual removal of homosexuality stemmed from a series of protests which began at the 1970 APA convention in San Francisco, California. At a session headed by psychiatrist Dr. Irving Bieber on the treatment techniques for homosexuality as a disorder, gay activists protested and then seized control of the session. Many of the psychiatrists’ reactions to the protests were angry and violent; one psychiatrist reportedly stated that the protestors should be shot.37 The psychiatrist’s attitudes revealed a prevailing sense of elitism that existed within psychiatry, one that was especially evident in the psychiatrists’ shock that protesters suffering from so-called deviant sexuality could challenge the field and professional experts. That possible patients, as the gay protestors were likely perceived, could openly counter the psychiatrists at a national psychiatric convention was particularly significant given the climate of the APA, which discouraged gay psychiatrists from admitting their sexuality. As with most professions at the time, to ‘come out’ as gay within the APA would threaten one’s career and ultimately discredit one’s authority. Regardless of the changes in rhetoric and efforts to de-stigmatize ‘deviant sexuality’ in psychiatry, homosexuality was, unlike other types of ‘mental illness,’ illegal and seen by many psychiatrists who were religious men, as a moral crime.

34 “The Problem with Homosexuality: An Overview,” 17. Box 1, Folder 13, ONE Archives.
36 Bayer, Homosexuality and American Psychiatry, 11-12.
Interestingly, over time the nature of the protests changed and the role of primary player shifted from gay activists to psychiatrists.\(^{38}\) What was, in 1970, a confrontation between activists and the psychiatric community became, over the course of the next three years, a divide within the field of American psychiatry. This was not strictly a war between psychiatry and the queer community. At the 1971 APA convention in Washington, D.C., the protesters achieved their initial goal: gaining a panel at the conference where they could present their position on the medicalization of sexuality.\(^{39}\) In addition to this development, the protesters requested to meet with the APA Committee on Nomenclature to remove homosexuality from the manual. While nothing came of this request at the time, it was the first official attempt to publicly address the diagnostic issue.

Events at the 1972 APA convention in Dallas, Texas indicated an obvious transition in the medicalization of homosexuality. First, as scholars Herb Kutchins and Stuart A. Kirk noted, there were no presentations at the convention that were “antithetical to the views of gay activists.”\(^{40}\) Second, there was a strong support within the psychiatric community for the activists. Three psychiatrists joined activists presenting on a panel discussing the activists’ point of view. One of them, referred to as “Dr. Anonymous,” revealed not only that he was gay, but also that there were more than 200 other APA members who were also gay and that there existed a Gay Psychiatric Association.\(^{41}\) Dr. Anonymous was in reality Dr. John Fryer, a psychiatrist who took care to hide his identity at the convention, wearing a mask, a baggy suit to hide his form, and using a microphone to distort his voice. Without tenure at Temple University, and having been fired from previous positions on account of his sexuality, Fryer was cautious about his participation at the convention.

\(^{38}\) GAP (Group for the Advancement of Psychiatry), founded in 1946, worked to reshape the APA and its approach to mental illness, considering the social and environmental elements of mental illness. This organization was committed to social activism in a way that the APA was not. Gerald Grob, “The Fielding H. Garrison Lecture: Psychiatry and Social Activism: The Politics of a Specialty in Postwar America” *Bulletin of the History of Medicine* 60, 4 (Winter 1986): 483. This included a report entitled “The Social Responsibility of Psychiatry” that reflected and encouraged the “broad social activism that characterized much of American psychiatry in the late 1940s and the 1950s.” Mitchell Wilson, “DSM-III and the Transformation of American Psychiatry: A History” *The American Journal of Psychiatry* 150, 3 (March 1993): 401.

\(^{39}\) The protesters had also expanded at this point to include, in addition to gays and lesbians, Vietnam veterans and other demonstrators, protesting inaccurate pathologization or, in the case of veterans and the condition of Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder, the lack of medical recognition. Kutchins and Kirk, 66.

\(^{40}\) Kutchins and Kirk, Ibid.

\(^{41}\) Kutchins and Kirk, 67.
It was also at this convention that APA Chair Dr. Robert Spitzer made his connection to the gay and lesbian liberation movement through activist Ron Gold. It is important to note, however, that while his public support for the protesters at the time was significant to the APA’s movement to de-medicalize homosexuality, sympathy for gay and lesbian rights did not propel Spitzer’s decision. This encounter with Gold led to Spitzer’s facilitation of a discussion between gay activists and the APA Committee on Nomenclature. Spitzer also scheduled a panel on homosexuality for the 1973 convention in Honolulu, Hawaii. Following the Honolulu convention, in 1974 the APA held a referendum on the subject of fully removing homosexuality from the DSM. These actions cast Spitzer as sympathetic to gay rights, a position that was later challenged by his support for the continued medicalization of homosexuality.

Scientific evidence was crucial to both sides of the debate to remove homosexuality from the DSM. Psychiatrists both for and against this decision based their arguments on ostensible scientific evidence proving that homosexuality was either a mental disorder or that it had no logical place within the manual. Supporters for the change in psychiatric classification argued that homosexuality had no connection to psychopathy, arguing that the link between homosexuality and mental disorder was predominantly a product of a limited understanding of human sexuality and psychiatry. Reviewing the changes made through the APA conventions in the early 1970s, it became clear that the demedicalization of homosexuality was relatively quick; protesters and the supporting psychiatric community saw significant changes in only a matter of years. This was in part because of the success of the gay rights movement that initially pressured for change as well as the continued criticism of existing psychiatric practices both from outside and from within the APA. What was also evident was the growing understanding within the APA that homosexuality did not fit within the DSM and the current definition of mental disorders. But these developments, while significant, did not terminate the psychiatric surveillance of gay men and women, which existed throughout the Cold War. These developments also did not necessarily vanquish fears that gay individual’s sexual desires were symptoms of mental illness.

Because of the medical emphasis on mentality over action, to be homosexual was to have a condition that existed despite one’s behaviour and outward appearance. As the anonymous writer noted in the CMAJ article: “a homosexual is the course I would like to follow, but the law

---

forbids it. I have already gone through the disgrace and humiliation of being exposed and dismissed from employment [as a teacher]. This was not for some specific act, but just for what I am.”

Because of this definition of ‘abnormal’ sexuality as the symptom of a deeper illness or disorder, homosexuality was portrayed as a threat to the individual and, by proxy, the larger society. The effect of this philosophy and mentality on the individual was the personalization and internalization of the so-called threat.

The personal and internalized effect of medicalization was also evident at the TPH Forensic Clinic, where the majority of patients were homosexual. This population was also largely voluntary, indicating that these patients were deeply self-conscious of their so-called deviancy. In her article on the Forensic Clinic, Joan Holloban stated: “Eighty per cent seen at the clinic are not sent by courts, but by other agencies, or seek treatment voluntarily. Twice as many exhibitionists and pedophiles are sent by the courts as homosexuals.”

The apparent self-awareness of homosexual patients was also noted in Dr. P. G. Thomson’s commentary on Turner’s 1963 paper “The Sexual Offender.” Thomson drew attention to the public world of the homosexual, made possible through the creation of the homosexual community. According to Thomson, homosexuality was a promising subject of sociological study more than any other form of so-called deviation because of the element of self-perception and analysis:

> There is no public world of exhibitionism, etc. as there is of homosexuality. Homosexuals congregate together in bars and restaurants and often publish their own magazines. […] Thus, there is a homosexual society, which tends to concentrate itself in our great modern urban communities where it can be relatively inconspicuous. Such homosexual societies, no doubt, do much to enhance the further spread of homosexuality among a large body of latent and potential adolescents and young adults.

The patients’ self-awareness pointed both to the social diagnosis of homosexuality as an illness, and to the inherent anxiety of several patients at the clinic. Gays and lesbians weakened by

---

anxiety or other psychiatric disorders were more likely to be susceptible to the diagnosis of homosexuality as a mental disorder or symptom of mental illness.\(^{47}\)

The self-awareness of individuals who monitored their sexuality and mental health, and sought psychiatric aid were central components to the growing argument within the APA that homosexuality did not fit the model of a psychiatric disorder. As Marmor wrote in a 1973 letter to Dr. Chatowsky,\(^{48}\) in his experience as an adult psychiatrist every homosexual and heterosexual patient he treated had problems.\(^{49}\) Indeed this went with the territory, but Marmor noted that the nature of a patient’s psychological concerns and mental health was not based on his or her sexuality. He stressed the importance of studying homosexuality as it existed outside of the clinic stating:

> when one gets to interview non-patient homosexuals, as I have been doing on a research project for the past couple of years, one does find some who do not present significant psychopathy except for their difference in sex preference. Part of the problem, of course, is whether we define psychopathy simply on the basis of a different sex preference.\(^{50}\)

This point, addressed earlier by Dr. Evelyn Hooker in her study of gay male culture in the 1950s, was central to the argument within the psychiatric community that homosexuality was neither a mental disorder nor a symptom of deeper mental problems. Marmor later referred to Hooker’s study in a letter, stating that while “homosexuality in and of itself does not necessarily constitute a mental disorder” it presented major problems for society if only for the amount of injustice and suffering experienced “not only for the homosexual but also for those concerned about him.”\(^{51}\)

The social constraints placed upon homosexuals were often discussed in these papers, evoking a sense of sympathy for the ‘other.’ No comment was made, however, for how these problems could be remedied through changes in the legal system. According to the NIMH Task Force on Homosexuality, the psychiatrist’s responsibility here was not to change societal perceptions

---

\(^{47}\) The homosexual patients that the majority of clinicians and researchers came in contact with were seeking psychiatric help for what they believed, or were encouraged to believe, was a disorder or symptom of a mental illness. Marmor, “Notes on Some Psychodynamic Aspects of Homosexuality (Prepared for the Task Force on Homosexuality, NIMH) Preliminary Draft,” (November 1967), 55. Box 65, Folder 4 “National Institute of Mental Health Task Force on Homosexuality: Final Report and Background Papers,” no date. Charles E. Young, UCLA.

\(^{48}\) Director of Adult Services Community Mental Health Center.

\(^{49}\) Dr. Judd Marmor, letter to Dr. Chatowsky, 14 March 1973, Box 53, Folder 8, Charles E. Young Special Collection, UCLA.

\(^{50}\) Marmor, letter to Chatowsky, 14 March 1973, Ibid. UCLA.

\(^{51}\) Dr. Judd Marmor, letter to Philip B. Hallen, 12 March 1976, Ibid. UCLA.
about sexual normalcy but to prevent the spread of homosexuality. The report on the task force’s recommendations to the APA from the late 1960s stated that in addition to the need for more training in the area of sex education in the United States, psychiatrists should work to prevent homosexuality within American society, beginning with the child, while exploring and developing new therapies for the so-called condition. The task force urged a reconsideration of homosexuality within the APA’s definition of mental illness, because it claimed that current studies of homosexuality were limited and “should include homosexual individuals who do not come into contact with medical, legal or other social control or treatment sources and who therefore have been least studied.” The association between homosexuality and illness remained a point of contention for psychiatrists following the decision to remove the so-called condition from the DSM. The matter of surveillance and control in this case was evident in the efforts to manage the patient as well as the field of psychiatry, indicating a deeper anxiety present in both the patient and the professional.

4. Surveillance through Diagnosis

The DSM’s declassification and subsequent reclassification of homosexuality as a mental illness exemplified the pattern of self-surveillance and the extent to which it reflected the psychological nature of the Cold War as one of espionage and covert weaponry. Surveillance of homosexuality through the clinic in the 1950s and 1960s differed from other forms of monitoring ‘deviancy’ at the same time. Even in the early 1990s, despite changing laws about homosexuality, the practice of surveilling and policing homosexuality in Canada was based on catching individuals “in the act.” In addition to police surveillance through the physical monitoring of space in order to witness illegal or ‘deviant’ activity, methods of sexual

52 The outline for the task force included a section devoted to “Therapy and rehabilitation; early detection and prevention.” “Working Outline for Task Force” (no date), Box 1, Folder 3, “National Institute of Mental Health Task Force on Homosexuality, 1969-1972,” ONE.
54 “Recommendations of the Task Force on Homosexuality,” 4-5. UCLA.
56 This form of surveillance of gay men and lesbians was especially common in the military. Kinsman and Gentile, The Canadian War on Queers, 348.
57 Police surveillance of gays and lesbians included the use of hidden electronic listening devices (bugged rooms and telephones) and tailing suspects. Kinsman and Gentile, 139 and 152. One man interviewed in Kinsman and Gentile’s book recalled an encounter he had with a young Canadian diplomat: “It took place in a hotel, and the man
surveillance expanded in the mid-twentieth century to incorporate other means of spying. Through the 1950s the practice became increasingly psychological and covert, including the gathering of information from patients who may or may not have engaged in same-sex activity.58 In the case of psychiatric surveillance, individuals were urged to seek medical help for their ‘abnormalities.’ This type of self-reporting was increasingly dependent on information provided about the self by the individual under surveillance. This pattern of sexual vetting was far more insidious than catching individuals “in the act” demonstrating both a different goal and method.

Between the first edition of the DSM-II in 1968 and the DSM-III in 1980, the APA used at least four new terms to describe what was ultimately a condition whose symptoms were discomfort at being homosexual. “Sexual Orientation Disorder,” coined in 1968, turned into “Homodyshphilia” in 1974, only to be renamed as “Dyshomophilia” and finally reappear in the DSM-III in 1980 as “Ego-dystonic Homosexuality.” With the seventh edition of the DSM-II in 1974, the APA no longer classified homosexuality as mental disorder. The link between the two, however, was maintained by the condition Ego-dystonic Homosexuality. Like its predecessors, Ego-dystonic Homosexuality referred to an individual’s sexual dissatisfaction and it was finally removed in the DSM-III-R, the revised edition that was published in 1987. As was evident in the debates to declassify homosexuality, the decision to remove it from the DSM was based on a mixture of public opinion and psychiatric classification. Similarly, the attempt to bring homosexuality back into the manual was again influenced by two separate elements of medical control and curiosity. The process of medicalization and the decisions to pathologize conditions were often unrelated to the individual, making the construction of the disease less about the patient and more about taxonomy. Regardless, the effort to order and classify conditions was ultimately about control and defining what was medically and psychologically ‘normal.’

Between the early 1950s and the late 1960s a sense of tradition and medical authority had developed for the still young DSM. This sense of expertise, however, was soon challenged by sexual activists, clinicians, and researchers in the 1970s.59 The voice of authority adopted by psychiatric experts by the mid-twentieth century established the method of classification and interviewing me in October 1969 knew about this […] the only way they could have found out was by interviewing the other party or because the room was bugged and the other party knew about that.” 142-143. 58 Historian Allan Bérubé discusses this in the American context during the Second World War in his book Coming Out Under Fire: the History of Gay Men and Women in World War Two (New York: Free Press, 1990). 59 As Pillard notes in his recollection of the DSM debates, “Most of the psychiatrists present [at the 1970s APA Convention] were more upset by the behavior of their colleagues than by the protestors.” Pillard, 83.
subsequent diagnosis of mental disorders as traditional to the field of psychiatry, defining it as foundational to the field despite its relative newness. Several historians of medicine have critiqued the imposed traditionalism and authority enjoyed by the APA and exhibited in its creation of the DSM as a “bible” of mental disorders.\(^6\) While critical of the DSM, many of these studies still acknowledge its medical and social power in North America. Approaching this history as a cultural study, my examination of pathologization interprets the socio-political influences on psychiatry as manifest in the expert’s expression of authority and control. While acknowledging the influence of the gay rights movement on psychiatric nomenclature, my study considers how, in the climate of ‘Big Science,’ American psychiatry imagined itself responsible for monitoring the ‘enemy within.’ In order to control ‘deviance,’ surveillance of the body, mind, and sexuality moved from the expert to the individual.

The field of American psychiatry has viewed the history of the DSM’s declassification of homosexuality as either a success for human rights or as a failure for the field of psychiatry. The effects of the decision, however, were far more complicated. Evident in the existence of Ego-dystonic Homosexuality, the story of control through diagnosis did not end with the official removal of homosexuality from the manual in 1974. Rather, as the DSM gained greater influence over international psychiatry, the definition of sexual ‘abnormality’ and its link to mental illness became more convoluted and its definition multifarious. The encouragement of self-surveillance was evident in the APA’s construction of diagnosed sexual dissatisfaction. Medical observation and surveillance of sexuality did not cease following the declassification of homosexuality as a mental disorder. Instead, new, vague terminology and “conditions” continued the pathologization of sexual dissatisfaction. Similar to the situation where Canadian security authorities struggled to

---

\(^6\) Kutchins and Kirk are critical of the DSM and of Spitzer in their book *Making Us Crazy, DSM: The Psychiatric Bible and the Creation of Mental Disorders*. Working against the ‘great man’ narrative, and casting Spitzer as a middleman caught between the more progressive views of the activists and psychiatrists like Marmor and the archaic views of psychiatrists like Bieber and Dr. Charles Socarides, Kutchins and Kirk also challenged the systematic medicalization of behaviour that increased during the 1970s. Rachel Cooper also provided a well-argued critique of the inherent issues with the DSM and its method of diagnosis. She addressed the epistemological worries about the theory-laden DSM and the influence of social and financial factors on diagnostics. Cooper also argued that while the DSM had a practical use, because of its limitations it was, and is, not the best form of classification for mental disorders. Rachel Cooper, “What is Wrong with the DSM?” *History of Psychiatry* 15, 1 (2004): 5-25. Mitchell Wilson tracked the transformation of American psychiatric method through the 1970s and demonstrates how the DSM-III was an attempt to save psychiatry’s legitimacy. Mitchell Wilson, “DSM-III and the Transformation of American Psychiatry: A History,” *The American Journal of Psychiatry* 150, 3 (March 1993): 399-410.
define political subversion through Operation Profunc, the medical definition of sexual deviance remained broad even after the demedicalization of homosexuality.

i. Sexual Self-Surveillance as a Mental Disorder

Ego-dystonic Homosexuality was based on the individual’s self-perception of his or her sexuality and the medical capitalization on the anxiety and fear about abnormality. The change in nomenclature, particularly following the well-publicized “removal” of homosexuality from the manual, indicated a shift in the method of medicalizing behaviour and desire. What remained was a preoccupation with the individual’s self-surveillance of behaviour and thought. Clearly not all homosexuals were mentally ill, but Ego-dystonic Homosexuality pathologized those who struggled with their sexuality. The creation of the new condition affected far fewer individuals. But the focus on anxiety was inherent in the decision to include a condition clearly linked to homosexuality and obviously tied to the medicalization of unhappiness, discomfort, and unease. Spitzer, as Chair of the APA, was central to this development. Lauded for championing the removal of homosexuality from the manual, in reality Spitzer was instrumental in continuing the medicalization of homosexuality with the definition of sexual distress (about homosexuality) as a new psychiatric condition.

Unlike earlier editions of the APA manual, the DSM-III provided its readers with a clear definition of mental disorders, detailing how each was conceptualized within the manual and the psychiatric association. Spitzer identified mental disorder in the DSM-III’s foreword as “a clinically significant behavioral or psychological syndrome or pattern that occurs in an individual and that is typically associated with either a painful symptom (distress) or impairment in one or more important areas of functioning (disability).”61 Spitzer’s definition went on to highlight the difference between mental disorder and social deviance: “When the disturbance is limited to a conflict between an individual and society, this may represent social deviance, which may or may not be commendable, but is not by itself a mental disorder.”62 The emphasis on this difference corresponded with the earlier discussions within the APA regarding the medicalization of so-called sexual deviance, homosexuality, as a mental disorder. The direct reference to rhetoric and terminology pointed to a shift which, given the developments, was tempered by a lingering sense of psychiatric normalcy and abnormality.

---

61 DSM-III, 6.
62 DSM-III, 6. Original emphasis.
Like Homosexuality and Sexual Orientation Disorder before it, Ego-dystonic Homosexuality was listed under “Other Psychosexual Disorders.” Profiled as a homosexual’s desire to “acquire or increase heterosexual arousal,” Ego-dystonic Homosexuality was described within the DSM as a “sustained pattern of overt homosexual arousal that the individual explicitly states has been unwanted and a persistent source of distress.” According to the DSM-III, therefore, a homosexual who wished to be heterosexual in a hetero-normative society, and repress homosexual activity and urges, suffered from a mental disorder. Evident throughout the description of Ego-dystonic Homosexuality was the persistent assertion that homosexuality was not a mental disorder, coupled with a clear pathologization of what was previously a medically encouraged response to homosexuality: sexual re-orientation. The very inclusion of Ego-dystonic Homosexuality in the DSM-III therefore was an example of Thomas Kuhn’s paradigmatic shift in textbook science. What was previously seen as a scientific truth in 1952, that homosexuality was a mental disorder, was now, two decades later, archaic. In its place lay another truth: to hide one’s sexuality or attempt to deny one’s homosexuality was to be psychologically unwell even though hetero-normative society encouraged such covertness. Through this transition in diagnosis, the psychiatric definition of mental health as it related to sexuality, most specifically homosexuality, did a Gestalt shift. The classification of sexuality and behaviour as ‘well’ or ‘unwell’ depended on what was currently seen as scientifically ‘true,’ illustrating how science, medicine, and psychiatry were subjective fields and influenced by contemporary social norms and politics. At the same time, as Kuhn noted, “[i]n the sciences, therefore, if perpetual switches accompany paradigm changes, we may not expect scientists to attest to these changes directly.”

While the shift in reasoning and definition had occurred in sexual psychiatry as a field, experts took longer to change their thinking patterns, affecting the process of diagnosis. This period of adaptation was evident in the APA’s belated acceptance of Ego-dystonic Homosexuality as a psychiatric condition. In reality clinicians and researchers do not experience stark paradigm

63 DSM-III, 281.
65 The level of debate surrounding the establishment of this condition and that it was removed from the DSM-III in 1987 indicated that the irony did not go unnoticed by members of the APA.
66 “Gestalt Shift” can refer to a paradigm shift or a sudden comprehension of a different perspective. One of the most well-known examples of a Gestalt shift is in a shift of optical interpretation, for instance the shift between a vase to two faces. Both interpretations are possible, the viewer can go back and forth between the two images, but both images cannot be interpreted simultaneously – it is either the vase or the faces.
67 Kuhn, The Structure of Scientific Revolutions, 114-115.
shifts that match scientific revolutions. Rather, they are products of their society and their education. While ideas can quickly shift, individuals need time to adapt.

The details of the so-called condition recorded in the DSM established pathologized sexual dissatisfaction as something beyond a brief desire to change one’s behaviour. The DSM profiled Ego-dystonic Homosexuality as a disorder that was a persistent one and the chief concern of the individual. Identified as a condition associated with loneliness, accompanied by guilt, shame, anxiety, and depression, Ego-dystonic Homosexuality by definition exhibited the traits logically associated with individuals who identified their sexuality as ‘abnormal’ or ‘sick.’ This point was further emphasized by the DSM’s recognition of the power of negative images of homosexuality in society, matched with the positive representations of heterosexuality and family life.\(^\text{68}\) Regardless of this recognition, the apparent severity of the condition itself still seemed relevant enough to be included in the DSM. The manual noted that a course of action for therapists was to help the individual in finding relief in “homosexual subculture,” noting that it was rare that therapy would result in “spontaneous development of a satisfactory heterosexual adjustment.”\(^\text{69}\) This was a sharp diversion from the earlier efforts to ‘cure’ homosexuality through a variety of treatments and therapies.\(^\text{70}\) The foundation of Ego-dystonic Homosexuality as a disorder was unhappiness and dissatisfaction. These traits were accompanied by the desire to change and yet the individual could not – hence the syndrome. In addition to these traits, the DSM-III stated that because homosexuality was not considered to be a mental disorder, the manual could not include the factors that predisposed an individual to homosexuality. Arguably, these traits were understandable, but they hardly constituted a mental disorder any more than did homosexuality itself.

The creation of Ego-dystonic Homosexuality also reflected a continued desire to study homosexuality as a medical condition within the American psychiatric community.\(^\text{71}\) The debate

---

\(^\text{68}\) DSM-III, 282. Apparently this societal influence of discomfort established ‘dyshomophilia’ as different enough from homosexuality to be included in the manual after homosexuality’s declassification. Marmor, letter to Spitzer, 9 September 1977, Box 21, Folder 2, UCLA.

\(^\text{69}\) DSM-III, 281.

\(^\text{70}\) Spitzer, memo to Task Force on Nomenclature and Statistics and Advisory Committee on Psychosexual Disorders, 18 October 1977, Box 21, Folder 2, UCLA. Also evident in these records is that the creation of Ego-dystonic Homosexuality was very much a compromise on Spitzer’s part. Spitzer, letter to Pillard, 10 May 1977, Box 21, Folder 2, UCLA.

\(^\text{71}\) Kutchins and Kirk’s interpretation of the 1973 decision to remove homosexuality from the DSM was that it was far from a clear-cut resolution, referring to Spitzer’s continued lack of conviction that homosexuality was not a disorder. Kutchins and Kirk, 71.
about homosexuality reopened in 1979 focusing on medical classification and healthy sexuality, indicating Spitzer’s reluctance to remove the so-called condition altogether. This reluctance in a period of significant shifts in the DSM re-cast Spitzer as less of a rights activist or psychiatric revolutionary, and more of an opportunist and a scientist isolated from the political consequences of psychiatric diagnosis. Despite his contact with activists such as Ron Gold, Spitzer did not participate in the gay and lesbian liberation movement that supported his official stance in 1973 on homosexuality and the DSM. Evident in the DSM discussions and in his later studies about homosexuality, Spitzer’s stated concern was scientific methodology. He was apparently fascinated by the use of medical and psychiatric classification of mental disorders. What is significant to this study of managing perceived threats to normalcy is that Spitzer’s focus on sexuality, which was heavily based on the use of etiology, nosology, and nomenclature in modern psychiatry, increased medical surveillance of the individual.

The historical portrayals of the DSM debates and Spitzer vary, demonstrating the inherent division between scholars’ support for the DSM as a resourceful text and criticism of the manual as a means of controlling individuals and society through the creation of mental disorders. One historical portrayal of Spitzer is that of a middleman who refused to take a strong position on either side of the argument about whether or not homosexuality was a mental disorder. This interpretation of Spitzer is in direct contrast and reaction to the more popular and positive ‘great man’ myth. Others see his role in expanding the DSM to include more disorders

---

72 Hannah Decker, *The Making of DSM-III: A Diagnostic Manual’s Conquest of American Psychiatry* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), 163. Decker’s analysis of the DSM-III and Spitzer is an institutional history of the APA and a personal examination of Spitzer, studying how the APA Chair’s vision affected the way in which the DSM and APA became more scientific-based in the 1970s. Decker’s comprehensive study on the DSM-III was published a few months after I completed my research on Marmor’s papers in Los Angeles in January 2013. I read the book a year later in the spring of 2014.

73 Kirk and Kutchins, for instance, are intensely critical of the DSM and its methodology. Writing from a sociological standpoint, they address the issues with the process of diagnosis, highlighting the often archaic and torturous methods of ‘curing’ mental disorders in addition to the way in which the manual itself influences the social understanding of health and illness in North America. Kutchins and Kirk, xi. Rachel Cooper is also critical of the DSM and points to its limitations, while at the same time providing agency, in some cases, to clinicians and researchers. She argues that while there is a practical importance to the manual it should not be the only method of classifying mental disorders. Cooper, “What is Wrong with the DSM?,” 6. Decker’s analysis of Spitzer and the making of the DSM-III provided a different analysis of the manual, its construction, and its influence. She presented the DSM-III as influential in changing the course of American psychiatry through the rejection of psychoanalysis and embrace of scientific method in an era of anti-psychiatry. While she addresses limitations of the DSM, the APA, and Spitzer, Decker’s critique is not as strong as Kutchins and Kirk’s. In some cases her analysis is measured while at other points it is overrun with an appreciation for Spitzer and his achievements. Decker, 258. She was also critical of Kutchins and Kirk’s analysis of the DSM and its influence. Decker, 258.

74 Kutchins and Kirk, 69.
as one driven by his almost pathological need to classify these so-called conditions.\textsuperscript{75} The debate over the pathologization of homosexuality was divisive and Spitzer’s stance has been both celebrated as revolutionary and criticized as conservative. This dissertation examines Spitzer’s motivations and actions from an intellectual perspective, rather than a clinical or personal approach, considering the way in which he conceived psychiatric abnormality. From a cultural standpoint, Spitzer was not only a producer of psychiatric method but his inability to fully declassify homosexuality as a disorder was indicative of something else: his efforts to control sexuality. While his decision to keep homosexuality in the DSM as Ego-dystonic Homosexuality can be interpreted as a means of satisfying both sides of the APA’s debate,\textsuperscript{76} it was also representative of the Cold War paradigms that divided politics, ideology, and geopolitical groups into neat categories. In this way, Spitzer was less a hero in the history of psychiatry, or a confused middleman – he exemplified the desire to control ‘others’ and fetishized classification.

Critics of the DSM and of Spitzer’s perception of psychiatric nomenclature are consistent in APA discussions throughout the late 1960s and into the 1980s, indicating that the negative consequences of this form of medicalization were apparent at the time.\textsuperscript{77} Contemporary criticisms of Spitzer’s methodology also indicated how the creation of Sexual Orientation Disorder and its progeny were not simple oversights, but part of a larger intersection of desire to classify and simplify human sexuality for the sake of psychiatric nomenclature.\textsuperscript{78}

Following its demedicalization, Spitzer reportedly expressed his concern that clinicians and researchers would be unable to study homosexuality without its diagnosis. In a 1977 letter to Spitzer, Professor of Psychiatry Richard Pillard gave two options: homosexuality could either remain a diagnosable condition or it could be demedicalized – it could not exist as a diagnosable non-disorder.\textsuperscript{79} Pillard, being gay, had a vested interest in this battle of nomenclature. In the letter he commented on dyshomophilia stating that it seemed to be “an attempt at intellectual compromise of two options.”\textsuperscript{80} Spitzer responded to Pillard stating:

\begin{itemize}
\item[\textsuperscript{75}] Decker, The Making of DSM-III, 187.
\item[\textsuperscript{76}] This argument is prevalent in Kutchins and Kirk’s Making Us Crazy.
\item[\textsuperscript{77}] Dr. Harold I. Lief, letter to Dr. Judd Marmor, 23 May 1977. Box 21, Folder 2, UCLA.
\item[\textsuperscript{78}] One memo from Spitzer in 1977 addresses the division within the committee. Dr. Robert Spitzer, Memo, to Task Force on Nomenclature and Statistics and Advisory Committee on Psychosexual Disorders, 18 October 1977. Box 21, Folder 2, UCLA.
\item[\textsuperscript{79}] Dr. Richard Pillard, letter to Dr. Robert Spitzer, 29 April 1977. Box 21, Folder 2, UCLA.
\item[\textsuperscript{80}] Pillard went on to compare homosexuality to pathologized activities such as masturbation, stating that the anxiety experienced is less of a dysphilia and more of an anxiety or depressive syndrome. Pillard, Ibid. UCLA.
\end{itemize}
Perhaps you are correct in asserting that Dyshomophilia is a compromise. For many of us, the issue as to whether or not at some level homosexuality is *in some cases* pathological is still not resolved. To remove the category entirely from classification would be a way of removing the legitimization of the therapeutic efforts to study its etiology.\(^81\)

The belief that Spitzer was attempting to reach a compromise was echoed in a letter from Dr. Kent E. Robinson\(^82\) to Marmor in which he quoted a worried Spitzer: “‘They’ve been telling me that we can’t study homosexuality as an entity if it isn’t in the DSM-III.’”\(^83\) Robinson was of the opinion that Spitzer was being manipulated into this position, noting that he was unsure of how organized the movement was to convince Spitzer to keep homosexuality in the DSM.\(^84\) Spitzer’s point of view on the matter met several counter arguments, one being Robinson’s apt point that psychiatrists could study divorce without diagnosing it.\(^85\) While this exchange could be interpreted as Spitzer acting as a middleman between the opposing views about homosexuality’s place within the manual, it more clearly shows how Spitzer drew upon his supposed interest in studying homosexuality as a reason to keep it medicalized.

**ii. Medical Terminology as Surveillance:**

One of the primary issues about the pathologization of sexual dissatisfaction, in the form of Ego-dystonic Homosexuality, was that it did not accord with the DSM-III. Disagreements between clinicians and researchers over the classification of this condition continued through the 1970s. Unlike the earlier protests and public debates over the medicalization of homosexuality, the arguments about Ego-dystonic Homosexuality were predominantly on the grounds of terminology and psychiatric methodology. These disagreements were also influenced by and influential to the larger methodological shifts happening within the APA. American psychiatry in this period transitioned from a field dominated by psychoanalysis, the study of the mind, to one more biologically oriented, built through scientific method and focused on the brain.\(^86\)

Between May and October 1977 the Advisory Committee on Psychosexual Disorders discussed the primary nosological issues with Ego-dystonic Homosexuality. It addressed how

---

\(^81\) He ends the letter in a friendly tone: “Let’s keep talking.” Spitzer, letter to Pillard, 10 May 1977. Box 21, Folder 2, UCLA.

\(^82\) Deputy Medical Director of Outpatient Services

\(^83\) Dr. Kent E. Robinson, letter to Dr. Judd Marmor, 11 August 1977. Box 21, Folder 2, UCLA.

\(^84\) Dr. Kent E. Robinson, letter to Dr. Judd Marmor, Ibid. UCLA.

\(^85\) In the letter, Robinson also refers to Spitzer’s consistent references to Harold Leiff’s case of a middle-aged gay man who wanted to commit suicide “as if this was scientific evidence to support diagnosis of dyshomophilia.” Robinson, Ibid. UCLA.

and where it could situate the condition in the larger category of psychological disorders. The committee also challenged the condition’s existence on account of it not fitting under any of the existing subheadings. Committee members countering the validity of sexual dissatisfaction’s existence as a condition used other behaviours that could be studied without being identified as a syndrome or pathology. These included masturbation, vegetarianism, and distress over one’s virginity. These conditions were unrelated but, because of the way in which Ego-dystonic Homosexuality was classified as a condition that was self-conscious of abnormality, they were brought together to demonstrate how homosexuals could be anxious without being pathological. Like many aspects of the human condition, the committee argued, sexual impulses were not a product of anxiety but were influenced by conceptions of social normalcy. More than that, anxiety about one’s homosexuality should not be classified as a psychological disorder.

Spitzer had several concerns about the proper classification of sexual dissatisfaction within the DSM. In a May 1977 letter to Pillard, Spitzer referred to an earlier discussion with Doctors Richard Green, Rick Friedman, Harold Lief, and Kent Robinson in Toronto regarding the appropriateness of the condition, then referred to as ‘Homodysphilia,’ in the DSM-III. In the letter Spitzer noted that most of these psychiatrists agreed that the condition, while it existed as a valid diagnostic category, did not belong with the paraphilias, a new term for perversions that appeared in the 1977 edition of DSM-III with the official substitution of the term “dyshomophilia” for “homodysphilia.” A few months later in September 1977, Marmor challenged Spitzer’s idea of a psychological condition specific to homosexuality. Maintaining his stance on the issue that homosexuality itself did not constitute psychopathy, Marmor stated: “Of course some cases of homosexuality grow out of a pathological background! So do most cases of heterosexuality that we see in our offices! Such a statement in itself does not justify setting up a
separate illness category.” In short – the condition was redundant and assumed an innate link between anxiety and sexuality that did not exist. Marmor continued his letter by referring to his experience treating numerous homosexual patients over the years who were disturbed by their orientation. In analysing these cases, Marmor pointed to the impact of society and social norms on individuals’ apparent distress concerning their sexuality:

Their distress about their homosexual ‘impulses’ were not inherent in the impulses (on the contrary, those impulses were a source of pleasure) but in the consequence of expressing those impulses. This is not fundamentally different from heterosexual individuals who have been raised in puritanical households, who feel distressed by their sexual impulses. The only reason we treat individuals who feel distressed by their homosexual impulses as though they are a separate diagnostic category is because we have not yet fully accepted the idea that homosexual impulses per se do not necessarily constitute psychopathology.

This final point was especially significant as it demonstrated awareness among some clinicians and researchers that the psychiatric community based its understanding of health on social norms. According to Marmor, sexual distress was based on the social acceptance of sexual practice and therefore should be recognized as such in the psychiatric treatment of individuals distressed by their sexual orientation. Marmor concluded with a suggestion that there should indeed be a syndrome, not as a separate diagnostic category but under the heading “Psychosexual Disorders Not Elsewhere Classified.” Under this heading the condition could avoid being linked to its earlier categorization in DSM-I and DSM-II.

Marmor expressed his distaste for the term “Dyshomophilia” again in September. He stated:

My reason for urging this [avoidance of the term “dyshomophilia”] is not a trivial one. To create a new term which potentially lends itself to new generations of homosexual individuals being snidely referred to as ‘Dyshomophilics’ is contrary to everything that we are all trying to accomplish in the field of mental health. The forthright diagnosis of a syndrome called ‘Distress over Homosexual Impulses’ allows for no possibility of confusion and carries with it no possible derogatory implication.

Marmor’s warnings are significant in that he recognized the negative and adhesive impact of diagnosing behaviour on the individual along with the effect of terminology and medical labelling on the individual. Psychiatric nomenclature, he illustrated, did not work within a

93 Marmor, letter to Spitzer from Marmor, 9 September 1977, Box 21, Folder 2, UCLA.
94 Marmor, letter to Spitzer, 9 September 1977, Ibid. UCLA. Original emphasis.
95 Marmor, Ibid. UCLA
96 Ibid. UCLA.
vacuum. In his letter, Marmor articulated the social implications of pathologizing a condition. To establish a new condition related to homosexuality would ultimately go against what they were trying to accomplish within the field of psychiatry. Efforts to provide a means of addressing and treating conditions previously ignored or labelled under the broader categories of immorality or insanity would be wasted. Marmor’s warning addressed the deeper implications of medical terminology and rhetoric in lay society. In spite of the anti-psychiatry movement and growing public critique of the psychiatric method of defining healthy and unhealthy behaviour, psychiatry and medicine were still instrumental tools in establishing the social norm.

The question of whether there should be a separate category within the DSM-III for medicalized sexual dissatisfaction, or whether the so-called condition should be situated under “Other Psycho-sexual Disorders,” continued to plague the association through the 1970s. As debates within the committee progressed, Spitzer expressed his frustration at the continuing discussion. In a memo to the members of the Advisory Committee on Psychosexual Disorders dated 5 October 1977, Spitzer requested consensus on the issue of terminology and categorization. He gave an overview of where the committee members stood on the “burning issue of a separate category for homosexuals in conflict about their homosexual arousal pattern.”97 In the memo, Spitzer recognized various issues brought up by members on the subject of “Dyshomophilia” as a term, along with the possibility of using the term: “Homosexual Conflict Disorder.”98 He also challenged Marmor’s suggestion of the term “Distress about Homosexual Impulses,” one that expressed, as Harold Lief phrased it in an earlier correspondence, the condition in ordinary English.99 Spitzer, however, objected to this term “because it emphasizes the distress, rather than the internal conflict.”100 Ultimately, the term was not psychiatric enough. While homosexuality was removed from the DSM, Spitzer believed that homosexuals were prone to a specific type of turmoil that constituted a disorder. At this point the debate was not so much about whether the condition should exist, but how it should be identified. Spitzer’s focus on internalization was also significant to the argument of social and medical sexual control through the individual’s self-surveillance. Spitzer declared in the memo, as if his desire to end the debate was already not clear enough: “Please find or steal a pen, pencil,

---

97 Spitzer, memo to Members of the Advisory Committee on Psychosexual Disorders, 5 October 1977, Box 21, Folder 2, UCLA.
98 Spitzer, memo to Members of the Advisory Committee on Psychosexual Disorders, 5 October 1977, Ibid. UCLA.
99 Harold Lief, letter to Spitzer, 4 October 1977, Ibid. UCLA.
100 Spitzer, memo, 5 October 1977, Ibid. UCLA.
or other writing implement, NOW, and note your choice of the appropriate category on this memo below.”

He listed the choices as: Dyshomophilia, Distress about Homosexual Impulses, and Homosexual Conflict Disorder. He then concluded the memo with the following warning:

“If this memo is not returned within five (5) days of its receipt, it will blow up in your office.”

Spitzer obviously had a sense of humour, but his exasperation at the lengthy discussion betrayed his desire to confirm the terminology, rectify the issue at hand, and have the edition quickly published.

In the same way that public opinion of sexuality did not radically change immediately following the American and Canadian de-criminalization of private, consensual homosexual acts in the 1960s, the residues of homosexuality’s medicalization persisted following its demedicalization. The 1970s began with the disillusionment of the late 1960s that had seen the rapid dismantling of the ‘Us’ versus ‘Them’ North American confidence that had dominated the early Cold War. The American military failure in Vietnam and anti-Vietnam protests were echoed in the anti-psychiatry movement of the late 1960s and early 1970s that publicly challenged the nature of medical authorities. Methods of diagnosing homosexuality as a disorder became more complex and were still professionally contested. Even with the official “removal” of homosexuality from the APA manual, a spectre of medicalization persisted. Homosexuality was still monitored, not so much for its existence, but for the way in which the individual conceptualized and reacted to his or her sexuality. This form of surveillance was part of a system of psychiatric monitoring that continued the established pattern of classifying and subsequently controlling sexuality. It also reflected the persistent belief that homosexuality was something other than psychologically ‘normal’ and healthy.

5. Conclusion

In June 2013 the CBC radio program The Current devoted an episode to the Ex-Gay Movement in the United States, with a particular focus on the work of Spitzer. In 2001 Spitzer, aged 69, published a study titled “Can Some Gay Men and Lesbians Change their Sexual Orientation?” in the Archives of Sexual Behavior.

Spitzer’s 2001 study resulted from a meeting with a group of largely religious ‘ex-gays’ who felt that modern psychiatry denied their

[101] Spitzer, Ibid. UCLA.
[102] Spitzer, memo to Members of the Advisory Committee on Psychosexual Disorders, 5 October 1977, Ibid. UCLA.
experience of being ‘cured.’ They believed that therapy and a remedy for homosexuality was possible. The Current interviewed members of this movement, highlighting that the problem with Spitzer’s work with these individuals was that the subjects were largely self-selected: those who believed they had been ‘healed’ were eager to participate in a project discussing the possible attributes of so-called therapy.104 Spitzer, who stated that he enjoyed controversy, had trouble retracting the study when it became clear that it not only countered research completed decades earlier by his colleagues on the same subject, but was also poorly conducted.105 In the spring of 2013 Spitzer, now aged 81, finally retracted his 2001 study on the grounds that it was unscientific. His participation in the study, however, recalled his earlier resistance to fully declassify homosexuality as a mental disorder and his obsession with psychiatric nomenclature and control. It also demonstrated his continued belief that homosexuality was not ‘normal.’

Prevailing in Spitzer’s work was the idea that sexuality should be easily classified and understood, if not ‘cured.’

Similar to police surveillance of political radicals targeted for internment in the event of a Communist invasion or war, the medicalization of sexuality monitored the individual and managed so-called subversion through self-surveillance. Surveillance through the medicalization of homosexuality appeared as a consequence of its pathologization rather than the explicit intent of the classification. Unlike the covert Operation Profunc, which remained a mere plan of attack throughout the Cold War, the diagnosis of homosexuality as a mental disorder was a realized form of containment and control. The method of containment used in this case, medical nomenclature which confined individuals to the world of mental disorder and self-surveillance, was in and of itself insidious, turning the civilian inward to monitor his or her self for deviance and abnormality. The target of Ego-dystonic Homosexuality were individuals who themselves identified as mentally ill. While the earlier medicalization of homosexuality profited from the contemporary binary understanding of ‘healthy’ and ‘abnormal’ sexuality, the creation of Ego-dystonic Homosexuality, however brief, was based on the culture of anxiety.

105 Milton Wainburg from Columbia University had approached Spitzer regarding the problems of the study and its scientific methodology, or lack thereof, pointing out that the study’s participants were primarily advocates for the Ex-Gay Movement and that the questions within the study were biased. The study, published without peer review, received severe criticism from scholars like Wainburg along with sexual activists who were not only critical of the research but also dismayed with Spitzer’s apparent betrayal.
Language and threat were at the centre of this creation and maintenance of Cold War fears. The psychological nature of the Cold War and its culture of surveillance drew the numerous elements of terminology and threat even closer together. Similarly, the creation of medicalized sexual distress, experienced by some gay men and women in hetero-normative society, implanted the experience of the greater Cold War into the life of the individual. Surveillance was maintained by language and became, through this medicalized terminology, especially dependent on the individual’s state of anxiety and subsequent self-surveillance. The medical expert, strengthened by faith in modern science and technology as an ultimate authority, provided effective methods of surveillance and tools for monitoring what was deemed to be subversive activity and thoughts. In the case of the APA, the creation of Ego-dystonic Homosexuality was a symptom of the association’s attempt to maintain control and authority. Evident in both cases of surveillance discussed in this dissertation was the resistance to change the target. Whereas Operation Profunc was unable to consider a world where communism was not the ultimate threat to national security, psychiatrists at the APA were reluctant to move past the belief that homosexuals were not ill and in need of psychiatric intervention.
CONCLUSION      Quarantine and the Fear of Contagion

1. Introduction
Within Canadian history, the Cold War has not typically been studied as a history of ideas. This historical methodology, however, with its constant struggles to define terms, elusive relationships, and contextual definitions, suits the era and its climate of uncertainty. The Cold War was, as American sociologist Jackie Orr stated, a psychological war.¹ The enemy was ubiquitous and the means of conflict were based on intimidation and fear tactics – this reality challenged the clear camps of ‘Us’ and ‘Them.’ The desire to maintain these strong divisions was evident in both the history of Operation Profunc and the history of sexual policing through psychiatry. The RCMP’s resistance to adjust the focus of Operation Profunc’s surveillance and the APA’s persistent medicalization of homosexuality indicate two efforts to control individuals and define normalcy during the Cold War. Evident in this combined history of political and sexual policing, concerns about communism and sexuality were not just about behaviour and practice, but were centred on mentality, character, and psychology. These fears focused on what people could become, what they were behind a façade of normalcy, and how they could influence others. This fear for potentiality of destruction was the essence of the Cold War.

This cultural history of Canadian Cold War politics and sexuality offers a new perspective to the discussion of Cold War fear and surveillance. The process of interpretation exercised in this dissertation is integral to the study of war and society and to an era that was dominated by science and technology. The role of science and technology had, by the twentieth century, and most certainly by the nuclear era, shifted in scope. No longer was science defined by an individual, the lone figure working in a lab – by the atomic era science had become a community of collaboration, its fields increasingly specialized. ‘Big science,’ epitomized by the Manhattan Project of the Second World War which resulted in the atomic bomb, focused on the efforts and expertise of thousands rather than on the discoveries of a single scientist. As the mechanism behind the atomic and nuclear ages, big science defined the increased focus on the macro-sphere. At the same time, the work of the individual scientist became more centred on the micro-sphere. As the fields of science became more complex and turned into sub-specialities,

intricate developments within each field defined the larger study. In the culture of big science the scientist was no longer the polymath but the specialist.

The movement from the global, external, international, or macro perspective to the domestic, internal, national, or micro perspective was therefore fundamental to the Cold War. Anxiety was not merely a by-product of the military, political, and scientific cultures of the Cold War – it was the focus, the defining feature of a conflict between two elusive superpowers. To view fear during the Cold War in its totality is to recognize that it was neither fleeting nor a fluke: it was the Cold War. This was evident in both political and sexual policing.

American historian Elaine Tyler May challenged the idea that the suburb was oblivious to nuclear culture and threat of global conflict. May illustrated in Homeward Bound that the lives of North Americans during the 1950s and 1960s were inextricably linked to the threat of nuclear annihilation, countering the belief among Cold War scholars that the suburban household was an oasis of domestic comfort. May challenged the understood isolation of the suburb in Cold War studies, arguing that the American nuclear family and the suburban home became battlefields in the larger Cold War nuclear stalemate between superpowers. From the Nixon/Khrushchev kitchen debates to the use of the home as a site for civil defence, the Cold War was part of American domestic culture. May’s idea of the atomized Cold War experience has since become central to the study of Cold War culture and domestic history. This dissertation has expanded on May’s method and illustrated how Cold War fears were constructed upon the foundation of invisible threats. From efforts to identify political and sexual deviants to the omnipresent, but never seen, threat of nuclear radiation, the 1950s and 1960s were dominated by an understanding that the threat, whether political, social, sexual, or militaristic in nature, were invisible poisons to the structure of social and cultural norms.

May’s work on the influence of the Cold War on the domestic sphere is essential to several studies of gender, normalcy, and the culture of the suburban nuclear family during the 1950s. In Canada this study has been further developed to examine the related, though unique, situation in Canadian centres and society. Historians such as Joy Parr, Mona Gleeson, Mary Louise Adams, Doug Owram, Valerie Korinek, and Franca Iacovetta have, in their respective

---

studies, addressed the complexity of postwar Canada by challenging simplistic narratives of race, class, gender, and sexuality. Beyond the popular image of the 1950s as the period of economic prosperity and comfort, the decade was convoluted, uneasy, and ultimately anxious. Canadian culture and society, despite the growth of American cultural imperialism following the Second World War, were unique during the 1950s and 1960s. Scholars such as Reg Whitaker, Gary Marcuse, Robert Bothwell, and Steve Hewitt have developed the history of Canadian Cold War politics, military, and surveillance. As in the case of the myth of the postwar suburban utopia, so have the various myths of Canada’s international position during the Cold War tainted the perception of both its past and its present image as a benevolent nation. The myth of Canada’s blandness in comparison to the American histrionic witch-hunts is a popular one. This myth effectively disregards a period of turmoil in Canada and casts the nation as a shadow of the United States. Equally popular has been the myth of Canadian tolerance, effectively disproved by these scholars in their respective examinations of the longstanding institution of Canadian anti-communism and of domestic surveillance within Canada. This dissertation links the previously separate studies of culture and war in Canada, and explores an important vein that connects Cold War militarism, technology, and fear on North American society.

Atomization is central to understanding Cold War society and anxiety. Jackie Orr provided one of the more unique examples of scholarship on the study of Cold War anxiety, fear within the larger society, and individual psychology. Because the Cold War was so deeply psychological, society’s responses to the significant technological, scientific, and military shifts following the Second World War must also be studied from the level of the individual. Andrea Tone, Erika Dyck, and Elise Chenier, in their studies of psychology and psychiatry during the Cold War, addressed the atomization of the larger fears of social disintegration to the level of the individual. This method of presenting the Cold War as a micro-history by examining medicine,


pharmaceuticals, drugs, and psychiatric treatment, is extended in my study of Cold War fears and anxiety.

This dissertation looks at the Cold War as a period dominated by the enveloping fear of contamination and infiltration. It illustrates the parallel anxieties about communism and homosexuality as they existed in the context of the nuclear arms race and Cold War militarism. While scholars like John D’Emilio, Robert D. Dean, David K. Johnson, and Gary Kinsman and Patrizia Gentile\(^6\) addressed the clear connection that was insinuated between politics and sexuality, the larger discussion of the influence of fears of the covert menace as it related to politics, sexuality, and science are often missing from the discussion of political and social threat during the Cold War. This is especially the case within the Canadian historical framework. As the first comprehensive study of Operation Profunc, this dissertation addresses a previously unknown but significant chapter in Canadian Cold War history. By comparing this extensive disaster plan, that lasted from 1948 to 1983, with the institution of sexual psychiatry during the same era, this dissertation has addressed the larger culture of surveillance and control evident in the attempt to define threats to normalcy.

The symbolism of characterizing Cold War threats as diseases or illnesses was apparent in the contemporary methods of police and medical surveillance. This dissertation has focused on how the defining element of the nuclear era was the fear of infiltration. The efforts to prevent contamination tightly fused together war and domesticity, the national and international, and the personal and political. Communist containment during the Cold War was of paramount importance. Containment was first articulated in the American context by the Truman Doctrine that referred to the danger of nations falling to the power of international communism one after the other. The language of the American Containment Theory drew a clear connection between communism and infectious disease. Canada’s covert but extensive Operation Profunc was a plan to physically contain a threat. Profunc proposed to quarantine populations in an effort to stem the spread of enemy ideology in the event of emergency. While it was never enacted, the vast resources devoted to Operation Profunc and the scale of the multi-decade surveillance indicates...

that the RCMP and the government were significantly invested in their Canadian containment plan.

The connection between sexuality and illness during the 1950s and 1960s was not realized through quarantine as it was in programs for classification and cure of ‘deviant’ sexuality. Clinicians and researchers, including those opposed to its medicalization, commonly referred to the importance of preventing homosexuality. Their primary concern was to avoid its spread through the population. Turner’s papers indicate that while clinicians were encouraged not to condemn the homosexual on the basis of sin or crime, they were still urged to understand its causes in order to inhibit its manifestation within the individual.\(^7\) The NIMH Task Force on Homosexuality declared in its mission statement that its main purpose was to prevent homosexuality.\(^8\) So, while this group was instrumental in challenging the APA’s medicalization of homosexuality, it also focused on stopping homosexuality’s growth within the population. The medicalization of sexuality during the 1950s and into the 1970s was so pervasive within the psychiatric community that even those who opposed the definition of homosexuality as a disease still worked to prevent its spread within society.\(^9\)

In addition to the definition of homosexuality as a mental disorder or a symptom of mental illness, the psychological connection between sexual ‘abnormality’ and health was defined through anxiety during the Cold War. Fears about communist infiltration and nuclear radiation were accompanied by fears of mental illness and psychological abnormality. By this token, anxiety became a central component for diagnosing mental illness as it related to sexual ‘deviance’ or homosexuality. The transition from targeting homosexuality as a form of mental disorder in the early 1950s to the fear of one’s own sexuality in the early 1970s pointed to the deeply rooted culture of anxiety during the Cold War, exemplified in the extensive medicalization of society and sexuality. As Andrea Tone explored the culture of anxiety in the United States and how it was managed through psycho-pharmaceuticals and tranquilizers, this study addresses the culture of sexual anxiety in North America as it was perpetrated through the psychiatric definition of mental and sexual abnormality. Political anxiety was also at the heart of the RCMP Security Service’s classification of leftists as potential threats. Anticipation for

---


\(^9\) “Recommendations of the Task Force on Homosexuality,” Ibid. UCLA.
destruction through deviant activity turned the focus of surveillance from the political to the personal.

2. Summary

The spectre of contagion has continued past the Cold War through various threats to the North American (read democratic) way of life including acts of terrorism, epidemic disease, and radicalism. Cold War anxiety, however, remains unique. It followed a pattern of atomizing a global situation to the level of the individual. This was evident in the ways in which personal experience, desire, and mentality were defined as threatening to the larger society through politics, sexuality, and personal identity. The Cold War’s culture of conflict was therefore defined by the psychological state of both the individual and the nation at large. Ideologically, in North America, the Cold War was a conflict that cast civilians as the target in terms of nuclear war, and as the threat in terms of communism and deviancy. After the Second World War, military conflict was dominated by the invisible – whether radiation, the by-product of nuclear weapons, or the vague states of radical politics and deviant sexuality which threatened the status quo. The associated fear of brainwashing exemplified the concern that the nation would become weak through the psychological, philosophical, and sexual corruption of the citizen. Finally, the enthusiasm for science, technology, and medicine characterized a conflict that was built on a desire for power, authority, and comfort.

In Canada, Operation Profunc epitomized this fear. As a clandestine system that sought to prepare the nation for a future war by anticipating attack and infiltration, Operation Profunc attempted to secretly surveil the threat. In the event of war, the program would remove these closeted communists or “prominent functionaries” from the general population to remote locations in order to stem the possible flow of dissidence. Sexual psychiatry of the same era provided a medicalized example of a similar phenomenon: how to classify and understand a psycho-sexual invisible threat. The classification of homosexuality as mental illness matched the classification of communism as subversive. Communism and homosexuality were often linked together by contemporary concerns that homosexual men in power could be blackmailed.10 While similar to other forms of so-called social deviance such as drug use, heterosexual

---

promiscuity, and juvenile delinquency,\(^{11}\) fears about communism and homosexuality were more intricately intertwined with one another because of the combined anxieties regarding infiltration, invisibility, and contagion. The faith in science, medicine, and related technologies to reveal invisible “flaws” was part of modern psychiatry’s attempt to understand, classify, and ‘cure’ homosexuality during the Cold War. Together these two cases of Canadian Cold War disaster planning and North American sexual psychiatry exemplified the larger trends of Cold War anxieties.

Part One of this dissertation examined the plans for quarantine and containment in two settings: domestic communist subversion and covert homosexuality. Containment was a cornerstone of both the plan to intern communists and communist sympathizers and the medicalization of homosexuality. Internment of prominent functionaries, discussed in Chapters One and Two, was designed to inhibit the spread of communist ideology and influence should Canadian security become compromised. Attempts to contain or cure homosexuality within the psychiatric clinic, discussed in Chapters Three and Four, were to strengthen and maintain heteronormativity within Canadian society. The discussion of containment in both cases is based on plans for control. Canadian communists were arrested and monitored in other contexts, but Operation Profunc’s plan for mass arrests remained a blueprint for disaster management. The clinic was only one example in a larger history of incarceration and containment of gays and lesbians. While it affected a small population of patients, the strategies that the clinical psychiatrists sought to impose were more widely used outside of the clinic via private practice and popular psychiatric notions of sexual norms. Efforts to define homosexuality as a mental illness within the TPH Forensic Clinic and the APA’s DSM, therefore, were part of a larger pattern of sexual control.

Part Two addresses surveillance and the vagaries of defining the threat. The language used to identify, define, and describe political threats to national security and homosexuality, sexual deviancy, and mental illness shifted from the 1950s to the 1980s. Chapters Five and Six consider the way in which Operation Profunc’s surveillance of alleged subversives was influenced by changing rhetoric and conceptualizations of the threat to national security. Chapter Seven addresses Cold War sexual psychiatry and the medicalization of sexuality and anxiety.

These three chapters examine the patterns of surveillance, studying how the dominating gaze of the expert, either police or physician, monitored for hidden menaces. Existing within Cold War surveillance, exemplified here by Operation Profunc and sexual psychiatry, was an interconnected pattern of anxiety. The experts responded to anxiety about infiltration, deviancy, and radicalization by monitoring suspect individuals – in turn the experts sowed more anxiety for those under surveillance.

The dichotomized environment of superpowers and geo-political military opponents has effected both contemporary conceptions of enemy and ally, and historical perceptions of the era. This imposed sense of ‘Us’ and ‘Them’ can be viewed as an antidote to the uncertainty of the era, in the same way that the culture of domesticity and the suburban nuclear family were an antidote to the overwhelming fear of nuclear attack. Nuclear war did not happen and the Cold War, in this context, was one of psychological and hidden means. The two so-called deviances of communism and homosexuality were portrayed as operating stealthily, moving through populations and infecting individuals by proxy, akin to a contagious disease or the highly contaminating poison of radiation.

3. Concluding the Two Case Studies

The history of police surveillance in the name of national security and the medicalization of sexuality persist into the early twenty-first century. Leading up to its cancellation of Operation Profunc in 1983, planners saw the need to shift their focus from ‘prominent functionaries.’ The FLQ kidnapping of James Cross along with the murder of Pierre LaPorte in 1970 were shocking, not the least because of the realization that actual attack against the government was not motivated by communism.¹² By the end of the 1970s, Operation Profunc planners pointed to the need to focus on infiltration from different global regions such as the Middle East. This shift away from the geopolitical binaries of the Cold War to consider other potential dangers doomed Operation Profunc. Shortly after, RCMP surveillance methodology was questioned and placed under scrutiny in the 1981 Royal Commission of Inquiry Concerning Certain Activities of the RCMP, or the McDonald Commission. This investigation influenced the eventual termination of the RCMP Security Service and the creation of CSIS, a civilian security intelligence service, in

Along with this shift in personnel came a shift in focus in the late 1980s that matched the changing geo-political climate at the end of the Cold War.

In recent years the question of who is a threat to Canadian national security and how they should be managed has evoked Cold War methods of enemy profiling. The Canadian government’s anti-terrorism Bill C-51, for instance, that was introduced under Prime Minister Stephen Harper in 2015 challenges rights of citizens otherwise protected under the Charter of Rights and Freedoms. The language of this report is vague, echoing earlier ambiguous terminology from the Cold War. This bill’s broad definitions of terrorism, along with the continued censorship of Cold War surveillance records of figures like Tommy Douglas, indicate the long-standing anxiety built on national security threats and subversion.

Regarding sexuality, the marginalization of homosexuality became more complicated during the 1980s. While homosexuality was no longer defined as a mental illness or a symptom of psychological disorder, the AIDS crisis of the early 1980s introduced a new and deadly version of sexually transmitted contagion. What was at first a mysterious epidemic appearing in predominantly gay male communities, was soon publically referred to as a type of ‘gay cancer.’ Early writing about the AIDS epidemic was saturated in moralistic language and capitalized on the apparent role of disease in exposing the secret lives of individuals. Susan Sontag’s work *AIDS and Its Metaphors* addressed the fears of the illness’s scourge. AIDS was a new and frightening disease, but old sentiments about sex and morality persisted, connecting together disease, activity, and identity. Only when AIDS began to appear within non-gay groups, particularly haemophiliacs and those affected through tainted blood transfusions, did morality about AIDS patients begin to lessen and funding for medical research intensify.

The psychiatric medicalization of sexuality has also persisted in the wake of the de-classification of homosexuality as a mental illness in the DSM. Issues about gender and trans identity are now at the forefront of debates about definitions of healthy sexuality. The DSM-V,

---

17 Sontag, Ibid., 106.
for instance, still classifies trans-gendered and trans-sexuality as a medical disorder. The
language surrounding what is now termed “gender dysphoria,” initially “Gender Identity
Disorder,” echoes that of conditions such as “Ego-dystonic Homosexuality.”18 Questions about
how trans individuals can fit into “normal” society has been relegated to incendiary public
debates while the medicalization of the so-called conditions continues. Debates about
“normalcy” in the discussion of health and medicine have persevered following the Cold War,
indicating the continued role of the medical expert in defining and monitoring behaviour and
identity.

4. Conclusion

Within this history of Cold War anxiety is the persistent belief in absolutes. Both
psychiatry and national security focused on abnormality. Throughout the 1950s and into the
1970s both North American psychiatry and the RCMP Security Service encountered challenges
to the family and the nation. Psychiatry and policing had to adapt accordingly. As was evident in
psychiatry’s continued definition of homosexuality as a mental illness, regardless of the
changing classifications, and the RCMP’s continued focus on international communism, the shift
away from the clear paradigms of safety and threat was not an easy process. Nevertheless by the
1980s there was a clear transference in both the psychiatric categorization of sexual deviation
and methods of maintaining Canadian national security. Old prejudices and definitions of
abnormality remained, but the shifts of the early 1980s marked a distinct change in tactics and
means for addressing the medical, social, and military threats to normalcy.

Paradigmatic divisions were a fundamental component of the Cold War. The global
division between the superpowers and the omnipresent threat of nuclear destruction was
countered by a culture of consumerism and comfort intended to deflect the era’s sense of anxiety.
Unlike wars in the pre-atomic age, North America’s cultural militarization during the Cold War
was focused on domestic survival. This climate of fear turned inward. In the same way that
nuclear radiation poisoned an environment and its population, communism and homosexuality
were portrayed as capable of destroying the foundation of family, society, economy, and national
security. Moving from the global experience to the personal, the atomization of the Cold War

18 A 2005 article, co-written by Spitzer, addressed and challenged the controversy surrounding the DSM diagnosis
of Gender Identification Disorder. Kenneth J. Zucker and Robert L. Spitzer, “Was the Gender Identity Disorder of
Childhood Diagnosis Introduced into the DSM-III as a Backdoor Maneuver to Replace Homosexuality? A Historical
Note” *Journal of Sex and Marital Therapy* 2005, 31: 31-42.
experience brought the theoretical battle between the superpowers to the individual level of personal politics and sexuality. This dissertation has viewed the Cold War within a variety of spheres, indicating the pervasiveness of the fear of the invisible menace. Canadian history must move beyond the dialectics of politics and military, society and culture, science and technology, and sexuality and gender. These are all components of national history, and in the case of Cold War Canada, engaging in these separate studies enables writing a more comprehensive examination of the era’s mentality and experience.
Detail of Figure 5. “Out of date” map of planned reception centres and internment camps across Canada, c. 1951. Map, c. 1951. Reference no. 2011-00179-09-54-13, unprocessed collection, Library and Archives Canada.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Archival Material
CAMH Archives, Toronto, Ontario.
Dr. R. E. Turner fonds
Dr. Donald Blair Coates fonds

Charles E. Young Research Library, Special Collections, UCLA, Los Angeles, California.
Judd Marmor Papers, 1923-2001 Collection

Diefenbunker Museum, Carp, Ontario.
Doug Beaton Collection

Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Ontario.
“Prominent Communist Functionaries (PRFUNC)”
Unprocessed Collection on Operation Profunc

ONE National Gay and Lesbian Archives, Los Angeles, California.
Judd Marmor Collection

Primary Literature


Bibliography


Norris, Len. “You don’t suppose if we play ‘Peace on Earth’ we’ll be regarded as a Communist front organization …?” The Vancouver Sun (21 December 1954).


**Periodicals and Documentaries**


Mount, Nick. “On Hugh MacLennan’s Watch: Hugh MacLennan’s Bestseller *The Watch That*
Ends the Night Turns Fifty.” *The Walrus*, July/August 2009.


**Secondary Literature**


______. The Big Chill: Canada and the Cold War. Toronto: Canadian Institute of International Affairs, 1998.


Weisbord, Merrily. The Strangest Dream: Canadian Communists, the Spy Trials, and the Cold


Unpublished Theses, Dissertations, and other Papers


