Permission to Use

In presenting this thesis in partial fulfillment of the requirements for a Postgraduate degree from the University of Saskatchewan, I agree that the Libraries of this University may make it freely available for inspection. I further agree that permission for copying of this thesis/dissertation in any manner, in whole or in part, for scholarly purposes may be granted by the professor or professors who supervised my thesis work or, in their absence, by the Head of the Department or the Dean of the College in which my thesis work was done. It is understood that any copying or publication or use of this thesis or parts thereof for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission. It is also understood that due recognition shall be given to me and to the University of Saskatchewan in any scholarly use which may be made of any material in my thesis.

Requests for permission to copy or to make other uses of materials in this thesis in whole or in part should be made to:

Head of the Department of Archaeology and Anthropology
University of Saskatchewan
Saskatoon, Saskatchewan
S7N 5B1
Canada
Abstract

Obsidian was a prized tool stone heavily exploited in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem throughout the pre-contact period. Fifteen geochemically distinct sources in this area were utilized on a regular basis consistently through time. A large dataset of sourced obsidian artifacts currently exists but has rarely been applied to specific archaeological problems for Yellowstone National Park, Wyoming.

This thesis provides a comprehensive list of obsidian sources important to the archaeology of Yellowstone and analyzes spatial and temporal trends of obsidian source selection. This study examines diagnostic tools produced by people during the Archaic period, focusing on the McKean complex (~5500-3000 BP) and Pelican Lake phase (3000-1600 BP). The potential for a cultural preference for obsidian source selection is discussed by applying landscape theory and ethnographic evidence to the examination of archaeological data.

A pattern of obsidian source exploitation as seen at the Osprey Beach site (representing the Cody Complex) has led to the development of a proposed annual round, typically applied to the entire pre-contact period in the Park. This large annual round, however, is determined to be unlikely and unnecessary by this author. Alternative “local rounds” to this model are proposed and supported by the evidence.

A clear preference for the Obsidian Cliff source (a National Historic Landmark) located in the northern end of the Park is shown in these results. This preference can be interpreted in both economic and cultural terms. Otherwise, no purely cultural preference for an obsidian source is supported. The exploitation of certain obsidian sources did not change significantly between the McKean and Pelican Lake cultures. However, a significantly different pattern of exploitation is seen when analyzed by geographical area. The results of this research suggest a more localized pattern of obsidian exploitation than previously thought, impacting interpretations of seasonality and travel routes in the Yellowstone area.
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr. Ernie Walker, for his patience with the unusual and often challenging circumstances I presented him with. Thank you to my committee members, Dr. Margaret Kennedy and Dr. David Meyer, for their flexible and accommodating natures.

I would also like to thank Dr. Ann Johnson of the National Park Service for taking me under her wing as a volunteer. Thank you for encouraging me to go to graduate school, and for the suggestion that “something on obsidian” would make a good Master’s thesis.

Special thanks to John Reynolds for the good advice, good company, and even better stories. Thanks to Dr. Richard Hughes who shared his insight on the “tuff” problem, and gave information on other Yellowstone obsidian issues.

Ann Johnson, John Reynolds, Mary Meagher, Zachary Park and my family all contributed financially in one way or another during the writing of this thesis, and for that I am very grateful. I hope that you still think I’m a “good investment”.

Finally, I would like to thank the Yellowstone Park Foundation, and specifically Joan and Bob Donner, for the grant they provided which funded my graduate work. The Foundation’s generous assistance, incredible enthusiasm and ongoing support for Yellowstone archaeology has made so many things possible.
To Zack, for building me a desk and giving me grief about procrastination
Table of Contents

Permission to Use ........................................................................................................ i
Abstract ...................................................................................................................... ii
Acknowledgements .................................................................................................. iii
Dedication ................................................................................................................... iv
Table of Contents ...................................................................................................... v
List of Tables ............................................................................................................ vi
List of Figures .......................................................................................................... viii

1. Research Objectives and Background .................................................................. 1
   1.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................... 1
   1.2 Research Problems and Objectives .................................................................. 2
      1.2.1 Key Research Questions .............................................................................. 3
   1.3 Thesis Organization ......................................................................................... 4

2. The Environmental and Archaeological Setting .................................................. 6
   2.1 The Plains and Middle Rocky Mountains ......................................................... 6
      2.1.1 The Greater Study Area .............................................................................. 8
      2.1.2 The North and South Study Areas .......................................................... 8
   2.2 Background of Yellowstone Archaeology: Major Surveys and Excavations
      Included for Study ............................................................................................... 10
      2.2.1 The Osprey Beach Site (48YE409) .............................................................. 10
      2.2.2 The Donner Site (48YE252) .................................................................... 11
      2.2.3 The Malin Creek Site (24YE353) .............................................................. 11
   2.3 Local Chronology and Typological Classification ............................................ 13

3. Methodology .......................................................................................................... 17
   3.1 The Approach .................................................................................................... 17
   3.2 Landscape Theory and Analogy ...................................................................... 17
   3.3 The Sample ....................................................................................................... 19
      3.3.1 Inventories and Surveys-North Study Area ............................................. 20
      3.3.2 Inventories and Surveys-South Study Area ............................................. 22

4. Obsidian: A Comprehensive Overview ............................................................... 23
   4.1 Why Obsidian? ................................................................................................. 23
   4.2 A Brief Geological Explanation of Obsidian .................................................. 24
      4.2.1 Primary and Secondary Deposits .............................................................. 25
   4.3 Obsidian and Yellowstone: Past and Present .................................................. 26
      4.3.1 Techniques ................................................................................................ 27
   4.4 Obsidian in the Greater Yellowstone Area ...................................................... 27
      4.4.1 Definitions of the Term “Source” ............................................................. 28
      4.4.2 Some Considerations for Utility .............................................................. 28
      4.4.3 Considerations for Geochemical Analysis .............................................. 29
      4.4.4 Previous Research Goals of Obsidian Sourcing in Yellowstone ............ 30
   4.5 Primary Sources ............................................................................................... 31
      4.5.1 Obsidian Cliff (Yellowstone National Park) .............................................. 31
      4.5.2 Cashman Quarry (Montana) ...................................................................... 32
4.5.3 Bear Gulch (Idaho) ........................................................................ 33
4.6 Secondary Sources ........................................................................... 34
  4.6.1 Park Point (Yellowstone National Park) ........................................ 34
  4.6.2 Cougar Creek (Yellowstone National Park) ................................. 35
  4.6.3 Parker Peak (Yellowstone National Park) ...................................... 35
  4.6.4 Cascade Creek (Yellowstone National Park) ................................. 36
  4.6.5 Warm Creek (Yellowstone National Park) ................................. 37
  4.6.6 Malad (Idaho) ............................................................................. 37
  4.6.7 Teton Pass and Crescent H (Grand Teton National Park/Wyoming) ...................................................................................... 38
  4.6.8 Conant Creek Tuff (Wyoming/Idaho) ........................................... 39
  4.6.9 Lava Creek (Wyoming) ................................................................. 40
4.7 Other Sources .................................................................................. 40
  4.7.1 Packsaddle Creek (Idaho) ............................................................. 40
  4.7.2 Reas Pass (Idaho/Montana) .......................................................... 40
  4.7.3 American Falls/Mud Lake (Idaho), Timber Butte (Idaho) ............. 40
4.8 Summary ......................................................................................... 41
5. Theoretical Perspectives: Landscape and the Use of Analogy .......... 42
  5.1 The Questions We Ask .................................................................. 42
  5.2 The Cultural Selection of Obsidian Sources in Yellowstone .......... 43
    5.2.1 Landscape Theory and Archaeology: Some Background ........... 43
  5.3 Landscape and Hunter-Gatherers of the Plains ............................. 44
    5.3.1 Ethnoarchaeology and Analogy .................................................. 46
  5.4 Natural Places as Monuments ....................................................... 48
    5.4.1 Obsidian Cliff as Monument ....................................................... 48
    5.4.2 Visual Impact and Analogy ........................................................ 53
    5.4.3 Problems with Analogy and Middle-Range Theory ................... 54
6. The Multi-functionality of Obsidian ................................................. 56
  6.1 Ideological, Ritual, and Utilitarian Examples from Yellowstone and Beyond ...................................................................................... 56
7. Results and Conclusions ............................................................... 59
  7.1 Results ............................................................................................ 59
  7.2 Proposed “Local” Rounds ............................................................... 66
8. Discussion ......................................................................................... 72
  8.1 A Matter of Convenience? Obsidian Sources and the “Law of
     Monotonic Decrement” .................................................................. 72
  8.2 Concepts of “Efficiency” ................................................................. 74
  8.3 Results from the North and South Study Areas ............................. 74
  8.4 Economies of the Archaic and the Rejection of a Large Annual Round ...... 76
  8.5 Future Directions of Study ............................................................. 78
References ........................................................................................... 80
List of Tables

Table 1: Culture Chronology of Yellowstone National Park........................................16
Table 2: Results Sorted by Study Area........................................................................61
Table 3: Results Sorted by Culture/Complex ...............................................................62
Table 4: Results Sorted by Obsidian Source...............................................................63
List of Figures

Figure 1: Yellowstone National Park within the Greater Plains Region (adapted from Wood 1998) ................................................................. 7
Figure 2: The Study Areas. .................................................................................... 9
Figure 3: Major Sites and Obsidian Sources (proposed travel routes highlighted in yellow) ........................................................................... 12
Figure 4: Previously Proposed Annual Round (in green- adapted from Johnson et al. 2004) ............................................................. 18
Figure 5: Range of archaeological occurrence: Obsidian Cliff (solid line) and Bear Gulch (dotted line) obsidians (from Davis et al. 1995:54) ............... 32
Figure 6: Photograph (taken by M. Meagher in 1990) of Obsidian Cliff Plateau- the locality of Obsidian Cliff obsidian. Note columnar structure of cliffs (from Meagher and Houston 1998: 62) ................................................................. 50
Figure 7: Photograph of Obsidian Cliff Plateau in 1884 (by F. J. Haynes 1884, courtesy of Yellowstone Heritage and Research Center) .......... 50
Figure 8: Percentage of Obsidian from each Source, by Study Area... .................. 64
Figure 9: Percentage of Obsidian from each Source, by Culture/Complex... ........... 65
Figure 10: South Study Area: Yellowstone Lake and the Thorofare Travel Corridor.. 68
Figure 11: North Study Area: The Yellowstone River Valley.... ............................... 69